

TRANSPORT AND TECHNICAL SERVICES
GREEN WASTE COMPOSTING
STAGE 1 AND STAGE 2 SITE ASSESSMENT OUTCOME

Purpose of the Report

The purpose of this report is to notify the Minister of the outcome of the green waste composting Stage 1 and Stage 2 sites assessment. In addition, the report sets out the need to develop a temporary public green waste site and identifies a preferred location.

Background

On 13 July 2005 the States of Jersey approved a proposition that the Committee (now the Minister) be charged to provide a modern composting facility for the recycling of garden and green waste by 2007. The Solid Waste Strategy which accompanied the proposition sets out that the facility is required to ensure that the potential effects of bio-aerosols, pathogens and odour are more effectively controlled and to give potential for the composting of kitchen and / or agricultural organic waste should this become necessary.

A capital allocation of £4.212 Million was awarded to the Department in 2006. Following the award, the Minister consulted the Council of Ministers in January and February 2006 regarding the preferred location of La Collette for the replacement enclosed compost facility.

Upon challenge, the Minister subsequently agreed to await the outcome of the Working Party into Composting before progressing the development of the replacement facility. The Working Party on Composting produced a report in October 2006 which suggested that there were suitable alternative private sites which might be considered for a replacement compost facility or facilities. Following consultation with the author of the report and the Environment Scrutiny Panel, the Department issued an Expression of Interest in December 2006 and January 2007 for private sites for a compost facility or facilities.

- A report summarising the three stage Site Evaluation Process to be undertaken was prepared for the Environment Scrutiny Panel on 3rd August 2007 and this report is attached as Appendix 1.
- The Babtie Fichtner Green Waste Composting Stage 1 Assessment Report dated 19th November 2007 details the full initial assessment process carried out and is attached as Appendix 2.
- The Babtie Fichtner Green Waste Composting Stage 2 Assessment Report dated 19th November 2007 details the full secondary assessment process carried out and is attached as Appendix 3.

Discussion

A total of 18 privately owned sites were received from the Expression of Interest and 11 state owned sites were put forward as potential sites for composting and/or reception of green waste. The purpose of the stage 1 assessment process was to screen out the sites that were unlikely to be suitable leaving the sites that merited further detailed assessment.

All sites were initially assessed on the basis of the following criteria:

- The location of the site within the Island Planning Zones
- Vehicular access to the site
- Proximity to sensitive receptors for the purpose of bio-aerosol risks
- Useable site area

The following sites were recommended for further assessment in stage 2 having met the criteria specified in stage 1.

Private Sites:

- Field 1364, Trinity
- Field 506A, Grouville
- Field 1061A, 1061, 1062, St John
- Field 188, St Lawrence
- Fields 712, 713, 715, St Peter
- Field 1122, St Helier

States Sites:

- Field 298, St Peter
- Field 827, Trinity
- La Collette Industrial Zone, St Helier
- La Collette Leisure Zone, St Helier
- Fields 1277, 1278, St Helier
- Fields 1276, 1274, St Helier

Ten of the remaining sites not recommended for further assessment were placed on a reserve list to be re-visited if the sites passed for further assessment were found to be unsuitable. The reserve sites are those that would have passed Stage 1 screening but for their location within the Green Zone. Officers from the Planning Department advised that sites within the Green Zone should not be considered unless there were no suitable sites identified within the Industrial or Countryside zones.

The second stage of site evaluation assessed the following criteria:

Planning Criteria

- Compatibility with Island Plan
- Visual impact
- Biodiversity
- Heritage impact

Operational Criteria

- Power connection
- Drainage connection
- Level site

Environmental Criteria

- Nuisance (based on noise)
- Bio-aerosol risk
- Hazard zoning

Access / Transportation Criteria

- Proximity to Waste origin
- Traffic junction and access requirements

Impact on Programme

Vacant Possession

To speed up the evaluation process by reducing the number of solutions which were to undergo detailed evaluation, Stage 2 was sub-divided into two sections A and B.

In section A, solutions which failed on any single criteria such that the solution is considered unviable were eliminated. In Section B, all solutions which completed section A received evaluation against all of the Stage 2 criteria receiving a score between +2 and -5. A weighting was applied to each criteria to provide an overall score.

The second stage of evaluation was challenged by Officers in the Planning, Environment and Public Health Services who had some useful contributions and confirmed that the assessment process was valid.

The release of a United Kingdom Health and Safety Executive consultation (CD211) on the potential implications of vapour cloud explosions at fuel farms such as the one at La Collette was issued in February 2007. This prompted the La Collette Hazard Review Group to conduct a specific hazard risk assessment of the implications. This review has recently been completed and indicates that it is unlikely that new publicly accessible facilities will be considered suitable in the La Collette area for the foreseeable future.

This effects the proposed relocation of public, but not commercial reception facilities for green waste at La Collette. This is because commercial reception can be considered a low-sensitivity use in hazard terms.

