



| States Assembly

## Public Accounts Committee

### Records of Meetings

2024

The following records of meetings have been approved by the Committee.

Signed

.....  
Chair  
Deputy Inna Gardiner

États de Jersey



L's États d'Jèrri

# Public Accounts Committee

## Record of Meeting

Date: 27<sup>th</sup> March 2024

|               |   |
|---------------|---|
| Present       | Deputy Inna Gardiner, Chair<br>Deputy Kristina Moore, Member [via Microsoft Teams Items 1 –7 only]<br>Deputy Karen Wilson<br>Deputy Raluca Kovacs, Member<br>Deputy David Warr, Member<br>Philip Taylor, Lay-Member<br>Graeme Phipps, Lay-Member [via Microsoft Teams]  |
| In attendance | Lynn Pamment, Comptroller and Auditor General<br>Helen Thompson, Deputy Comptroller and Auditor General<br><br>Vijay Khakhria, Proposed Lay Member [via Microsoft Teams]<br>Glen Kehoe, Proposed Lay Member<br><br>Katherine De Carteret, Committee and Panel Officer<br>Joseph Brannigan. Research and Project Officer |

| Agenda matter  | Action |
|--|--------|
| <p><b>1. Introduction and Declarations of Conflicts</b></p> <p>The Chair welcomed Members to the first meeting of the PAC and after a round of introductions.</p> <p>Committee were asked by the Chair to note the declaration of interest's section in the Scrutiny and Public Accounts Committee Proceedings Code of Practice and consider declaring any relevant interests. Chair noted regular declarations made by the Committee.</p> <p>Deputy Inna Gardiner: as per public record &amp; as previous role as Minister for Children and Education responsible for budget in 2022 and 2023 for the review of those accounts.</p> <p>Deputy Karen Wilson as per public record. Development of new healthcare facilities as part of project board, some service developments e.g. cannabis. Has joined Connétable of St Clement residents committee – may draw on states funded services.</p> <p>Deputy Raluca Kovacs as per public record declarations. Chairing community activities – will revisit.</p> <p>Deputy Kristina Moore as per public record – set objectives for CEO in role as previous Chief Minister and previous role as chair of SEB.</p> <p>Deputy David Warr as per public record declarations. Ex housing Minister.</p> |        |

|   |            |
|---|------------|
| <p>Philip Taylor was presently the chair of the Jersey College for Girls Foundation which gave grants. He was also the Chair of Jersey Trees for Life which occasionally received small grants from Government.</p> <p>Graeme Phipps: Chair of the Jersey Climate Forum.</p>  |            |
| <p><b>2. Procedural and Administrative Matters</b></p> <p><b>The committee considered and made decisions, regarding the following:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• (Vice-Chair) Chair nominated Kristina Moore. Approved<br/>In absence of Chair and Vice Chair – Karen Wilson. Approved<br/>It was decided that Deputy Raluca Kovacs would lead the review on Annual report and accounts, with Lay Members.</li> <li>• Day and time of regular meetings the committee agreed to hold meetings on Wednesdays 12.30 – 3.30 pm.</li> <li>• Oral and written evidence. The committee discussed the procedures around oral and written evidence.</li> <li>• Individual matters PAC is not to consider these for areas of review.</li> </ul>  | <b>JJB</b> |
| <p><b>3. Working Practices</b></p> <p>The PAC considered and agreed the Committee’s future working practices, including consideration of Committee communication. The PAC agreed to use Microsoft Teams as primary way of communication. The PAC also agreed to share by email duplicate document through email at the start until all members have access to Microsoft Teams. PAC also looked at conduct of meetings.</p> <p>The PAC noted the Code of Practice for Scrutiny Panels and the PAC and Code of Conduct for Lay Members of the PAC.</p>  | <b>JJB</b> |
| <p><b>4. Comptroller and Auditor General Update</b></p> <p>The PAC received an update from the Comptroller and Auditor General (C&amp;AG) in relation to her audit plan for 2024. The C&amp;AG explained to the new PAC the current work programme for the year and how it is updated. The C&amp;AG informed the PAC that a number of reports have already been published this year Electronic Patient Record, Annual Reporting and the Use of Consultants.</p> <p>The C&amp;AG also informed the PAC to expect two reports in the next quarter Tackling Fraud and Error Phase 2 and Jersey Performance Framework. The C&amp;AG also informed the PAC that they are looking into the annual reporting of public bodies that have produced annual reports. They will look at transparency, assessment tool and issue a best practice guide.</p> <p>The C&amp;AG informed the PAC of the Key findings and recommendations of the Use of Consultants. The PAC discussed the report and agreed to look at the Government response and possible follow up depending on response.</p> | <b>JJB</b> |
| <p><b>5. Annual Reporting</b></p> <p>The PAC noted a draft comments paper in relation to the Executive Response to the C&amp;AG report ‘Annual Reporting’. The PAC discussed the draft comments and agreed to publish the comments paper.</p>   | <b>KdC</b> |

|  |                   |
|--|-------------------|
| <p><b>6. Handling and Learning from Complaints – Follow up</b></p> <p>The PAC noted and discussed the Executive Response, associated comments to the C&amp;AG report ‘Handling and Learning from Complaints – Follow Up’ and a draft comments paper.</p> <p>The PAC noted that a letter had been drafted to the Chief Executive to follow up on the concerns it had identified within the Comments paper, however, it agreed that it would not proceed with the letter and conduct a full follow up later in the year. The PAC tasked Officers to incorporate the PAC concerns into the comments paper. The PAC agreed to publish the comments paper Executive Response once the comments paper was updated.</p>           | <p><b>KdC</b></p> |
| <p><b>7. Government Response to COVID-19 Pandemic: Economic, Social and Health Related Recovery</b></p> <p>The PAC noted the Executive Response and a draft comments paper in relation to the C&amp;AG report ‘Government Response to COVID-19 Pandemic: Economic, Social and Health Related Recovery’.</p> <p>The PAC discussed the draft comments and agreed to make minor changes to the comments paper and tasked Officers to make the changes. The PAC agreed to publish the comments paper Executive Response once the comments paper was updated.</p> <p>The PAC noted that all of the recommendations are expected to be delivered by December 2024 the PAC agreed to follow up in 2025 on the implementation.</p> | <p><b>KdC</b></p> |
| <p><b>8. Mid-Term Reflections</b></p> <p>The PAC noted and discussed the Executive Response to the C&amp;AG report ‘Mid-Term Reflections and agreed to publish the executive response without any additional comments.</p>   | <p><b>KdC</b></p> |
| <p><b>9. Major and strategic projects</b></p> <p>The PAC noted the Executive Response to the C&amp;AG report ‘Major and Strategic Projects, Including Capital Projects’ and agreed to publish the executive response without any additional comments.</p>  | <p><b>KdC</b></p> |
| <p><b>10. Electronic Patient Record</b></p> <p>The PAC noted the executive response to the C&amp;AG report ‘Electronic Patient Records’ and agreed to discuss any further comments or actions at the PAC next meeting.</p>   | <p><b>KdC</b></p> |
| <p><b>11. Report for Performance Management – Follow Up</b></p> <p>The PAC noted the final draft report of the previous PAC’s review of Performance Management – Follow up. The PAC tasked Officers to publish the report and associated news release.</p>   | <p><b>KdC</b></p> |
| <p><b>12. Future Meetings</b></p> <p>The PAC noted that the Committee’s first full scheduled meeting would take place at 12:00pm on Wednesday 24th April 2024 in the Blampied Room, States Building. The PAC noted that this meeting would also be a training session.</p>   | <p><b>JJB</b></p> |

