



**THE STATES assembled on Tuesday  
12th December 2023, at 9.30 a.m. under  
the Presidency of the Deputy Bailiff,  
Robert James MacRae, Esquire.**

**His Excellency the Lieutenant Governor,  
Vice-Admiral Jeremy Paul Kyd, C.B.E. was present.**

All members were present at roll call with the exception of –

Connétable Deidre Wendy Mezbourian of St. Lawrence – excused attendance  
Deputy Louise Mary Catherine Doublet of St. Saviour – en défaut (défaut raised at 10.29 a.m.)  
Deputy Philip Francis Cyril Ozouf of St. Saviour – excused attendance (arrived in the Chamber at 11.08 a.m.)

Prayers

#### **Standing Order 55A – remote participation**

THE STATES, with reference to their Act dated 14th September 2021, in which they had agreed that, notwithstanding Standing Order 55A(1), members who did not wish to attend in the States Chamber might continue to take part in States meetings using Microsoft Teams (until the States had considered and voted upon a proposition to re-apply Standing Order 55A(1) or to repeal or vary the terms of the Standing Order), assembled in accordance with Standing Order 55A with members able to participate remotely using Microsoft Teams.

#### **Proposed Government Plan 2024-2027 P.72/2023**

THE STATES, resuming consideration of a proposition of the Council of Ministers entitled ‘Proposed Government Plan 2024-2027’ (P.72/2023), as amended, resumed consideration of an amendment of the Economic and International Affairs Scrutiny Panel (P.72/2023 Amd.(25)) and, adopting parts 1 and 2 of an amendment of the Council of Ministers (P.722023 Amd.(25) Amd.) agreed that –

in paragraph (1), the sum “£2,090,000” should be substituted with “£1,033,000”, the word “freezing” should be substituted with “reducing”, the words “, and subsequent figures updated accordingly” should be deleted and the table should be substituted as follows –

	2024 Estimate (£000)	2025 Estimate (£000)	2026 Estimate (£000)	2027 Estimate (£000)
Impot Duties Spirits	7,655	8,171	8,327	8,522
Impot Duties Wine	9,158	9,673	9,755	9,878
Impot Duties Cider	1,036	1,083	1,081	1,083
Impot Duties Beer	6,686	7,060	7,120	7,211

in paragraph (2), the word “freezing” should be substituted with “reducing”, the sum “£1,045,000” should be substituted with “£1,033,000” and the subsequent sub-paragraphs (b) and (c) should be deleted.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 27**

Connétable of St. Peter  
 Connétable of St. John  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Deputy C.F. Labey  
 Deputy S.G. Luce  
 Deputy L.M.C. Doublet  
 Deputy K.F. Morel  
 Deputy S.M. Ahier  
 Deputy I. Gardiner  
 Deputy I.J. Gorst  
 Deputy K.L. Moore  
 Deputy P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Deputy Sir P.M. Bailhache  
 Deputy D.J. Warr  
 Deputy H.M. Miles  
 Deputy J. Renouf  
 Deputy H.L. Jeune  
 Deputy M.E. Millar  
 Deputy T.J.A. Binet  
 Deputy M.R. Ferey  
 Deputy A.F. Curtis  
 Deputy B. Ward  
 Deputy K.M. Wilson  
 Deputy L.K.F. Stephenson  
 Deputy M.B. Andrews

**CONTRE: 19**

Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Deputy G.P. Southern  
 Deputy M. Tadier  
 Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat  
 Deputy R.J. Ward  
 Deputy C.S. Alves  
 Deputy L.J. Farnham  
 Deputy S.Y. Mézec  
 Deputy T.A. Coles  
 Deputy B.B.de S.V.M. Porée  
 Deputy M.R. Scott  
 Deputy C.D. Curtis  
 Deputy L.V. Feltham  
 Deputy R.E. Binet  
 Deputy A. Howell  
 Deputy R.S. Kovacs

**ABSTAIN: 1**

Connétable of St. Clement

THE STATES, adopting part 3 of the amendment of the Council of Ministers to the amendment of the Economic and International Affairs Scrutiny Panel, agreed that, in paragraph (3), the new paragraph (1) should be substituted with the following –

“(1) to agree that the Government of Jersey should publish a broader review of alcohol policy and consider what additional support could be provided for the hospitality sector and the Island’s small spirits producers.”.

