

Scrutiny Liaison Committee

Records of Meetings

2023

The following records of meetings have been approved by the Committee.

Signed



President
Deputy Sam Mézec

États de Jersey



L's États d'Jèrri

Scrutiny Liaison Committee

Record of Meeting

Date: 24th January 2023

Present	Deputy Lyndsay Feltham (Vice-President) Deputy Catherine Curtis Deputy Moz Scott Deputy Geoff Southern Deputy Max Andrews (on behalf of Deputy Mézec) Deputy Rob Ward (on behalf of Deputy Luce)
Apologies	Deputy Sam Mézec (President) Deputy Steve Luce
Absent	
In attendance	Tim Oldham, Assistant Greffier of the States, Committees and Panels Janice Hales, Research and Project Assistant

Agenda matter	Action
<p>1. Records of Meetings</p> <p>The Committee approved the records of the meetings held on 29th November and 6th December 2022, subject to minor agreed revisions.</p>	
<p>2. Work Programmes and Activity Reports</p> <p>The Committee noted the work programmes and activity reports of the various Scrutiny Panels, including the Future Hospital Review Panel.</p> <p>The recently lodged P.115/2022 The Draft Sea Fisheries (TCA - Licensing of Fishing Boats) (Amendment of Law and Regulations (No. 2) (Jersey) Regulations 202- was discussed. It was noted that the regulations had been lodged by the Minister for the Environment and were in the process of being reviewed by the Environment, Housing and Infrastructure Panel (EHI), although there were elements of the matter that were of interest to the Economic and International Affairs Panel (EIA). It was agreed that, if required, the Chair of the EIA Panel would contact the Chair of the EHI Panel to discuss any potential remit overlap.</p> <p>The Chair of the Children, Education and Home Affairs Panel (CEHA) informed the Committee that her Panel had only recently become aware of work to be undertaken by both the Children's Commissioner and the Minister for Children and Education in respect of looked after young people, that would duplicate work planned by the Panel. It had therefore agreed to not pursue those matters at this stage. Ongoing challenges with timely communication of notable policy matters and media announcements by Ministers to Scrutiny Panels, and access to work programmes of Arm's Length Organisations was discussed. It was considered that, in addition to continued relationship building to help overcome such matters, the adherence to existing protocols or the creation of new ones might be explored. It was agreed that this would be raised with the Chief Minister at the upcoming Scrutiny Liaison Committee President/Chief Minister (SLCP/CM) meeting .</p>	

<p>3. Privileges and Procedures Committee (PPC)</p> <p>The Committee noted the work programme and activity report of PPC.</p>	
<p>4. Government Plan 2023 – 2026</p> <p>The Committee reflected on the recent approach of Scrutiny Panels to the Government Plan and discussed what, if any, changes could be made to the approach in future. Key themes identified included:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • delays in receiving requested information was a problem and had had an impact on deadlines • ongoing wait for the publication of Ministerial Plans • some late and incomplete Ministerial Responses • significant time pressures on all parties caused by the General Election • concerns over the quality and transparency of business cases • pressures of the number and timing of amendments • Corporate Services Panel to follow up on overarching themes arising from all Panel output and Ministerial Responses <p>Uncertainty over the Government's approach to mid-term reporting was also considered a potential problem for Panels undertaking follow up work, as this would, amongst others, cause uncertainty as to how funding was being spent if there was little or no access to transparent mid-term reporting. The Committee also asked how funding was spent and who had responsibility for which areas. It was agreed that relevant issues would be taken forward with the Chief Minister at the upcoming liaison meeting.</p>	
<p>5. Formation of new Health and Care Board</p> <p>The Committee discussed the recent appointment of Professor Hugo Mascie-Taylor for a fixed term period of 12 months as Chair of a new Health and Care Board, which was being established to oversee the Health and Community Services Department as it worked to advance the quality and safety of services. Professor Mascie-Taylor was appointed by the Minister for Health and Social Services, and his work during that time would include advising the Minister on the terms of reference for the new Board, overseeing the work of the turnaround team and a reform of the Department's clinical governance arrangements.</p> <p>The Committee considered a number of concerns about the process undertaken in respect of the appointment and noted that the Health and Social Security Panel had received a briefing on the issue and was continuing work in the area. It was also noted that the Public Accounts Committee (PAC) might undertake further work at the appropriate time in due course.</p>	
<p>6. Bilateral Investment Treaty (BITs)</p> <p>Concerns were raised over the notification period provided to States Members to raise comments ahead of the BIT between Jersey and the United Arab Emirates coming into force. It was agreed that this matter would be raised with the Chief Minister at the upcoming liaison meeting.</p>	
<p>7. Training and Work Programme</p> <p>The Committee was informed of ongoing work to establish a specific training programme for Scrutiny Members that would work in tandem with a wider training programme for all States Members. A further update and draft Scrutiny programme would be provided at the next meeting.</p>	<p>TO</p>

<p>8. Meeting with SLC President, Vice President and Chief Minister</p> <p>The Committee was informed that the next meeting with the Chief Minister was to be held on 26th January. Areas identified for discussion included:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Government Plan • Civil Servant Pay Increase • Process for agreeing on Bilateral Investment Treaties coming into force • Communication between Ministers and Scrutiny Panels 	
<p>9. Future Meetings</p> <p>The Panel noted its next meeting was scheduled to be held on 14th February 2023 at 2pm in Blampied Room, States Building. The Committee asked that an alternative date during the following week be identified due to a clash with the half-term school holidays.</p>	<p>JH</p>

Scrutiny Liaison Committee

Record of Meeting

Meeting held digitally

Date: 9th February 2023

Present	Deputy Sam Mézec (President) Deputy Lyndsay Feltham (Vice-President) Deputy Catherine Curtis Deputy Steve Luce Deputy Moz Scott Deputy Geoff Southern
Apologies	
Absent	
In attendance	Tim Oldham, Assistant Greffier of the States Janice Hales, Research and Project Officer

