



Economic and International Affairs Scrutiny Panel

Acceptance of Cash Payment Review

Witness: Jersey Cl.Cash is King

Wednesday, 18th September 2024

Panel:

Deputy M. Tadier of St. Brelade (Chair)

Deputy G.P. Southern of St. Helier Central (Vice-Chair)

Deputy M.B. Andrews of St. Helier North

Deputy K.M. Wilson of St. Clement

Witness:

Ms. N. Morgan, Founder, Jersey Cl.Cash is King

[14:31]

Deputy M. Tadier of St. Brelade (Chair):

Welcome to this hearing for the Economic and International Affairs Scrutiny Panel. I want to say welcome to any members of the public listening as well. This is a hybrid session. We have got Deputy Andrews joining us online, although I should really let him introduce himself. I will start by introducing the panel, and then if I can pass over to you, please, and let you introduce yourself, that would be great. I am Deputy Montfort Tadier. I am the chair of this panel. Max, just for the record.

Deputy M.B. Andrews of St. Helier North:

Deputy Max Andrews, panel member.

Deputy G.P. Southern of St. Helier Central (Vice-Chair):

Geoff Southern, panel member.

Deputy K.M. Wilson of St. Clement:

Deputy Karen Wilson.

Deputy M. Tadier:

Thank you, and you are?

Founder, Jersey Cl.Cash is King:

I am Nina Morgan. The founder of the Facebook page called Cl.Cash is King.

Deputy M. Tadier:

Nina, thank you for coming in today. First of all, also thank you for your written submission, which we have read, and I know it contained a lot of useful considerations. So we will be speaking to those a little bit today as well. Again, just for those listening, this is a review we are doing into the use of cash and how people pay for things in Jersey and that wider context. It might be valuable for us and the public listening if you could briefly outline the background to the Facebook group that you have set up, Jersey Cl.Cash is King, and tell us a little bit about that, please.

Founder, Jersey Cl.Cash is King:

As far as the reasons, there used to be a lot of mentions about businesses on various Facebook pages, that people could not pay with cash, essentially. In one of them, a gentleman said that: "Would it not be nice that if somebody put all these places in one place", so I answered that call. Sadly, at the moment, there are over 50 businesses locally who do not accept cash at all and it is not a very good place where we have limited supply and access to goods and services as it is.

Deputy M. Tadier:

Okay, just for the record, how many members roughly are there in the Facebook group?

Founder, Jersey Cl.Cash is King:

I think it is around 4,500 maybe, yes.

Deputy M. Tadier:

Thank you. You have talked about some of the businesses, those 50 businesses that you have identified as a group, do they fall into any particular categories predominantly or ...?

Founder, Jersey Cl.Cash is King:

Mostly cafés.

Deputy M. Tadier:

Cafés.

Founder, Jersey Cl.Cash is King:

Cafés, restaurants. There are some public service places like Water you should be able to access. Some surgeries even do not or they specifically request you to have precise amount of cash, so they do not carry any floats at all.

Deputy M. Tadier:

Doctors' surgeries, do you mean?

Founder, Jersey Cl.Cash is King:

Yes. I know at least one of the medical cannabis places do not accept cash so how does a person who is on low income access that if they do not have a bank account is beyond me, to be honest.

Deputy M. Tadier:

We will of course talk more about that. So you identify in your submission that you would support any proposition to protect and enshrine the use of cash in Jersey, is that correct?

Founder, Jersey Cl.Cash is King:

I would, yes.

Deputy M. Tadier:

The panel has received a number of submissions to that effect really, certainly public submissions at least, so there have been many who have identified choice as a key factor. What are your views on the choice, firstly of individuals to make a choice of either using cash or not cash and then on the other hand of businesses to be able to choose how they operate? Where does the balance lie in that?

Founder, Jersey Cl.Cash is King:

Yes, is it a difficult one, is it not? My personal view on that is that there is a section of society who simply do not have access to bank accounts or cannot operate cards or other electrical devices. People with certain mental health issues, learning difficulties, et cetera. It is a discrimination and they are completely shut out from those services and places. We have Disability Discrimination Act in Jersey so whether there is a choice or not there is a legislation that should, in theory, at least so give us equal access. Whether there is actually room for choice.

Deputy G.P. Southern:

In your head you are making the act of refusing somebody an act of discrimination?

Founder, Jersey Cl.Cash is King:

Absolutely.