Members presented voted as follows –

**POUR: 43**

Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of St. Peter  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
 Connétable of St. John  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of St. Mary

**CONTRE: 2**

Deputy M.R. Scott  
 Deputy A. Howell

**ABSTAIN: 2**

Connétable of St. Clement  
 Deputy A.F. Curtis

Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Deputy G.P. Southern  
 Deputy C.F. Labey  
 Deputy M. Tadier  
 Deputy S.G. Luce  
 Deputy L.M.C. Doublet  
 Deputy K.F. Morel  
 Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat  
 Deputy S.M. Ahier  
 Deputy R.J. Ward  
 Deputy C.S. Alves  
 Deputy I. Gardiner  
 Deputy I.J. Gorst  
 Deputy L.J. Farnham  
 Deputy K.L. Moore  
 Deputy S.Y. Mézec  
 Deputy P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Deputy Sir P.M. Bailhache  
 Deputy T.A. Coles  
 Deputy B.B.de S.V.M. Porée  
 Deputy D.J. Warr  
 Deputy H.M. Miles  
 Deputy J. Renouf  
 Deputy C.D. Curtis  
 Deputy L.V. Feltham  
 Deputy R.E. Binet  
 Deputy H.L. Jeune  
 Deputy M.E. Millar  
 Deputy T.J.A. Binet  
 Deputy M.R. Ferey  
 Deputy R.S. Kovacs  
 Deputy B. Ward  
 Deputy K.M. Wilson  
 Deputy L.K.F. Stephenson  
 Deputy M.B. Andrews

THE STATES, adopting the amendment of the Economic and International Affairs Scrutiny Panel, as amended, agreed that –

in paragraph (a), after the words “Article 9(2)(a) of the Law” there should be insert the words –

“, except that total estimate for 2024 Impôt Duties shall be decreased by £1,033,000 by reducing the Impôt Duties for Spirits, Wine, Cider and Beer, with the relevant figures in Appendix 2 – Summary Table 1 updated in line with the following table –

	2024 Estimate (£000)	2025 Estimate (£000)	2026 Estimate (£000)	2027 Estimate (£000)
Impot Duties Spirits	7,655	8,171	8,327	8,522
Impot Duties Wine	9,158	9,673	9,755	9,878
Impot Duties Cider	1,036	1,083	1,081	1,083
Impot Duties Beer	6,686	7,060	7,120	7,211

in paragraph (h), after the words “of the Report” there should be inserted the words –

“, except that, to accommodate a drop in States income caused by reducing the Impôt Duties for Spirits, Wine, Cider and Beer –

(a) the Head of Expenditure for the Central Reserve shall be reduced by £1,033,000.”; and

after paragraph (k) there should be inserted the following new paragraph (l) and the existing paragraph (l) re-designated as paragraph (m) –

“(l) to agree that the Government of Jersey should publish a broader review of alcohol policy and consider what additional support could be provided for the hospitality sector and the Island’s small spirits producers.”.

Members presented voted as follows –

**POUR: 45**

**CONTRE: 0**

**ABSTAIN: 1**

Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of St. Peter  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
 Connétable of St. John  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Deputy G.P. Southern  
 Deputy C.F. Labey  
 Deputy M. Tadier  
 Deputy S.G. Luce  
 Deputy L.M.C. Doublet  
 Deputy K.F. Morel  
 Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat  
 Deputy S.M. Ahier  
 Deputy R.J. Ward  
 Deputy C.S. Alves  
 Deputy I. Gardiner  
 Deputy I.J. Gorst  
 Deputy L.J. Farnham  
 Deputy K.L. Moore  
 Deputy S.Y. Mézec  
 Deputy P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Deputy Sir P.M. Bailhache  
 Deputy T.A. Coles  
 Deputy B.B.de S.V.M. Porée  
 Deputy D.J. Warr  
 Deputy H.M. Miles  
 Deputy M.R. Scott  
 Deputy J. Renouf  
 Deputy C.D. Curtis  
 Deputy L.V. Feltham  
 Deputy R.E. Binet  
 Deputy H.L. Jeune  
 Deputy M.E. Millar  
 Deputy A. Howell  
 Deputy T.J.A. Binet

Connétable of St. Clement

Deputy M.R. Ferey  
 Deputy R.S. Kovacs  
 Deputy A.F. Curtis  
 Deputy B. Ward  
 Deputy K.M. Wilson  
 Deputy L.K.F. Stephenson  
 Deputy M.B. Andrews

THE STATES resumed consideration of the proposition of the Council of Ministers, as amended and rejected an amendment of Deputy Samuel Yves Mézec of St. Helier South (P.72/2023 Amd.(14)) that, in paragraph (b), after the words “domestic liquid and solid waste”, there should be inserted the words –

“, but excluding the consideration of any charges that are regressive and do not take into account the proportionality of payments to the income of the payee”.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 16**