Agenda matter	Action
<p>1. Work Permit Holder Welfare Review Panel</p> <p>The Committee approved a Scoping Document and Terms of Reference for the establishment of Scrutiny Review Panel which will examine the effectiveness of the current Work Permit Policy in protecting people from exploitation and Modern Day Slavery.</p> <p><u>Budget</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Smart Survey Costs Promotional Costs: £620.00• Transcription costs at £150 per hearing: 5 hearings = £750.00• Focus Group Sessions (X 4) = £9,480• Radio Advertisement Campaign (2 weeks) (Based on 30 second – 35 spot advert) = £2,635• Total = £13,485	

Scrutiny Liaison Committee

Record of Meeting

Date: 21st February 2023

Present	Deputy Sam Mézec (President) Deputy Lyndsay Feltham (Vice-President) Deputy Catherine Curtis Deputy Moz Scott Deputy Geoff Southern Deputy Rob Ward (on behalf of Deputy Luce)
Apologies	Deputy Steve Luce
Absent	
In attendance	Lucy Marsh-Smith, Senior Legislative Drafter (item 4) Yannick Fillieul, Assistant Greffier of the States, Chamber and Members' Services (item 5) Tim Oldham, Assistant Greffier of the States, Committees and Panels

Agenda matter	Action
<p>1. Records of Meetings</p> <p>The Committee approved the records of the meetings held on 24th January 2023 and 9th February 2023, subject to minor agreed amendments to the record of 24th January in relation to Bilateral Investment Treaties.</p>	
<p>2. Work Programmes and Activity Reports</p> <p>The Committee noted the work programmes and activity reports of the various Scrutiny Panels, including Review Panels. Particular consideration was given to the following matters:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Gender Pay Gap Review Panel – it was noted that the obligated formal Ministerial Response to the Panel's report, that had been published towards the end of the previous Assembly, remained outstanding despite the long since passed 6 week deadline and recent communication with relevant members of the Government requesting that the situation be rectified. It was agreed that the President would formally write to the Chief Minister on behalf of the Committee to outline the position, and that it would be further raised at the forthcoming liaison meeting with the Chief Minister. The Chair of the Health and Social Services Panel, Deputy Geoff Southern, raised the matter of a Vote of No Confidence in his position that had been lodged by his Vice Chair, Deputy Sir Philip Bailhache, and which was scheduled to be debated at the next meeting of the States on 28th February. The Chair explained that he had approached two other Members of his Panel to discuss a letter of complaint about their conduct, which he had recently received from the Minister for Health and Social Services. The discussions about the complaint, coupled with previous challenges the Chair had raised with the Members concerned as to their conduct, had resulted in the Chair asking the Members to consider resigning from the Panel in light of an irreparable breakdown in trust and in the relationship with the Minister. In view of the escalation that had occurred with the lodging of the Vote of No 	

<p>Confidence, the Committee discussed that it had limited options available to it to address the matter, although consideration was given to the possible merits of conversations being held by the President or the wider Committee with Deputy Sir Bailhache and the Members concerned, despite the late stage, about the wider implications to the reputation and good functioning of the Scrutiny system of the present situation.</p> <p>Mindful of the situation with the Health and Social Security Panel and having been informed of challenges that Members of the Economic and International Affairs Panel were working to resolve, it was noted that the relevant Codes of Practice governing the Scrutiny function outlined certain, albeit limited, courses of action that might be taken by Chairs and the Committee in circumstances of dispute on or with Scrutiny Panels. Such actions, in line with relevant Standing Orders, did not include the authority for Chairs themselves, nor indeed the Committee, to remove Members from their Panels if Members did not themselves agree to resign. The Committee resolved that it might, in due course, consider re-visiting the options available to Chairs and itself in such circumstances, work which could lead to proposals to amend Standing Orders or the Scrutiny Proceedings and/or Engagement Codes should such a need be identified.</p>	
<p>3. Privileges and Procedures Committee (PPC)</p> <p>The Committee noted the work programme and activity report of PPC, including its sub-Committees.</p>	
<p>4. Legislative Drafting Office</p> <p>The Committee welcomed the Senior Legislative Drafter to discuss, amongst a range of matters, how legislative drafting priorities were established and progressed.</p> <p>In the course of the discussions, the Senior Legislative Drafter undertook to give further consideration to the routine provision of marked up copies of draft amendments to legislation when lodged for debate in the States Assembly, to help assist Members in their navigation of often complex matters. It was noted that such a “Keeling Schedule” showing amendments in situ currently occurred on a request basis, as to provide this for every legislative project was not practical within current resourcing. However, the Legislative Drafting Office embraced technology and would be mindful of opportunities in this area.</p> <p>Furthermore, the Senior Legislative Drafter would provide an update the Committee, following the meeting, in respect of a breakdown of the timeline of the progression of law drafting for the Zero hours Contracts (Employment (Amendment No, 12) (Jersey) Law 2022) and Landlords not to discriminate against tenants with children (Discrimination (Amendment of Law) (Jersey) Regulations 2021).</p> <p>The Committee thanked the Senior Legislative Drafter for her time and she withdrew from the meeting.</p>	
<p>5. Training for States Members</p> <p>The Committee welcomed the Assistant Greffier of the States (Chamber and Members’ Services) to the meeting and received and discussed a draft training programme for States Members, in addition to a separate Scrutiny specific programme that would supplement the overarching provision. The Committee was informed that it was intended for the overarching programme to be considered for approval at a forthcoming meeting of the Privileges and Procedures Committee, but that the opportunity that had arisen to share an earlier draft with the Chairs of the Scrutiny function, due to their particular interest in this area, had been very welcome.</p>	