# Public Accounts Committee

## Record of Meeting

Date: 24<sup>th</sup> April 2024

|               |  |
|---------------|--|
| Present       | Deputy Inna Gardiner, Chair<br>Deputy Kristina Moore, Member<br>Deputy Karen Wilson, Member<br>Deputy Raluca Kovacs, Member<br>Deputy David Warr, Member<br>Philip Taylor, Lay-Member<br>Graeme Phipps, Lay-Member<br>Vijay Khakhria, Proposed Lay Member<br>Glen Kehoe, Proposed Lay Member                           |
| In attendance | Lynn Pamment, Comptroller and Auditor General<br>Helen Thompson, Deputy Comptroller and Auditor General<br><br>Andy Harris, Committee and Panel Officer<br>Joseph Brannigan, Research and Project Officer<br>Howard Le Cornu, Resolution Centre [item 8 only]<br>Abigail Le Chevalier, Resolution Centre [item 8 only] |

| Agenda matter   | Action       |
|---|--------------|
| <p><b>1. Records of Meetings</b></p> <p>The PAC noted and approved the record of the meeting held on 27<sup>th</sup> March 2024, subject to minor amendments. The Officer advised that the amendments would be made.</p>  | <b>AH/JB</b> |
| <p><b>2. Appointment of Lay Members</b></p> <p>The PAC noted the appointment of Glen Kehoe and Vijay Khakhria as Lay Members of the PAC at the States Assembly sitting on 16<sup>th</sup> April 2024. The PAC welcomed them both to the Committee.</p>  |              |
| <p><b>3. Conflicts of Interest</b></p> <p>Glen Kehoe noted that he was a member of the Geospatial Board which provided assistance to Government in identifying solutions for Geo-mapping in respect of IT programmes and solutions. It was noted, however, that this work was not charged for and was done on a voluntary basis.</p> <p>Vijay Khakhria noted that he did not currently have any conflicts of interest in relation to his role on the PAC.</p> |              |
| <p><b>4. Comptroller and Auditor General Update</b></p> <p>The PAC received a presentation from the Comptroller and Auditor General (C&amp;AG) in relation to the progress made in the audit plan for 2024. The following updates were noted:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Commissioning of Services – it was noted that the fieldwork had been completed on this review and that the report was currently in drafting.</li> </ul>              |              |

|   |                       |
|---|-----------------------|
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Critical Infrastructure Resilience – this report was currently in the draft reporting stage, and it was intended for the report to be presented during May 2024.</li> <li>• Oversight of Arm’s Length Bodies – fieldwork had been completed on the review and it was currently in the report drafting stage.</li> <li>• Tackling Fraud and Error Phase 2 – the phase two fieldwork for this review was commencing and a project specification had been published.</li> <li>• Jersey Performance Framework – Fieldwork had commenced on this review and a project specification had been published.</li> <li>• Annual Reporting – fieldwork had also commenced on this review and a project specification had been published. A self-assessment tool had also been issued in January 2024.</li> </ul> <p>The C&amp;AG then provided the PAC with a presentation outlining the analysis of her Annual Report of Findings 2023. This focussed on the summary of work that had been undertaken by the Jersey Audit Office, as well as an analysis of the main themes of recommendations made in 2023. The C&amp;AG then explained the movement of open recommendations from C&amp;AG reports in 2023, alongside the categories that these recommendations fell into.</p> |                       |
| <p><b>5. Electronic Patient Record</b></p> <p>The PAC noted the Executive Response that had been provided by Government to the C&amp;AG report ‘Electronic Patient Records’. The PAC agreed that it wished to make comments in relation to the response and tasked the Officers to draft these and circulate to the Chair for final approval.</p>   | <p><b>AH / JB</b></p> |
| <p><b>6. Report for Performance Management – Follow Up</b></p> <p>The PAC recalled that it had presented the report of its predecessor, ‘Performance Management – Follow up’ on Thursday 28<sup>th</sup> March 2024. It was noted that the Executive Response to the report was due on Tuesday 28<sup>th</sup> May 2024.</p>  |                       |
| <p><b>7. Briefing – States Annual Report and Accounts 2023</b></p> <p>The PAC noted that it had arranged private briefings on the afternoon of Thursday 2<sup>nd</sup> May 2024 in relation to the Annual Report and Accounts 2023. It was noted that the PAC would first meet with Mazars (auditors of the States of Jersey Accounts) and follow on from a briefing from Government Officials.</p> <p>It was noted that, as the accounts pertained to 2023, the Chair and three Members of the PAC held a potential conflict of interest having held Ministerial roles during this period. It was, therefore, agreed that Deputy Kovacs would act as the lead member on any review of the Annual Report and Accounts, with other Members assessing any potential conflicts in questioning as the review progressed.</p>  |                       |
| <p><b>8. Training</b></p> <p>The PAC welcomed Howard Le Cornu and Abigail Le Chevalier from the Resolution Centre for a training session to assist it in identifying its key priorities for the remainder of its term of office.</p>  |                       |
| <p><b>9. Work Programme</b></p> <p>The PAC agreed that it would defer discussion of this item until the following meeting in order to factor in the outcomes of the training session that had taken place with the Resolution Centre.</p>   | <p><b>AH</b></p>      |

|                            |  |
|----------------------------|--|
| <b>10. Future Meetings</b> |  |
|----------------------------|--|

|   |  |
|---|--|
| The PAC noted that its next scheduled meeting was due to take place at 12:00pm on Wednesday 15 <sup>th</sup> May in the Blampied Room, States Building. |  |
|---|--|

# Public Accounts Committee

## Record of Meeting

Date: 2<sup>nd</sup> May 2024

|               |  |
|---------------|--|
| Present       | Deputy Inna Gardiner, Chair<br>Deputy Kristina Moore, Member<br>Deputy Karen Wilson, Member [items 1 and 2 only]<br>Deputy Raluca Kovacs, Member<br>Deputy David Warr, Member<br>Graeme Phipps, Lay-Member<br>Glen Kehoe, Proposed Lay Member [via Microsoft Teams]  |
| Apologies     | Vijay Khakhria, Proposed Lay Member<br>Philip Taylor, Lay-Member   |
| In attendance | Helen Thompson, Deputy Comptroller and Auditor General<br><br>Mark Kirkham, Mazars [item 1 only]<br>Gavin Barker, Mazars [item 1 only]<br>Nicola Hallas, Mazars [item 1 only]<br>Richard Bell, Treasurer of the States [item 3 only]<br>Andrew Hacquoil, Group Director, Strategic Finance [item 3 only]<br>Elaine Miller, Minister for Treasury and Resources [item 3 only]<br>Andrew Metcalfe, Associate Director of Planning and Performance [item 3 only]<br>Hannah Layer, Head of Group Reporting [item 3 only]<br>Jason Whitfield, Chief Information Officer [item 3 only]<br>Jonathan Corfe, Senior Strategy Officer, Insight [item 3 only]<br><br>Andy Harris, Committee and Panel Officer<br>Joseph Brannigan, Research and Project Officer |

| Agenda matter   | Action    |
|---|-----------|
| <p><b>1. Briefing from Mazars, External Auditors of the States of Jersey Group Accounts, re States Annual Report and Accounts 2023</b></p> <p>The PAC received Mark Kirkham, Gavin Barker, Mazars and Nicola Hallas, from Mazars (External Auditors of the States of Jersey Group Accounts) for a private briefing in relation to their audit of the States of Jersey Annual Report and Accounts 2023. The record of this meeting was classified as exempt in accordance with the Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011 (as amended) under Qualified Exemption Article 34.</p>                 |           |
| <p><b>2. Electronic Patient Records</b></p> <p>The PAC noted draft comments in relation to the Executive Response to the Comptroller and Auditor General's (C&amp;AG) report 'Electronic Patient Records'. The PAC discussed the comments and agreed additional points for inclusion. The Officer advised that this would be updated and circulated for final approval in due course. The PAC also agreed that it would include the points raised within a news release to be circulated to the media in respect of the PAC's formation and work programme priorities for its term of office.</p> | <b>AH</b> |



**3. Briefing from Government of Jersey on States Annual Report and Accounts 2023**

The PAC received Richard Bell, Treasurer of the States, Andrew Hacquoil, Group Director, Strategic Finance, Elaine Miller, Minister for Treasury and Resources, Andrew Metcalfe, Associate Director of Planning and Performance, Hannah Layer, Head of Group Reporting, Jason Whitfield, Chief Information Officer and Jonathan Corfe, Senior Strategy Officer, Insight for a private briefing in relation to the States Annual Report and Accounts 2023. The record of this meeting was classified as exempt in accordance with the Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011 (as amended) under Qualified Exemption Article 36(a).