Connétable of St. Martin  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Deputy G.P. Southern  
 Deputy M. Tadier  
 Deputy L.M.C. Doublet  
 Deputy R.J. Ward  
 Deputy C.S. Alves  
 Deputy L.J. Farnham  
 Deputy S.Y. Mézec  
 Deputy T.A. Coles  
 Deputy B.B.de S.V.M. Porée  
 Deputy C.D. Curtis  
 Deputy L.V. Feltham  
 Deputy R.S. Kovacs  
 Deputy M.B. Andrews

**CONTRE: 31**

Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of St. Peter  
 Connétable of St. John  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Deputy C.F. Labey  
 Deputy S.G. Luce  
 Deputy K.F. Morel  
 Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat  
 Deputy S.M. Ahier  
 Deputy I. Gardiner  
 Deputy I.J. Gorst  
 Deputy K.L. Moore  
 Deputy P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Deputy Sir P.M. Bailhache  
 Deputy D.J. Warr  
 Deputy H.M. Miles  
 Deputy J. Renouf  
 Deputy R.E. Binet  
 Deputy H.L. Jeune  
 Deputy M.E. Millar  
 Deputy A. Howell  
 Deputy T.J.A. Binet  
 Deputy M.R. Ferey  
 Deputy A.F. Curtis  
 Deputy B. Ward  
 Deputy K.M. Wilson  
 Deputy L.K.F. Stephenson

**ABSTAIN: 1**

Deputy M.R. Scott

THE STATES resumed consideration of the proposition of the Council of Ministers, as amended and, adopting an amendment of Deputy Sir Philip Martin Bailhache of St. Clement (P.72/2023 Amd.), agreed that –

in paragraph (e), after the words “Article 9(2)(b) of the Law” there should be inserted the words –

“, except that in Summary Table 3, the transfers in the last two rows of the table shall be replaced as follows –

		2024	2025	2026	2027
£'000		Proposed	Proposed	Proposed	Proposed
Transfer from	Transfer to				
Strategic Reserve	Consolidated Fund	20,000	20,000	-	-
Consolidated Fund	Strategic Reserve	-	-	-	40,000

in paragraph (h), after the words “Appendix 2 – Summary Tables 5(i) and (ii) of the Report” there should be inserted the words –

“, except that in Summary Table 5(i) the figures in the columns Expenditure and Head of Expenditure for Treasury and Exchequer shall each be increased by £20 million in 2024, so as to reinstate the States grant to the Social Security Fund in full.”.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 26**

Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
 Connétable of St. John  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Deputy G.P. Southern  
 Deputy M. Tadier  
 Deputy S.G. Luce  
 Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat  
 Deputy R.J. Ward  
 Deputy C.S. Alves  
 Deputy L.J. Farnham  
 Deputy S.Y. Mézec  
 Deputy Sir P.M. Bailhache  
 Deputy T.A. Coles  
 Deputy B.B.de S.V.M. Porée  
 Deputy C.D. Curtis  
 Deputy L.V. Feltham  
 Deputy R.E. Binet  
 Deputy A. Howell  
 Deputy R.S. Kovacs  
 Deputy B. Ward

**CONTRE: 21**

Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of St. Peter  
 Deputy C.F. Labey  
 Deputy L.M.C. Doublet  
 Deputy K.F. Morel  
 Deputy S.M. Ahier  
 Deputy I. Gardiner  
 Deputy I.J. Gorst  
 Deputy K.L. Moore  
 Deputy P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Deputy D.J. Warr  
 Deputy H.M. Miles  
 Deputy M.R. Scott  
 Deputy J. Renouf  
 Deputy H.L. Jeune  
 Deputy M.E. Millar  
 Deputy M.R. Ferey  
 Deputy A.F. Curtis  
 Deputy K.M. Wilson  
 Deputy L.K.F. Stephenson  
 Deputy M.B. Andrews

**ABSTAIN: 0**

THE STATES resumed consideration of the proposition of the Council of Ministers, as amended and, adopting an amendment of Deputy Carina Soares Alves of St. Helier Central (P.72/2023 Amd.(18)), agreed that –

in paragraph (e), after the words “Appendix 2 – Summary Table 3 in line with Article 9(2)(b) of the Law” there should be inserted the words –

“, except that a new line should be inserted in Summary Table 3 to include a transfer of £75,000 from the Health Insurance Fund to the Consolidated Fund to allocate funds to extend the Free GP visits for Children and Young People Scheme to all full-time students, including students in full-time education undertaking Higher Education at Highlands College, Colleges, and Universities in the UK or abroad”; and

in paragraph (h), after the words “Appendix 2 – Summary Tables 5(i) and (ii) of the Report” there should be inserted the words –

