

Carbon Neutral Jersey

Response to in-committee debate

23 July 2021

R.169/2021



Contents

1.	<u>Introduction</u>	2
2.	<u>Summary of key themes and issues</u>	3
3.	<u>Summary of the Minister for the Environment’s opening statement</u>	4
4.	<u>Minister for the Environment’s response by theme</u>	6
	• <u>1. Transport</u>	6
	• <u>2. Heating, Cooling and Cooking</u>	8
	• <u>3. Sustainable Finance</u>	9
	• <u>4. Energy Market</u>	10
	• <u>5. People-Powered Approach to becoming Carbon Neutral</u>	11
	• <u>6. Policy, Legislation and Financing</u>	14
	• <u>7. Other</u>	16
5.	<u>Response to specific questions</u>	18
6.	<u>Summary of the Minister of the Environment’s closing statement</u>	21
7.	<u>Appendices</u>	22
	• <u>Appendix 1: Youth Parliament for the States Assembly</u>	23



1. Introduction

The Carbon Neutral Jersey in-committee debate took place on 23 July 2021. The debate was an opportunity for States Members to express their initial reactions to the recommendations made by the Citizens' Assembly on Climate Change.

The Minister for the Environment presented a report to the States on 15 July 2021 (R.120/2021¹). It provided members with relevant background information and requested States Member's high-level comments on the issues and questions outlined. The report included:

- the costs and benefits of the carbon neutral transition
- the Citizens' Assembly on Climate Change recommendations summary
- a summary of the people-powered process thus far
- the Carbon Neutral Roadmap process going forward

A recording of the debate² and a complete written record of everything that members said (Hansard) is available on the States Assembly website. This report is not intended to duplicate those records. It outlines the issues raised by States Members and the Minister's response to them. It also addresses the questions he was asked during the debate. Contributions are grouped into various themes.

The Carbon Neutral Roadmap will be developed considering the views expressed in the debate. They will also be used to identify what is important to Members in setting priorities.

¹ [Carbon Neutral Jersey \(Consideration "in-committee"\) Hansard \(23 July 2021\)](#)

² [Recording of States Assembly \(Morning Session\): in-committee debate](#)



2. Summary of key themes and issues

The debate provided States Members with an opportunity to express their views on the recommendations made by the Citizens' Assembly on Climate Change³. The discussion, whilst wide-ranging, raised a range of key themes and issues, which are listed below. These are not listed in any chronological order, nor does the list imply preference or significance, rather, they are simply grouped by general themes as raised in the Citizens' Assembly on Climate Change recommendations report.

Themes discussed and responded to in this report:

- Transport
- Heating, Cooling and Cooking
- Sustainable Finance
- Energy Market
- People-Powered Approach to becoming Carbon Neutral
- Policy, Legislation and Financing

³ [Achieving Carbon Neutrality – Report of Jersey's Citizens' Assembly on Climate Change](#)



3. Summary of the Minister for the Environment's opening statement

Issue: Minister for the Environment - Opening Statement Summary

- The Minister expressed his sincere thanks to the members of the Citizens' Assembly for the time they committed to the process and the gravitas shown to this issue.
- The Minister noted the effort and cost required to deliver a constructive Citizens' Assembly on Climate Change as well as the time in planning and delivering this important piece of deliberative democracy.
- The subject of when and how we should become carbon neutral is complex. The Citizens' Assembly on Climate Change were presented with the evidence and gave it due thought and consideration. They set an ambition and were optimistic for a different future, giving a very clear message for an early date for carbon neutrality and ambitious milestones along the way. When asked about the level of ambition the Citizens' Assembly members asked if they could propose other dates. They concluded that they want to see an ambitious timetable becoming carbon neutral by 2030.
- The climate emergency is a fundamental issue that will impact generations to come and that is why it is important that our young people are heard in this debate.
- Jersey's Youth Parliament had time to debate and consider the Citizens' Assembly Recommendations Report drawing a number of poignant conclusions. The Minister pledged to them that he would read a statement from them during this in-committee debate.

Jersey's Youth Parliament Statement for the States Assembly in-committee debate ([Appendix 1](#)):

"We, as the Jersey Youth Parliament, agree with the recommendations made by the Citizen's Assembly on Climate Change however, we have ambitions that we want to achieve but we need your help to do this.