<p>The Committee was supportive of the overarching direction of travel of a structured, wide-ranging and ongoing schedule of training opportunities and provided some further suggestions of areas that might be added. Deputy Rob Ward highlighted that as part of his ongoing engagement with the Commonwealth Parliamentary Association (CPA) and the associated CPA Academy, he was due to attend their headquarters in March. He offered, should it be helpful, to share the programmes with colleagues involved in the Academy to gather further informed feedback.</p> <p>The Committee noted that in addition to individual Panels and the PAC continuing to arrange training specific to their own needs through the Scrutiny training programme, it might give further consideration to arranging further all Scrutiny Member training at an appropriate time.</p> <p>The Committee thanked the Assistant Greffier for his time and he withdrew from the meeting.</p>	
<p>6. Meeting with SLC President, Vice President and Chief Minister</p> <p>The Committee was informed that the next meeting with the Chief Minister was scheduled to be held on 27th February. Areas identified for discussion included:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Late or incomplete Ministerial Responses to Scrutiny/PAC reports • Recent roll out of significant IT platforms • Avoiding arrangement of Government briefings that clashed with existing Scrutiny commitments 	
<p>7. Future Meetings</p> <p>The Panel noted that its next meeting was scheduled to be held on 14th March 2023 at 2pm in Le Capelain Room, States Building.</p>	

Scrutiny Liaison Committee

Record of Meeting

Meeting held digitally

Date: 10th March 2023

Present	Deputy Sam Mézec (President) Deputy Lyndsay Feltham (Vice-President) Deputy Catherine Curtis Deputy Steve Luce Deputy Moz Scott
Apologies	
Absent	
In attendance	Tim Oldham, Assistant Greffier of the States Janice Hales, Research and Project Officer

Agenda matter	Action
<p>1. Bridging Liquid Waste Strategy 2023-26 Review</p> <p>The Committee approved a Scoping Document and Terms of Reference on behalf of the Environment, Housing and Infrastructure Panel (EHI) for a review into the Bridging Liquid Waste Strategy.</p> <p><u>Budget</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Review Costs: Public Hearing Transcripts £150 (per audio hour) x 6 hours = £900• Expert Adviser Estimated around 15-20 days at £1,200 per day, plus travel costs if visits are required = £25,000• Digital and Public Engagement A D&PE plan will be prepared for the Panel's consideration although it is envisaged that the type and scope of this particular review will not require any additional budget for advertising / call for evidence etc. a minimal budget is included at this stage to promote the panel's review with paid sponsored social media posts = £30 <p>Total £25,930</p>	

Scrutiny Liaison Committee

Record of Meeting

Date: 14th March 2023

Present	Deputy Sam Mézec (President) Deputy Lyndsay Feltham (Vice-President) Deputy Catherine Curtis Deputy Moz Scott Deputy Sir Philip Bailhache (Vice-Chair Health and Social Security Panel)
Apologies	Deputy Steve Luce
Absent	
In attendance	Tim Oldham, Assistant Greffier of the States, Committees and Panels Janice Hales, Research and Project Officer

Agenda matter	Action
<p>1. Records of Meetings</p> <p>The Committee approved the records of the meetings held on 21st February 2023 and 10th March 2023, subject to a minor typographic amendment to the record of 21st February 2023.</p> <p>The Committee considered the record of the meeting of 10th March 2023, noting it related to a digital meeting held to approve Terms of Reference and a Scoping Document for an upcoming review. It recalled that it had previously agreed that such requests for approval would be sent digitally via Teams and the documents would be considered approved within 48 hours subject to any communication from Members to the contrary. The Committee agreed to maintain this process, however, requested additionally that the record of the meeting should record whether each Member had actively responded or whether their consent derived from the aforementioned process.</p>	
<p>2. Training for States Members</p> <p>The Committee recalled that at its last meeting it had received an update on the draft training programme for States Members, in addition to a separate Scrutiny specific programme that would supplement the overarching provision. It was noted that the overarching programme had subsequently been considered by the Privileges and Procedures Committee and had been well received.</p> <p>It was further noted that work continued to establish specific options in the areas agreed for further Scrutiny training, and the Committee requested to be provided with an update as progress was made.</p>	TO/JH
<p>3. Work Programmes and Activity Reports</p> <p>The Committee noted the work programmes and activity reports of the various Scrutiny Panels, including Review Panels.</p> <p>The Chair of the Children, Education and Home Affairs Panel relayed her Panel's disappointment that a question on youth knife crime that it had submitted for inclusion on the forthcoming Children and Young People's survey had been rejected by the selection body for the survey. The Panel had received feedback about the possible</p>	

<p>'sensitivity' of the matter but remained unclear as to how the determination to exclude the question had been made and the extent of the relationship between Government and Statistics Jersey. It was agreed that a briefing should be arranged with the Chief Statistician to help better understand the role of Statistics Jersey and how information it generated could be used to help inform Scrutiny Panels.</p>	<p>JH</p>
<p>The Committee was informed that the Chair of the Economic and International Affairs Panel had met recently with members of the Digital and Public Engagement team at the States Greffe, to discuss a number of possible initiatives regarding how the Panel might develop its engagement with stakeholders and the wider public. The Committee was informed that it would shortly begin to receive a monthly activity report on Scrutiny public engagement, and that it was proposed that relevant members of the team would attend the Committee on an occasional basis, at the invitation of the Committee, to provide an opportunity for more detailed discussions on the work being undertaken or as significant matters arose.</p>	<p>TO/JH</p>
<p>4. Privileges and Procedures Committee (PPC)</p> <p>The Committee noted the work programme and activity report of PPC, including its sub-Committees.</p>	
<p>5. Children's Commissioner Law</p> <p>The President informed the Committee that, in the context of the role ascribed to him in the legislation, he had been liaising with the Chief Minister regarding a forthcoming proposition that contained minor amendments to the Law in respect of the eligibility criteria for applicants to the role of Children's Commissioner, and the term of office. The Committee was informed that the proposition was due to be lodged that week.</p>	
<p>6. Meeting with SLC President, Vice President and Chief Minister</p> <p>The Committee noted the meeting that was due to take place in February had been postponed due to the Chief Minister being off Island. It was noted that the next meeting was due to take place on 20th March 2023. The Committee agreed that topics it would like to be discussed as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Delays in receiving Ministerial Responses and other Government documentation • Briefings being offered at short notice with minimal information provided • Recommendations Tracker • Role of Statistics Jersey <p>The Committee discussed the topic related meeting with the Chief Minister and the Panel Chairs and agreed that a meeting be scheduled to discuss Government Transparency.</p>	<p>JH</p>
<p>7. Conduct</p> <p>The Committee considered a complaint regarding the conduct of one its Members. This matter was discussed in private in accordance with the Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011.</p>	
<p>8. Future Meetings</p> <p>The Panel noted that its next meeting was scheduled to be held on 4th April 2023 at 2pm in Le Capelain Room, States Building.</p>	