Deputy M. Tadier:

Is that something you think would either fall into the discrimination law or do you think it is something that could be legislated for separately in terms of one ...

Founder, Jersey Cl.Cash is King:

Either, possibly. It might be already covered by the discrimination law legislation as it is. It all depends how it is viewed, whether it is counted as providing access or not.

Deputy M. Tadier:

In terms of the balance of harm between ... if legislation with or some kind of compulsion or protection about the use of cash were to be enacted, in terms of the balance of harm between not doing that and the harm that would have on individual members of the public versus doing it and the harm that would be ... or inconvenience to businesses, where do you think the balance lies in that?

Founder, Jersey Cl.Cash is King:

Personally I think it is a no contest to be honest. There is a cost for doing the business, whether that cost is paying for an extra 10 minutes for somebody doing the float and the banking and the minimal fee per £100 that banks usually take if they receive cash payments from businesses. The right access to have entire society be able to access goods and services no matter what they are outweighs the inconvenience. Because that is all it is; it is simply an inconvenience.

Deputy M. Tadier:

What do you think the logical conclusion would be if Government chose to do nothing?

Founder, Jersey Cl.Cash is King:

I think there will be more and more cashless because it is inconvenient for some businesses who have less cash customers. That would mean that there will be less and less businesses or services that we can access with cash. There will be a shrinking and that would lead into basically having a subcategory of population completely cut out of certain things. That is not something we should be allowing to happen at all.

Deputy M. Tadier:

Thank you. This will be my last question for now before I pass on to Max. There has been limited appetite from the in-person submissions ... sorry, I will start that again. The people who have come to speak to us as a panel, like you are doing today, all of them have been reluctant to suggest that

Government should have any form of intervention, even the ones who are perhaps pro-choice in the matter, shall we say, or pro-cash in a loose sense. Some of them have suggested that there might, though, be certain products and services where they would accept intervention. If, for example, you were not necessarily able to secure a blanket acceptance of cash across the board, are there particular services and products which you think nobody should be refused?

Founder, Jersey Cl.Cash is King:

Any public facing. Any public facing, that is where I would say.

Deputy M. Tadier:

Anything to do with healthcare, for example, or ...?

Founder, Jersey Cl.Cash is King:

Well, government services should be also. Speaking of the Government, I believe some departments, if not all, have a limit of £1,000 cash payment. Why is that? Why is there a limit? Because, for example, applying for citizenship would take you over the threshold. How do you pay that then if you do not have a bank account? Simple things like that.

Deputy M. Tadier:

Yes. Thank you. Max, can I pass over to you?

Deputy M.B. Andrews:

Indeed, Chair. Thank you for coming in today and before the panel. I just want to start off by asking you a question about any of your followers on Facebook. Have they raised concerns about some of the services they have access to that the Government are delivering where they have only been able to pay electronically and there has been no option to be making payment via cash?

Founder, Jersey Cl.Cash is King:

I must admit straight off that I do not read absolutely every single post in that Facebook group. I do try and keep a track on everything, but it is impossible. What springs to mind is instances of carers taking the person they are caring for, say, swimming or sports facility, and not then able to actually attend, which is not very good at all. To be honest, I cannot think of any other from the top of my head. But there have been a couple of cases of those, and they have been reported in papers as well, I think.

Deputy M.B. Andrews:

Obviously, the panel have raised concerns about consumers going to make payments, and then they only realise when they are about to make a payment that the business is not accepting cash.

Can you just inform us as a panel about your experiences, having spoken to people who follow your Facebook page, who have told you about their stories in relation to that matter?

Founder, Jersey Cl.Cash is King:

Very often the experience seems to be that they go into a shop or whatever business, collect their goods that they want to purchase, go to the till, and there is a tiny little sign that says “cashless”. You have all your shopping left in your hands, and they are just going to have to leave it there. So they have wasted God only knows how much time in that shop wanting to give their business just to be turned away. If there is a sign, it should be highly visible right at the door. You cannot miss it, but it is never there. It is by the till and it is usually rather small.

Deputy M.B. Andrews:

Obviously you have mentioned already your preference for all businesses to be accepting cash. However, do you think that potentially one of the recommendations for the panel could be to compel all businesses who have gone cashless to ensure that there is signage or notice given to their clients about the options that they have available when making payment?

Founder, Jersey Cl.Cash is King:

Yes. Very often, we already have that practice as in businesses at least used to have a little advert of which cards they take, just by the entrance door usually. There should be a sign if they do not take cash visually displayed as that.