Firstly, we want a bright sustainable future for Jersey and as the youth of our Island we have strong dreams that we aim to accomplish. Our views are very important as the Government have said that they want to put children first, and therefore we need to be heard. We have loads of ideas that we feel should be implemented into the Carbon Neutral Roadmap and together, we can work to make a difference to our beautiful Island of Jersey. We are all very passionate about this issue as it determines our future and the future of generations after us. How can we, as the Jersey Youth Parliament, focus on other issues on the Island when we are conscious that we might not have a world to fix if climate change isn't tackled now?

We fully support the decision that has been made to set the year of 2030 as the target for carbon neutrality. We feel that this is a timescale which both reflects the urgency of the climate crisis and provides a real opportunity for us to achieve our aims. If we work together as an Island, we can challenge climate change before it's too late. These recommendations are key to securing a thriving and prosperous future for us all to enjoy and cherish. With all this in mind, we firmly believe that the use of fossil-fuelled vehicles should be phased out



and not banned as cost of living is going up and banning these might limit the quality of life of young people.

We have carefully discussed each recommendation made and its implications and we firmly believe that these are the steps we must take to secure our future. We appreciate the work by the Citizens' Assembly that has gone into producing these recommendations, and we hope that you will fully consider them. We look forward to seeing the Carbon Neutral Roadmap and to a path which will help us to combat the climate emergency.

We only have one chance, so we need to make it count."

- The Minister expressed his thanks to the members of the Jersey Youth Parliament for their powerful statement. Recognising the level of ambition shown by both the Citizens' Assembly on Climate Change and the Jersey Youth Parliament, the Minister asked States Members to remain open minded about the possibility of change.
- Becoming carbon neutral by 2030 will require an aggressive on-Island carbon reduction programme. The Citizens' Assembly acknowledged the potential benefits that will accrue to us. Long-term benefits will include less traffic on our roads, healthier lifestyles, economic transformation, and reputational benefits.
- The Carbon Neutral Roadmap will provide a route to becoming carbon neutral by 2030. It will include the actions required - including the financial actions necessary and fiscal measures.
- The Minister expressed that the States Members have responsibility to respond to the work that has been done by our community. The purpose of the in-committee debate is to set us on track in what we think will be in the Carbon Neutral Roadmap: it will outline the ambition, the policies and the funding.



4. Minister for the Environment's response by theme

1. Transport: Bus Service

There were a number of issues raised regarding the bus service. These included:

- The cost of using the bus service was too expensive for users
- Ownership and control of the bus service, and the cost to government
- The number of buses on the Island that need to be replaced
- The role of the bus service in reducing congestion and pollution
- The ability of the bus service to cater for increased passenger numbers
- Potential routes
- Decarbonisation of the bus fleet including the use of second-generation renewable diesel
- Unacceptable journey times for some students using the school bus system.

Minister for the Environment's comments

- The Minister for Infrastructure has commissioned a review into the bus service as outlined in the Sustainable Transport Policy⁴. The results from this review will be used to make sure that the service will be accessible to as many Islanders as possible. It includes a review of ticketing policy and of what drives people's behaviour and choices regarding bus use.
- These comments and suggestions are being considered as part of the bus service development plan and the Mobility as a Service framework plan, both of which are required by the Sustainable Transport Policy agreed by the States Assembly in 2020 (P.128/2019)⁵.

1. Transport: Ban of Registration of New Hydrocarbon Vehicles

The Citizens' Assembly on Climate Change recommended a ban on the registration of hydrocarbon fuelled vehicles by 2025. States Members acknowledged the extensive evidence that Citizens' Assembly members examined in order to make this recommendation. Members referred to the Jersey Youth Parliament's statement which suggested a phased-out approach to ensure a Just Transition rather than setting a ban date. States Member's views on the ban included:

- The use of fossil-fuelled vehicles should be phased out, rather than banned, to prevent risk to impacts on the cost of living and the quality of life of young people
- 2025 is too ambitious as the timescale is too short
- Potential dates for the ban were put forward
- A ban date of 2025 would be 5-plus years ahead of the UK. States Members expressed that a Jersey ban should be slightly ahead of a UK ban to prevent importation of vehicles that the UK cannot sell.
- Jersey should consider vehicle manufacturer's timetables for phasing out hydrocarbon fuelled vehicles when deciding on a date for the Island

⁴ [Sustainable Transport Policy 2019 \(gov.je\)](https://www.gov.je/SustainableTransportPolicy2019)

