

# STATES OF JERSEY

## OFFICIAL REPORT

THURSDAY, 6th NOVEMBER 2014

<b>APPOINTMENT OF MINISTERS, COMMITTEES AND PANELS .....</b>	<b>7</b>
<b>1. The Minister for Treasury and Resources .....</b>	<b>7</b>
<b>1.1 Senator A.J.H. Maclean:.....</b>	<b>8</b>
1.1.1 Deputy G.P. Southern of St. Helier: .....	10
1.1.2 Deputy M. Tadier of St. Brelade: .....	10
1.1.3 Deputy M. Tadier: .....	10
1.1.4 Connétable A.S. Crowcroft of St. Helier: .....	11
1.1.5 The Connétable of St. Helier:.....	11
1.1.6 Deputy R.J. Rondel of St. Helier:.....	11
1.1.7 Deputy T.A. Vallois of St. John: .....	11
1.1.8 Deputy M.R. Higgins of St. Helier:.....	12
1.1.9 Deputy M.R. Higgins:.....	12
1.1.10 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf: .....	12
1.1.11 Deputy S.Y. Mézec of St. Helier: .....	13
1.1.12 Deputy S.Y. Mézec:.....	13
1.1.13 Deputy R. Labey of St. Helier: .....	13
1.1.14 Deputy R. Labey:.....	14
1.1.15 Senator P.F. Routier:.....	14
1.1.16 The Connétable of St. Martin: .....	14
1.1.17 Deputy J.A. Hilton of St. Helier: .....	14
1.1.18 Deputy G.P. Southern: .....	15
1.1.19 Deputy G.P. Southern: .....	15
1.1.20 Deputy J.A. Martin of St. Helier:.....	15
<b>1.2 Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré of St. Lawrence: .....</b>	<b>15</b>
1.2.1 Deputy K.C. Lewis of St. Saviour:.....	18
1.2.2 Deputy G.P. Southern:.....	18
1.2.3 Deputy G.P. Southern:.....	19
1.2.4 The Deputy of St. John: .....	20
1.2.5 Deputy M. Tadier: .....	20
1.2.6 Deputy M. Tadier: .....	20
1.2.7 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf:.....	20
1.2.8 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf:.....	21
1.2.9 Deputy A.D. Lewis of St. Helier:.....	21
1.2.10 Deputy K.L. Moore of St. Peter:.....	21
1.2.11 Deputy J.A. Hilton: .....	22
1.2.12 Deputy J.A. Hilton: .....	22
1.2.13 Senator P.F. Routier:.....	22