Scrutiny Liaison Committee

Record of Meeting

Meeting held digitally

Date: 27th March 2023

Present	Deputy Sam Mézec (President) Deputy Lyndsay Feltham (Vice-President) Deputy Catherine Curtis Deputy Rob Ward Deputy Steve Luce Deputy Moz Scott
Apologies	
Absent	
In attendance	Tim Oldham, Assistant Greffier of the States Janice Hales, Research and Project Officer

Agenda matter	Action
<p>1. Governance of Health and Social Care</p> <p>The Committee approved a Scoping Document and Terms of Reference on behalf of the Public Accounts Committee for a review into the Governance of Health and Social Care.</p> <p>Whilst the Committee recalled its agreement that approval would be taken within 48 hours of the documents being circulated unless concerns were raised otherwise, it was noted that individual approval was registered in writing within that timeframe by the President, Deputy Scott and Deputy Ward.</p> <p><u>Budget</u></p> <p>Review Costs:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Transcription costs at £150 per hearing (10 hearings): £1,500.00• Social Media promotion: £40.00 <p>Total £1,540.00</p>	
<p>2. Performance Management - Follow up</p> <p>The Committee approved a Scoping Document and Terms of Reference on behalf of the Public Accounts Committee for a review into Performance Management – Follow up.</p> <p>Whilst the Committee recalled its agreement that approval would be taken within 48 hours of the documents being circulated unless concerns were raised otherwise, it was noted that individual approval was registered in writing within that timeframe by the President, Deputy Scott, Deputy Luce and Deputy Ward.</p>	

27.03.2023

Budget

Review Costs:

- Transcription costs at £150 per hearing: 8 hearings. £1,200.00
- Social Media promotion £20.00

Total £1,220.00

Scrutiny Liaison Committee

Record of Meeting

Meeting held digitally

Date: 24th May 2023

Present	Deputy Sam Mézec (President) Deputy Lyndsay Feltham (Vice-President) Deputy Catherine Curtis Deputy Rob Ward Deputy Steve Luce Deputy Moz Scott
Apologies	
Absent	
In attendance	Tim Oldham, Assistant Greffier of the States Janice Hales, Research and Project Officer

Agenda matter	Action
<p>1. Children, Education and Home Affairs Scrutiny Panel: Review of Secondary Education Funding</p> <p>The Committee approved a Scoping Document and Terms of Reference on behalf of the Children, Education and Home Affairs Scrutiny Panel for a review into the Review of Secondary Education Funding.</p> <p>Whilst the Committee recalled its agreement that approval would be taken within 48 hours of the documents being circulated unless concerns were raised otherwise, it was noted that individual approval was registered in writing within that timeframe by the President, Vice President, Deputy Luce, Deputy Scott and Deputy Ward.</p> <p><u>Budget</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">Review Costs: Public Hearing Transcripts £150 (per audio hour) x 6 hours = £900Expert Adviser Estimated around 15 days at £1,000 per day (no travel costs anticipated) = £15,0006 <p><i>NOTE: The Panel has not approached potential advisers to tender for this role yet. The Panel will revert to SLC with an update on the budget once further detail is available.</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">Digital and Public Engagement (D&PE) = £500 <p>A detailed D&PE plan will be prepared and appended to this scoping document once finalised. The Panel will engage with the public to collect evidence for the 'public expectations' part of the Terms of Reference.</p> <p>The following items will be covered by the D&PE budget:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">£70 on social media boosting	

24.05.2023

- £160 on informational / contact postcards (£80 initial spend and will order more with remaining £80, if needed)

The graphic design costs of the postcard / banner do not come from the review budget

- £85 for roadside banner printing; ·
- £135 for an outside banner for the pop-up stand (this will be a generic scrutiny banner (not review specific) that can be re-used for other reviews / by other Panels)
- £50 contingency.

TOTAL REVIEW BUDGET = £16,4007

Scrutiny Liaison Committee

Record of Meeting

Date: 25th May 2023

Present	Deputy Sam Mézec, President Deputy Lyndsay Feltham, Vice President, Deputy Catherine Curtis Deputy Steve Luce Deputy Moz Scott Deputy Rob Ward
Apologies	
Absent	
In attendance	Ian Cope, Chief Statistician (Item 4 and 5) Daniel Edmunds, Principal Statistician (Item 4) Deputy Kristina Moore, Chief Minister (Item 5) Deputy Lucy Stephenson, Assistant Chief Minister (Item 5) Paul Bradbury, Head of Ministerial Support (Item 5) Dirk Danino-Forsyth, Director of Communications (Item 5) Tim Oldham, Assistant Greffier of the States (Committees and Panels) (Items 1-5) Janice Hales, Research and Project Officer

Agenda matter	Action
<p>1. Records of Meetings</p> <p>The Committee approved the records of the meeting held on 4th April. It was agreed that minor amendments would be made to the file note and private minute dated 5th May, which would be subsequently recirculated for final approval.</p>	JH
<p>2. Work Programmes and Activity Reports</p> <p>The Committee noted the work programmes and activity reports of the various Scrutiny Panels, including Review Panels.</p> <p>The Chair of the Health and Social Security Panel informed the Committee that the Panel had recently completed drafting its terms of reference and scoping document for its review into Overpayment of Social Security Benefits, and that the documents would be circulated imminently for the Committee's approval. The Chair informed the Committee that detailed discussion had gone into the scoping document to try and manage any potential 'scope creep' as this particular review could generate a lot of interest by individuals on their personal cases.</p>	
<p>3. Privileges and Procedures Committee (PPC)</p> <p>The Committee noted the work programme and activity report of PPC, including its Sub-Committees.</p>	
<p>4. Briefing: Operation of the Statistics Unit</p> <p>The Committee received a briefing from the Chief Statistician and a Governmental officer on the operation of the Statistics unit. A private detailed file note was made of</p>	