⁵ [Vote for Sustainable Transport Policy \[P.128/2019\] As amended](#)



Minister for the Environment's comments

- Banning the registration of hydrocarbon fuelled vehicles is a challenging discussion and this policy area ultimately sits with the Minister for Infrastructure. I recognise that Jersey should not become a dumping ground for 'dirty' vehicles after the UK ban dates come into force. Careful consideration needs to be given to the range of policy levers that will enable vehicle owners to transition to low carbon vehicles. To ensure we have a Just Transition, consideration must be given to workers in the fuel supply industry, as well as small businesses that rely on their own vehicles.
- The Carbon Neutral Roadmap will include policies to increase the number of journeys undertaken using sustainable transport.
- In line with the financing strategy, The Climate Emergency Fund will be used to provide a programme of incentives to increase the uptake of low carbon transport technologies.

1. Transport: Second-generation Renewable Diesel

There was a general positive consensus amongst States Members about the use of second-generation renewable diesel on the Island.

- Members highlighted the Island's need to reduce petrol and diesel usage
- Using second-generation renewable diesel to extend the life of older petrol and diesel vehicles could play a role in a Just Transition and will prevent more electric vehicles being produced

However, there were some concerns:

- Second generation renewable diesel costs more per litre than standard diesel
- Subsidising transition fuels through mechanisms such as by reducing the tax on second-generation renewable diesel could bring about price parity

This potential policy area should sit alongside targets to ban the registration of new petrol and diesel fuelled vehicles.

Minister for the Environment's comments

- As previously discussed in response to questions, and in debates, the use of transition fuels will certainly play an essential role in our pathway to net-zero. There are a range of challenges to be considered around market availability, security of supply, competition and increased costs to consumers that must be taken into consideration in order to meet Principle 5 of the Carbon Neutral Strategy⁶, which requires a commitment to not overall increase income inequality. The Infrastructure Minister has advised that the trial of Hydrotreated Vegetable Oil in the public service vehicle fleet was successful and he very much hopes it will provide a useful springboard for more investigations around the feasibility and applicability of use of transition fuels.
- A strategic review of Jersey's long-term energy requirements will be undertaken to inform a future government-led energy strategy. This work will include soliciting decarbonisation transition plans and market insights from all current Island energy providers. The Carbon Neutral Roadmap will include policies to support the faster adoption of non-fossil hydrocarbons such as second-generation renewable diesel.

⁶ [Carbon Neutral Strategy \(gov.je\)](https://www.gov.je/carbon-neutral-strategy)



2. Heating, Cooling and Cooking: Construction Sector

There was a consensus among States Members that the construction sector has a role to play in tackling the climate emergency.

Key issues raised were:

- The emissions associated with the use of cement and concrete
- The emissions associated with domestic and commercial heating using oil and gas
- The need for more sustainable construction methods and use of sustainable-alternative materials
- The need to adopt new building techniques, which encourage sustainable design and a lower carbon cost
- The importance of future-proofing homes for climate impact was raised as a necessity moving forward, recognising that efficient homes are cheaper to run, which lowers the cost of living, as well as reducing energy consumption
- A reduction of G.S.T. (goods and services tax) on building materials that help to improve the energy efficiency of buildings

Minister for the Environment's comments

- The Minister supports the need to enhance our building bye-laws, and has already recognised the importance of this in the draft Bridging Island Plan⁷, where a commitment has been made to undertake a review of building bye-laws and technical guidance to achieve a significant and permanent reduction in Jersey's carbon emissions arising from buildings. This can make real improvements to our built environment and we will work with the construction sector to ensure that they are able to access the training and skills required.
- We have many opportunities, through Island Plan policies; through improved recycling and technology relating to building materials, and, directly through our own estate management, by working in partnership with States-owned companies and arms-length organisations. This matter is for the Minister for Infrastructure and the Minister for Treasury and Resources to consider. However, as recommended by the Citizens' Assembly, the Minister for the Environment agrees that we need an Energy Minister to coordinate these opportunities better.
- We will work with our construction sector to ensure it is able to respond to technological changes to deliver the low carbon buildings and retrofits required.
- The Minister understands that a working group has been convened by the Minister for Housing and Communities to explore modern methods of construction, what role they can play in Jersey for both our transition to net-zero and to support a more resource efficient future our construction sector.

