



## Work Permit Holder Welfare Review Panel

### Records of Meetings

Year: 2023

The following records of meetings have been approved by the Panel.

Signed

.....

Chair

Work Permit Holder Welfare Review Panel

# Work Permit Holder Welfare Review Panel

## Record of Meeting

Date: 2nd February 2023

Present	Deputy Beatriz Porée, Chair Deputy Mary Le Hegarat, Vice-Chair Connétable Marcus Troy, Member Deputy Lyndsay Feltham, Member Deputy Montfort Tadier, Member
Apologies	
Absent	
In attendance	Anna Thorne, Committee and Panel Officer Ben Walker, Research and Project Officer Leila Osman, Communications Officer

Agenda matter	Action
<p><b>1. Records of Meetings</b></p> <p>The Panel noted and approved the record of the meeting held on 20th December 2022.</p>	
<p><b>2. Panel Membership and Vice-Chair</b></p> <p>The Panel noted its Membership consisted of Deputy Beatriz Porée (Chair), Deputy Mary Le Hegarat, Connétable Marcus Troy, Deputy Lyndsay Feltham and Deputy Montfort Tadier, and agreed to appoint Deputy Mary Le Hegarat as Vice-Chair of the Panel.</p>	
<p><b>3. Work Permit Holder Welfare Review: Terms of Reference and Scoping Document</b></p> <p>The Panel noted and approved the final version of the Terms of Reference and Scoping Document for its review. It agreed that the target launch date for the review was Monday 6th February 2023.</p>	
<p><b>4. Draft Correspondence to Ministers</b></p> <p>The Panel reviewed the draft correspondence to the Minister for Home Affairs, Chief Minister and the Minister's for Housing and Communities, Environment, Health and Social Services, Social Security and Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture, advising them of the review's launch and Terms of Reference and requested minor amendments to the wording of the correspondence.</p>	<b>BW</b>
<p><b>5. Draft Correspondence to Stakeholders</b></p> <p>The Panel noted that draft correspondence to stakeholders would be provided to the Panel for its approval in due course.</p>	<b>BW</b>
<p><b>6. Proposed Digital and Public Engagement Plan</b></p> <p>The Panel noted and approved the Proposed Digital and Public Engagement Plan and the draft press release for the launch of the review.</p> <p>The Panel discussed further options for stakeholder engagement with the review</p>	<b>BW/LO</b>

02.02.2023

and requested that the Officer arrange for quotes to be provided in relation to radio advertising and focus group sessions, for the Panel's consideration.	
<b>7. Review Work Plan</b>	
The Panel noted the review work plan and key milestones for its work.	
<b>8. Work Permit Holder Survey: Update</b>	
The Officer informed the Panel that a draft survey had been developed and that Statistics Jersey had provided feedback on the proposed content and questions. It was advised that the survey would be further developed and provided to the Panel for its consideration in due course.	<b>AT/BW</b>
The Panel discussed options for work permit holder engagement in the Panel's survey and requested that the Officer include a note that the Panel may contact work permit holders in future with regards to a follow-up survey.	<b>AT</b>
<b>9. Future Meetings</b>	
The Panel discussed the frequency of future meetings and requested that the Officer provisionally schedule Panel meetings to take place on a fortnightly basis.	<b>BW</b>
<b>10. Briefings: Work Permit Policy</b>	
The Officer informed the Panel that Government Officers would be contacted to arrange a private briefing on the Work Permit Policy, and that areas of questioning for the briefing would be provided to the Panel in due course.	<b>BW</b>

# Work Permit Holder Welfare Review Panel

## Record of Meeting

Date: 23rd February 2023

Present	Deputy Beatriz Porée, Chair Deputy Lyndsay Feltham, Member Deputy Montfort Tadier, Member
Apologies	
Absent	Deputy Mary Le Hegarat, Vice-Chair Connétable Marcus Troy, Member
In attendance	Anna Thorne, Committee and Panel Officer Ben Walker, Research and Project Officer Leila Osman, Communications Officer

Agenda matter	Action
<p><b>1. Records of Meetings</b></p> <p>The Panel approved the record of the meeting held on 2nd February 2023.</p>	
<p><b>2. Stakeholder correspondence</b></p> <p>The Panel noted the receipt of responses from a number of the stakeholders contacted.</p> <p>The Panel identified areas for follow up in correspondence with some stakeholders and requested that additional information was sought for its review and that briefings should be scheduled as necessary.</p> <p>The Panel requested that all stakeholders be provided with a timeframe of one month to submit a response to the review, and that additional groups and individuals be contacted and invited to make a submission.</p>	<p><b>BW/AT</b></p> <p><b>BW/AT</b></p>
<p><b>3. Call for evidence</b></p> <p>The Panel noted that the Chair had recorded a video as part of the call for evidence and agreed that the same information should also be recorded in Portuguese.</p>	<b>LO</b>
<p><b>4. Work Permit Holder Survey</b></p> <p>The Panel agreed that once the survey for work permit holders was finalised it should be sent out immediately after its approval to ensure the greatest number of respondents.</p>	<b>BW/AT</b>
<p><b>5. Site Visits</b></p> <p>The Panel noted the process regarding site visits and requested that arrangements be made to facilitate Panel site visits to employers of work permit holders.</p>	<b>BW</b>