<p>the briefing, classified as exempt in accordance with Article 35 of the Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011 (as amended).</p>	
<p>5. Meeting: Transparency in Government with the Chief Minister</p> <p>The Committee received the Chief Minister and the Assistant Chief Minister, Deputy Lucy Stephenson, together with the Chief Statistician and Government officers to discuss Government transparency. A private detailed file note was made of the briefing, classified as exempt in accordance with Article 35 of the Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011 (as amended).</p>	
<p>6. Meeting with SLC President, Vice President and Chief Minister</p> <p>The Committee noted the file note from the meeting held on 24th April 2023. The Committee discussed areas of questioning for the upcoming meeting on 14th June 2023 and agreed to include rescindments on propositions as an area of discussion. It was agreed that any further areas arising be forwarded to the Committee's officers on the relevant Teams channel for inclusion at the meeting.</p>	<p>JH</p>
<p>7. Letter from Chair Diversity Forum (PPC) Sub-Committee</p> <p>The Committee noted a letter from the Diversity Forum (PPC) Sub-Committee in respect of the diversity of membership on panels and committees and agreed that it would invite a member of the Sub-Committee to its next meeting for further discussion on the topic.</p>	<p>JH</p>
<p>8. Any Other Business</p> <p>The Committee recalled the earlier meeting with the Chief Minister on Government transparency, and considered the feasibility of it holding meetings with the Chief Minister in public. It was agreed this would be tabled as an item at its next scheduled meeting for further discussion.</p> <p>The Chair of the Economic and International Affairs Panel raised the potential of lay members being appointed to Scrutiny Panels, extending the structure by which the PAC was presently constituted. It was agreed this would be tabled as an item at the next scheduled meeting for further discussion.</p>	<p>JH</p>
<p>9. Future Meetings</p> <p>The Committee agreed its next scheduled meeting would take place on 20th June 2023 at 2pm in Le Capelain Room, States Building.</p>	

Scrutiny Liaison Committee

Record of Meeting

Meeting held digitally

Date: 26th May 2023

Present	Deputy Sam Mézec (President) Deputy Lyndsay Feltham (Vice-President) Deputy Catherine Curtis Deputy Rob Ward Deputy Steve Luce Deputy Moz Scott
Apologies	
Absent	
In attendance	Tim Oldham, Assistant Greffier of the States Janice Hales, Research and Project Officer

Agenda matter	Action
<p>1. Health and Social Security Panel: Review of Income Support Benefit Overpayments</p> <p>The Committee approved a Scoping Document and Terms of Reference on behalf of the Health and Social Security Scrutiny Panel for a review into the Review of Income Support Benefit Overpayments.</p> <p>Whilst the Committee recalled its agreement that approval would be taken within 48 hours of the documents being circulated unless concerns were raised otherwise, it was noted that individual approval was registered in writing within that timeframe by the Vice President, Deputy Curtis, Deputy Luce and Deputy Scott.</p> <p><u>Budget</u></p> <p>Review Costs:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">Public Hearing Transcripts £150 (per audio hour) x 2 hours = £300 <p>Digital and Public Engagement</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">A D&PE plan will be prepared for the Panel's consideration although it is envisaged that the type and scope of this particular review will not require any additional budget for advertising / call for evidence etc. a minimal budget is included at this stage to promote the panel's review with paid sponsored social media posts = £30 <p>TOTAL = £330</p>	

Scrutiny Liaison Committee

Record of Meeting

Date: 9th June 2023

Present	Deputy Sam Mézec, President Deputy Lyndsay Feltham, Vice President, Deputy Catherine Curtis Deputy Steve Luce Deputy Moz Scott Deputy Rob Ward
Apologies	
Absent	
In attendance	Deputy Ian Gorst, Minister for Treasury and Resources Deputy Elaine Millar, Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources with responsibility for Financial Services Deputy Steve Ahier, Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources Richard Bell, Treasurer of the States Simon Hayward, Director of Treasury and Investment Russell Crowe, Head of Treasury and Investment Janice Hales, Research and Project Officer Jade Hahn, Research and Project Officer

Agenda matter	Action
<p>1. Briefing – Government Funds, Bonds and Investments</p> <p>The Committee received the Minister for Treasury and Resources, the Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources with responsibility for Financial Services, the Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources and Government officers to a briefing on Government Funds, Bonds and Investments. A private detailed file note was made of the briefing, classified as exempt in accordance with Article 35 of the Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011 (as amended).</p>	

Scrutiny Liaison Committee

Record of Meeting

Date: 20th June 2023

Present	Deputy Sam Mézec, President Deputy Lyndsay Feltham, Vice President, Deputy Catherine Curtis Deputy Moz Scott Deputy Rob Ward Connétable Michael Jackson (Vice Chair of EHI Panel) (items 2 and 3 only)
Apologies	Deputy Steve Luce
Absent	
In attendance	Lisa Hart, Greffier of the States (Item 2 only) Tim Oldham, Assistant Greffier of the States (Committees and Panels) Janice Hales, Research and Project Officer

Agenda matter	Action
1. Records of Meetings The Committee approved the records of its meetings held on 24th, 25th and 26th May 2023.	
2. Scrutiny Proceedings The Committee heard from the Chair of the Economic and International Affairs (EIA) Panel regarding a possible amendment to Standing Orders that she was considering that might, ultimately, compel the removal of Panel membership from a Member who was subject to a complaint considered and upheld by the Commissioner for Standards. There followed a broader discussion about the ability of Chairs to effectively manage unduly disruptive behaviour by Panel members. The Committee was reminded by the Greffier of the States that the role of the Commissioner was to determine whether there was a breach of the Code of Conduct for Elected Members (the Code) and could not become involved in the breakdown of relations between Panel Members, unless the Member had been accused or been seen to have broken the Code, thereby invoking her jurisdiction. The Committee further recalled that following an investigation, the Commissioner would make a recommendation, writing to PPC advising of such, with PPC being the responsible body for determining the subsequent course of action in respect of proposed sanctions. It was noted that as Members to Scrutiny Panels were appointed by the States Assembly, the responsibility to remove a Member from that position, if that course of action was determined, rested with the Assembly should a Member chose not to resign in the circumstances. It was noted that the Chair of the EIA Panel had arranged to raise the matter for further discussion with PPC at its forthcoming meeting, and that an update would be provided to the Committee in due course. The Committee also considered P.45/2023 <i>Appointment of non-elected Members on Scrutiny Panels</i> , lodged by Deputy Scott and scheduled for debate on 4th July 2023. The Chair of the EIA Panel explained the rationale behind seeking to explore	