Deputy M.B. Andrews:

The panel notes yesterday in its public hearing with the Minister for Sustainable Economic Development, that cash in circulation has decreased in the last few years. Are you concerned that we are heading towards a cashless society? If so, how soon do you think that potentially could be?

Founder, Jersey Cl.Cash is King:

I think at the moment, the numbers and figures are being slightly twisted because of the pandemic. Yes, I will count it in those where everybody was pushing for card payments. Cash is returning. To be honest, as a Government, I think we should be promoting cash use because it is an income stream for the Government as well.

[14:45]

If it is just down to the powers that be, and I am not talking about local level government now, I am talking the big boys, there is a push towards cashless. However, I do not really see that happening because most of Europe is very protective of cash. So it is going to be very difficult. There might

be a few countries like the U.K. (United Kingdom) and perhaps Jersey that might turn cashless, I would say even within the next 10 years, if we do not push back. That is basically it.

Deputy M.B. Andrews:

Just one last question from me. This seems to be, again, a generational issue, especially for the ageing population. Can you maybe just tell us about some of the concerns that have been raised with you, especially for older citizens who have tried to access services and they have maybe not been able to access, but potentially crucial services to them due to the fact that they have only been able to make card payment?

Founder, Jersey Cl.Cash is King:

Yes, although I would suggest that just an issue for the elderly population is a bit of a strawman because ... especially now that finances are getting tough, it is younger and younger people who are having to rely on just the cash-in-hand system. Access for services, especially now that the banks are closing their branches outside town, is having an impact and is having a massive impact. Not many people like online banking. Not everybody does have a computer or mobile. I have an online banking, I never use it, I do not like it. If I want banking, I go to the shop and I cannot ... I do not count myself into the elderly population just yet. I saw a suggestion from - I cannot remember now who it was - of banking hubs creation and that would be ... I think they are in the U.K. already and they are run by post offices in the U.K. That would be ideal because I understand that there are less people going into the bank, so it might not be financially viable for a single bank to have their branches away, but there could quite easily be a hub scattered around the Island, which would allow people to go and do their banking when they need.

Deputy M.B. Andrews:

Okay, thank you very much.

Deputy K.M. Wilson:

Thank you, Nina. I am going to just ask you some questions now. I just wanted to ask, as a consumer, do you believe the focus of past governmental involvement to have been on business or banks in promoting specific payment methods? Or do you think, indeed, it is up to the consumer?

Founder, Jersey Cl.Cash is King:

A bit of both.

Deputy K.M. Wilson:

Okay. Can you tell me a little bit about your views on the difference?

Founder, Jersey Cl.Cash is King:

I think, as far as a governmental approach, having one type of revenue stream and tracking and for taxing, I can understand that it is easier if everything was electronic. So you have your tax fraud, you have your money laundering, et cetera. So it is easier to catch. I understand that and it makes sense. But not everything needs to be easy and simple. We have been able to deal with these things for decades and decades without having to go completely simple. From a consumer, is it nice and easy and simple to just tap that card? Yes, it is. But do you actually know how much is going out on each of those taps that I cannot keep a track on them? What I have in my pocket, however, I know exactly what is in there. I know how much I am putting out. One is convenient to one and other type is convenient to another. A lot of us are a bit of both.

Deputy K.M. Wilson:

Okay, thank you very much. Some of those making submissions have identified the need for consideration of digital inclusion. Are there any actions you believe could be undertaken to enable Islanders to adopt digital payments should they choose to do so?

Founder, Jersey Cl.Cash is King:

Well, as a core, where I live, we do not even have mobile coverage in our house. That would be the first. Not everybody has a phone or computer or tablet or whatever. Not everybody wants them. They are very expensive little devices and unless we are going to hand out every single person a free contract and a free machine, whatever that machine happens to be, it is not going to happen.

Deputy K.M. Wilson:

What about, for example, the £100 payment that was given to each individual during COVID? Do you have any views on those kinds of actions that would actually encourage people to use digital payments at all?

Founder, Jersey Cl.Cash is King:

I am assuming you are referring ... there was another witness who suggested some kind of a card system. That would still require a bank account. A lot of these people who cannot have a bank account, how do you go by that? A lot of people do not understand just numbers. They need to be able to see. For some, I think a prepaid card, I suppose you could call them, might work. For some, it would just not make any sense at all.

Deputy K.M. Wilson:

All right, thank you.

Founder, Jersey Cl.Cash is King:

Sorry.