23.02.2023

<p><b>6. Review Work Plan</b></p> <p>The Panel noted the review work plan and key milestones for its work.</p> <p>The Panel requested that research be undertaken on areas which included corresponding regulation and processes that affected the administration of the Work Permit Policy and the public terms of reference of relevant bodies.</p>	
<p><b>7. Briefing on Work Permit Policy: Question Plan</b></p> <p>The Panel reviewed and requested changes to the draft question plan for a private briefing with Jersey Customs and Immigration Service to be held on 2nd March 2023.</p>	<b>BW</b>
<p><b>8. Future Meetings</b></p> <p>The Panel noted that its next scheduled meeting was due to take place at 12:30pm on 2nd March 2023 in the Le Capelain Room, States Building and would include a private briefing on the Work Permit Policy from the Jersey Customs and Immigration Service.</p>	

# Work Permit Holder Welfare Review Panel

## Record of Meeting

Date: 2<sup>nd</sup> March 2023

Present	Deputy Beatriz Porée, Chair Deputy Mary Le Hegarat, Vice-Chair Deputy Lyndsay Feltham, Member Deputy Montfort Tadier, Member Connétable Marcus Troy, Member
In attendance	<b>Item 2</b> Warrick Horsfall, Senior Manager, Immigration Policy and Compliance, Jersey Customs and Immigration Service Andrew Hunt, Assistant Director, Jersey Customs and Immigration Service  Anna Thorne, Committee and Panel Officer Ben Walker, Research and Project Officer Leila Osman, Communications Officer Katie Bastiman, Communications Officer

Agenda matter	Action
<b>1. Records of Meetings</b>  The Panel approved the record of its meeting held on 23rd February 2023.	
<b>2. Briefing – Jersey Customs and Immigration Service</b>  The Panel welcomed the Assistant Director and the Senior Manager, Immigration Policy and Compliance of the Jersey Customs and Immigration Service for a briefing on the Work Permit Policy and forthcoming changes to the policy.  The record of this meeting was classified as exempt in accordance with articles 26, 35 and 36 of the Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011 (as amended).	
<b>3. Stakeholder correspondence and call for evidence</b>  The Panel acknowledged receipt of responses from stakeholders and requested that Caritas be contacted and invited to make a submission.  The Panel recalled the submission it received from the Jersey Advisory and Conciliation Service and requested that the Officer undertake research with regard to minimum employment notice periods.  The Panel requested that a letter be drafted to the Environmental Health Department in relation to the inspection of properties used as accommodation for work permit holders.	<b>BW/AT</b>  <b>BW</b>  <b>BW/AT</b>

<p><b>4. Jersey Customs and Immigration Service Data</b></p> <p>The Panel noted nationality and industry sector data received from the Jersey Customs and Immigration Service.</p> <p>The Panel discussed the briefing it received on the Work Permit Policy from the Jersey Customs and Immigration Service that day and requested that the Officer undertake research about United Kingdom visa rules and the rules governing the Jersey work permit system.</p>	<p><b>AT</b></p>
<p><b>5. Work Permit Holder Survey</b></p> <p>The Panel received an update from the officer that the draft survey had been reviewed by Statistics Jersey and would be provided to the Panel for its review and approval.</p>	<p><b>BW</b></p>
<p><b>6. Site visits</b></p> <p>The Panel was provided with information about the manner in which site visits could be undertaken and agreed that these would be requested during the course of the review.</p>	
<p><b>7. Future Meetings</b></p> <p>The Panel noted it was due to receive Friends of Africa for a private briefing at 2pm on 9th March 2023 in the Le Capelain Room, States Building.</p> <p>The Panel noted that its next scheduled meeting was due to take place at 2pm on 16th March 2023 in the Le Capelain Room, States Building, and that a number of Members would be unable to attend. The Panel requested that the Officer liaise with the Panel Chair to reschedule the meeting.</p>	<p><b>BW</b></p>

# Work Permit Holder Welfare Review Panel

## Record of Meeting

Date: 15<sup>th</sup> March 2023

Present	Deputy Beatriz Porée, Chair Deputy Mary Le Hegarat, Vice-Chair Deputy Montfort Tadier, Member
Apologies	Connétable Marcus Troy, Member Deputy Lyndsay Feltham, Member
In attendance	Ben Walker, Research and Project Officer Leila Osman, Communications Officer

Agenda matter	Action
<p><b>1. Records of Meetings</b></p> <p>The Panel noted and approved the record of its meeting held on 2nd March 2023.</p>	
<p><b>2. Stakeholder correspondence and call for evidence</b></p> <p>The Panel acknowledged receipt of two anonymous responses to the call for evidence.</p> <p>The Panel requested more information about Jersey's bi-lateral treaty arrangements with other jurisdictions in relation to the Work Permit Policy.</p> <p>The Panel asked for an update on the recruitment of work permit holders by Health and Community Services (HCS). It was advised that the information had been requested from HCS and would be provided to the Panel in due course.</p> <p>The Officer advised that a document tracking submissions would be made available to the Panel.</p> <p>The Panel was provided with an update on social media public engagement with the review.</p>	<p><b>BW</b></p> <p><b>AT</b></p> <p><b>BW</b></p>
<p><b>3. Work Permit Holder Survey</b></p> <p>The Panel noted that an updated version of the draft survey had been circulated by the Officer on 9th March 2023 following feedback provided by Statistics Jersey.</p> <p>The Panel discussed a number of changes and requested that the Officer recirculate an updated version of the draft survey for the Panel's review and approval.</p> <p>The Panel noted draft posters and postcards produced by Digital and Public Engagement to promote the survey and requested changes to the artwork.</p>	<p><b>AT</b></p> <p><b>LO</b></p>
<p><b>4. Site visits</b></p> <p>The Panel was informed that invitations to facilitate site visits to employers of work permit holders had been sent to the Jersey Farmers Union and the Jersey Hospitality Association. It was advised that the Officer would also send a similar invitation to the Jersey Care Commission in due course.</p>	<p><b>BW</b></p>