1.2.14	Deputy S.Y. Mézec:.....	23
1.2.15	Deputy S.G. Luce of St. Martin:.....	23
<b>2.</b>	<b>The Minister for Health and Social Services.....</b>	<b>24</b>
<b>2.1</b>	<b>Senator A.K.F. Green:.....</b>	<b>24</b>
2.1.1	Deputy M.R. Higgins:.....	26
2.1.2	Deputy L.M.C. Doublet of St. Saviour:.....	27
2.1.3	Connétable M.J. Paddock of St. Ouen:.....	27
2.1.4	Deputy P.D. McLinton of St. Saviour:.....	27
2.1.5	Deputy S.Y. Mézec:.....	28
2.1.6	Deputy G.P. Southern:.....	28
2.1.7	Deputy M. Tadier:.....	28
2.1.8	Deputy M. Tadier:.....	28
2.1.9	Connétable D.W. Mezbourian of St. Lawrence:.....	29
2.1.10	Deputy J.M. Maçon of St. Saviour:.....	29
2.1.11	Deputy R.J. Renouf of St. Ouen:.....	29
2.1.12	Deputy J.A. Hilton:.....	30
2.1.13	The Connétable of St. Martin:.....	30
2.1.14	Deputy R. Labey:.....	30
2.1.15	The Deputy of St. John:.....	31
2.1.16	Deputy A.D. Lewis:.....	31
2.1.17	Deputy A.D. Lewis:.....	31
2.1.18	The Deputy of St. Martin:.....	31
<b>2.2</b>	<b>Senator Z.A. Cameron:.....</b>	<b>32</b>
2.2.1	Deputy R.G. Bryans of St. Helier:.....	34
2.2.2	Deputy M.R. Higgins:.....	34
2.2.3	Deputy M.R. Higgins:.....	34
2.2.4	Deputy R. Labey:.....	35
2.2.5	Deputy G.P. Southern:.....	35
2.2.6	Deputy J.M. Maçon:.....	35
2.2.7	Deputy P.D. McLinton:.....	35
2.2.8	Deputy A.D. Lewis:.....	36
2.2.9	Deputy L.M.C. Doublet:.....	36
2.2.10	Deputy M. Tadier:.....	36
2.2.11	Deputy M. Tadier:.....	36
2.2.12	Deputy S.Y. Mézec:.....	37
2.2.13	Deputy S. Pinel of St. Clement:.....	37
2.2.14	Deputy G.P. Southern:.....	37
2.2.15	Deputy P.D. McLinton:.....	38
2.2.16	Deputy G.P. Southern:.....	38
2.2.17	Senator P.M. Bailhache:.....	38
2.2.18	Senator P.F. Routier:.....	38
2.2.19	Deputy G.P. Southern:.....	39
<b>3.</b>	<b>The Minister for External Relations.....</b>	<b>40</b>
<b>3.1</b>	<b>Senator P.M. Bailhache:.....</b>	<b>40</b>
3.1.1	Deputy S.Y. Mézec:.....	41
3.1.2	Deputy S.Y. Mézec:.....	41

3.1.3 Deputy G.P. Southern:.....	42
3.1.4 Deputy J.A. Martin:.....	42
3.1.5 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf:.....	42
3.1.6 Deputy R.G. Bryans:.....	43
3.1.7 Deputy M.R. Higgins:.....	43
3.1.8 Deputy S.Y. Mézec:.....	43
3.1.9 Deputy G.P. Southern:.....	44
<b>3.2 Deputy M. Tadier:.....</b>	<b>44</b>
3.2.1 Connétable J. Gallichan of St. Mary:.....	46
3.2.2 The Connétable of St. Mary:.....	46
3.2.3 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf:.....	47
3.2.4 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf:.....	47
3.2.5 Deputy S.Y. Mézec:.....	47
3.2.6 Deputy R.G. Bryans:.....	48
3.2.7 Deputy G.P. Southern:.....	48
3.2.8 Deputy S.Y. Mézec:.....	48
3.2.9 The Connétable of St. Lawrence:.....	49
3.2.10 Deputy M.J. Norton of St. Brelade:.....	49
3.2.11 Deputy M.J. Norton:.....	50
3.2.12 Deputy G.P. Southern:.....	50
3.2.13 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf:.....	50
<b>LUNCHEON ADJOURNMENT PROPOSED.....</b>	<b>52</b>
<b>LUNCHEON ADJOURNMENT.....</b>	<b>52</b>
<b>4. ADJOURNMENT UNTIL 3.15 p.m. PROPOSED.....</b>	<b>52</b>
Senator I.J. Gorst:.....	52
4.1 Deputy J.M. Maçon:.....	53
4.2 Connétable S.A. Le Sueur-Rennard of St. Saviour:.....	53
<b>ADJOURNMENT.....</b>	<b>54</b>
<b>5. The Minister for Transport and Technical Services.....</b>	<b>54</b>
<b>5.1 Deputy E.J. Noel of St. Lawrence:.....</b>	<b>55</b>
5.1.1 Deputy M. Tadier:.....	56
5.1.2 Deputy M. Tadier:.....	57
5.1.3 The Deputy of St. Ouen:.....	57
5.1.4 Deputy G.P. Southern:.....	57
5.1.5 Deputy G.P. Southern:.....	57
5.1.6 Senator P.F. Routier:.....	57
5.1.7 The Connétable of St. Ouen:.....	58
5.1.8 Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré:.....	58
5.1.9 Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré:.....	58
5.1.10 Deputy M.R. Higgins:.....	58
5.1.11 Deputy M.R. Higgins:.....	59
5.1.12 The Connétable of St. Helier:.....	59
5.1.13 Deputy R. Labey:.....	59
5.1.14 The Deputy of St. John:.....	59
5.1.15 The Deputy of St. John:.....	60