# Public Accounts Committee

## Record of Meeting

Date: 15<sup>th</sup> May 2024

|               |   |
|---------------|---|
| Present       | Deputy Inna Gardiner, Chair<br>Deputy Kristina Moore, Vice-Chair<br>Deputy Karen Wilson, Member [items 1 and 2 only]<br>Deputy Raluca Kovacs, Member<br>Deputy David Warr, Member<br>Graeme Phipps, Lay-Member<br>Glen Kehoe, Lay Member<br>Vijay Khakhria, Lay Member<br>Philip Taylor, Lay-Member                 |
| In attendance | Kate Faragher, Consultant -Facilitator and Coach, Bespoke Skills [Item 8 only]<br><br>Lynn Pamment, Comptroller and Auditor General<br>Helen Thompson, Deputy Comptroller and Auditor General<br><br>Andy Harris, Committee and Panel Officer<br>Joseph Brannigan, Research and Project Officer [Items 1 to 7 only] |

| Agenda matter  | Action       |
|--|--------------|
| <p><b>1. Records of Meetings</b></p> <p>The PAC noted and approved the records of meetings held on 27<sup>th</sup> March, 24<sup>th</sup> April and 2<sup>nd</sup> May 2024.</p>   | <b>AH/JB</b> |
| <p><b>2. Conflicts of Interest</b></p> <p>The PAC did not note any new Conflicts of Interest.</p>  |              |
| <p><b>3. Comptroller and Auditor General update</b></p> <p>The PAC received an update from the Comptroller and Auditor General in respect of her audit plan for 2024. It was agreed that, given the time constraints within the meeting, the PAC would receive a further update from the C&amp;AG on her ongoing work programme at its next scheduled meeting on 5<sup>th</sup> June 2024.</p>   |              |
| <p><b>4. Electronic Patient Records</b></p> <p>The PAC noted the presentation of its comments paper regarding the Executive Response to the C&amp;AG report 'Electronic Patient Records. It was agreed that the PAC would send a follow up letter to the Interim Chief Executive Officer (CEO) to request a response to the issues highlighted in its comments.</p>  |              |
| <p><b>5. Use of Consultants – Follow up Executive Response</b></p> <p>The PAC noted and discussed the Executive Response to the C&amp;AG report 'Use of Consultants – Follow up'. The PAC identified areas of concern that it wished to raise and agreed it would produce comments to present alongside the response. The PAC tasked Officers to draft comments so that it could approve them for presentation following its next scheduled meeting on 5<sup>th</sup> June 2024.</p> | <b>AH</b>    |

15.05.2024

|   |                     |
|---|---------------------|
| <p><b>6. States Annual Report and Accounts Review 2023</b></p> <p>The PAC discussed and agreed the Terms of Reference for the proposed review into the States of Jersey Annual Report and Accounts 2023. The PAC also discussed and approved the scoping document in respect of the review. It was noted that these would be sent to the Scrutiny Liaison Committee (SLC) for approval, after which it was intended for the review to be launched on Friday 17<sup>th</sup> May 2024.</p> <p>The PAC noted that the Government had yet to provide copies of the Internal Audit Opinion and Auditors report on Internal IT controls and requested that this be followed up as a matter of priority. The PAC noted that it was due to hold a public hearing with the Treasurer of the States and the Interim CEO on Wednesday 5<sup>th</sup> June 2024. The PAC discussed a draft question plan and discussed topic areas that the PAC wished to include for the hearing. Officers advised that these would be updated and circulated in due course.</p> <p>The PAC noted that it wished to arrange a further hearing with the Chief Officer for Health and Community Services (HCS) and the Treasurer of the States to discuss the health-related overspend within the 2023 accounts. Officers advised that a date would be identified, and a meeting request circulated in due course.</p> <p>The PAC noted that the Chair, Vice-Chair and Deputies Wilson and Warr had all held Ministerial positions during 2023 and, therefore, Deputy Raluca Kovacs would act as lead member for the review. It was agreed that the Members who had held Ministerial positions would not participate in the hearings for the review in the interest of openness and transparency.</p> | <p><b>AH/JB</b></p> |
| <p><b>7. Quarterly Recommendations Tracker</b></p> <p>The PAC noted the Quarter One Recommendations Tracker update report and agreed to review it at its next scheduled meeting. The PAC also tasked Officers to arrange a hearing with the Interim CEO for September 2024 to discuss the implementation of recommendations on the tracker arising from Quarter Two 2024. It was also noted that the Interim CEO had agreed to provide the PAC with the quarterly update reports by the end of the month, following the quarter end.</p>  | <p><b>AH/JB</b></p> |
| <p><b>8. Training</b></p> <p>The PAC received Kate Faragher, a training coach and facilitator from Bespoke Skills Ltd. between 1:30pm and 4pm for a training session on effective questioning skills for the newly elected PAC Members and Non-Elected Members.</p> <p>The PAC also noted proposed details of a visit to Westminster to meet with and observe its counterpart PAC. It was advised that the provisional dates for this trip would be 3<sup>rd</sup> and 4<sup>th</sup> July 2024. Officers advised that further details of the trip would be circulated in due course.</p>   |                     |
| <p><b>9. Work Programme</b></p> <p>The PAC noted its current work programme for 2024 and agreed it would discuss this further at its next scheduled meeting on 5<sup>th</sup> June 2024.</p>  |                     |
| <p><b>10. Future Meetings</b></p> <p>The PAC noted that its next scheduled meeting was due to take place at 12:30pm on Wednesday 5<sup>th</sup> June 2024 in the Blampied Room, States Building.</p>  |                     |

# Public Accounts Committee

## Record of Meeting

Date: 5<sup>th</sup> June 2024

|               |  |
|---------------|--|
| Present       | Deputy Inna Gardiner, Chair<br>Deputy Kristina Moore, Vice-Chair [Items 1 – 2 and 4 – 13]<br>Deputy Raluca Kovacs, Member<br>Deputy David Warr, Member [Items 1 – 2 and 4 – 13]<br>Graeme Phipps, Lay-Member<br>Vijay Khakhria, Lay Member<br>Philip Taylor, Lay-Member  |
| Apologies     | Deputy Karen Wilson, Member<br>Glen Kehoe, Lay Member  |
| In attendance | Lynn Pamment, Comptroller and Auditor General<br>Helen Thompson, Deputy Comptroller and Auditor General<br><br>Richard Bell, Treasurer of the States [item 3 only]<br>Andrew Metcalfe, Associate Director of Strategic Planning and Performance, Cabinet Office [item 3 only]<br>Jason Whitfield, Chief Information Officer, Cabinet Office [item 3 only]<br>Hannah Layer, Group Reporting Director, Treasury and Exchequer [item 3 only]<br><br>Andy Harris, Committee and Panel Officer<br>Joseph Brannigan, Research and Project Officer<br>Charlotte Curry, Communications Officer [item 3 only] |