15.03.2023



<p><b>5. Meeting: Kenyan Jersey Committee</b></p> <p>The Panel noted that a private briefing had been arranged with Kenyan Jersey Committee on the impact of the Work Permit Policy on 23rd March 2023 at 1pm in the Le Capelain Room, States Building.</p>	
<p><b>6. Future Meetings</b></p> <p>The Panel noted that its next scheduled meeting was due to take place at 1pm on 22nd March 2023 in the Le Capelain Room, States Building.</p> <p>The Panel noted that a number of key stakeholders had been earmarked for private briefings with the Panel and requested that the Officer produce a list of private briefings and public hearings for the Panel to review and approve at its next scheduled meeting.</p>	<p><b>BW</b></p>

# Work Permit Holder Welfare Review Panel

## Record of Meeting

Date: 22<sup>nd</sup> March 2023

Present	Deputy Beatriz Porée, Chair Deputy Mary Le Hegarat, Vice-Chair Deputy Montfort Tadier, Member Deputy Lyndsay Feltham, Member
Apologies	Connétable Marcus Troy, Member
In attendance	Anna Thorne, Committee and Panel Officer Ben Walker, Research and Project Officer Leila Osman, Communications Officer

Agenda matter	Action
<p><b>1. Records of Meetings</b></p> <p>The Panel noted and approved the record of its meeting held on 15th March 2023.</p>	
<p><b>2. Call for Evidence</b></p> <p>The Panel noted the summaries and key themes from responses to the Panel's general call for evidence and the submissions, briefings and Public Hearings tracker.</p> <p>The Panel acknowledged receipt of one anonymous response to the call for evidence since its last meeting.</p>	
<p><b>3. Work Permit Holder Survey</b></p> <p>The Panel noted that an updated version of the draft survey had been circulated by the Officer on 9th March 2023 following feedback provided by Statistics Jersey.</p> <p>The Panel discussed a number of changes and requested that the Officer recirculate an updated version of the draft survey for the Panel's review and approval.</p> <p>The Panel noted draft posters and postcards produced by Digital and Public Engagement to promote the survey and requested changes to the artwork.</p>	<p><b>AT</b></p> <p><b>LO</b></p>
<p><b>4. Meeting: Kenyan Jersey Committee</b></p> <p>The Panel noted it was due to receive the Kenyan Jersey Committee for a private meeting at 1pm on 23rd March 2023 in the Le Capelain Room, States Building.</p>	
<p><b>5. Future Meetings</b></p> <p>The Panel noted that its next scheduled meeting was due to take place at 2:30pm on 28th April 2023 in the Le Capelain Room, States Building.</p> <p>The Panel noted a draft list of private briefings and public hearings for the Panel to review and approve. The Panel also noted that offers had been received for the Panel to undertake site visits at various employers in the agricultural and care sectors. The Panel requested that the Officer liaise directly with the Chair of the Panel to agree and arrange private briefings, public hearings and site visits.</p>	<p><b>BW</b></p>

22.03.2023

# Work Permit Holder Welfare Review Panel

## Record of Meeting

Date: 20<sup>th</sup> April 2023

Present	Deputy Beatriz Porée, Chair Deputy Mary Le Hegarat, Vice-Chair Deputy Montfort Tadier, Member Deputy Lyndsay Feltham, Member
Apologies	Connétable Marcus Troy, Member
In attendance	Ahmie Kent, Jersey Filipino Tambayan Group Gracey Hotton, Jersey Filipino Tambayan Group Millie Falles, Jersey Filipino Tambayan Group Dina Rouse, Jersey Filipino Tambayan Group Ian Cardwell, member of the public  Anna Thorne, Committee and Panel Officer Ben Walker, Research and Project Officer

Agenda matter	Action
<p><b>1. Meeting: Jersey Filipino Tambayan Group</b></p> <p>The Panel welcomed Ahmie Kent, Gracey Hotton, Millie Falles and Dina Rouse from the Jersey Filipino Tambayan Group and Ian Cardwell, a member of the public for a private meeting to discuss the impact of the Work Permit Policy on the Filipino work permit holder community in Jersey.</p> <p>This meeting was held in private in accordance with the Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011 (as amended) under Absolute Exemption Article 26 and a private record was taken.</p>	

# Work Permit Holder Welfare Review Panel

## Record of Meeting

Date: 25<sup>th</sup> April 2023

Present	Deputy Beatriz Porée, Chair Deputy Mary Le Hegarat, Vice-Chair ( <b>Item 1 and 2 only</b> ) Deputy Montfort Tadier, Member Deputy Lyndsay Feltham, Member
Apologies	Connétable Marcus Troy, Member
In attendance	<b>Item 1 and 2 only:</b> Peter Le Maistre, President, Jersey Farmers Union Jane Rueb, Executive Secretary, Jersey Farmers Union Nick Mourant, Meleches Farms  <b>Item 3 only:</b> Patricia Rowan, Director, Jersey Advisory and Conciliation Service  Anna Thorne, Committee and Panel Officer Ben Walker, Research and Project Officer