⁷ [The draft Bridging Island Plan \(gov.je\)](https://www.gov.je)



3. Sustainable Finance

The recommendations from the Citizens' Assembly on Climate Change included high level messages on the issue of Sustainable Finance.

The debate included the following views:

- That short-term costs can have long-term benefits way beyond good headlines
- Jersey has the potential to be a beacon for future economies and societies
- Jersey's response to a carbon neutral society could lead to a greater wealth for Islanders and for our contribution to the globe, as well as lead to a greater standard of living and a greater pleasure in Islanders' daily lives. Conversely it was argued that it would lead to the impoverishment of the Island and cuts in the standard of living

Minister for the Environment's comments

- The Minister for the Environment welcomed the conversation around economic change and wealth distribution. These are the long-term challenges that we need to start to consider and will be an ongoing part of the global transition to net-zero. The talks at COP26 will have a strong focus on the issue of sustainable finance, and we will be working with Jersey Finance and others to consider the implications and opportunities for Jersey to position itself on this important agenda.



4. Energy Market: Renewable Energy

There were a number of issues raised regarding renewable energy at a utility level. These included:

- Views both for and against the adoption of utility-scale renewables in Jersey
- Due to Jersey's current energy composition, climate change is not the driver for moving towards renewable energy. Rather, the driver for moving towards renewable energy in Jersey is energy security. However, it was highlighted that energy security is a different issue and was not within the remit of this in-committee debate

Minister for the Environment's comments

- The Minister welcomed the wide-ranging discussion and recognises that utility scale renewables will, in the long-term, contribute to energy security, but they will not currently reduce our scope 1 emissions due to the low carbon electricity supply currently in place. The Minister understands that the current supply contract is in place until 2027.
- The general development order of the Planning and Building law makes provision for permitted development rights to install micro renewables without requiring planning consent (within the constraints of listed and heritage buildings).
- The draft Bridging Island Plan⁸ considers renewable energy options as part of the infrastructure requirements for the Island. There are many new technologies emerging, and we are future proofing our journey to carbon neutrality by recognising the need for ongoing technological advice and support. The draft Bridging Island Plan includes policies (ME1, ME2 and ME3) that require enhanced energy efficiency from new development. A review of building bye-laws is also being scoped currently.

⁸ [The draft Bridging Island Plan \(gov.je\)](https://www.gov.je)



5. People-Powered Approach to becoming Carbon Neutral: Just Transition

Principle 5 of the Carbon Neutral Strategy⁹ states that ‘we will make sure that carbon neutrality policies do not overall increase income inequality. The Citizens’ Assembly on Climate Change recommendations reference the importance of a Just Transition throughout their report. The in-committee debate highlighted the importance of delivering a Just Transition. Recognising that:

- People need as long a warning as possible to be able to adapt. The later that changes are made, the faster they have to be implemented, which can be both difficult and expensive for the public, for the Government and for businesses. Members highlighted their responsibility as an Assembly to set a framework so the legislation, policies and guidance regarding achieving carbon neutrality are not rushed through at short notice, causing unnecessary injustice to the public
- The impact of our changing climate on vulnerable community members were discussed. For example, that our homes are not built to withstand potential increased temperatures to which our elderly may struggle to adapt
- Technology and public services were key topics of conversation in terms of a Just Transition
- Members recognised the cost implications of achieving carbon neutrality and the impact on the less well-off in our society
- Members recognised that a Just Transition is a complex, key issue which they will have to address, as politicians, going forward

Minister for the Environment’s comments

- The Minister for the Environment wholeheartedly agrees that we must ensure a Just Transition. To ensure we meet the commitment we made in Principle 5 of the Carbon Neutral Strategy, that carbon neutrality policies do not overall increase income inequality, it is essential to include workers and the community as a whole in the process of designing our approach to tackling the climate emergency. We must recognise the disproportionality of the cost implications on median and lower-income groups. The pathway to net-zero is challenging and the transition must be fair to all Islanders.
- A multi criteria impact assessment of policy proposals will take place.
- In line with the financing strategy, it is proposed that the Climate Emergency Fund will be used to provide a programme of incentives for low carbon technologies. The nature of these incentives will be set out in the Carbon Neutral Roadmap. A mechanism will be used to proportionally target greater investment towards low-income families in order to support a Just Transition.