| Agenda matter   | Action       |
|---|--------------|
| <p><b>1. Records of Meetings</b></p> <p>The PAC noted and approved the record of the meeting held on 15th May 2024.</p>   | <b>AH/JB</b> |
| <p><b>2. Conflicts of Interest</b></p> <p>The PAC did not note any new Conflicts of Interest.</p>   |              |
| <p><b>3. Public Hearing – States Annual Report and Accounts 2023 Review</b></p> <p>The PAC received the Treasurer of the States and officers for a public hearing at 2pm in relation to the PAC’s review of the Annual Report and Accounts 2023. The proceedings were webcast live and a recording was made so that a transcript could be produced.</p> |              |
| <p><b>4. Comptroller and Auditor General update</b></p> <p>The PAC received an update from the Comptroller and Auditor General in respect of her audit plan for 2024. The following updates were noted:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Commissioning of Services – it was noted that the report was currently in drafting.</li> </ul>     |              |

|   |                  |
|---|------------------|
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Critical Infrastructure Resilience – it was noted that this report was published on 3rd of June 2024.</li> <li>• Oversight of Arm’s Length Bodies – it was noted that this report was currently in the drafting stage.</li> <li>• Tackling Fraud and Error Phase 2 – the phase two fieldwork for this review was commencing and a project specification had been published.</li> <li>• Jersey Performance Framework – Fieldwork had commenced on this review and a project specification had been published.</li> <li>• Annual Reporting – fieldwork had also commenced on this review and a project specification had been published. A self-assessment tool had also been issued in January 2024.</li> </ul> <p>The C&amp;AG provided the PAC with a presentation outlining the findings from the Jersey Audit Office Annual Report 2023. The C&amp;AG provided analysis of the Jersey Audit Office’s (JAO) performance compared to comparable Audit Offices, as well as an analysis of the costs of the organisation for 2023.</p> <p>The C&amp;AG outlined the findings from the JAO Transparency Report 2023. This outlined how the JAO was organised to meet the responsibilities of the C&amp;AG, as well as the quality assurance processes for the JAO, and the quality monitoring results for 2023.</p> <p>The C&amp;AG explained the financial statements of audit quality and the feedback received. The C&amp;AG then explained the percentage of audit recommendations accepted for action compared to other comparable Audit Offices.</p> |                  |
| <p><b>5. Electronic Patient Records</b></p> <p>The PAC noted a letter from the Acting Chief Executive in response to questions raised within the comments published alongside the Executive Response to the Electronic Patient Records report. The PAC noted the response and agreed it would conduct further follow up during August 2024 when it was anticipated a prioritisation of Modernisation and Digital Programmes would be completed.</p>   |                  |
| <p><b>6. Use of Consultants – Follow up Executive Response</b></p> <p>The PAC discussed and approved draft Comments in respect of the Executive Response to the C&amp;AG report ‘Use of Consultants – Follow Up and asked Officers to publish these as soon as possible.</p>  | <p><b>AH</b></p> |
| <p><b>7. Performance Management – Follow up - Executive Response</b></p> <p>The PAC noted the Executive Response to the Comptroller and Auditor General report on performance management – follow up and agreed to review at its next meeting.</p>  |                  |
| <p><b>8. States Annual Report and Accounts Review 2023</b></p> <p>The PAC noted the draft question plan in respect of the public hearing with the Chief Officer for Health and Community Services scheduled for 3rd July 2024 and agreed to review at its next meeting.</p> <p>The PAC noted the written questions to be sent out by the PAC in relation to a public hearing for the States Annual Report and Accounts 2023 Review. The PAC noted the letters to be sent out by the PAC to individual departments regarding the Annual Report and Accounts 2023. The PAC was advised that responses to the questions were due on Monday 17th June 2024.</p>   |                  |

|  |                  |
|--|------------------|
| <p><b>9. Procurement by the Government of Jersey</b></p> <p>The PAC noted and discussed a draft Scoping Document and Terms of Reference for the PAC's proposed review of Procurement by the Government of Jersey. The PAC agreed to approve the documents once Officers had made minor changes to the documents.</p> | <p><b>AH</b></p> |
| <p><b>10. Quarterly Recommendations Tracker</b></p> <p>The PAC noted and discussed the Quarter One Recommendations Tracker update report and agreed to review further at its next scheduled meeting.</p>   |                  |
| <p><b>11. Work Programme</b></p> <p>The PAC noted its current work programme for 2024 and agreed it would discuss this further at its next scheduled meeting on 19th June 2024.</p>  |                  |
| <p><b>12. Future Meetings</b></p> <p>The PAC noted that its next scheduled meeting was due to take place at 12:30pm on Wednesday 19th June 2024 in the Blampied Room, States Building.</p>   |                  |

# Public Accounts Committee

## Record of Meeting

Date: 19th June 2024

|               |   |
|---------------|---|
| Present       | Deputy Inna Gardiner, Chair<br>Deputy Kristina Moore, Vice-Chair<br>Deputy Karen Wilson, Member<br>Deputy Raluca Kovacs, Member<br>Deputy David Warr, Member<br>Graeme Phipps, Lay-Member<br>Vijay Khakhria, Lay Member<br>Glen Kehoe, Lay Member   |
| Apologies     | Philip Taylor, Lay-Member   |
| In attendance | Lynn Pamment, Comptroller and Auditor General<br><br>Graeme Sproats, Statistician, Statistics Jersey [item 3 only]<br>Sarah Davis, Head of Analytics and Statistics Enablement, Statistics Jersey [item 3 only]<br><br>Andy Harris, Committee and Panel Officer<br>Joseph Brannigan, Research and Project Officer |

| Agenda matter   | Action |
|---|--------|
| <p><b>1. Records of Meetings</b></p> <p>The PAC noted and approved the record of the meeting held on 5th June 2024.</p>   |        |
| <p><b>2. Conflicts of Interest</b></p> <p>Deputy Kristina Moore declared that she had recently been appointed as a member of the board for the Jersey Opera House. The PAC noted this declaration and agreed that Deputy Moore would recuse herself from any work examining grants and subsidies provided to the Jersey Opera House.</p>  |        |
| <p><b>3. Briefing from Statistics Jersey on the Island Outcome Indicators</b></p> <p>The PAC received officials from Statistics Jersey for a briefing on updates that had been made to the Island Outcome Indicators and how these would be presented to the public. The record of this meeting was classified as exempt in accordance with the Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011 (as amended) under Qualified Exemption Article 35.</p>   |        |
| <p><b>4. Comptroller and Auditor General update</b></p> <p>The PAC received an update from the Comptroller and Auditor General in respect of her audit plan for 2024. The following updates were noted:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Commissioning of Services – it was noted that this review was currently in the draft reporting stage.</li> <li>• Oversight of Arm's Lengths Bodies – it was noted that this review was also in the draft reporting stage.</li> </ul> |        |

19.06.2024

- Tackling Fraud and Error, Phase Two – fieldwork was currently ongoing in relation to phase two of this review.
- Staff Recruitment and Retention – a draft project specification was currently being created in relation to this planned review.
- Jersey Performance Framework – it was noted that fieldwork was ongoing in the relation to this review.
- Annual Reporting - it was noted that fieldwork was ongoing in the relation to this review.
- Grants and Subsidies – it was noted that work was due to commence on this review and that a project specification was due to be published.

#### Critical Infrastructure Resilience – Energy

The C&AG provided the PAC with an overview of the recently published report, Critical Infrastructure Resilience – Energy, which had been presented on Monday 3rd June 2024. The review had evaluated whether the Government had an effective approach to critical infrastructure resilience for the energy sector that encompassed supporting and requiring asset owners and operators to implement high standards of resilience.