5.1.16	Deputy P.D. McLinton:	60
5.1.17	Senator P.F.C. Ozouf:	60
5.1.18	Deputy M. Tadier:	60
5.1.19	Deputy M. Tadier:	61
5.1.20	Deputy G.P. Southern:	61
5.1.21	Deputy G.P. Southern:	61
5.1.22	Deputy M.R. Higgins:	61
5.1.23	Deputy M.R. Higgins:	62
5.1.24	Senator P.F. Routier:	62
5.1.25	Deputy G.P. Southern:	62
<b>5.2</b>	<b>Deputy K.C. Lewis:</b>	<b>62</b>
5.2.1	The Connétable of St. Helier:	64
5.2.2	The Connétable of St. Helier:	64
5.2.3	The Connétable of St. Ouen:	64
5.2.4	Connétable J.E. Le Maistre of Grouville:	64
5.2.5	Deputy G.P. Southern:	65
5.2.6	Senator P.F. Routier:	65
5.2.7	Deputy C.F. Labey of Grouville:	65
5.2.8	Deputy M. Tadier:	66
5.2.9	The Deputy of St. Martin:	66
5.2.10	The Deputy of St. Martin:	66
5.2.11	The Connétable of St. Martin:	67
5.2.12	The Connétable of St. Martin:	67
5.2.13	Deputy M.R. Higgins:	67
5.2.14	The Deputy of St. Peter:	67
5.2.15	Senator L.J. Farnham:	67
5.2.16	Senator P.F.C. Ozouf:	67
5.2.17	Deputy G.P. Southern:	68
5.2.18	The Connétable of St. Helier:	68
5.2.19	Deputy M. Tadier:	68
5.2.20	Deputy M. Tadier:	68
5.2.21	The Connétable of Grouville:	69
5.2.22	Deputy G.P. Southern:	69
5.2.23	Deputy G.P. Southern:	69
5.2.24	Deputy M. Tadier:	69
5.2.25	Deputy M. Tadier:	69
<b>6.</b>	<b>The Minister for Home Affairs</b>	<b>71</b>
<b>6.1</b>	<b>Deputy K.L. Moore of St. Peter:</b>	<b>71</b>
6.1.1	Deputy M. Tadier:	73
6.1.2	Deputy J.A. Martin:	73
6.1.3	Deputy J.A. Martin:	73
6.1.4	Deputy M.R. Higgins:	74
6.1.5	Deputy M.R. Higgins:	74
6.1.6	Deputy G.P. Southern:	74
6.1.7	Deputy G.P. Southern:	75
6.1.8	Deputy A.D. Lewis:	75
6.1.9	Deputy M.R. Higgins:	75
6.1.10	Deputy G.P. Southern:	75

6.1.11	Deputy G.P. Southern:	76
6.1.12	The Connétable of St. Mary:	76
6.1.13	The Connétable of St. Ouen:	76
6.1.14	Deputy J.M. Maçon:	76
6.1.15	Deputy J.M. Maçon:	77
6.1.16	Senator P.F.C. Ozouf:	77
6.1.17	Deputy A.D. Lewis:	77
6.1.18	Deputy M. Tadier:	77
6.1.19	Deputy M. Tadier:	78
6.1.20	Deputy J.A. Martin:	78
6.1.21	Deputy M.R. Higgins:	78
6.1.22	Deputy M. Tadier:	78
6.1.23	Deputy M. Tadier:	79
6.1.24	The Connétable of St. Martin:	79