⁹ [The Carbon Neutral Strategy \(gov.je\)](https://www.gov.je)



5. People-Powered Approach to becoming Carbon Neutral: Parish Projects

States Members shared a wide range of projects currently being undertaken, as well as their future plans to help tackle the Climate Emergency. Plans were diverse from discussing biodiversity enhancement programmes; safer routes to school projects; energy efficiency measures and initiatives developed by Parish climate action groups.

Minister for the Environment's comments

- The Minister for the Environment was delighted to hear of so much activity going on in the Parishes with school projects and community engagement as well as Parishes developing action plans to reduce their own greenhouse gas emissions.
- The Minister believes that our Parish system provides such a strong community connection that will be critical in delivering the transition to net-zero. He will work closely with the Comité des Connétables and is pleased to be able to report that, since the in-committee debate, a further number of Parishes have held assemblies to discuss the climate emergency. We will continue to support this activity through the Carbon Neutral Roadmap and Connétables are encouraged to discuss their ideas with Officers.
- The eco active programme already provides advice on low carbon living for Islanders and businesses, including Parishes. The Carbon Neutral Roadmap will include policies to support community and business engagement. This will require additional resources in due course.

5. People-Powered Approach to becoming Carbon Neutral: Community Engagement

States Members expressed a range of views in relation to this, including:

- A keenness to further develop civic engagement. Recognising the value of the Citizens' Assembly process
- Members thanked the Citizens' Assembly on Climate Change for their time and commitment
- Members praised the Climate Conversation in its effectiveness to reach Islanders using social media, in particular reaching young people, using innovative methods
- Members made it clear that they would like to see more of this, however, also expressed the importance of the task at hand in achieving behaviour change amongst the population
- Members expressed that by making sensible and responsible decisions about their lifestyle, and the actions that they take, Islanders will help us on this journey to carbon neutrality

Minister for the Environment's comments

- The Minister is delighted with the response to the engagement work that has been carried out. Engagement requires resource, taking officer time and money to run campaigns but it is important to carry out high quality engagement so that everyone in Jersey can play their part. We will continue to ensure that we engage with all members of our Island community in line with Principle 4 of the Carbon Neutral Strategy¹⁰ which says we need to all play our part.
- The eco active programme already provides advice on low carbon living for Islanders and businesses. The Carbon Neutral Roadmap will include policies to support community and business engagement.

¹⁰ [The Carbon Neutral Strategy \(gov.je\)](https://www.gov.je/TheCarbonNeutralStrategy)



5. People-Powered Approach to becoming Carbon Neutral: Young People

Members acknowledged how fundamental the issue of climate change is to young people and the importance of hearing young people's voices in this debate. Members praised the statement from by Jersey Youth Parliament as 'utterly inspiring, honest and an appreciation of the urgency and practicality of the situation'.

Their debate acknowledged:

- The level of ambition voiced in the statement from the Jersey Youth Parliament will require an aggressive on-Island carbon reduction programme
- There is no doubt that this is one of the greatest challenges for now, for our future and to create a bright, sustainable future for our young people
- Safer routes to schools were discussed as a key topic for young people linking sustainability to mental and physical health and well-being

Minister for the Environment's comments

- The Minister was very impressed by the passion and strength of views expressed by the Jersey Youth Parliament and he thanked them for providing such a powerful statement to inspire the in-committee debate ([Appendix 1](#)). We have a moral duty to listen to and work with young people on the issue of climate change and ensure real change that will make a difference to their futures and the futures of generations to come.
- The importance of education is recognised the Carbon Neutral Roadmap will include policies to strengthen engagement with all sectors of our community including children and young people.



6. Policy, Legislation and Financing: Cost for Tackling the Climate Emergency

Throughout the in-committee debate, States Members acknowledged the need to make legislative decisions.

This included the following views:

- Global environmental initiatives and legislation will require Jersey to change its local climate strategy and adjust legislation to follow suit
- To ensure a Just Transition, it was recognised that a number of incremental environmental changes need to be made with a phased approach
- Members highlighted that emerging technologies will provide a key role in ensuring a smooth transition towards carbon neutrality
- Timely action was considered important to prevent Jersey being seen as a place to dispose of sources of pollution
- Leaving change until the last moment will prove more difficult and expensive for the public, the Government and local businesses

Minister for the Environment's comments

- The Minister for the Environment recognises these strategic points, many of which are reflected in the context and policies set out in Preferred Strategy.
- In developing the Carbon Neutral Roadmap, the full range of levers (including legislation, incentives, taxation, regulation, education and communication) will be considered, and versions of each will be required for Jersey to become carbon neutral.