The review had provided the following key findings:

- There was no definition of critical national infrastructure in the Island and no cross-cutting infrastructure policy. The bridging Island Plan 2022-25, published in March 2022, included a strategic proposal to develop a new Infrastructure Roadmap for Jersey.
- The Government of Jersey’s approach to understanding and securing the resilience of the Island’s infrastructure had been severely tested by critical incidents over recent years. These included the COVID-19 pandemic, the tragic incident at Haut du Mont, the January 2023 floods, the October 2023 gas outage and the impact of storm Ciaran in November 2023.
- Jersey imported 98% of all energy supplies. Excluding petroleum products for road, aviation and marine use, 59% of energy consumed from these imports was from low carbon sources.
- The Government issued a Crisis Resilience Improvement Plan (the Plan) in July 2023, chiefly in response to the independent review of the Government’s management of COVID-19 pandemic. The Plan acknowledged that Government had an underdeveloped risk identification and mitigation system at both operational departmental level and at a strategic Government level.
- Both before and after the Plan was published, there had been learning from each of the key incidents. The Government had carried out six de-brief exercises but there remained a great deal to do to bring that learning into effect.
- Work was now in hand to introduce a Jersey Resilience Law. The States were clear that powers needed to be prioritised and proportionate to achieve short, medium and long-term plans. The current intention was that a new Resilience Law would be introduced in a phased way, starting before the end of 2025.
- Capacity in the Government to manage resilience was currently very limited and arrangements intended to underpin effective resilience were not yet adequate. The Community Risk Register was not an effective tool in its current format. The Jersey Resilience Forum had not yet successfully



|   |                  |
|---|------------------|
| <p>made resilience feel like an Island-wide challenge where partners picked up proactive roles and responsibilities.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Government arrangements to assure the resilience of energy supply as both a community leader and as a key customer were weak. Arrangements for ensuring the monitoring, reporting and scrutinising of resilience information by the operators and owners of critical infrastructure for energy were not established.</li> <li>• The proposed new Resilience Law included a focus on both anticipating and resisting critical incidents. A significant mechanism intended to provide assurance in these areas as part of the new legislation was the Jersey Resilience Forum’s introduction of Resilience Standards. These Resilience Standards introduced new duties on all those likely to be engaged in an emergency response. They were thorough and represented best practice. However, it was not evident that they had been adjusted to take account of the need for a proportionate approach in Jersey.</li> <li>• Overall, there was a lack of a coherent, joined up approach across Government. This mitigated against surety of resilience in the energy sector. Roles and responsibilities were also not clear enough. There was no single person, team or department responsible for co-ordinating energy matters and there was no requirement or clear expectation for the teams in various departments to work effectively together.</li> <li>• The Carbon Neutral Roadmap and, before that, Pathway 2050, set a vision for Jersey’s future energy provision in order to meet the challenges of the net zero transition. However, from a resilience perspective, there were significant decisions to be made.</li> </ul> <p>In conclusion, the C&amp;AG noted that a framework and documentation had been put in place to manage critical incidents and promote resilience. A new Resilience Law was proposed, based on good practice in other jurisdictions. These developments had potential to enhance controls, manage risk, provide assurance and promote resilience. However, urgent action was required to put in place a robust Community Risk Register including energy infrastructure risks owned and managed by the Government and individual suppliers. Effective relationships were necessary to build between the Government and all energy providers to enable the Jersey Resilience Forum to function effectively in respect of energy infrastructure risks. Critical incidents in recent years should be the catalyst for the Government and its partners to address weaknesses in managing energy resilience. There was work to be undertaken by Government to enable it, as a community leader, to provide Islanders with assurance on energy supply, fuel storage and distribution. Clear, resourced action plans should be developed to demonstrate how capacity was to be enhanced in an integrated way which balanced short and medium–term risk management and the needs and opportunities of future energy policy.</p> <p>The C&amp;AG had made 12 recommendations within the report along with four areas of work that should be prioritised and two areas for consideration. It was noted that the Executive Response to the report was due on 15th June 2024.</p> |                  |
| <p><b>5. Use of Consultants – Follow up Executive Response</b></p> <p>The PAC noted that it had presented its comments on the Executive Response and requested further information from the Acting Chief Executive in relation to these comments. It was noted that a response was due to be shared on 17th June, however, an extension had been requested to 21st June. The PAC agreed it would discuss the response further at its next scheduled meeting.</p>  | <p><b>AH</b></p> |

|   |  |
|---|--|
| <p><b>6. Performance Management – Follow up - Executive Response</b></p> <p>The PAC noted and discussed the Executive Response to its report 'Performance Management – Follow Up'. The PAC agreed that it would produce comments on the Executive Response highlighting its views on the response to the recommendations. Officers advised that these would be drafted and shared with the PAC in due course for approval.</p>  | <p><b>AH</b></p>                                   |
| <p><b>7. States Annual Report and Accounts Review 2023</b></p> <p>The PAC noted the draft question plan in respect of the public hearing with the Chief Officer for Health and Community Services scheduled for 3rd July 2024 and discussed areas of inclusion. It was agreed that Officers would circulate the question plan for further input from Members by Monday 24th June, after which the question plan would be updated and circulated to Members.</p> <p>The PAC noted responses to written questions that had been received from Government Departments arising from the departmental annual reports contained within the Annual Report and Accounts. It was noted that extensions had been requested by the Cabinet Office and Department for Infrastructure and Environment to Friday 21st June. The PAC requested that all responses be circulated once these had been received for Members to identify any further follow up questions.</p> <p>The Officer explained that a Heads of Report had been drafted for the review and that work would commence on drafting the report ahead of the public hearing on 3rd July 2024. Once this hearing had taken place, the final report would be shared with the PAC for approval.</p> | <p><b>JB</b></p> <p><b>JB</b></p> <p><b>AH</b></p> |
| <p><b>8. Procurement by the Government of Jersey</b></p> <p>The PAC noted that the Scoping Document and Terms of Reference were currently with the Scrutiny Liaison Committee (SLC) for sign off prior to being launched. It was agreed that, subject to sign off from SLC, the review would be launched on Monday 24th June 2024. The Officer advised that letters would be drafted to send to key stakeholders and Government of Jersey and Non-Ministerial Chief Officers in due course.</p>   | <p><b>AH/JB</b></p>                                |
| <p><b>9. Quarterly Recommendations Tracker</b></p> <p>The PAC noted and discussed the Quarter Two Recommendations Tracker update report and agreed to review further at its next scheduled meeting.</p>   |  |
| <p><b>10. Future Meetings</b></p> <p>The PAC noted that its next scheduled meeting was due to take place at 12:30pm on Wednesday 10th July 2024 in the Blampied Room, States Building.</p>  |  |

# Public Accounts Committee

## Record of Meeting

Date: 3<sup>rd</sup> July 2024

|               |  |
|---------------|--|
| Present       | Deputy Inna Gardiner, Chair<br>Deputy Raluca Kovacs, Member<br>Deputy David Warr, Member<br>Philip Taylor, Lay-Member<br>Graeme Phipps, Lay-Member<br>Vijay Khakhria, Lay Member<br>Glen Kehoe, Lay Member   |
| Apologies     | Deputy Kristina Moore, Vice-Chair<br>Deputy Karen Wilson, Member   |
| In attendance | Lynn Pamment, Comptroller and Auditor General<br><br>Mr. Chris Bown, Chief Officer, Health and Community Services<br>Mr. Obi Hasan, Financial Recovery Director, Health and Community Services<br>Dr. Simon Chapman, Chief of Service, Surgery, Health and Community Services<br><br>Andy Harris, Committee and Panel Officer<br>Joseph Brannigan, Research and Project Officer<br>Charlotte Curry, Communications Officer |

| Agenda matter   | Action                            |
|---|-----------------------------------|
| <p><b>1. States Annual Report and Accounts Review 2023</b></p> <p>The Public Accounts Committee (PAC) received Mr. Chris Bown, Chief Officer, Health and Community Services and officers for a public hearing in relation to its review of the States Annual Report and Accounts 2023. The proceedings were webcast live on the States Assembly website and a recording was made so that a transcript could be produced.</p> <p>Further to the public hearing, the PAC requested that a letter be sent to the Chief Officer requesting additional information arising from the hearing. Officers advised that a letter would be drafted and circulated for approval in due course.</p> <p>The PAC also agreed to present key points arising from the hearing on the States Assembly social media platforms. The Communications Officer advised that these would be sent for approval in due course.</p> | <p><b>JB</b></p> <p><b>CC</b></p> |