**6.2 Deputy S.Y. Mézec: .....79**

6.2.1	The Connétable of St. Lawrence:	81
6.2.2	Deputy M. Tadier:	81
6.2.3	Deputy M.R. Higgins:	82
6.2.4	Deputy A.D. Lewis:	82
6.2.5	Deputy S. Pinel:	83
6.2.6	Deputy M.R. Higgins:	83
6.2.7	Deputy J.A. Hilton:	83
6.2.8	Deputy M.R. Higgins:	84
6.2.9	The Connétable of St. Lawrence:	84
6.2.10	The Connétable of St. Lawrence:	85
6.2.11	Deputy M. Tadier:	85
6.2.12	Deputy M. Tadier:	86
6.2.13	Deputy M. Tadier:	86
6.2.14	Deputy M. Tadier:	86

**CONTINUATION OF MEETING BEYOND 5:30 P.M. ....87**

**7. The Minister for Economic Development .....89**

**7.1 Senator L.J. Farnham:.....90**

7.1.1	Deputy G.P. Southern:	91
7.1.2	Deputy G.P. Southern:	92
7.1.3	The Connétable of St. Lawrence:	92
7.1.4	The Connétable of St. Lawrence:	92
7.1.5	Deputy S.Y. Mézec:	92
7.1.6	The Connétable of Grouville:	93
7.1.7	Deputy S.N. Wickenden of St. Helier:	93
7.1.8	Deputy M.R. Higgins:	93
7.1.9	Deputy M.J. Norton:	93
7.1.10	Deputy M. Tadier:	94
7.1.11	Deputy R. Labey:	94
7.1.12	The Deputy of St. Peter:	95
7.1.13	Senator P.F. Routier:	95
7.1.14	Senator P.F. Routier:	95
7.1.15	Connétable C.H. Taylor of St. John:	95

7.1.16	Deputy S.M. Bree of St. Clement: .....	96
7.1.17	Deputy S.M. Bree: .....	96
7.1.18	Deputy J.A. Martin: .....	96
<b>7.2</b>	<b>Deputy A.D. Lewis: .....</b>	<b>97</b>
7.2.1	Senator P.F. Routier: .....	99
7.2.2	Deputy M.R. Higgins:.....	99
7.2.3	Deputy G.P. Southern:.....	100
7.2.4	Deputy M. Tadier: .....	100
7.2.5	The Connétable of St. Lawrence:.....	100
7.2.6	The Connétable of Grouville:.....	101
7.2.7	Senator P.F. Routier: .....	101
7.2.8	The Deputy of St. Peter: .....	101
7.2.9	Deputy G.P. Southern:.....	102
7.2.10	Deputy G.P. Southern: .....	102
7.2.11	Senator P.F.C. Ozouf: .....	103
7.2.12	Deputy M.R. Higgins:.....	104
7.2.13	Deputy M.R. Higgins: .....	104
7.2.14	Deputy M. Tadier:.....	105
<b>9.</b>	<b>ARRANGEMENTS FOR CONTINUATION OF MEETING .....</b>	<b>106</b>
	<b>ADJOURNMENT.....</b>	<b>108</b>

[9:30]