Deputy K.M. Wilson:

That is okay. Thank you.

Deputy M. Tadier:

Okay, Geoff, can we pass to you?

Deputy G.P. Southern:

It seems to me that what you are saying is there may well be a cost in including cash. The question might be where does that cost come? Does it fall on the members of the public to make sure that they have got the right electronic gizmo or does the cost fall on the banks who are suggesting that dealing with cash is more expensive for them?

Founder, Jersey Cl.Cash is King:

If we were to move totally cashless and we would have to find a way to ensure that every single individual would have access, then the cost of that kind of action would have to fall on the Government and the taxpayer. It cannot be dictated that, say, me as a government body would say to you: "You have to go and spend X, Y, and Z to buy this device or you cannot interact with the rest of the society." That is not feasible, I do not think, in any ... unless you are in China, which I think they are actually doing this, but that is a different kettle of fish completely.

Deputy G.P. Southern:

News to me that the Chinese are ahead on this one. It would not surprise me perhaps.

Founder, Jersey Cl.Cash is King:

Or behind.

Deputy G.P. Southern:

One of the systems that we do see is a so-called cashback system. So you used to be able to go pay for your goods and then: "Would you like some cash, Sir?", "Yes, indeed" or no. Is that something that is worth exploring?

Founder, Jersey Cl.Cash is King:

Cashback? I use cashback all the time, or used to, because where I live the closest A.T.M. (automatic teller machine) is about a half an hour walk away from me, so I used to get cashback from my shop in order to pay with card and get cashback so I can spend cash in the other small shops in the village who prefer cash, but that has been taken away now. I do not know why

Morrisons said 3, 4 months ago that it will only take 6 months to return the cashback, never to be seen again currently.

Deputy G.P. Southern:

When push comes to shove is it not just a question of who is going to pay for any changes? Have you any thoughts about how or in what form services might be paid for?

Founder, Jersey CI.Cash is King:

You are referring to cashbacks?

Deputy G.P. Southern:

Or beyond ... or wider.

Founder, Jersey CI.Cash is King:

The cash is already in circulation, it does not have an actual cost. Where the cost lies is the third-party activities. There was a very interesting paper I came across, it is not in my submission; so apologies for that. It is titled *Cash as Public Infrastructure* by Ursula Darlinghaus, PhD, Institute for Money, Technology and Financial Inclusion, which is about 90 pages long so I did not print that out, I am afraid. However, it is at the end, 3 last pages.

Deputy M. Tadier:

We can certainly review that as an additional written submission. We would be interested in that. You can talk to us about that quickly, if you like, giving us a summary.

Founder, Jersey CI.Cash is King:

Because it touches what you said where the cost lies, and it is quite well covered that the cash itself not only is a revenue for the Government because you order the mint and the printing which ... and then you sell that cash to the banking institutions and private individuals with a mark-up. So it would actually make sense to promote more cash use and have it more on the ... just to bolster the public purse, if I may so. The cost is already being paid on cash and it retains its value no matter what it is; it is always the same value. Where the cost comes is from how long it takes somebody to do the tills, do the cashing up, walk to the bank, drop it in. But those kind of things are usually already budgeted in workforce costs. So whether they are ... I do not think they are additional costs at all because they already exist. Whereas using cards usually take a percentage of the sale plus a connection fee and, depending on the bank, there might be others. Then there is the rental of the machines, there is the paper, sometimes ... some of them still use ink so there is an ink and there is no guarantee that you are connected. They go down all the time. I see one or 2 posts a week on

my page saying: "Oh, the cash machines are down in that place or that place" and it can be the entire, say, Sandpiper system goes down. What happens then if we do not have cash as a fallback?

Deputy K.M. Wilson:

It is very interesting because one of the submissions that we have had is that cash actually costs more, so we have never heard it explained in that way before. What would you argue would then be the variable cost associated with using cash as the method of payment?

Founder, Jersey CI.Cash is King:

As a variable cost?

Deputy K.M. Wilson:

Yes, because what you have talked about is fixed cost in the sense that it is all contained in the workforce and whatever. Do you see any variable cost to using cash at all?

Founder, Jersey CI.Cash is King:

The only variable cost in using cash is the bank fees which vary per £100 from bank to bank for business to deposit. For example, I think the Barclays is 0.6 per cent or free, depending on the size of your business. If you are small or medium, it is free. Whereas some of the other ones go well over the 1 per cent fee. As far as that, that is the only variable.