6. Policy, Legislation and Financing: Cost for tackling the Climate Emergency

It was clearly acknowledged by all States Members that there will be a very substantial cost associated with tackling the Climate Emergency and that the social cost of the transition should be recognised.

The following was discussed:

- There were discussions around short-term costs and long-term benefits in tackling the climate emergency
- Concerns were raised about delivering a Just Transition
- Spending on climate change should be viewed as a similar level of priority as spending as the hospital, the new Government office block and supporting businesses during the pandemic
- Members asked the Minister for the Environment for a business case so that States Members could see the effect and full implications of the net-zero proposal on Islanders and investors
- A key concern is that funding a sustainable economy must not be at the expense of public services
- There is a potential risk of the Island continuing to use old technology, leaving the Island unprepared for future changes and effecting future generations, including future disposal costs
- Various sectors of the economy and initiatives will require investment for tackling the Climate Emergency. For example, changes in farming practices in order to provide future food security and protect the industry as it responds to climate change
- It was recognised that energy efficient homes are cheaper to run and therefore this will have a positive impact on the lowest earning in our community which is important for a Just Transition

The States members raised views on the Fiscal Stimulus Fund. It was felt that learning from the experience of the Fiscal Stimulus Fund, the Climate Emergency Fund must ensure that it links and joins up with the other parts of Government priorities so that there is a clear and consistent approach.

Minister for the Environment's comments

- We need a long-term financing strategy to work throughout the transition to carbon neutral and net-zero. The Carbon Neutral Roadmap will set out the principles for developing this strategy. It will recognise how we can most effectively use the Climate Emergency Fund in the short term to kick start action, whilst developing new revenue raising measures in the mid-term and a longer term financing strategy. The timing of the medium-term and long-term financial measures will be a matter for the new Assembly.
- The policy package of the Carbon Neutral Roadmap will be subject to a multi criteria assessment that will include cost and affordability as key criteria. This approach will ensure we bring forward a balanced, measured approach that addresses both the short-term action and the long-term transition costs.
- The fiscal stimulus fund is the remit of the Minister for Treasury and Resources and was overseen by a panel who considered the merits of schemes against a set of criteria.



7. Other: Joined up Government of Jersey

The need for Government to be more 'joined up' was expressed during the in-committee debate. Future Government action must be in alignment with achieving a carbon neutral future. To do this the Government should:

- Consider carbon neutrality within all of its economic policies, in order to create a sustainable economy and ensure climate adaptation
- Work with the private sector to make the most of expertise and resources
- Recognise that the whole Assembly signed up to agree that they would aim to become carbon neutral by 2030

Members urged the Minister for Treasury and Resources to think about joined-up Government and the commitments the Assembly have made and how this can be achieved through greater collaboration.

Minister for the Environment's comments

- The Minister for the Environment supports the aspiration for more joined up decision making which is at the heart of these comments. This will be an issue for our incoming government to discuss and deliberate. The Minister believes that there should be a single Minister responsible for energy who will integrate all government actions. The Carbon Neutral Roadmap will require commitments to implementation beyond the life cycle of one term of government, indeed it will cover a good 10 government periods in the pathway to 2050. Ensuring we stick to the objectives despite changes in government and politics will be a significant challenge. Our electorate can hold us to account on the commitments we make, our challenge is to deliver the policies we make, in light of balancing competing priorities and challenges that require short term fixes.
- The Minister supports the Citizens' Assembly on Climate Change recommendation that the incoming Council of Ministers in 2022 allocate a new ministerial portfolio for energy and climate change.
- The Carbon Neutral Roadmap will include policies on strategic governance and leadership, which will include the steps the Government of Jersey will take to decarbonise its operations. A Government of Jersey fleet review has been undertaken as part of the Sustainable Transport Policy¹¹ and will inform future fleet contract reviews.

¹¹ [Sustainable Transport Policy 2019 \(gov.je\)](https://www.gov.je/sustainable-transport-policy-2019)



7. Other: Marine Environment

There was a broad discussion around the role of the marine environment in our journey to becoming carbon neutral. In particular, the significant resource that Jersey's seagrass beds provide for carbon sequestration.