Agenda matter	Action
<p><b>1. Site Visit: Jersey Farmers Union</b></p> <p>The Panel was received by Peter Le Maistre, President and Jane Rueb, Executive Secretary at the offices of the Jersey Farmers Union, to discuss matters related to the Work Permit Policy and the recruitment and employment of work permit holders in the agricultural sector in Jersey.</p> <p>This meeting was held in private in accordance with the Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011 (as amended) under Absolute Exemption Article 26 and a private record was taken.</p>	
<p><b>2. Site Visit: Meleches Farms</b></p> <p>The Panel was received by Nick Mourant during a visit to Meleches Farms, an independent grower of Jersey Royal potatoes, who provided the Panel with an overview of internal recruitment and human resource processes, as well as external audits carried out at Meleches Farms.</p> <p>The Panel then toured the site facilities and was provided with the opportunity to speak to members of staff employed on a work permit and view on-site work permit holder accommodation.</p>	
<p><b>3. Meeting: Jersey Advisory and Conciliation Service (JACS)</b></p> <p>The Panel welcomed the director of JACS who provided information about the work of the organisation, particularly in relation to the advice and support provided to people employed on a work permit. JACS had previously provided a submission to the Panel and answered follow up questions in further correspondence.</p>	

25.04.2023

JACS agreed to supply further information to the Panel in confidence and this meeting was held in private in accordance with the Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011 (as amended) under Absolute Exemption Article 26 and a private record was taken.	
--	--

# Work Permit Holder Welfare Review Panel

## Record of Meeting

Date: 28<sup>th</sup> April 2023

Present	Deputy Beatriz Porée, Chair Deputy Mary Le Hegarat, Vice-Chair Deputy Montfort Tadier, Member Deputy Lyndsay Feltham, Member
Apologies	Connétable Marcus Troy, Member
In attendance	<b>Item 1 only:</b> Lee Madden, Managing Director, GR8 Recruitment Em Holliday, Operations Director Hospitality and Retail, GR8 Recruitment  <b>Item 2 only:</b> Francis Robinson, Senior Representative, Unite the Union Edyta Buard, member of the public  Anna Thorne, Committee and Panel Officer Ben Walker, Research and Project Officer

Agenda matter	Action
<b>1. Meeting: GR8 Recruitment</b>  The Panel welcomed Lee Madden, Managing Director and Em Holliday, Operations Director Hospitality and Retail for GR8 Recruitment, to discuss matters related to the Work Permit Policy and the recruitment and employment of work permit holders in Jersey.  This meeting was held in private in accordance with the Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011 (as amended) under Absolute Exemption Article 26 and a private record was taken.	
<b>2. Meeting: Francis Robinson and Edyta Buard</b>  The Panel welcomed Francis Robinson, a Senior Representative for Unite the Union and Edyta Buard, a member of the public with experience providing community support, to discuss the impact of the Work Permit Policy on the work permit holder community in Jersey.  This meeting was held in private in accordance with the Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011 (as amended) under Absolute Exemption Article 26 and a private record was taken.	

# Work Permit Holder Welfare Review Panel

## Record of Meeting

Date: 5<sup>th</sup> May 2023

Present	Deputy Beatriz Porée, Chair Deputy Mary Le Hegarat, Vice-Chair Deputy Lyndsay Feltham, Member
Apologies	Connétable Marcus Troy, Member Deputy Montfort Tadier, Member
In attendance	Anna Thorne, Committee and Panel Officer Ben Walker, Research and Project Officer Leila Osman, Communications Officer

Agenda matter	Action
<p><b>1. Review call for evidence</b></p> <p>The Panel received an update on the key themes arising from the responses to the Panel's call for evidence and acknowledged receipt of two anonymous responses to the call for evidence.</p> <p>The Panel requested more information about passport stamps in relation to visas issued to work permit holders following a query raised in a submission to the Panel.</p> <p>The Panel was provided with an update on public engagement with the review.</p>	<b>BW</b>
<p><b>2. Stakeholder Correspondence</b></p> <p>The Panel noted receipt of responses to its letters to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Jersey Advisory and Conciliation Service</li> <li>• Minister for Housing and Communities</li> <li>• Minister for Treasury and Resources</li> <li>• Minister for Social Security</li> <li>• Minister for Health and Social Services</li> </ul>	
<p><b>3. Jersey Community Relations Trust (JCRT): Report</b></p> <p>The Panel noted the 2023 JCRT 'Poverty in Jersey' Report and requested that the Officer inform the JCRT that the Panel intended to use the 'Poverty in Jersey' Report as part of the evidence for its review.</p>	<b>BW</b>
<p><b>4. Work Permit Holder Survey</b></p> <p>The Panel noted that a finalised version of the survey circulated to Panel Members was due to launch on 11th May 2023.</p> <p>The Panel was informed that a press notice and social media content would be circulated for the Panel's approval in due course.</p>	<b>BW/AT</b>  <b>LO</b>
<p><b>5. Public Hearing: Jersey Farmers Union</b></p> <p>The Panel noted that it was due to receive Peter Le Maistre and Jane Rueb of the Jersey Farmers Union and Mike Renouard of the Jersey Royal Company for a Public</p>	

05.05.2023

Hearing at 12:30pm on 10 <sup>th</sup> May 2023, and discussed and approved areas of questioning.	
<p><b>6. Public Hearing: Jersey Hospitality Association</b></p> <p>The Panel noted that it was due to receive Ana and Marcus Calvani from the Jersey Hospitality Association for a Public Hearing at 3:30pm on 11th May 2023, and discussed and approved areas of questioning.</p>	
<p><b>7. Future Meetings</b></p> <p>The Panel noted that its next scheduled meeting was due to take place at <b>2pm on 31st May 2023 in the Le Capelain Room, States Building.</b></p>	