**The Roll was called and the Dean led the Assembly in Prayer.**

## **APPOINTMENT OF MINISTERS, COMMITTEES AND PANELS**

### **The Bailiff:**

Before we start perhaps it would just help if I reminded Members of what is going to happen. The Chief Minister will propose his candidates, each nomination must be seconded. I shall then invite other nominations for the particular ministerial post. If there are not any then the Chief Minister's candidate will be appointed. If there are, and later seconded, then we will move into an election. When candidates are proposed and seconded, no speeches, it is just simply to propose and second them. The arrangement, if there is an election, is that the other candidates must withdraw. Now in the interests of fairness, I have directed that they should not have access to electronic equipment in the place where they will be because otherwise it would be possible for them to be informed as to the sort of questions which are being asked here and the whole point of them being in purdah is that they should not get any benefit by hearing what is going on. Then each candidate speaks for up to 10 minutes and then there will be questions for up to 20 minutes. There will be a bell after 9 minutes of a speech, and after 19 minutes of questions, and then a second bell after 10 minutes of a speech and after 20 minutes of questions and we are going to apply the University Challenge rules, so that there will be an absolute stop at that stage, no matter what state we are in, whether a question is halfway through or not. That is really again to be fair between all different candidates. In questions I will agree to each questioner if he or she wishes to ask a supplementary but it must be a genuine supplementary. I am not going to agree to a Member, in effect, having 2 questions on different subjects. It must be a supplementary to the first one. In relation to voting, if there is simply 2 candidates then we will vote electronically but if there are 3 or more it will be done by ballot with the Attorney, the Deputy Viscount and the Assistant Greffier acting as scrutineers. If there is any rejection of a nominated candidate put forward by the Chief Minister then the Chief Minister is entitled to rethink things either in the order he wants Ministers proposed or in the identity of any nominees, and if we need to adjourn for a few minutes for him to think about that, we will do so. I hope that clarifies the procedure. I begin by asking the Chief Minister to read out his declaration.

### **1. The Minister for Treasury and Resources**

#### **Senator I.J. Gorst (The Chief Minister Designate)**

I should like to propose for the office of Minister for Treasury and Resources Senator Maclean. Thank you.

### **The Bailiff:**

Is that seconded? **[Seconded]** Are there any other nominations for the position of Minister for Treasury and Resources?

#### **Connétable M.P.S. Le Troquer of St. Martin:**

I would like to nominate Deputy Le Fondré for the position.

### **The Bailiff:**

Is that seconded? **[Seconded]** Are there any other nominations? Then we simply have 2 nominations. In which case therefore would Deputy Le Fondré please withdraw with the member of the Greffier staff who will look after him. We move on to the procedures. I will invite Senator Maclean to speak for up to 10 minutes and no more.

#### **Senator A.J.H. Maclean:**

Before I start could I just seek clarification? Did you say there is a bell at one minute?

**The Bailiff:**

No, 9 minutes, so one minute to go.

**1.1 Senator A.J.H. Maclean:**

The responsibility and role of Minister for Treasury and Resources over the next 3½ years will be more challenging than it has probably ever been. The world economy is recovering but it is fragile with risks on the downside that could impact our revenues and recovery. Indeed we saw earlier this year how changing circumstances led to lower than forecast revenues and a £95 million budget deficit. I am not one to turn down a challenge, having served 2 terms at Economic Development Department during a period covering the most severe global financial crisis imaginable. I led the transformation of that department, reducing the headcount, delivering efficiencies and new ways of supporting the economy more effectively for less. We took a new approach to supporting business by largely outsourcing delivery to professionals with the right expertise. This led to the creation of Jersey Business to support and develop the vitally important small business sector, and Digital Jersey to develop and promote the exciting new digital sector. We established the brand Locate Jersey comprising an in-house team to drive inward investment so critical to the diversification of our economy. We created the £5 million Innovation Fund to stimulate innovation, creativity, job opportunities and business growth. Against stiff opposition we redesigned the beach lifeguard service, introducing the R.N.L.I. (Royal National Lifeboat Institution), reducing the cost to the public purse and improving the service. Ninety per cent of our beach lifeguards are now local, trained to the highest standards by the R.N.L.I. We undertook structural changes, integrating the harbours and airport, removing duplication and reducing operating costs by more than £1 million while improving services. We developed and guided through the States numerous complex new laws to boost financial services like Foundations as well as modernising the Intellectual Property Law and introducing a Financial Services Ombudsman. The Ombudsman Law was developed by working with Guernsey to deliver a pan-Channel Islands solution. I strongly believe that there are more opportunities for pan-Channel Islands co-operation that can drive further efficiencies and benefits for both Islands. The slightly redefined role of Minister for Treasury and Resources proposed by the Chief Minister principally involves responsibility for public finances, including domestic tax and expenditure, corporate procurement and States-owned utilities. A role that is perhaps more about economics than accounting and one that will require the desire, commitment and capability to reform the way we have approached and managed public finances. The next Minister for Treasury and Resources will have approximately 150 days to put together the next Medium-Term Financial Plan. This will cover department spending for the period 2016 to 2019. In preparation for this I would ask for an immediate review of revenue forecasts and test the way in which they are compiled. In an environment where revenues are coming under increasing pressure and costs have continued to rise we will have to work harder together to find some innovative solutions to provide the quality public services at an affordable price. For the avoidance of any doubt I do not believe that raising taxes is an innovative solution. Indeed, any tax rises should always be the very last option, not the first, as is often the case with so many governments. If we want to have a competitive economy and deliver sustainable growth we must maintain a lower and simple tax regime. In the immediate future we face 2 key funding priorities at Health and Education. To deliver long-term sustainable funding for these and balanced budgets we will need to make some difficult decisions.