In addition to this there were discussions around:

- The potential of harnessing tidal power including the potentially destructive impact that tidal barrages can have on the marine environment
- Sustainable fishing

Minister for the Environment's comments

- The Carbon Neutral Strategy¹² states that we will provide support for sequestration projects. This is an area of great interest and one that we will be looking at as part of the policy development work on carbon sequestration in both terrestrial and marine environments including blue carbon. It is a developing area of research at a global level and we will continue to look to good practise and follow developments in carbon accounting from sequestration which are evolving. COP26 may provide additional guidance and direction.
- The draft Bridging Island Plan¹³ recognises the positive role of sequestration and makes policy provision to enable appropriate schemes to come forward both on-shore and offshore. The Plan also proposes that work is undertaken to develop a marine spatial plan for Jersey and the Minister looks forward to exploring what opportunities may exist through this work.

¹² [The Carbon Neutral Strategy \(gov.je\)](#)

¹³ [The draft Bridging Island Plan \(gov.je\)](#)



5. Response to specific questions

States Members posed a range of questions for the Minister for the Environment, responses are provided in the section below.

Issue: Questions to the Minister for Environment - Estimates of the Cost of Net-Zero

Estimates of the cost of net-zero:

"Can we really ask anyone to make meaningful choices if they do not know the options they face? I ask the Minister to prepare an outline business case and to request this outline business case as clear as that for the hospital so we can see the effect of the net-zero proposal on the average Islander and our investors, the taxpayers, will understand the full implications of this expenditure. If we are going to be business-like, as Deputy Gardiner suggests, then we should be approaching it on a business-like basis"

Minister for the Environment's comments

- The Preferred Strategy sets out a strategic principle on paying for carbon neutrality that will be detailed in the Carbon Neutral Roadmap. A multi criteria impact assessment including costs, carbon impacts, socio-economic impacts and additional co-benefits will be carried out on the policy package that is brought forward in the Carbon Neutral Roadmap.
- In line with the financing strategy, the Climate Emergency Fund will be used to provide a programme of incentives for low carbon technologies. The nature of these incentives will be set out in the Carbon Neutral Roadmap. A mechanism will be used to proportionally target greater investment towards low-income families in order to support a Just Transition.

Issue: Questions to the Minister for Environment – Renewable Energy

"I am appreciative of the Minister for the Environment allowing us to discuss this issue in this forum after the citizen's report was produced but since the citizen's report has been published, it would be good to hear from him if he has had any conversations, any discussions, any action plans with the Jersey Electricity Company and energy providers to make renewable energy more viable. He will be aware very well of the debate I brought forward about renewable energy and the many meetings we have had with Jersey Electricity Company and looking into this, and I would like to hear from him now how his department are advancing renewable energy".

Minister for the Environment's comments

- As the Member will be aware, it would be premature for me to provide details of discussions and meetings with regard to work under development. I can, however, direct the Member to the comments with regard to making provision through the Island Plan review process for enabling work on renewable energy schemes.
- Utility scale renewable energy options will be considered as part of the strategic review of Jersey's long-term energy requirements.



Issue: Questions to the Minister for Environment – The Climate Conversation

"Something that I want to touch on is about the climate conversation that has been facilitated by the Minister because I think that has been particularly effective, even more so than some other campaigns that Government have run. ... the use of social media: brilliant. I want to ask The Minister if that is going to continue or whether that was just leading up to the report because I do think it should continue".

Minister for the Environment's comments

- Thank you for the comment which is most appreciated, I know the team that coordinated the campaign work extremely hard and seldom receive recognition for their efforts, so I would like to take this opportunity to thank them on behalf of us all. I can assure you that continuing the conversation around the pathway to net-zero will be a crucial part of addressing the climate emergency and I am pleased to have your support with this aspect.
- The Carbon Neutral Roadmap will include policies to support community and business engagement.

Issue: Questions to the Minister for Environment – Safer Cycling, Pedestrian Routes

"I would also like to hear, and probably in conjunction with the Minister for Infrastructure, the Comité des Connétables and their Road Committees about providing safe cycling and pedestrian routes, commuter networks, around the Island. ... I would like to hear the practicalities of this because, as I say, I think we have gone beyond the talking and the report writing. I would like to know what practical steps are in train so that we can achieve something. A roadmap has been asked for and if the Minister for the Environment could tell us how far advanced that roadmap is now with timescales so that the community can get behind this and look forward to changes being made".