# Work Permit Holder Welfare Review Panel

## Record of Meeting

Date: 10<sup>th</sup> May 2023

Present	Deputy Beatriz Porée, Chair Deputy Mary Le Hegarat, Vice-Chair Deputy Lyndsay Feltham, Member
Apologies	Connétable Marcus Troy, Member Deputy Montfort Tadier, Member
In attendance	Peter Le Maistre, President, Jersey Farmers Union Jane Rueb, Executive Secretary, Jersey Farmers Union Mike Renouard, Business Unit Director, Jersey Royal Company  Anna Thorne, Committee and Panel Officer Ben Walker, Research and Project Officer Katie Bastiman, Communications Officer

Agenda matter	Action
<p><b>1. Public Hearing: Jersey Farmers Union</b></p> <p>The Panel received Peter Le Maistre and Jane Rueb of the Jersey Farmers Union and Mike Renouard of the Jersey Royal Company for a Public Hearing at 12:30pm. The hearing was recorded, and webcast live via Public-I and a transcript was produced.</p> <p>Following the Public Hearing, the Panel discussed key topics to include on its social media updates with the Panel Communications Officer.</p>	

# Work Permit Holder Welfare Review Panel

## Record of Meeting

Date: 11<sup>th</sup> May 2023

Present	Deputy Beatriz Porée, Chair Deputy Mary Le Hegarat, Vice-Chair Deputy Lyndsay Feltham, Member
Apologies	Connétable Marcus Troy, Member Deputy Montfort Tadier, Member
In attendance	Ana Calvani, Co-Chief Executive Officer, Jersey Hospitality Association Marcus Calvani, Co-Chief Executive Officer, Jersey Hospitality Association  Anna Thorne, Committee and Panel Officer Ben Walker, Research and Project Officer Katie Bastiman, Communications Officer

Agenda matter	Action
<p><b>1. Public Hearing: Jersey Hospitality Association</b></p> <p>The Panel received Ana and Marcus Calvani of the Jersey Hospitality Association for a Public Hearing at 3:30pm. The hearing was recorded, and webcast live via Public-I and a transcript was produced.</p> <p>Following the Public Hearing, the Panel discussed key topics to include on its social media updates with the Panel Communications Officer.</p>	

# Work Permit Holder Welfare Review Panel

## Record of Meeting

Date: 24<sup>th</sup> May 2023

Present	Deputy Beatriz Porée, Chair Deputy Mary Le Hegarat, Vice-Chair Deputy Montfort Tadier, Member Deputy Lyndsay Feltham, Member Connétable Marcus Troy, Member
Apologies	
In attendance	Cheryl Kenealy, Owner and Director, 1-2-1 Care Ben Walker, Research and Project Officer

Agenda matter	Action
<p><b>1. Meeting: 1-2-1 Care</b></p> <p>The Panel welcomed Cheryl Kenealy, Owner and Director of 1-2-1 Care, to discuss matters related to the Work Permit Policy and the recruitment and employment of work permit holders in Jersey.</p> <p>This meeting was held in private in accordance with the Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011 (as amended) under Absolute Exemption Article 26 and a private record was taken.</p>	

# Work Permit Holder Welfare Review Panel

## Record of Meeting

Date: 30<sup>th</sup> May 2023

Present	Deputy Beatriz Porée, Chair Deputy Lyndsay Feltham, Member Deputy Montfort Tadier, Member
Apologies	Deputy Mary Le Hegarat, Vice-Chair Connétable Marcus Troy, Member
In attendance	<b>Item 1 only:</b> Washington Gwatidzo, Friends of Africa Laina Penttila, Friends of Africa Lesley Katsande, Friends of Africa Arthur Kembo, Friends of Africa  <b>Item 2 only:</b> Joshua Muchiri, Kenyan Jersey Committee Maggie Turner, Kenyan Jersey Committee Anthony Nyatta, Kenyan Jersey Committee Mick Robbins, Kenyan Jersey Committee  Anna Thorne, Committee and Panel Officer Ben Walker, Research and Project Officer Katie Bastiman, Communications Officer

Agenda matter	Action
<b>1. Public Hearing: Friends of Africa</b>  The Panel received Washington Gwatidzo, Laina Penttila, Lesley Katsande and Arthur Kembo of Friends of Africa for a Public Hearing at 2pm. The hearing was recorded, and webcast live via Public-I and a transcript was produced.  Following the Public Hearing, the Panel discussed key topics to include on its social media updates with the Panel Communications Officer.	
<b>2. Public Hearing: Kenyan Jersey Committee</b>  The Panel received Joshua Muchiri, Maggie Turner, Anthony Nyatta and Mick Robbins of the Kenyan Jersey Committee for a Public Hearing at 3:30pm. The hearing was recorded, and webcast live via Public-I and a transcript was produced.  Following the Public Hearing, the Panel discussed key topics to include on its social media updates with the Panel Communications Officer.	