# Public Accounts Committee

## Record of Meeting

### Meeting held digitally

Date: 30<sup>th</sup> July 2024

|               |  |
|---------------|--|
| Present       | Deputy Inna Gardiner, Chair<br>Deputy Kristina Moore, Vice-Chair<br>Deputy Raluca Kovacs, Member<br>Deputy Karen Wilson, Member<br>Deputy David Warr, Member<br>Philip Taylor, Lay-Member<br>Graeme Phipps, Lay-Member<br>Vijay Khakhria, Lay Member<br>Glen Kehoe, Lay Member |
| In attendance | Andy Harris, Committee and Panel Officer<br>Joseph Brannigan, Research and Project Officer   |

| Agenda matter   | Action    |
|---|-----------|
| <b>1. States Annual Report and Accounts 2023</b><br><br>The Public Accounts Committee (PAC) noted and approved the publication of its report P.A.C.2/2024 'States Annual Report and Accounts 2023'. It was agreed that the report would be sent to States Members and the media under embargo before formal presentation on Wednesday 31 <sup>st</sup> July 2024. | <b>AH</b> |

# Public Accounts Committee

## Record of Meeting

### Meeting held by video conference

Date: 14<sup>th</sup> August 2024

|               |   |
|---------------|---|
| Present       | Deputy Inna Gardiner, Chair<br>Deputy Raluca Kovacs, Member<br>Philip Taylor, Lay-Member<br>Graeme Phipps, Lay-Member<br>Vijay Khakhria, Lay Member<br>Glen Kehoe, Lay Member |
| Apologies     | Deputy Kristina Moore, Vice-Chair<br>Deputy Karen Wilson, Member<br>Deputy David Warr, Member   |
| In attendance | Helen Thompson, Deputy Comptroller and Auditor General, Jersey Audit Office<br><br>Andy Harris, Committee and Panel Officer<br>Charlotte Curry, Communications Officer        |

| Agenda matter   | Action    |
|---|-----------|
| <b>1. Records of Meetings</b><br><br>The Public Accounts Committee (PAC) approved the record of the meeting held on 3 <sup>rd</sup> July 2024.  |           |
| <b>2. Conflicts of Interest</b><br><br>The PAC noted that there were no conflicts of interest to raise in respect of the items being discussed on the agenda for the meeting.   |           |
| <b>3. Executive Response – Critical Infrastructure Resilience – Energy</b><br><br>The PAC noted the Executive Response to the Comptroller and Auditor General’s (C&AG) report, Critical Infrastructure Resilience – Energy. The PAC discussed the response and overall agreed that the response was positive, and it would seek to present it in due course. It also agreed that it would draft comments highlighting points that had been discussed in relation to the overall ownership of the recommendations and the timeline for bringing forward legislation in relation to resilience. The Officer advised that these would be drafted and shared with the PAC in due course for approval. | <b>AH</b> |
| <b>4. Executive Response – Commissioning of Services</b><br><br>The PAC noted that the Executive Response to the C&AG report ‘Commissioning of Services’ had been requested and was due to be received on Monday 9 <sup>th</sup> September 2024. It was also noted that an extension to this deadline had been received from Government due to availability of key officers over the summer recess period. The PAC agreed to extend the deadline until 18 <sup>th</sup> September 2024 and requested the Officer to communicate this to the relevant officials.   | <b>AH</b> |

|   |                               |
|---|-------------------------------|
| <p><b>5. Executive Response – Oversight of Arm’s Length Bodies</b></p> <p>The PAC noted that the Executive Response to the C&amp;AG report ‘Oversight of Arm’s Length Bodies’ had been requested and was due to be received on Tuesday 17<sup>th</sup> September.</p>   |                               |
| <p><b>6. Procurement by the Government of Jersey Review</b></p> <p>The PAC noted that a number of submissions had been received from external and non-ministerial departments in response to questions it had raised about Government procurement processes. It was noted that the deadline for submissions had been extended to Friday 23<sup>rd</sup> August and further submissions would be shared in due course. The PAC agreed to confirm with those that had replied with submissions to date whether they would be willing to attend a public hearing or private hearing with the PAC in order to discuss the submissions further. The Officer advised that, once the submissions had been received, an overview of the key themes raised would be provided to the PAC.</p> <p>The PAC noted that it had agreed to conduct a survey as part of the review in order to gather views from providers and businesses who were currently using the SAP Ariba system for raising invoices and payments for services with Government. The Officer explained that discussions had taken place with Statistics Jersey and the Data Protection Unit in order to clarify the best processes for conducting the survey. It was noted that a draft survey would be provided to the PAC at its meeting on 4<sup>th</sup> September with a view to discussing and identifying the key areas to be examined. It was also explained that the review submissions would be considered further in order to identify any further areas for inclusion within the survey.</p> <p>In order to further assist the PAC in its review, it was agreed that it would request a briefing from the Corporate Services team in order to better understand the different procurement processes utilised by Government.</p> | <p>AH</p> <p>AH</p> <p>AH</p> |
| <p><b>7. Handling and Learning from Complaints Review</b></p> <p>The PAC noted and discussed draft Terms of Reference and a Scoping Document for its proposed review of Handling and Learning from Complaints. The PAC agreed changes to the Terms of Reference and requested the documents to be recirculated for consideration by Members at the next meeting on 4<sup>th</sup> September.</p>  | <p>AH</p>                     |
| <p><b>8. States Annual Report and Accounts 2023 Review</b></p> <p>The PAC recalled that its report P.A.C.2/2024 States Annual Report and Accounts 2023 had been presented on Wednesday 31<sup>st</sup> July 2024. It was noted that the report had received extensive media coverage and that it had been a successful piece of work. The Chair thanked all members for their contributions to the review. It was also noted that the Executive Response to the report had been requested and was due to be received on Tuesday 24<sup>th</sup> September 2024.</p>   | <p>AH</p>                     |
| <p><b>9. Quarterly Recommendations Tracker</b></p> <p>The PAC noted an update report on the recommendations’ tracker for quarter two 2024. The PAC noted that the report did not provide additional detail about the recommendations that had been closed during the quarter and tasked the Officer to request additional information on the rationale for the closing of those recommendations. It was agreed that this would be used to inform the question plan for the public hearing with the interim Chief Executive scheduled for 25<sup>th</sup> September 2024.</p>  | <p>AH</p>                     |

|                            |  |
|----------------------------|--|
| <b>10. Future Meetings</b> |  |
|----------------------------|--|

|  |  |
|--|--|
| <p>The PAC noted that its next scheduled meeting was due to take place at 12:30pm on Wednesday 4<sup>th</sup> September 2024 in the Seymour and Icho Rooms, Morier House. Noting the number of items on the agenda for this meeting, the PAC agreed to extend the meeting by an hour. The Officer advised that the meeting request would be updated in due course.</p> |  |
|--|--|