Deputy K.M. Wilson:

Thank you.

Deputy M. Tadier:

Thanks for that. I suppose the point is that there are fees usually, whether it is business handling cash and paying in cash or paying for the card services.

Founder, Jersey CI.Cash is King:

If you are completely honest with all the additional fees with the card use, I would not be surprised if they are pretty even.

Deputy M. Tadier:

You do talk about this in your submission, so you say about the fees that banks charge and you argue for them either being limited or abolished, is that right? I do not want to misquote you.

Founder, Jersey CI.Cash is King:

I think they should be equal.

Deputy M. Tadier:

Yes. I think you said any fees related must be like what electronic transaction carrier, no more.

Founder, Jersey CI.Cash is King:

Yes, in relation to, say, LibertyBus, which is 50p more if you use cash versus card payment,

Deputy M. Tadier:

It is.

[15:00]

Founder, Jersey CI.Cash is King:

That is not right.

Deputy M. Tadier:

You would not want to see that expanded so people say you can use cash but you are going to pay more for it?

Founder, Jersey CI.Cash is King:

No, I would not.

Deputy M. Tadier:

Do you think we should make a recommendation on that basis that it would be discriminatory to charge cash users more?

Founder, Jersey CI.Cash is King:

I think so, yes. But in the same way it should not cost more to use a card machine. So, level playing field

Deputy M. Tadier:

Those are just absorbed as business as usual?

Founder, Jersey CI.Cash is King:

Yes. Any business person knows there is a cost for making business.

Deputy M. Tadier:

Can I ask you though about when it comes to banking charges, for example at the moment private individuals do not pay to pay in cash into their bank accounts?

Founder, Jersey CI.Cash is King:

No, they do not.

Deputy M. Tadier:

Do you think that there is a responsibility for banks to also review and question whether they apply those charges to businesses generally, given the fact that maybe that is not how banks traditionally make their money?

Founder, Jersey CI.Cash is King:

Banks traditionally make their money by lending our money to other people with a hefty mark-up. We do not get to see any of that. A current account holder does not have any interest. I think their bottom lines could handle it, quite honestly. Whether they will do that, that is a different matter.

Deputy M. Tadier:

Do you think there is a risk that if cash were to go out of circulation, so if tomorrow we did not use cash anymore, would banks simply try and pass fees on to card users in another way? Is there a risk we could see card fees go up?

Founder, Jersey CI.Cash is King:

I would suggest so, because even a penny in the sea will ... drop a penny, it grows into a great big puddle. So, I do not know what the figure for the bank is, how much they actually make from those fees from businesses to deposit in cash. But they would have to cover that income from somewhere else. That would then most logically be slapped on card use.

Deputy M. Tadier:

Do you differentiate between the costs of a business using cash versus card in terms of where that money that gets siphoned off goes? So when you tap your card and let us say 1.5 per cent goes to a card company, that money, where will that end up relative to the cost of using cash? Do you have any thoughts?

Founder, Jersey CI.Cash is King:

I do not know precisely where they go. I know whoever is supplying the machine will take a cut connection to the bank. There is a fee depending on cards ... different cards have different costs related. So it is a bit complicated. Whereas cash, I put £100 as a business into a bank and I pay

0.6 per cent fee for that; very simple. There is no variation and guessing how much my cost for the month is going to be.

Deputy M. Tadier:

Right, thank you. I think you are doing very well by the way, to get through all of these questions. The panel has been ... I think you have answered the question about discounts actually in surcharges so we talked about LibertyBus as one example . There were those who have expressed concerns that banks are gaining too much power over individuals and I think you have mentioned that in your submission. Are there any additional points that you would like to add or explanation around that?

Founder, Jersey Cl.Cash is King:

I touched on it, I do not think I am going into great detail on it on the submission.

Deputy M. Tadier:

Certainly some people have made those kind of comments.

Founder, Jersey Cl.Cash is King:

If you go in the bank and want to withdraw money very often the bank will ask you what you want to use this for. To me and for many it is none of their business, it is my assets, you are holding them for me, I have a right for those assets and pull them out whenever I like without having to explain where am I going to use them.

Deputy G.P. Southern:

And/or where you have got that money from; is that also in your thinking?

Founder, Jersey Cl.Cash is King:

Yes, in theory. There is that limit for money laundering, is it £9,999 or something like that. So up to a point there is no need to because I could be selling my old furniture and I want to put it in. Why do I need to explain that to anybody?