# Work Permit Holder Welfare Review Panel

## Record of Meeting

Date: 31<sup>st</sup> May 2023

Present	Deputy Beatriz Porée, Chair Deputy Mary Le Hegarat, Vice-Chair Deputy Lyndsay Feltham, Member Connétable Marcus Troy, Member
Apologies	Deputy Montfort Tadier, Member
In attendance	Anna Thorne, Committee and Panel Officer Ben Walker, Research and Project Officer Leila Osman, Communications Officer

Agenda matter	Action
<p><b>1. Records of Meetings</b></p> <p>The Panel noted and approved the record of the meeting held on 22nd March 2023.</p>	
<p><b>2. Stakeholder correspondence: Letter to the Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture</b></p> <p>The Panel noted and approved a draft letter to the Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture, in relation to the support provided to work permit holders on-Island and the economic contribution of work permit holders.</p> <p>The Panel requested that the draft letter be amended to include a question about the treaties and Memorandum of Understanding's that have been developed between Jersey and other jurisdictions in relation to work permit holders.</p>	<b>AT</b>
<p><b>3. Ministerial correspondence: Residents and Non-Residents Charging Policy: Amendment</b></p> <p>The Panel noted and discussed the Residents and Non-Residents Charging Policy for Health and Community Services, which had been amended by the Minister for Health and Social Services in August 2022.</p>	
<p><b>4. Memorandum of Understanding (MoU): Jersey and Antigua and Barbuda</b></p> <p>The Panel noted and discussed the MoU between the Government of Jersey and Antigua and Barbuda.</p>	
<p><b>5. Passport Stamps/Vignettes</b></p> <p>The Panel noted sample passport stamps and vignettes provided by the Jersey Customs and Immigration Service.</p> <p>The Panel noted and approved a draft letter to the Minister for Justice and Home Affairs regarding the cost of implementing a 'visa vignette' for passports and travel documentation.</p>	<b>BW</b>
<p><b>6. l'Écume II Incident</b></p>	

<p>The Panel recalled its email correspondence in May 2022 regarding the l'Ecume II incident, and agreed to postpone further actions until the investigation of the incident was concluded.</p>	
<p><b>7. Work Permit Holder Survey</b></p> <p>The Panel noted that the Work Permit Holder Survey had received 140 responses in English, 15 responses in Tagalog, two responses in Romanian, three responses in Portuguese, five responses in Polish and two responses in Swahili as of 24th May 2023.</p> <p>The Panel noted and discussed the comments made by the Jersey Customs and Immigration Service in relation to the Work Permit Holder Survey.</p>	
<p><b>8. Public Hearing: Minister for Justice and Home Affairs</b></p> <p>The Panel noted it was due to receive the Minister for Justice and Home Affairs and Government Officers from the Jersey Customs and Immigration Service for a Public Hearing at 3:30pm on Wednesday 7th June 2023.</p> <p>The Panel noted and approved areas of questioning.</p>	<b>BW</b>
<p><b>9. Future Meetings</b></p> <p>The Panel noted that its next scheduled meeting was due to take place at 2:30pm on Friday 9th June in the Le Capelain Room, States Building.</p>	

# Work Permit Holder Welfare Review Panel

## Record of Meeting

Date: 7<sup>th</sup> June 2023

Present	Deputy Beatriz Porée, Chair Deputy Lyndsay Feltham, Member Deputy Montfort Tadier, Member
Apologies	Deputy Mary Le Hegarat, Vice-Chair Connétable Marcus Troy, Member
In attendance	Deputy Helen Miles, Minister for Home Affairs Mark Cockerham, Head, Jersey Customs and Immigration Service Andrew Allen, Senior Manager, Jersey Customs and Immigration Service  Anna Thorne, Committee and Panel Officer Ben Walker, Research and Project Officer Katie Bastiman, Communications Officer

Agenda matter	Action
<p><b>1. Public Hearing: Minister for Home Affairs</b></p> <p>The Panel received Deputy Helen Miles, Minister for Home Affairs, Mark Cockerham and Andrew Allen, Head and Senior Manager of the Jersey Customs and Immigration Service respectively, for a Public Hearing at 3:30pm. The hearing was recorded, and webcast live via Public-I and a transcript was produced.</p> <p>Following the Public Hearing, the Panel discussed key topics to include on its social media updates with the Panel Communications Officer.</p>	

# Work Permit Holder Welfare Review Panel

## Record of Meeting

Date: 9<sup>th</sup> June 2023

Present	Deputy Beatriz Porée, Chair Deputy Mary Le Hegarat, Vice-Chair Deputy Lyndsay Feltham, Member Connétable Marcus Troy, Member
Apologies	Deputy Montfort Tadier, Member
In attendance	Anna Thorne, Committee and Panel Officer Ben Walker, Research and Project Officer Leila Osman, Communications Officer

Agenda matter	Action
<p><b>1. Records of Meetings</b></p> <p>The Panel requested that the records of the meetings held on 5<sup>th</sup>, 10<sup>th</sup>, 11<sup>th</sup>, 30<sup>th</sup> and 31<sup>st</sup> May 2023 be added for approval at the next scheduled Panel meeting on Thursday 22<sup>nd</sup> June 2023.</p>	<b>BW</b>
<p><b>2. Stakeholder engagement</b></p> <p>The Panel noted that the Work Permit Holder Survey ('Survey') was due to conclude on Monday 12<sup>th</sup> June 2023, and requested that the Officer extend the deadline for responses by one week.</p> <p>The Panel noted the submission provided by the Jersey Chamber of Commerce on 24<sup>th</sup> May 2023, and discussed issues raised in the submission that related to the Work Permit Policy.</p> <p>The Panel noted and approved draft correspondence to Liberate Jersey and the Salvation Army.</p>	<b>BW/LO</b>
<p><b>3. Report: Key Themes and Draft Heads of Report</b></p> <p>The Panel noted and discussed the key themes from its review of work permit holder welfare and, subject to changes and additions, approved the draft heads of report.</p>	<b>BW</b>
<p><b>4. Briefings: Minister's for Treasury and Resources and Social Security</b></p> <p>The Panel noted that further information was required to inform its review on matters related to Income Tax, Social Security contributions and access to benefits and Government Services.</p> <p>The Panel agreed to receive the Ministers for Treasury and Resources and Social Security for a private joint meeting, and noted and discussed the proposed areas of questioning. The Panel requested that the Officer schedule a joint meeting with both Ministers and their Officers.</p>	<b>BW</b>