# Public Accounts Committee

## Record of Meeting

Date: 25<sup>th</sup> September 2024

|               |  |
|---------------|--|
| Present       | Deputy Inna Gardiner, Chair<br>Deputy Kristina Moore, Vice-Chair<br>Deputy Raluca Kovacs, Member<br>Deputy Karen Wilson, Member<br>Deputy David Warr, Member<br>Philip Taylor, Lay-Member<br>Graeme Phipps, Lay-Member<br>Vijay Khakhria, Lay Member<br>Glen Kehoe, Lay Member         |
| Apologies     |  |
| In attendance | Andrew McLaughlin, Chief Executive Officer [item 2 only]<br>Sebastian Perez, Head of Office of the Chief Executive [item 2 only]<br><br>Lynn Pamment, Comptroller and Auditor General<br><br>Joseph Brannigan, Research and Project Officer<br>Charlotte Curry, Communications Officer |

| Agenda matter   | Action                            |
|---|-----------------------------------|
| <p><b>1. Conflicts of Interest</b></p> <p>The PAC noted and thanked Graeme Phipps, Lay-Member for his notice that he was taking part in the People’s Debate as a member of the public and not in relation to the PAC. The People’s Debate was a States Assembly event which was implemented as part of the Democracy Week activities.</p> <p>There were no other conflicts of interest to raise in respect of the items being discussed on the agenda for the meeting.</p>  |                                   |
| <p><b>2. Quarterly Public Hearing with the Chief Executive Officer Government of Jersey</b></p> <p>The PAC discussed, amended and assigned speaking order for the question plan for the hearing with the Chief Executive Officer.</p> <p>The Committee received Andrew McLaughlin, Chief Executive Officer, Government of Jersey, for a Quarterly Public Hearing. The proceedings were webcast live on the States Assembly website and a recording was made so that a transcript could be produced.</p> <p>The PAC tasked Officers with following up letters regarding questions and matters mentioned in the hearing to the Chief Executive Officer.</p> | <p><b>JB</b></p> <p><b>JB</b></p> |



|   |                                   |
|---|-----------------------------------|
| <p><b>3. Comptroller and Auditor General Update</b></p> <p>The PAC received an update from the Comptroller and Auditor General (C&amp;AG) in relation to the progress of her audit plan for 2024. The C&amp;AG explained that the following reviews had progressed since the previous meeting:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Tackling Fraud and Error Phase Two – Phase 2 fieldwork complete in report drafting stage and to be published soon</li> <li>• Cyber Security Arrangements – Planned</li> <li>• Strategic Property Management - Project Specification Stage the project specification to be published</li> <li>• Staff Recruitment and Retention – Fieldwork ongoing project specification published</li> <li>• Jersey Performance Framework – Fieldwork was completed in report drafting stage and to be published soon</li> <li>• ICT Implementation – Benefits System - Likely to be deferred and replaced by Thinkpiece</li> <li>• Government Value for Money Programme - Likely to be deferred and replaced by Good Practice Guide</li> <li>• Annual Reporting - Report planned and workshop to take place soon</li> <li>• Financial Management and Internal Control - Fieldwork due to commence</li> <li>• Grants and Subsidies - Fieldwork ongoing</li> <li>• Transparency and Excellence in Annual Reporting - Report completed to be published soon</li> </ul> | <p><b>AH</b></p>                  |
| <p><b>4. Executive Response - Commissioning of Services</b></p> <p>The PAC noted the Executive Response to the C&amp;AG report 'Commissioning of Services' and agreed to review the Executive Response and make comments on Microsoft Teams after the meeting.</p>  |                                   |
| <p><b>5. Executive Response - Oversight of Arm's Length Bodies</b></p> <p>The PAC noted the Executive Response to the C&amp;AG report 'Oversight of Arm's Length Bodies' and agreed to review the Executive Response and make comments on Microsoft Teams after the meeting.</p>  |                                   |
| <p><b>6. Procurement by the Government of Jersey Review</b></p> <p>The PAC noted that a number of submissions from the public had been received and asked that they were shared on Microsoft Teams. The PAC also discussed the Arm's Length organisation letters drafted by Officers. The PAC made some changes to the letters during the meeting and agreed to continue to provide comments via Microsoft Teams after the meeting.</p> <p>The PAC agreed to split into subgroups for the Procurement by the Government of Jersey Review and Handling and Learning from Complaints Review and tasked Officers to arrange meeting dates accordingly.</p>   | <p><b>JB</b></p> <p><b>JB</b></p> |
| <p><b>7. Handling and Learning from Complaints Review</b></p> <p>The PAC noted the launch of the Handling and Learning from Complaints Review. The PAC noted an updated recommendations tracker on Handling and Learning from Complaints and Performance Management and agreed to review these and provide comments on Microsoft Teams after the meeting.</p>   | <p><b>JB</b></p>                  |

|   |           |
|---|-----------|
| <b>8. States Annual Report and Accounts 2023 Review</b><br>The PAC noted the Executive Response to the PAC report 'States Annual Report and Accounts 2023' and agreed to review the Executive Response and provide comments on Microsoft Teams after the meeting. | <b>JB</b> |
| <b>9. Future Meetings</b><br>The PAC noted that its next scheduled meeting was due to take place at 12:15pm on Wednesday 16th October 2024 in the Ivy Forster room of the States Building.  |           |

# Public Accounts Committee

## Record of Meeting

Date: 16<sup>th</sup> October 2024

|               |  |
|---------------|--|
| Present       | Deputy Inna Gardiner, Chair<br>Deputy Raluca Kovacs, Member [items 3 – 11]<br>Deputy Karen Wilson, Member<br>Deputy David Warr, Member<br>Graeme Phipps, Lay-Member<br>Glen Kehoe, Lay Member  |
| Apologies     | Deputy Kristina Moore, Vice-Chair<br>Philip Taylor, Lay Member<br>Vijay Khakhria, Lay Member   |
| In attendance | Elaine Walsh, Chair Risk and Audit Committee [item 3 only]<br>Catherine Watson, Chief Internal Auditor [item 3 only]<br>Richard Bell, Treasurer of the States [item 4 only]<br>Caroline Hastings, Director, Commercial Services [item 4 only]<br>Paul Raffray, Senior Category Manager, Commercial Services [item 4 only]<br><br>Lynn Pamment, Comptroller and Auditor General<br><br>Andy Harris, Committee and Panel Officer<br>Joseph Brannigan, Research and Project Officer |

| Agenda matter  | Action |
|--|--------|
| <p><b>1. Records of Meetings</b></p> <p>The PAC noted and approved the record of the meeting held on Wednesday 25<sup>th</sup> September 2024.</p>   |        |
| <p><b>2. Conflicts of Interest</b></p> <p>The PAC noted that there were no conflicts of interests to be declared in relation to the meetings agenda.</p>   |        |
| <p><b>3. Private Meeting with the Chair of the Risk and Audit Committee and Chief Internal Auditor</b></p> <p>The PAC received Elaine Walsh, Chair Risk and Audit Committee and Catherine Watson, Chief Internal Auditor for a private meeting to discuss the work of the Risk and Audit Committee and Internal Audit in respect of risk management. The record of this meeting was classified as exempt in accordance with the Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011 (as amended) under Absolute Exemption Article 26.</p> |        |
| <p><b>4. Private Meeting with Commercial Services Team</b></p> <p>The PAC received Richard Bell, Treasurer of the States, Caroline Hastings, Director, Commercial Services and Paul Raffray, Senior Category Manager, Commercial Services for a private briefing in relation to the procurement function within the Commercial Services Team. The record of this meeting was classified</p>  |        |