Deputy M. Tadier:

Do you think that is a duty of care they apply or do you think it is a different reason because I know with online payments they will often check with the customer to avoid scams, for example. Do you think that is why they are doing it or do you think there is a different reason?

Founder, Jersey Cl.Cash is King:

I presume that is the reason, but whether they should be treating a private individual as a default criminal is right or wrong ... I think I know where I am thinking.

Deputy M. Tadier:

Okay, thank you.

Founder, Jersey Cl.Cash is King:

As far as online banking goes, I would like to touch on this, as an example, you want to use your online banking and you want to pay somebody ... say you want to buy a motorbike or whatever, and you have not done business with them before, and it could be a legitimate business that flags up green on the online portal, and you put a, say, £2,000 payment. You have to then press several times: "Do you want to do ... are you really sure you want to do this?" "Yes." "Are you really sure you want to do this?" "Yes." "Can you put your pin sentry numbers in?" "Yes." Two days later the person you wanted to send it to says nothing has arrived so you spend 2 hours on the phone: "Why did my money not go?" "Oh, we did not think you should ... it was a bit dodgy." I said: "Hang on a second, I have just gone through several confirmations that I wanted to do this and now the person I want to buy this thing from thinks that I am no good to it" and then you have to redo the whole thing but this time the bank has preapproved your transaction. So the bank is trying to limit how to use your money. I understand that there is a level of protection, but I think they are a little bit overzealous on that. Whether there is a balance to be found or not, I do not know.

Deputy M. Tadier:

Thank you. Right, so I think those are my questions for now. Who wants to ask question 8?

Deputy K.M. Wilson:

I think Max was that.

Deputy M. Tadier:

Max, are you all right? I do not know if you have got sight of questions, have you, Max?

Deputy M.B. Andrews:

Yes, I think we have already touched on question 8 a bit before, but I know several stakeholders have raised concerns about money laundering, for instance, and fraud as well. I just wanted to have your views on cash and electronic payments in relation to both money laundering and fraud.

Founder, Jersey Cl.Cash is King:

Against fraud I would suggest that cash is much safer. You cannot be scammed online with this. If you do not have any online activity and access, you cannot be scammed. I presume, this is just ...

I have no proof whatsoever, but I would imagine that online scams have actually gone through the roof because there are so many of them around and you see also compared to when cash was more in use, there would have been less. You would actually have to be taken to a bank by the scammer and then try and withdraw that money where the cashier would then be gatekeeping you there.

Deputy G.P. Southern:

In response to that, we have been ... some people have said that that is balanced by cash in hand procedure issues. So you pay your cleaner whatever it is per week and that money is not necessarily declared as income. So that the balance between computer fraud and cash-in-hand money quietly going into the grey or the black economy, is that balanced? Have you found any information on that?

Founder, Jersey Cl.Cash is King:

I guess it depends how big the ... you call it grey economy, is it not?

Deputy M. Tadier:

The grey economy, informal economy, there is also the illegal economy.

Founder, Jersey Cl.Cash is King:

How big it actually is and whether it has even much of an impact on tax takes or not. Yes, it does happen but we have legislations, we have the powers to deal with it. So there would be no extra that needs to be done. People tend to be very vigilant on that. It is not looked very kindly because we are all taxpayers. So whoever is dodging will be picking up the slack from it. It is not very popular, I do not think. But I think online environment is much more riskier versus ... for individuals and for businesses, where businesses get scammed as well. It is so easy because you are just quickly tapping, you are not actually sitting down with a person and where you can trust your gut instinct and do a little bit of a hearing out: "This does not really sound right" whereas on the online environment it is done like that.

Deputy M. Tadier:

Max, do you want to finish your line of questioning and then we will bring Karen in?

Deputy M.B. Andrews:

Do you think there is any pressure from law enforcement authorities who would probably prefer electronic transactions because it is probably more traceable compared to, say, cash transactions that is a lot more difficult to monitor and have oversight of?

Founder, Jersey Cl.Cash is King:

Yes, I am sure they would prefer it. Why does everything need to be monitored, is my question?

Deputy M.B. Andrews:

I didn't quite hear that, sorry.

Founder, Jersey Cl.Cash is King:

Why does everything need to be monitored, is my question?

Deputy M. Tadier:

So why does everything need to be monitored?

Deputy M.B. Andrews:

I think from, say, a law enforcement perspective, I am asking would there be more pressure to go cashless in that respect because it is easier for them to do their job compared to if they are cash transactions?