20.06.2023

<p>the extension of provisions for 'lay members' to be appointed beyond the PAC to include other Panels within the Scrutiny function, though primarily her own. The Chair explained that her Panel had a very broad remit and, at times, it could be challenging to find Members for the Panel with the required experience to cover this remit. The Chair also explained that lay members on Scrutiny Panels may offer more flexibility in establishing appropriately sized memberships of Panels, as many Members were very busy and some chose not to serve in the Scrutiny function, despite not being in Government positions.</p> <p>Asked in respect of context, the Greffier of the States informed the Committee that she was unaware of any jurisdiction where lay members were appointed to the equivalent Panels such as Select Committees (other than the PAC equivalent). The Greffier further explained that with the existing 'Troy Rule', there was a limit on the amount of Ministers and Assistant Ministers that could be appointed that in effect provided the potential for 28 Members to be appointed for Scrutiny Panels.</p> <p>The Committee discussed the matter with the Chair of the EIA Panel, giving consideration amongst other matters to the role of States Members and expectations thereon in respect of parliamentary scrutiny, the range of skills and knowledge amongst Members, the purpose and principles of Scrutiny, the difference in the role of Scrutiny versus that of PAC, the provision of a budget for the engagement of expert advisers for reviews, access to sensitive information and payment of lay members. Further to the discussion, the Committee confirmed that it was not supportive of the proposal and requested Comments be drafted to reflect the discussions and points raised.</p> <p>The Chair of the EIA Panel informed the Committee that she would consider the feedback provided by the Committee and decide her next steps on the matter.</p>	JH
<p>3. Previously held Briefings and Meetings</p> <p>The Committee discussed the recently held briefings and meetings with the Chief Minister and the Chief Statistician. Performance management measures were discussed, with it being agreed that this area would be raised with the Chief Minister at the next meeting with the SLC President and Vice President.</p> <p>The Committee discussed the possibility of it holding public hearings with the Chief Minister to cover certain overarching issues relating to Government that were separate to those falling formally within the remit of the Corporate Services Panel. It was informed that Standing Orders were effectively silent on this matter and it was therefore agreed that this would be raised with the Chief Minister at the next meeting with the SLC President and Vice President.</p>	JH
<p>4. Work Programmes and Activity Reports</p> <p>The Committee noted the work programme and activity reports from all Panels and Review Panels.</p> <p>The Chair of the Corporate Services Panel informed the Committee that his Panel was due to launch a review on People and Culture as a follow up to a previous review on this topic. It was also informed that Comments were due to be presented on <i>P.29/2023 Draft Income Tax (High Value Residents – Amendment) (Jersey) Law 202-</i>.</p> <p>The Chair of the Economic and International Affairs Panel informed the Committee that a review on Supply Chain would be launched imminently with Terms of Reference and Scoping Document currently being drafted. It was also informed that Comments had been drafted on <i>P.28/2023 Draft Taxation (Exchange of Information – Amendment) (Jersey) Regulations 202-</i> which was due for debate on 4th July 2023.</p>	

<p>The Chair advised the Committee that the Minister for External Relations had not attended a Public Hearing since November 2022, however, it was noted by the Panel that this was due to personal reasons.</p> <p>The Chair of PAC informed the Committee that numerous hearings were due to take place the following week with Chief Officers regarding performance management. The Committee was also informed that a public hearing had recently taken place with the Chief Executive Officer, Government of Jersey, which would be the final hearing prior to the departure following her resignation.</p> <p>The Chair of the Future Hospital Review Panel informed the Committee that the Panel was planning a hearing with the Chief Minister to discuss the status of the project and the transparency of financial information for the business case.</p> <p>The Vice Chair of the Environment Housing and Infrastructure Panel informed the Committee that a review into the Bridging Liquid Waste Strategy was underway, however, submissions from stakeholders and the public to date could be considered low in comparison to other reviews.</p> <p>The Committee discussed the upcoming Government Plan and noted it had not received a timeline for receipt of the documents or lodging dates. It also noted that the lodging of the Government Plan would likely impact on any reviews undertaken in Q3 and Q4 of 2023.</p>	
<p>5. Privileges and Procedures Committee (PPC)</p> <p>The Committee noted the work programme and activity report of PPC, including its Sub-Committees.</p> <p>The Chair of PAC, the Committee's representative on PPC, additionally informed the Committee that PPC had recently met with Dr Chris Pich who had been commissioned by the States Greffe to undertake a study which explored voter engagement and identified barriers of voter engagement. The meeting gave an opportunity for PPC to ask questions on the key findings and recommendations which had been presented to PPC in advance. The Committee was also informed that PPC had recently met with Government officers regarding voter engagement who had presented options and costs on digital voter registration. This would be discussed further at future PPC meetings.</p>	
<p>6. Government Lodging Programme (GLP) with lodging timeframes</p> <p>The Committee noted the recently circulated GLP with lodging timeframes, but questioned whether the version received was up to date. It requested that this to be clarified by officials, with a view to a more up to date version being circulated if available. It also noted that a significant amount of legislation was due to be lodged in Q3 and Q4 which would likely impact on the workloads of Panels at a busy time with the Government Plan.</p>	JH
<p>7. Meeting with SLC President, Vice President and Chief Minister</p> <p>The Committee noted there had been no meeting with the Chief Minister in May and June to date, but that a meeting was being pursued for late June/early July.</p>	JH
<p>8. Future Meetings</p> <p>The Committee agreed its next scheduled meeting would take place on 11th July 2023 at 1.30pm in Le Capelain Room, States Building and would include a meeting with the Chair of the Diversity Forum (PPC) Sub-Committee.</p>	