|   |  |
|---|--|
| <p>as exempt in accordance with the Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011 (as amended) under Absolute Exemption Article 26.</p>  |  |
| <p><b>5. Comptroller and Auditor General Update</b></p> <p>The PAC agreed to defer this agenda item until its next scheduled meeting on Wednesday 6<sup>th</sup> November 2024.</p>   |  |
| <p><b>6. Executive Response – Commissioning of Services</b></p> <p>The PAC noted and discussed the Executive Response to the Comptroller and Auditor General (C&amp;AG) report ‘Commissioning of Services’. The PAC agreed comments in relation to the response and requested that these be drafted by the Officer ahead of publication of the response. The Officer advised that a draft of the comments would be shared in due course for approval.</p>   |  |
| <p><b>7. Executive Response – Oversight of Arm’s Length Bodies</b></p> <p>The PAC noted and discussed the Executive Response to the Comptroller and Auditor General (C&amp;AG) report ‘Oversight of Arm’s Length Bodies. The PAC agreed comments in relation to the response and requested that these be drafted by the Officer ahead of publication of the response. The Officer advised that a draft of the comments would be shared in due course for approval.</p>  |  |
| <p><b>8. Procurement by the Government of Jersey</b></p> <p>The PAC noted that a survey was currently being produced in order for it to be sent to all suppliers who engaged with the SAP Ariba system. The Officer advised that this would be shared ahead of the next scheduled meeting on 6<sup>th</sup> November 2024.</p> <p>The PAC noted that letters had been sent to all Arm’s Length Bodies of the States of Jersey in order to ascertain whether they engaged with the Government’s procurement system or not. It was noted that the deadline for the responses was Friday 1<sup>st</sup> November 2024.</p>   |  |
| <p><b>9. Handling and Learning from Complaints</b></p> <p>The PAC noted that it had launched its review on 19<sup>th</sup> September 2024 and letters had been sent to external stakeholders and the Chief Executive in order to gather evidence for the review. The deadline for these responses was Friday 25<sup>th</sup> October 2024. The PAC noted that it had received submissions from members of the public and requested that these be recirculated on Microsoft Teams for consideration ahead of its next scheduled meeting on 6<sup>th</sup> November 2024.</p> <p>The PAC noted that a public hearing had been scheduled on Wednesday 20<sup>th</sup> November with the Chief Officer for Customer and Local Services, and a further joint hearing had been scheduled with the Chief Officer’s for Health and Community Services and Infrastructure and Environment on Wednesday 4<sup>th</sup> November. The Officers advised that question plans would be circulated in due course for discussion.</p> |  |
| <p><b>10. States of Jersey Annual Report and Accounts 2023</b></p> <p>The PAC noted and discussed the Executive Response to its report ‘States Annual Report and Accounts 2023’. The PAC agreed comments in respect of the response and requested the Officer to draft these ahead of the presentation of the response. The Officer advised that draft comments would be circulated in due course for approval.</p>   |  |

|                            |  |
|----------------------------|--|
| <b>11. Future Meetings</b> |  |
|----------------------------|--|

|  |  |
|--|--|
| The PAC noted that its next scheduled meeting was due to take place at 12:30pm on Wednesday 6 <sup>th</sup> November 2024 in the Blampied Room of the States Building. |  |
|--|--|

# Public Accounts Committee

## Record of Meeting

Date: 6<sup>th</sup> November 2024

|               |   |
|---------------|---|
| Present       | Deputy Kristina Moore, Vice-Chair<br>Deputy Raluca Kovacs, Member<br>Deputy Karen Wilson, Member<br>Deputy David Warr, Member<br>Glen Kehoe, Lay Member |
| Apologies     | Philip Taylor, Lay Member<br>Vijay Khakhria, Lay Member<br>Deputy Inna Gardiner, Chair<br>Graeme Phipps, Lay-Member                                     |
| In attendance | Helen Thompson, Deputy Comptroller and Auditor General<br><br>Joseph Brannigan, Research and Project Officer<br>Arlene Maltman, Communications Officer  |

| Agenda matter  | Action |
|--|--------|
| <p><b>1. Conflicts of Interest</b></p> <p>The PAC noted that there were no conflicts of interests to be declared in relation to the meetings agenda.</p>   |        |
| <p><b>2. Comptroller and Auditor General Update</b></p> <p>The PAC received an update from the Deputy Comptroller and Auditor General (C&amp;AG) in relation to the progress of the C&amp;AG audit plan for 2024. The C&amp;AG explained that the following reviews had progressed since the previous meeting:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Tackling Fraud and Error Phase 2 - fieldwork completed at Draft Report stage</li> <li>• Project Specification published - Report planned for November 2024</li> <li>• Cyber Security Arrangements planned</li> <li>• Strategic Property Management - fieldwork commencing and project specification published</li> <li>• Staff Recruitment and Retention - fieldwork ongoing and Project specification published</li> <li>• Jersey Performance Framework - fieldwork completed and Report to be published on 14<sup>th</sup> October 2024</li> <li>• Learning lessons from ICT Implementations - fieldwork ongoing and Thinkpiece planned</li> <li>• Efficiency Savings - fieldwork ongoing and Good Practice Guide planned</li> <li>• Annual Reporting - self-assessment tool issued in January 2024, Report published on 27<sup>th</sup> September 2024 and workshop planned for November 2024</li> <li>• Follow up of previous audits</li> <li>• Financial Management and Internal Control - fieldwork ongoing and Project specification published</li> </ul> |        |

06.11.2024

|  |           |
|--|-----------|
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Grants and Subsidies - fieldwork nearing completion and Project specification published</li> </ul> <p>The Deputy C&amp;AG provided the PAC with a presentation outlining the analysis of her Transparency and Excellence in Annual Reporting and Jersey Performance Framework. This focussed on the summary of work that was undertaken by the Jersey Audit Office, as well as an analysis of the main themes of recommendations made in the reports.</p>   |           |
| <p><b>3. Procurement by the Government of Jersey</b></p> <p>The PAC noted the document produced by Officers highlighting the key themes arising from submissions. The PAC also noted information provided by the C&amp;AG in relation to previous recommendations relevant to procurement.</p> <p>The PAC noted information provided by Jersey Chamber of Commerce in relation to a survey of users of the Government of Jersey Procurement process. The PAC agreed to continue perusing its own survey regarding Procurement and tasked Officers to produce this.</p> <p>The PAC received an update on the progress of the review from the Officer, who informed the Committee that the survey was almost ready, and the PAC would be able to review this before its next meeting. The ALOs letters were received and shared with the PAC. The PAC noted that Officers were drafting a key themes document in respect of the submissions.</p> | <b>JB</b> |
| <p><b>4. Handling and Learning from Complaints</b></p> <p>The PAC noted the letter from the Chief Executive and agreed to review it further. The PAC noted and discussed the draft question plan for the public hearing on 20<sup>th</sup> November 2024 with the Chief Officer for Customer and Local Services and requested Officers to makes amendments to some of the question areas.</p> <p>The PAC noted the proposed dates for a further pop-up stand and agreed to review these online and to agree an approval a date.</p>  | <b>JB</b> |
| <p><b>5. Change of December Salary Payments</b></p> <p>The PAC discussed the change of payment date for States of Jersey employees in December and requested that Officers draft a letter to request further details on the change from Government.</p>  | <b>JB</b> |
| <p><b>6. Future Meetings</b></p> <p>The PAC noted its draft meeting schedule for 2025 and asked Officers to make changes to the dates which the PAC would then review prior to the next meeting. The PAC also asked Officers to provide dates that other Panels intended to meet to assist in determining their own availability for dates.</p> <p>The PAC noted that its next scheduled meeting was due to take place at 12:30pm on Wednesday 20<sup>th</sup> November 2024 in the Blampied Room of the States Building.</p>  | <b>JB</b> |