Minister for the Environment's comments

This is a question for the Minister for Infrastructure. I understand there is work already underway including:

- a programme to update and improve school travel plans across the island's schools. This programme is engaging with schools, including site visits and identifying options to improve safer access to the schools for cyclists and pedestrians. This is increasing our understanding of specific sustainable travel interventions with schools to support a future investment programme.
- The recruitment of a dedicated Cycling Development Officer to focus on active travel across the island. The officer is responsible for developing infrastructure and behaviour change projects as part of the Sustainable Transport Policy, as well as informing the developing active travel rapid plan from an operational perspective of improved networks for active travel across the island.

Issue: Questions to the Minister for Environment – Timeline for the Carbon Neutral Roadmap

"I would like to know what practical steps are in train so that we can achieve something. A Roadmap has been asked for and if the Minister for the Environment could tell us how far advanced that Roadmap is now with timescales so that the community can get behind this and look forward to changes being made. Sometimes they are impractical but if they



understand the reasoning behind, I think there will be buy in. The sooner we receive a roadmap we can debate that”.

Minister for the Environment’s comments

- My comments on the in-committee debate are being published alongside the Preferred Strategy and work is now well under way to develop the full policy package within the strategic principles presented in that document. The timeline for producing the Carbon Neutral Roadmap remains unchanged and will be published by the end of the year to enable consultation ahead of a planned debate that will take place within this term of government.



6. Summary of the Minister for the Environment's closing statement

Issue: Minister for the Environment - Closing Statement Summary

- There are a set of issues there about the ministerial structure, how we make sure the environmental agenda and the infrastructure agendas are closely co-ordinated. Infrastructure investment is clearly a major part of this. But equally we need environmental policy to achieve the sustainability that virtually every Member supports in theory. This now needs to be converted into action.
- Secondly, we have heard bits of dysfunctionality, for example disappointment in our fiscal stimulus opportunities. We have to be much more flexible. Considering issues of organisational structures; the way in which we work in our ministerial structures. The Citizens' Assembly has recommended the need for a Minister for Energy.
- We need to harness the enthusiasm, energy, skills and knowledge of our States Members in the work that we have to do.
- There seems to be a consensus that we need to do things in the Government Plan on fiscal measures. Members spoke about missed opportunities so the Government Plan must not become a missed opportunity.
- This project requires a paradigm shift. Today is a start of a journey. I think today's debate has been a really good start. I hope somehow or other, the energy and the passion and the ideas that Members have shown today will continue along Jersey's journey to carbon neutrality and net-zero. I thank Members all for it - please do not stop here.
- If all Members can make sure that praise goes out to the Citizens' Assembly members because I do not think I have been able to do that adequately today. This is community-led, and they have really set us on the road.



7. Appendices

Appendix 1: Youth Parliament Statement for the States Assembly

The statement as sent to the Minister for the Environment to read during the in-committee debate from the Jersey Youth Parliament.



01.06.2021

Response to the Citizens' Assembly's Recommendations

We as the Jersey Youth Parliament agree with the recommendations made by the Citizen's assembly on climate change however, we have ambitions that we want to achieve but we need your help to do this.

Firstly, we want a bright sustainable future for Jersey and as the youth of our island we have strong dreams that we aim to accomplish. Our views are very important as the government have said that they want to put children first, and therefore we need to be heard. We have loads of ideas that we feel should be implemented into the carbon neutral roadmap and together, we can work to make a difference to our beautiful island of Jersey. We are all very passionate about this issue as it determines our future and the future of generations after us. How can we as the Jersey youth parliament focus on other issues on the island when we are conscious that we might not have a world to fix if climate change isn't tackled now?

We fully support the decision that has been made to set the year of 2030 as the target for carbon-neutrality. We feel that this is a timescale which both reflects the urgency of the climate crisis and provides a real opportunity for us to achieve our aims. If we work together as an island, we can challenge climate change before it's too late. These recommendations are key to securing a thriving and prosperous future for us all to enjoy and cherish. With all this in mind, we firmly believe that the use of fossil-fuelled vehicles should be phased out and not banned as cost of living is going up and banning these might limit the quality of life of young people.

We have carefully discussed each recommendation made and its implications and we firmly believe that these are the steps we must take to secure our future. We appreciate the work by the citizens assembly that has gone into producing these recommendations, and we hope that you will fully consider them. We look forward to seeing the carbon - neutral roadmap and to a path which will help us to combat the climate emergency.

We only have one chance, so we need to make it count.



Climate Emergency JSY

R.169/2021