Founder, Jersey Cl.Cash is King:

I think they would like it because it would make their life a lot easier. However, as from a criminal point of view, money laundering, obtaining assets, it reminds me of, I think it was in the 1970s in the U.K. when the tax rates went through the roof, people started paying with pieces of art. If you are a criminal, you will find a way around it. Whether there is cash, they just use something else as a currency, so to speak.

Deputy M. Tadier:

Thanks for that, Max. We will bring Karen in.

Deputy K.M. Wilson:

We may have passed the moment but I just wanted to go back to your points around discrimination and this notion of inconvenience. What is it that makes you draw those conclusions about discrimination and inconvenience? What are the key things that we need to take away from what you were telling us today, that we might want to consider?

Founder, Jersey Cl.Cash is King:

For me, as I am a carer of a 100 per cent disabled person, it is ... I expect society to be open for all its population as far as governmental services, businesses, goods. If you are being denied because of disability, that you cannot go to a cafe, you cannot go to the airport or the ports of Jersey, go and have a cup of coffee there, if you do not have a card. They do not take cash. These are used traditionally, ports and places of where tourists dump their cash, extra coins and all that gone. It is

a bit weird. But going back to discrimination is, I cannot take my partner to the best part of 50 places because we prefer using cash, and that includes swimming pools. There are some heritage sites to other tourist areas, restaurants.

[15:15]

So yes, it is discrimination because I would expect that all these things were open for everybody. I know businesses choose their customers all the time but they cannot do that based on disabilities, and that is where I draw the line.

Deputy K.M. Wilson:

Okay, thank you. The only other area I just wanted to come back to was in this scenario where you are going to a store and you are able to get cash back. In terms of the scale of the size of the operation, because there is one argument that it is a very costly thing to manage cash as part of the transaction for business, what would you say about smaller businesses? Because I am presuming that you are talking about smaller corner shops that offer that, when the banks are actually saying: "Well actually to manage that kind of a transaction, it is quite costly."

Founder, Jersey Cl.Cash is King:

I was in catering for the best part of 20 years in a management level. I have been doing cash-ups that entire ... and doing the books and the accounts related. Never ever has it taken me more than 10, 15 minutes. Is that really too much of a cost, is my question?

Deputy K.M. Wilson:

So it is not necessarily about the cash holding, it is about the management of that cash when it is actually being transacted from a customer?

Founder, Jersey Cl.Cash is King:

Yes. It comes in and the end of the day cash-up is done, and then it either usually goes into a great big heavy safe and then gets removed there from the following day once or twice a week and then walked into the nearest bank and plopped in.

Deputy M. Tadier:

Do you think there is an element at which there is a critical mass? So some businesses have told us the fact that is because society is moving, whether it has been compelled or not it is another matter. But so little cash is being used that in the past they might have used the cash to recirculate so you are taking cash but you are paying people back in cash whereas people are tapping now so

there is no change to be given, for example. Do you have any thoughts around whether we have passed the critical point of ...?

Founder, Jersey Cl.Cash is King:

I do not think so because the tide has been turning already. Like I said, we have been influenced by the pandemic years where everybody was avoiding cash. Well, not everybody, but a lot of people were. If they had a card, the card was used because it was seen as more hygienic. But that is long gone now. In the U.K., cash has gone up in use, I think we are reaching about 30 per cent point now in the U.K. You will see the same in here, there are a lot of businesses in my page that say that most of their intake is in cash and it is getting more and more and more. But I would imagine that is also because people are more aware. We have television programmes now, news reports, or the papers there have been all these issues about cash. So it will be bouncing back. I do not see it becoming the major currency used but it will return back to its ... by one-third of the transactions.

Deputy G.P. Southern:

Let us put it to the extreme. The Government says to banks: "You can operate as a bank under these conditions, some of which are a cost to you." What should one of those conditions be that you maintain a system or cash use? Would you put it in the law?

Founder, Jersey Cl.Cash is King:

Would I put it in the law? I would put it in as a recommendation by the Jersey Financial. I do not want to advertise a specific bank, but a Barclays system of small to medium, no transaction fee for cash deposits. Then if you are a bigger business, it is still fairly low, because let us face it, it is mainly machines that do the counting nowadays in the banks, not really the humans. I think so. I would cap that. I would request a capping of those costs, so all banks ... because some banks are more pushing towards not having cash at all than others. Some banks, I do not know if there have been more cases, but I was told of a person who wanted to open a café in St. Helier and they could not get a bank account because they wanted to operate with cash. Their bank turned them down. You cannot have a business account, so no café. Where there is one there are probably more cases.