Alternative locations for temporary public green waste reception were reviewed in parallel with the site evaluation process for the permanent replacement composting facility or facilities. In accordance with the Solid Waste Strategy, it is proposed to co-locate public Re-use and Recycling facilities with the proposed sites.

Conclusions

The result of the Stage 2 assessment is that, the La Collette industrial site (S5) scored the highest in the assessment for commercial reception and in-vessel composting facilities. It has been concluded that further assessment of the remaining alternative sites would not reveal a better site than La Collette through a third stage of assessment.

Further third stage assessment is required to determine whether Field 298, in St Peter - the former composting site (S1), Field 827, Trinity - Howard Davis Farm (S4) or Field 1277, St Helier - Warwick Farm (S11) should be selected to accommodate the public green waste reception facility.

None of these sites are ideal for public green waste reception due to their location within the Countryside zone and proximity to residential properties. It is therefore proposed that the current Refuse Handling Plant at Bellozanne is also assessed in stage 3 as a potential public green waste reception site. This site was excluded from the potential sites assessed in stage

1 as it is not available until completion of the Energy from Waste Project in 2011, but the site would have scored highest in Stage 2 were its availability to be discounted.

Part of the study was to check whether allowing smaller sites for receiving or processing only part of the Island's green waste would introduce additional superior sites. No single privately owned site scored higher than the best performing single States owned sites and the best performing States owned sites are large enough to deal with the whole waste flow. The Stage 1 assessment established that the area required for composting and maturation accounts for only a small proportion of the total site area, with much of the space required for vehicle reception and manoeuvring.

This indicates that there will be economic dis-benefits to multiple sites through the requirement for additional access roads, reception areas and storage areas compared to a single site operation. None of the private sites considered had existing infrastructure that would have any significant benefit when assessed as a multiple site. Therefore there is no benefit in further consideration of multiple sites as these could not score higher than the best scoring States-owned single sites.

A temporary site at Compound 6 / Field 1491 in Bellozanne Valley, St Helier is proposed as suitable until a permanent site is available in 2010 / 2011. This site has the advantages of being in a central location and being close to the existing Re-use and Recycling Centre which would enable those using both facilities to reduce the number of journeys undertaken. The site is States owned and is designated as Countryside in planning terms. The site has been subject to public consultation which identified a number of residents concerns which will need to be addressed further before submitting a planning application.

The proposed site would require minimal capital and revenue investment to become operational. It is estimated that approximately £56,000 of civil works would be required and twelve custom-made collection containers purchased. It is requested that a total of £100,000 be earmarked from the existing Temporary Re-use and Recycling Centre capital allocation for the works. The revenue implications of approximately £113,400 for three extra staff and £12,339 leasing costs of vehicles required to operate this site will have to be met from mid 2008 from existing Transport Technical Services budgets.

Recommendations

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services is recommended to:

1. approve the four potential public reception sites proposed to go on to a third stage of assessment to identify a preferred permanent site or site(s) to be co-located with permanent Re-use and Recycling Centre collection facilities.
2. approve the selection of La Collette industrial area as the confirmed preferred location for the replacement enclosed composting facility and commercial green waste reception site, subject to a full Environmental Impact Assessment and Health Impact Assessment.
3. approve Compound 6 / Field 1491 in Bellozanne Valley as the preferred location for a temporary public green waste collection facility for a period of 4 years until a permanent facility or facilities can be introduced-

Reason(s) for Recommendation

To progress the identification of green waste composting sites in order to implement commitments within the Solid Waste Strategy.

Actions Required

The Director of Waste Strategy Projects is to:

1. Conduct the third stage of review for the four sites identified in the Stage 2 Assessment Report to identify the permanent public green waste collection site or sites / Re-use and Recycling Centre facility and report back to the Minister for Transport and Technical Services on the outcome.
2. Progress the development of a full environmental impact assessment, health impact assessment and planning application for the preferred site - the La Collette Industrial Area - for the permanent enclosed in-vessel compost facility and commercial green waste reception, seeking a further Ministerial Decision before submitting the planning application
3. Progress the development of a planning application for the temporary public green waste reception facility at Compound 6, Field 1491, Bellozanne Valley, seeking a further Ministerial Decision before submitting the planning application.

Written by: Will Gardiner - Director of Waste Strategy Projects

Approved by: John Richardson - Chief Officer Transport and Technical Services

Attachments:

- Appendix 1 - "Green Waste Composting - Site Evaluation Process - Summary for the Environment Scrutiny Panel. (3rd August 2007)
- Appendix 2 - Bابتie Fichtner "Green Waste Composting - Stage 1 Assessment Report" (19th November 2007)
- Appendix 3 - Bابتie Fichtner "Green Waste Composting - Stage 2 Assessment Report" (19th November 2007).

39/8/5

11 December 2007