[9:45]

These will undoubtedly involve a combination of reprioritisation of existing resources, increasing revenues through a growing economy, improving productivity, driving efficiency savings and cutting out unnecessary costs and waste. Over the next 3½ years we will need to target investment



to support and develop growth opportunities for the economy. Aside from direct investment I would review a range of possible fiscal incentives, including tax breaks to attract investment and drive growth. Although economic growth is essential for job creation and revenues we also need to work much harder and faster to cut out unnecessary expenditure and waste. That is a key part of the focus of the public sector reform programme or modernisation, as I like to call it. A programme that must deliver a modern, efficient and cost-effective public sector. The foundation has been set and departments are embracing change with Lean methodology delivering better services for less. There are good examples in parts of Health and Social Security where the programme has been trialled. Lean must be rolled out faster across all departments. We must deliver eGovernment, modernise working practices, consolidate office space and streamline delivery. I will work tirelessly with all Ministers and all departments to modernise the public sector. Treasury also run corporate procurement and I want to review how this operates, especially contracts like travel. There are probably greater efficiencies to be delivered with a new procurement strategy. I would also like to see a simplification of the process to ensure more local businesses, whatever their size, have the opportunity to tender for more States contracts. I fully support Supply Jersey, the automated platform, a tremendous eGovernment initiative developed by the procurement team that should go live early next year. It should provide good opportunities for small local businesses and to deliver much better value at the same time. The States own or have substantial holdings in utility companies comprising J.T. (Jersey Telecom), Jersey Water and Jersey Electricity. These represent public assets worth hundreds of millions of pounds. The shareholder responsibility for these holdings falls to the Minister for Treasury and Resources, a responsibility to challenge these companies to ensure a fair financial return and good services for Islanders and businesses alike. I want to consider better ways to manage the shareholder responsibility and improve governance. One option could be to follow the U.K. (United Kingdom) or Guernsey models of establishing a single non-political board of experts to manage such holdings, although establishing a board would involve a cost. These are substantial and, in many respects, complex businesses that need professional oversight and a clear shareholder strategy. By managing them better with a professional board, improving their value and returns, any cost should be more than covered. On the subject of boards and panels across the States I do think we need an urgent review to ensure consistency and value, some could undoubtedly be consolidated. In terms of tax, tighter compliance should be a focus to ensure we collect what is owed. I would also consider a tax amnesty similar to those offered by other jurisdictions. There are clear opportunities for sharing of information between Social Security and Treasury to improve efficiency and compliance at both ends. I want to see greater co-operation and automation of processes. As part of eGovernment online tax assessments must be delivered as a priority. There are obvious symmetries between Social Security and Treasury. For example, I would like to see the collection systems brought together along with debt recovery and compliance. Why are both departments duplicating the same functions at great cost when they could operate as a single team from one office? As the economy recovers we must start to build-up reserves again by allocating revenue to the Stabilisation Fund. Long-term planning is essential. The long-term capital programme has £35 million per annum allocated over the next 20 years but will need careful review and probably reprofiling to meet short-term pressures. Ensuring that we continue to deliver capital projects in the short term is key to our economic recovery and consistent with advice from the Fiscal Policy Panel. The problem has been getting projects started because under the Public Finances Law the full funding needs to be made available before commencement. This needs to be addressed so that projects can commence on time. In conclusion, I believe that over the last 6 years, as Minister for Economic Development, I have demonstrated the leadership and capabilities to deliver creative solutions to problems and to drive positive change. I ask Members for their support. Thank you. **[Approval]**