<p><b>5. Meeting: Caritas Jersey</b></p> <p>The Panel noted it had received an offer from the Chief Executive Officer of Caritas Jersey, to meet with the Panel to discuss its review. The Panel requested that the Officer schedule a meeting with Caritas Jersey.</p>	<p><b>BW</b></p>
<p><b>6. Meeting: Jersey Women’s Refuge</b></p> <p>The Panel noted that the private meeting with the Jersey Women’s Refuge scheduled to take place on Friday 9<sup>th</sup> June, had been rescheduled to take place on Friday 23<sup>rd</sup> June at 3:30pm.</p>	
<p><b>7. Meeting: Cambrette Care</b></p> <p>The Panel noted that it was due to receive Cambrette Care for a private meeting on 13<sup>th</sup> June 2023 at 1pm.</p>	
<p><b>8. Future Meetings</b></p> <p>The Panel noted that its next scheduled meeting was due to take place at 2pm on Thursday 22<sup>nd</sup> June 2023, in the Le Capelain Room, States Building.</p>	

# Work Permit Holder Welfare Review Panel

## Record of Meeting

Date: 13<sup>th</sup> June 2023

Present	Deputy Beatriz Porée, Chair Deputy Montfort Tadier, Member Deputy Lyndsay Feltham, Member.
Apologies	Deputy Mary Le Hegarat, Vice-Chair Connétable Marcus Troy, Member
In attendance	Beth Gicquel, Director, Cambrette Care  Ben Walker, Research and Project Officer

Agenda matter	Action
<p><b>1. Meeting: Cambrette Care</b></p> <p>The Panel welcomed Beth Giquel, Director of Cambrette Care, to discuss matters related to the Work Permit Policy and the recruitment and employment of work permit holders in Jersey.</p> <p>This meeting was held in private in accordance with the Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011 (as amended) under Absolute Exemption Article 26 and a private record was taken.</p>	

# Work Permit Holder Welfare Review Panel

## Record of Meeting

Date: 3<sup>rd</sup> July 2023

Present	Deputy Beatriz Porée, Chair Deputy Mary Le Hegarat, Vice-Chair Deputy Lyndsay Feltham, Member Connétable Marcus Troy, Member
Apologies	Deputy Montfort Tadier, Member
In attendance	Patrick Lynch, Chief Executive Officer, Caritas Jersey Richard Nunn, Officer responsible for church and community work, Salvation Army Vic Tanner Davy, Chief Executive Officer, Liberate Jersey  Ben Walker, Research and Project Officer

Agenda matter	Action
<p><b>1. Meeting: Caritas Jersey, Liberate Jersey and the Salvation Army</b></p> <p>The Panel welcomed Patrick Lynch, Chief Executive Officer for Caritas Jersey, Richard Nunn, Officer responsible for church and community work for the Salvation Army and Vic Tanner Davy, Chief Executive Officer for Liberate Jersey, to discuss the impact of the Work Permit Policy on the work permit holder community in Jersey.</p> <p>This meeting was held in private in accordance with the Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011 (as amended) under Absolute Exemption Article 26 and a private record was taken.</p>	

# Work Permit Holder Welfare Review Panel

## Record of Meeting

Date: 7<sup>th</sup> July 2023

Present	Deputy Beatriz Porée, Chair Deputy Mary Le Hegarat, Vice-Chair Deputy Montfort Tadier, Member Deputy Lyndsay Feltham, Member Connétable Marcus Troy, Member
Apologies	
In attendance	Deputy Ian Gorst, Minister for Treasury and Resources Deputy Elaine Millar, Minister for Social Security Deputy Malcolm Ferey, Assistant Minister for Social Security Connétable Richard Vibert, Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources Deputy Steve Ahier, Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources Richard Summersgill, Comptroller of Revenue, Treasury and Exchequer Dominic Murphy, Assistant Comptroller of Revenue, Treasury and Exchequer Sue Duhamel, Director, Strategic Policy, Planning and Performance Cath Mearman, Head of Service & Business Hub, Customer and Local Services Abbie Moore, Private Secretary, Minister for Treasury and Resources  Ben Walker, Research and Project Officer

Agenda matter	Action
<p><b>1. Meeting: Ministers for Treasury and Resources and Social Security</b></p> <p>The Panel welcomed the Ministers for Treasury and Resources and Social Security and Government Officers, to discuss the impact of the Jersey Income Tax and Social Security systems on work permit holders in Jersey.</p> <p>This meeting was held in private in accordance with the Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011 (as amended) under Absolute Exemption Article 26 and a private record was taken.</p>	

# Work Permit Holder Welfare Review Panel

## Record of Meeting

Date: 14<sup>th</sup> July 2023

Present	Deputy Mary Le Hegarat, Vice-Chair Deputy Lyndsay Feltham, Member Connétable Marcus Troy, Member Deputy Montfort Tadier, Member
Apologies	Deputy Beatriz Porée, Chair
In attendance	Ben Walker, Research and Project Officer

