

STATES OF JERSEY



COMPOSITION AND ELECTION OF THE STATES ASSEMBLY: REFORM – PROPOSAL 1 (P.93/2013) – THIRD AMENDMENT (P.93/2013 Amd.(3)) – COMMENTS

Presented to the States on 2nd December 2013
by the Privileges and Procedures Committee

STATES GREFFE

COMMENTS

The Privileges and Procedures Committee presented comments to the States in advance of the debates on the various reform propositions (P.94/2013, P.98/2013, P.116/2013 and P.117/2013 and related amendments refer). The comments were in the form of a report prepared by Professor Iain McLean and Professor Ron Johnston, entitled: 'The Proportionality of Electoral Districting Schemes for Jersey: an Evaluation'.

Following receipt of Deputy Le Fondré's amendment to Senator Ozouf's proposition, the Committee has considered the Deputy's proposal using the methodology employed by Professors McLean and Johnston, as set out in the following tables. Further information regarding the methodology applied by the Professors is available in their report, which was presented to the States by PPC on 25th October 2013 as 'Composition and election of the States Assembly: reform – (P.93/2013, P.94/2013, P.98/2013, P.116/2013, P.117/2013 and associated amendments) – comments'.

Table A: The Ratios and Proportionality Measures

Parish	Scheme											
	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12
St. John	1.62	1.64	0.82	1.39	1.53	1.55	1.48	1.37	0.92	1.55	1.49	1.56
St. Peter	1.22	0.96	1.64	1.15	1.12	1.16	1.11	0.80	1.23	1.16	1.16	0.91
Grouville	1.13	0.98	0.98	1.08	1.05	1.08	1.03	0.82	1.15	1.16	1.17	0.94
St. Clement	0.90	0.78	1.04	0.83	0.81	0.86	0.82	0.87	0.89	0.96	0.97	0.99
St. Brelade 1			0.93									0.89
St. Brelade 2			0.89									0.85
St. Brelade	0.97	0.90		0.88	0.86	0.92	0.88	0.94	0.95	0.92	0.94	
St. Ouen	1.39	1.17	1.17	1.14	1.29	1.33	1.27	0.98	1.23	1.26	1.25	1.11
St. Helier 1	0.73		1.03	0.93	1.05	0.83	0.91		0.85	0.78	0.84	0.75
St. Helier 2	0.80		1.16	1.02	0.93	0.90	1.00		0.92	0.77	0.77	0.85
St. Helier 3			0.88		0.89					0.85	0.82	0.84
St. Helier		0.78						1.01				
St. Saviour 1			1.11							0.86	0.86	1.06
St. Saviour 2			1.16							0.88	0.89	1.10
St. Saviour 3			0.83								0.91	0.79
St. Saviour	0.87	1.05		0.79	0.77	0.83	0.79	1.03	0.84			
St. Martin	1.26	1.25	1.25	1.22	1.19	1.20	1.15	1.05	1.31	1.28	1.25	1.19
St. Lawrence	1.26	1.34	0.89	1.00	1.15	1.20	1.15	1.12	1.07	1.13	1.17	1.27
St. Mary	2.10	2.62	1.31	1.91	2.03	2.01	1.92	1.10	2.05	2.01	1.92	2.50
Trinity	1.44	1.52	0.76	1.40	1.36	1.37	1.31	1.27	1.50	1.50	1.42	1.45
Most												
Overrrpsntd	2.10	2.62	1.64	1.91	2.03	2.01	1.92	1.37	2.05	2.01	1.94	2.50
Underrpsntd	0.73	0.78	0.76	0.79	0.77	0.83	0.79	0.80	0.84	0.77	0.77	0.75
Range	1.37	1.84	0.88	1.12	1.26	1.18	1.13	0.57	1.21	1.24	1.17	1.75
Propn. underrpsntd	0.68	0.65	0.46	0.52	0.58	0.68	0.52	0.34	0.68	0.68	0.60	0.68
Deviation measure	0.36	0.49	0.21	0.29	0.32	0.33	0.29	0.16	0.32	0.33	0.30	0.42

Key to schemes: 1 – PPC rejected; 2 – default; 3 – PPC interim; 4 – Farnham; 5 – Green; 6 – Ozouf; 7 – Pitman; 8 – Southern; 9 – Noel; 10 – Connétable of St. Mary (A); 11 – Connétable of St. Mary (B); 12 – Le Fondré.

Table B: The Schemes Rank-Ordered*(i) By Scheme (rank order position in [])*

Scheme	Range		Measure Underreprd.		Deviation	
PPC Rejected	1.37	[10]	0.68	[=8]	0.36	[10]
Default	1.84	[12]	0.65	[=7]	0.49	[12]
PPC Interim	0.88	[2]	0.46	[2]	0.21	[2]
Farnham	1.12	[3]	0.52	[=3]	0.29	[=3]
Green	1.26	[9]	0.58	[5]	0.32	[=6]
Ozouf	1.18	[6]	0.68	[=8]	0.33	[=8]
Pitman	1.13	[4]	0.52	[=3]	0.29	[=3]
Southern	0.57	[1]	0.34	[1]	0.16	[1]
Noel	1.21	[7]	0.68	[=8]	0.32	[=6]
Connétable of St. Mary (A)	1.24	[8]	0.68	[=8]	0.33	[=8]
Connétable of St. Mary (B)	1.17	[5]	0.60	[6]	0.30	[5]
Le Fondré	1.75	[11]	0.65	[=8]	0.42	[11]

(ii) By Rank Order Position

Rank Order	Range	Measure Underrepresented	Deviation
1 (best)	Southern	Southern	Southern
2	PPC Interim	PPC Interim	PPC Interim
3	Farnham	Farnham Pitman	Farnham Pitman
4	Pitman		
5	CSMary (B)	Green	CSMary (B)
6	Ozouf	CSMary (B)	Green Noel
7	Noel	Default	
8	CSMary (A)	PPC Rejected Ozouf Noel CSMary (A) Le Fondré	Ozouf CSMary (A)
9	Green		
10	PPC rejected		PPC Rejected
11	Le Fondré		Le Fondré
12 (worst)	Default		Default