**The Bailiff:**

We now have up to 20 minutes for questions to Senator Maclean. Any questions?

### **1.1.1 Deputy G.P. Southern of St. Helier:**

In preparation of today I was reading some ancient documents dated from 2005 and I found this statement: "Policy makers, States Members and Ministers have to be more questioning of simple platitudes of strategic policy aims and think more about design and implementation of the necessary resources to make them happen. Platitudes are easy, making things improve across the board is a bigger challenge." It came from one of our advisers on Scrutiny. The first statement under "Economy, Jobs and Growth" on the potential Minister's manifesto was: "Review and remove unnecessary red tape, regulation and legislation." Will the potential Minister tell us where that unnecessary red tape, regulation and legislation is and what he will remove?

### **Senator A.J.H. Maclean:**

Yes, it is very difficult to be precise at this time. We have undertaken, in fact I have commissioned a report before the end of this political term at Economic Development called *The cost of doing business in Jersey Review*, which is being undertaken by a major accountancy firm. They are specifically looking at the whole range of potential savings that can be delivered and, indeed, cost to business, looking at the whole supply chain, including legislation and barriers that might be presented by various pieces of legislation and regulation. Similar, I might say, to what has been going on with the coalition Government in the U.K. where they have looked specifically at small businesses and ways in which regulation, particularly areas around employment and health and safety in certain circumstances, impact on one man bands or 2-man bands, very small businesses. They looked at ways in which that can be mitigated so that those particular areas can grow into the future and develop greater employment opportunities. I think the answer to the Deputy's question is quite simply when we have the result of the *Cost of Doing Business Review* that will identify the areas where most likely. But if he wants an example specifically around employment law I would identify the unfair dismissal 26-week period in Jersey. In Guernsey it is a year. In the U.K. it has been moved to 2 years. It provides an unlevel playing field and I think that is an area that we need to be perhaps considering but we will see if that is identified in the review when it comes forward.

### **1.1.2 Deputy M. Tadier of St. Brelade:**

Does the candidate acknowledge that in Jersey, like elsewhere in the world, the gap between the poorest in society and the wealthiest is growing and if he does, how does economic growth under the current model benefit those at the bottom rather than those at the top?

### **Senator A.J.H. Maclean:**

I do agree with that. It is a challenge but of course by growing the economy you create job opportunities and it puts more money into the economy, and that basically is supportive of all people within the Island community. I think that is a clear indicator.

### **1.1.3 Deputy M. Tadier:**

I will ask a supplementary. One cannot have it both ways. If the gap is increasing between the 2, putting more money in the pot only means that more money would be diverted to the top and not the bottom. How do we reverse that trend and what will the Minister do?

### **Senator A.J.H. Maclean:**

The other area of course which is important is improving skills. The skills agenda is absolutely critical to ensure that people have an opportunity to improve their opportunity for getting jobs that pay larger sums of money but a successful economy again, as I have already said, puts more money ultimately into the economy and provides a better policy of living for all, and a higher standard of public services.

#### **1.1.4 Connétable A.S. Crowcroft of St. Helier:**

The candidate mentioned his successes as Minister for Economic Development; does he consider the delay in bringing forward the review of the Licensing Law to be one of those successes? While we are on the subject of the Licensing Law, as Minister for Treasury and Resources would the Minister be interested in seeing a transfer of the administration of alcohol licences from Treasury to the Parishes, in the sense that I am sure he wishes to see a strengthening of the role of the Parishes who could use the income from such licences to defray the cost of the administration?