Agenda matter	Action
<b>1. Work Permit Holder Survey: Results and Key Themes</b>  The Panel received an update from the Officer on the analysis of the Work Permit Holder Survey ('Survey') results.  The Panel noted and discussed the results and key themes from the survey and requested changes to the presentation of some of the results in the analysis.	<b>BW</b>
<b>2. Review Work Plan/evidence gathering</b>  The Panel noted and discussed the evidence it received from key stakeholders, submissions and the Work Permit Holder Survey and agreed to close the evidence gathering stage of the review, and to produce a draft report.  The Officer informed the Panel that a draft report would be produced for consideration and approval by the Panel in due course.	<b>BW/AT</b>
<b>3. Briefings: Ministers for Treasury and Resources and Social Security</b>  The Panel noted the joint private meeting held with the Ministers for Treasury and Resources and Social Security and Government Officers on Friday 7 <sup>th</sup> July 2023, and requested that the Officer draft follow-up correspondence to both Ministers for the Panel to consider and approve.	<b>BW</b>
<b>4. Panel Meeting Schedule</b>  The Panel noted that its meeting schedule had been updated with placeholder meetings on 3 <sup>rd</sup> and 24 <sup>th</sup> August 2023. The Panel requested that the meeting on the 3 <sup>rd</sup> August be moved to ensure Panel Members' availability.	<b>BW</b>
<b>5. Future Meetings</b>  The Panel noted that its next scheduled meeting was due to take place at 2pm on Thursday 24 <sup>th</sup> August 2023, in the Le Capelain Room, States Building.	

# Work Permit Holder Welfare Review Panel

## Record of Meeting

Date: 24th November 2023

Present	Deputy Beatriz Porée, Chair Deputy Mary Le Hegarat, Vice Chair Deputy Lyndsay Feltham Deputy Montfort Tadier
Apologies	Connétable Marcus Troy
In attendance	Ben Walker, Research and Project Officer Joseph Brannigan, Research and Project Officer

Agenda matter	Action
<p><b>1. Work Permit Holder Welfare Review: Post Review Evaluation</b></p> <p>The Panel noted that the Ministerial Response to the Panel's Work Permit Holder Welfare Review Report was due to be received on 23rd November 2023. The Officer informed the Panel that this had not been received and that a follow-up request for the Ministerial Response was sent earlier that day.</p> <p>As part of its Review Evaluation Process the Panel discussed and reflected on its review of Work Permit Holder Welfare.</p> <p>The Panel recalled that it held both private and public meetings with key stakeholders during its review. The Panel noted that private meetings had sometimes resulted in duplication of the evidence later gathered during Public Hearings, and that less evidence had been received through Public Hearings, compared with private meetings.</p> <p>The Panel also noted some challenges regarding the use of stakeholder evidence following private meetings, and how this process was communicated to stakeholders. The Panel further noted that some stakeholders had expressed disappointment that the evidence provided in private meetings, had not been used in the Panel's report.</p> <p>The Panel reflected on the emotive nature of the review and agreed that additional support for States Members dealing with challenging constituent issues should be considered as part of future reviews, to include signposting for agencies that could offer support to States Members and their constituents.</p> <p>The Panel discussed the expectations of stakeholders and the public about the scope and impact of the review. The Panel noted that some stakeholders and members of the public felt that the Panel's review would result in a significant turning point in the treatment of work permit holders in Jersey. The Panel agreed that the management of stakeholder and public expectations about the outcomes of future scrutiny reviews should be considered.</p>	

The Panel then discussed States Member engagement with the review and how this could be measured. The Panel agreed that a form of polling or a survey could be used to collect feedback about how the Panel's report had been received. The Panel also discussed limitations with the profile of its report and agreed that consideration should be provided to improve the reach of future published scrutiny reports.

The Panel agreed to consider the Ministerial Response, once received, in order to discuss any areas of follow up or actions. The Officer was asked to arrange a further meeting for the Panel in this regard.

**BW**

# Work Permit Holder Welfare Review Panel

## Record of Meeting

Date: 7<sup>th</sup> December 2023

Present	Deputy Beatriz Porée, Chair Deputy Mary Le Hegarat, Vice-Chair Deputy Lyndsay Feltham, Member Deputy Montfort Tadier, Member
Apologies	Connétable Marcus Troy, Member
In attendance	Ben Walker, Research and Project Officer Joseph Brannigan, Research and Project Officer

Agenda matter	Action
<p><b>1. Review of Work Permit Holder Welfare: Ministerial Response</b></p> <p>The Panel noted that it had received the Ministerial Response to its Review of Work Permit Holder Welfare on 24<sup>th</sup> of November.</p> <p>The Officer informed the Panel that 10 of the Panel's recommendations had been rejected, five recommendations had been accepted but marked as completed, five recommendations had been partially accepted and five recommendations had been accepted. The Officer also informed the Panel that four partially accepted recommendations and two accepted recommendations had been provided without target dates for completion or action.</p> <p>The Officer further informed the Panel that an analysis of the recommendations marked as rejected, and accepted but completed, was in progress which would be shared with the Panel in due course.</p> <p>The Panel expressed disappointment with a number of matters contained in the Ministerial Response including:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• The number of rejected recommendations.</li><li>• The absence of target dates for completion or action of some partially accepted and accepted recommendations.</li><li>• Consideration given to the evidence gathered by the Panel.</li><li>• The evidence used to support the Ministerial Response and the general tone of the Ministerial Response.</li></ul> <p>The Panel discussed areas of follow up and actions that could be taken and agreed that correspondence should first be sent to the Minister for Home Affairs. The Panel requested that the Officer draft correspondence to the Minister for Home Affairs for the Panel to consider and approve.</p>	<p><b>BW</b></p> <p><b>BW</b></p>