“, except that, in Summary Table 5(i) the Head of Expenditure for Health and Community Services should be increased by £75,000 to allocate funds to extend the Free GP visits for Children and Young People Scheme to all full-time students, including students in full-time education undertaking Higher Education at Highlands College, Colleges, and Universities in the UK or abroad”.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 24**

Connétable of St. Martin  
 Connétable of St. John  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Deputy G.P. Southern  
 Deputy M. Tadier  
 Deputy L.M.C. Doublet  
 Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat  
 Deputy R.J. Ward  
 Deputy C.S. Alves  
 Deputy L.J. Farnham  
 Deputy S.Y. Mézec  
 Deputy T.A. Coles  
 Deputy B.B.de S.V.M. Porée  
 Deputy M.R. Scott  
 Deputy C.D. Curtis  
 Deputy L.V. Feltham  
 Deputy A. Howell  
 Deputy R.S. Kovacs  
 Deputy B. Ward  
 Deputy M.B. Andrews

**CONTRE: 20**

Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of St. Peter  
 Deputy C.F. Labey  
 Deputy S.G. Luce  
 Deputy K.F. Morel  
 Deputy S.M. Ahier  
 Deputy I.J. Gorst  
 Deputy K.L. Moore  
 Deputy P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Deputy Sir P.M. Bailhache  
 Deputy D.J. Warr  
 Deputy H.M. Miles  
 Deputy J. Renouf  
 Deputy R.E. Binet  
 Deputy M.E. Millar  
 Deputy T.J.A. Binet  
 Deputy M.R. Ferey  
 Deputy A.F. Curtis  
 Deputy K.M. Wilson

**ABSTAIN: 0**

THE STATES, resuming consideration of the proposition of the Council of Ministers, as amended, commenced consideration of an amendment of the Council of Ministers (P.72/2023 Amd.(33) and rejected an amendment of Deputy Samuel Yves Mézec of St. Helier South (P.72/2023 Amd.(33) Amd.) that –

before Paragraph 1 there should be inserted a new paragraph as follows and the subsequent paragraphs re-designated accordingly –

**“PAGE 2, PARAGRAPH (e) –**

After the words “in line with Article 9(2)(b) of the Law” insert the words –

“,except that within Summary Table 3 the transfer from the Strategic Reserve to the Consolidated Fund should be increased by £3,000,000 for 2024, with this funding of £3,000,000 for subsequent years to be identified from an alternative sustainable funding source”.”; and

in paragraph 2, the words following “increased by” should be substituted with “£3,000,000”.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 13**

Connétable of Grouville  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Deputy G.P. Southern  
 Deputy M. Tadier  
 Deputy R.J. Ward  
 Deputy C.S. Alves  
 Deputy S.Y. Mézec  
 Deputy T.A. Coles  
 Deputy B.B.de S.V.M. Porée  
 Deputy C.D. Curtis  
 Deputy L.V. Feltham  
 Deputy R.S. Kovacs

**CONTRE: 35**

Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of St. Peter  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
 Connétable of St. John  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Deputy C.F. Labey  
 Deputy S.G. Luce  
 Deputy L.M.C. Doublet  
 Deputy K.F. Morel  
 Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat  
 Deputy S.M. Ahier  
 Deputy I. Gardiner  
 Deputy I.J. Gorst  
 Deputy L.J. Farnham  
 Deputy K.L. Moore  
 Deputy P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Deputy Sir P.M. Bailhache  
 Deputy D.J. Warr  
 Deputy H.M. Miles  
 Deputy M.R. Scott  
 Deputy J. Renouf  
 Deputy R.E. Binet  
 Deputy H.L. Jeune  
 Deputy M.E. Millar  
 Deputy A. Howell  
 Deputy T.J.A. Binet  
 Deputy M.R. Ferey  
 Deputy A.F. Curtis  
 Deputy B. Ward  
 Deputy K.M. Wilson  
 Deputy L.K.F. Stephenson  
 Deputy M.B. Andrews

**ABSTAIN: 0**

THE STATES resumed consideration of the amendment of the Council of Ministers.

**Changes in Presidency**

The Bailiff retired briefly from the Chamber during consideration of the amendment of the Council of Ministers (P.72/2023 Amd.(33)) to the proposition of the Council of Ministers entitled ‘Proposed Government Plan 2024-2027’ (P.72/2023) and the meeting continued under the Presidency of Mr. William John Charles Millow, Deputy Greffier of the States, until the Bailiff’s return.



**Adjournment**

THE STATES adjourned, having agreed to reconvene on Wednesday 13th December 2023 to continue consideration of the proposition of the Council of Ministers entitled 'Proposed Government Plan 2024-2027' (P.72/2023) and the other outstanding items of public business.

THE STATES rose at 5.28 p.m.

**L.-M. HART**

*Greffier of the States*