Scrutiny Liaison Committee

Record of Meeting

Meeting held digitally

Date: 30th June 2023

Present	Deputy Sam Mézec (President) Deputy Lyndsay Feltham (Vice-President) Deputy Catherine Curtis Deputy Rob Ward Deputy Steve Luce Deputy Moz Scott
Apologies	
Absent	
In attendance	Tim Oldham, Assistant Greffier of the States Janice Hales, Research and Project Officer

Agenda matter	Action
<p>1. Supply Chain Resilience</p> <p>The Committee approved a Scoping Document and Terms of Reference on behalf of the Economic and International Affairs Panel for a review into Supply Chain Resilience.</p> <p>Whilst the Committee recalled its agreement that approval would be taken within 48 hours of the documents being circulated unless concerns were raised otherwise, it was noted that individual approval was registered in writing within that timeframe by Deputy Luce, Deputy Scott and Deputy Ward.</p> <p><u>Budget</u></p> <p><u>Review Costs:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Public Hearing x 4 - £600• Digital and Public Engagement - £100• Advisor - £15,000 (indicative of 15 days) <p>Total = £15,700</p>	

Scrutiny Liaison Committee

Record of Meeting

Date: 11th July 2023

Present	Deputy Sam Mézec, President Deputy Lyndsay Feltham, Vice President, Deputy Catherine Curtis Deputy Steve Luce Deputy Moz Scott Deputy Rob Ward
Apologies	
Absent	
In attendance	Deputy Carina Alves, Chair, PPC Diversity Sub Committee [item 2 only] Deputy Louise Doublet, PPC Diversity Sub Committee Member [item 2 only] Tim Oldham, Assistant Greffier of the States (Committees and Panels) Kellie Boydens, Principal Committee and Panel Officer [item 2 only] Janice Hales, Research and Project Officer

Agenda matter	Action
<p>1. Records of Meetings</p> <p>The Committee approved the records of its meetings held on 9th and 20th June subject to one small amendment to the record of 20th June 2023.</p>	
<p>2. Meeting with PPC Diversity Sub Committee</p> <p>The Committee welcomed the Chair of the PPC Diversity Sub Committee to discuss recent correspondence regarding Gender Balance on Scrutiny Panels and Committees.</p> <p>It was noted that out of 23 female States Members, 10 presently served on Scrutiny Panels or Committees, which was broadly considered an appropriate representation in view of the various influences on that ratio.</p> <p>The Chair of the Economic and International Affairs Scrutiny Panel wished it to be recorded that it was her view that diversity on Panels and Committees should be encouraged as it contributed to the different decisions and offered more insight.</p> <p>The Chair of the Health and Social Security Panel wished it to be recorded that it was his view that whilst it was positive that Panels and Committees had a mix of genders, it was also important that stakeholders, including members of the Public who engaged with and were targeted by Scrutiny, were also balanced and the focus was not unduly weighted to one gender.</p> <p>It was agreed that the President would correspond by way of follow up with the Sub Committee, confirming that the that the topic would be discussed in more detail by the Committee during this term with a view to gender balance on Panels and Committees being included as part of the new States Members induction.</p>	JH
<p>3. Previously held Briefings and Meetings</p>	

11.07.2023

<p>The file note of the briefing on 9th June 2023 between the Committee and the Minister for Treasury and Resources on Government Bonds and Investments was approved.</p>	
<p>4. Work Programmes and Activity Reports</p> <p>The Committee noted the work programme and activity reports from all Panels and Review Panels.</p> <p>The Chair of the Corporate Services Panel informed the Committee that it would be undertaking a follow up review on People and Culture with Terms of Reference and Scoping Document to be circulated for approval imminently. It was also informed that Deputy Lyndsey Feltham would be co-opted for the purpose of that review.</p> <p>The Chair of the Public Accounts Committee (PAC) advised that public hearings were ongoing with Chief Officers regarding performance management.</p> <p>The Chair of the Children, Education and Home Affairs Panel informed the Committee that the recently published survey for its review on Secondary Education Funding had received positive feedback. It was also informed that the appointment of an expert adviser was still being explored.</p> <p>The Chair of the Health and Social Security Panel informed the Committee that the review into overpayment of social security payments was ongoing. It was also informed that Q3 and Q4 of this year looked extremely busy in terms of upcoming legislation and it may be that a number of propositions would need to be 'called in' to be looked at in more detail, should the Panel workload be excessive.</p> <p>The Work Permit Holder Welfare Review was discussed with the Chair of PAC (as a Review Panel Member) informing the Committee that the review was nearing completion. It was also informed that the review had highlighted that a lot of people were in critical need and the Review Panel was looking to expediate the report.</p>	
<p>5. Privileges and Procedures Committee (PPC)</p> <p>The Committee noted the work programme and activity report of PPC, including its Sub-Committees. It was informed that PPC was due to meet the following week and an update would be provided in due course.</p>	
<p>6. Government Plan 2024 – 2027</p> <p>The Committee discussed the upcoming Government Plan and the effect it may have on Panel and Committee work. It also discussed the previous Government Plan where appendices and business plans were provided late impacting on deadlines and it was agreed that communication between the Committee and Government would continue regularly asking for updates to the timeline.</p>	<p>TO/JH</p>
<p>7. Scrutiny Proceedings</p> <p>The Committee noted the withdrawal of P.45/2023 'Appointment of non-elected Members on Scrutiny Panels' which had been lodged by Deputy Moz Scott.</p>	
<p>8. Access to minutes of Government bodies</p> <p>The Committee discussed recent requests for access to signed minutes of meetings of Government bodies, with the Chair of Corporate Services informing the Committee of difficulties that had recently been encountered by the Panel in obtaining minutes. The Chair went on to inform the Committee that the Panel had asked for the minutes at a public quarterly hearing and was informed that they would be forthcoming. The Committee was further informed that when the issue was raised with the Department</p>	