Deputy M. Tadier:

I have got a couple of areas of questioning, which I think ... we are coming towards an actual end anyway and towards 3.30, which is what we had allocated. But there is this concept of legal tender that keeps coming back in submissions. Can you talk to us about what you understand by the idea of legal tender? I will caveat that by saying it came up during the debate recently on sports centres where the Attorney General, I think it was, said that there is no definition in law about legal tender.

There is a general wider understanding or belief in cash being a legal tender. What do you have to say about that?

Founder, Jersey CI.Cash is King:

What is a legal tender? know a legal tender is not a piece of plastic with a chip in it. Legal tender is where a note or a coin has a set value and it holds its set value and it can be used as a transaction method.

Deputy M. Tadier:

I guess what I am getting at is that if you have got a £5 or a £10 or even a £20 note, it is fine to say that that £20 note is worth £20 but if nobody is accepting that anymore that renders the idea of legal tender a bit problematic.

Founder, Jersey CI.Cash is King:

It would disappear because we would be left with just digital numbers that can be wiped off the space of the planet if somebody wants to, just on a flick.

Deputy M. Tadier:

I think your submission makes this clear, but just for us, we will have to consider a recommendation among ... a number of them, potentially, around enshrining the use of cash or not, which we will not take lightly because it does ... it would be an imposition on businesses on the one hand, but we need to consider whether that is the right way to go. Is that something you would want the panel to do and want the Government to do?

Founder, Jersey CI.Cash is King:

Yes, I would. So would the other 4,000-plus people, if not more.

Deputy M. Tadier:

The next question, I suppose, is getting slightly more into the realms of philosophy, but I think it is something which has come out during our review, is the impact that moving entirely cashless might have on our being human. So a lot of people feel that it is not just about the ability to use cash, but it is about the human interaction that goes with cash, perhaps the length of time it takes, the conversations that are had, when you do transact in cash. Is there an element of truth in that, do you think?

Founder, Jersey CI.Cash is King:

From personal experience, yes, there is. I go to a shop, and I just tap away, and I say: "Hi", tap, "Bye", out of the door. I interact with cash. There are usually several sentences swapped between

2 people. Yes, there is definitely a social component of using cash. A lot of people go to the bank to have a chat with the cashier, but also with the other people who are waiting to be seen. It is a social interaction tool or vehicle, whichever you want to think about it. Yes, that would definitely go, and that would probably have rather a large impact. You think about the pandemic years when we were 6 feet away and we tapped from the distance. Barely anybody spoke with anybody, even waiting in the queues because somebody was 6 feet behind. It was just silent in the shops. That is what we are looking at.

Deputy K.M. Wilson:

I think what I am hearing is that you are describing a very different kind of customer service, which is that traditionally customer service was about building a relationship on a face-to-face basis with the customer, whereas the electronic payment method is a different kind of customer service.

Founder, Jersey Cl.Cash is King:

If you want to call it ... if you are talking just with a machine, that is literally the self-service tills. While they do have their pace, especially on the lunch hour in town, the self-service tools are very nice and quick. I must admit it is a shame they do not take cash though because somebody who is in a hurry might just prefer using cash and it takes a little bit longer to put the coins in, but not that much. But there is nobody to talk to. It is a machine. It is out you go. How many jobs are lost as well?

Deputy M. Tadier:

Thank you. Do we have any other questions? Max? No. Do you have any questions for us, Nina? Or any other points.

Founder, Jersey Cl.Cash is King:

I do not know. It is such a huge topic.

Deputy M. Tadier:

Yes, we are mindful of that. As I have suggested that it starts off being about cash, but it also becomes about other areas which are relevant.

Founder, Jersey Cl.Cash is King:

Privacy, choice, security, budgeting, traditions, it is an entire world.

Deputy M. Tadier:

We appreciate you coming in, especially because I know that you are just one member of the online group and that you are representing them in it.

Founder, Jersey Cl.Cash is King:

Yes, no pressure.

Deputy M. Tadier:

Yes, exactly. But I know that they will probably be rooting for you and some of them will have been watching. Thanks again for both your submission and your time today.

Founder, Jersey Cl.Cash is King:

It has been a pleasure.

Deputy K.M. Wilson:

Thank you very much. Thank you.

Deputy M. Tadier:

And I think we can go offline.

[15:26]