<p>regarding the lateness of the minutes, the Chair was informed that the minutes were in fact file notes and there had been an error in the description of the records.</p> <p>The Chair of the Environment, Housing and Infrastructure Panel informed the Committee that whilst his Panel had not had trouble with accessing minutes, it had encountered a delay in receiving the Liquid Waste Strategy which had delayed the launch of the Panel's review. The Chair of PAC also informed that PAC had encountered a delay in receiving the Health Strategy.</p> <p>It was agreed that the President would monitor the situation and any issues would be reported back to the Committee.</p>	
<p>9. Meeting with SLC President, Vice President and Chief Minister</p> <p>The President and Vice President gave a verbal update of their meeting with the Chief Minister held on 10th July 2023.</p> <p>The Committee was informed of a number of amendments that were being discussed to recently lodged propositions namely:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • P.47-2023 (Whistleblowing Legislation lodged by Deputy Alves) • P.52-2023.pdf (Financial Support for Parents of babies requiring neonatal care lodged by Deputy Kovacs) • P.53-2023 (Negotiation on behalf of the States of Jersey, the purchase of the former Seaside Café and carpark site at Grève de Lecq - lodged by Deputy Farnham) • P.48-2023.pdf (Mortgage repayment assistance lodged by Deputy Southern) <p>The Committee noted that the amendment to P.53/2023 had been lodged by Deputy Lucy Stephenson of St Peter, St Ouen and St Mary as opposed to the Council of Ministers (CoM). Discussion was had as to whether this was an amendment from Deputy Stephenson due to it being a Parish matter rather than a CoM issue.</p> <p>The Committee was informed that a timeline of the Government Plan 2023 – 2027 was discussed with the proposed lodging date due on 19th September 2023. The Committee was further informed that the issue of the late appendices and the impact on Panel deadlines was raised with the Chief Minister informing the President and Vice President that their concerns had been noted.</p> <p>The Committee was informed that neither the Chief Minister nor the Deputy Chief Minister would be in attendance at the final States meeting prior to the recess due to the Chief Minister being off Island attending the 'Women Deliver 2023 Conference' taking place in Kigali, Rwanda, whilst the Deputy Chief Minister would be on annual leave. It was informed that the Minister for Treasury and Resources would be Acting Chief Minister, which would include responsibility for taking Questions without Notice on the Chief Minister's behalf. The Committee expressed various concerns in relation to the absences, including in respect of the impact on due accountability and the provision of appropriately informed Ministerial responses during the Question periods at the States meeting. In view of the potential impact on the States meeting, it was agreed to contact the Greffier of the States to establish whether notice of the absences would be circulated to all States Members, by the States Greffe or the Government, without delay.</p> <p>The Committee was informed that the topic of holding Committee hearings in public with the Chief Minister was raised. It was agreed that this would be discussed further between officers with an update provided after the summer recess.</p>	

<p>The Chair of the Economic and International Affairs Panel discussed Ministerial Delivery Plans and asked if it could be raised with the Chief Minister, at the next liaison meeting, that the dates in the Ministerial Delivery Plan for the Minister for External Relations were not consistent with what was being presented and if these dates were due to be updated.</p> <p>The Chair also raised the issue of medicinal cannabis which featured within the Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture’s Ministerial Delivery Plan. The Chair highlighted that the Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture seemed to be leading on the topic, however, she also raised from a health perspective that the number of prescriptions being issued for medicinal cannabis could be considered excessive and enquired if any work was being undertaken by the Health and Social Security Panel in this area. It was agreed that this would be taken offline and a conversation be undertaken between both Chairs.</p>	
<p>10. Future Meetings</p> <p>The Committee agreed its next scheduled meeting would take place on 19th September 2023 at 2.00pm in Le Capelain Room, States Building. It was also noted that this was the day that the Government Plan was due to be lodged.</p>	

Scrutiny Liaison Committee

Record of Meeting

Meeting held digitally

Date: 14th July 2023

Present	Deputy Sam Mézec (President) Deputy Lyndsay Feltham (Vice-President) Deputy Catherine Curtis Deputy Rob Ward Deputy Steve Luce Deputy Moz Scott
Apologies	
Absent	
In attendance	Tim Oldham, Assistant Greffier of the States Janice Hales, Research and Project Officer

Agenda matter	Action
<p>1. People and Culture Follow-up Review</p> <p>The Committee approved a Scoping Document and Terms of Reference on behalf of the Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel for a review into the People and Culture Follow-up Review.</p> <p>Whilst the Committee recalled its agreement that approval would be taken within 48 hours of the documents being circulated unless concerns were raised otherwise, it was noted that individual approval was registered in writing within that timeframe by the Vice President, Deputy Curtis and Deputy Ward.</p> <p><u>Budget</u> Review Costs:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Transcription Costs for Public Hearings: (£150 x 3) £450• Digital and Public Engagement: Press notices and social media (boosts): review launch and key findings from each public hearing: £100 <p>If gaps are identified once the Panel has begun its comparative analysis of the Be heard and HR Lounge Surveys (or at any point in the evidence gathering stage of the review), an updated Digital and Public Engagement Strategy will be used to target the specific key stakeholders identified.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Contingency budget for this (boosting on social media): £100 Transcription £450 Digital and Public Engagement £200• Total: £650	

Scrutiny Liaison Committee

Record of Meeting

Meeting held digitally

Date: 25th July 2023

Present	Deputy Sam Mézec (President) Deputy Lyndsay Feltham (Vice-President) Deputy Catherine Curtis Deputy Rob Ward Deputy Steve Luce Deputy Moz Scott
Apologies	
Absent	
In attendance	Tim Oldham, Assistant Greffier of the States Janice Hales, Research and Project Officer

Agenda matter	Action
<p>1. States Annual Report and Accounts 2022 Review</p> <p>The Committee approved a Scoping Document and Terms of Reference on behalf of the Public Accounts Committee for a review into the States Annual Report and Accounts 2022.</p> <p>Whilst the Committee recalled its agreement that approval would be taken within 48 hours of the documents being circulated unless concerns were raised otherwise, it was noted that individual approval was registered in writing within that timeframe by the Vice President and Deputy Curtis.</p> <p><u>Budget</u></p> <p><u>Review Costs:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Transcription costs at £150 per hearing: 3 hearings. £450.00• Digital and Public Engagement £85.00 <p>TOTAL £535.00</p>	