#### **Senator A.J.H. Maclean:**

The Connétable is never one to miss an opportunity to drive some more revenue. As far as the Licensing Law is concerned; yes, that is indeed something that is not a success as far as I am concerned. But I would say in mitigation that the responsibility has not fallen purely to Economic Development, and there has been a cross-departmental working group trying to drive a development of a new Licensing Law. It is critically important. Although Economic Development had responsibility for that law it is indeed Home Affairs and Health that have been instrumental and vitally important to feeding into that process. Now, I am pleased to say, that progress has been made and a draft law is at a position where it is ready to be lodged very soon. I think that is a positive move at last, Connétable. As far as the transfer from Treasury, although I accept his point, I think at this stage there would need to be a lot more work done if we were to move to that. I do support the principle of what Senator Ozouf has said about a fairer deal for St. Helier and I think as part of that we can consider very important issues around licensing and fees, as the Connétable mentioned.

#### **1.1.5 The Connétable of St. Helier:**

If I could just press the candidate please on the matter of strengthening the role of the Parishes. Is it not the case that in comparative jurisdictions this kind of function would not be handled by central Government, by local government, and is this not a perfect example of it, and will he agree to look into the possibility of delegating licensing administration to the Parishes?

#### **Senator A.J.H. Maclean:**

I think it is very reasonable to look into the matter. However, we are not very similar to many other jurisdictions so we have to look at it for a Jersey solution, but I am more than happy to look into it. I think that is a sensible route.

#### **1.1.6 Deputy R.J. Rondel of St. Helier:**

In his speech the Minister spoke about the possibility of a tax amnesty. Would he be able to elaborate on how this would work please?

#### **Senator A.J.H. Maclean:**

We have seen in other jurisdictions Guernsey and the U.K. where tax amnesties are offered. It gives the opportunities for businesses and individuals to come forward and clean up their tax affairs, and it has generated revenue. It is a revenue-raising opportunity and an opportunity to clean the slate as far as those involved are concerned. It is something I think should certainly be considered.

#### **1.1.7 Deputy T.A. Vallois of St. John:**

Would the candidate agree to an independent forensic account of public finances before work on M.T.F.P. (Medium-Term Financial Plan) begins?

#### **Senator A.J.H. Maclean:**

I see no reason why that option should not be looked at.

**1.1.8 Deputy M.R. Higgins of St. Helier:**

Would the candidate explain to Members what academic and professional qualifications he has and explain their relevance to the Treasury and Resources role and what particular analytical and questioning skills he has?

**Senator A.J.H. Maclean:**

If the Deputy is asking do I have accountancy qualifications then the answer is no, I do not. I have however been a politician for 9 years. I have been the Minister for Economic Development for a 6-year period. I stand on my record as far as the management and leadership of that particular department is concerned. I would also point out that as far as the history is concerned we can look at great former Ministers for Treasury and Resources who I would dearly wish to aspire to be anything like, such as the former Senator Cyril Le Marquand, Senator Ralph Vibert, Senator Pierre Horsfall, none of whom had qualifications with regard to accountancy, and indeed we can look further afield to the likes of George Osborne in the U.K. and Michel Sapin in France, although aligning to the French, looking at the fiscal position there, that is probably not quite so good. **[Laughter]** I would stand nevertheless on my record at Economic Development and, as I previously said, the role of Minister for Treasury and Resources is more aligned to economics than it would be necessarily to forensic accounting.

**1.1.9 Deputy M.R. Higgins:**

Supplementary. The candidate did not explain if he had any academic qualifications or any professional qualifications. I also asked about analytical skills. For example, the Can-Be-Done Productions, for example. What analytical, investigatory and questioning skills, when he was Minister for Economic Development, did he apply to that?

**Senator A.J.H. Maclean:**

Ministers are not supposed to have necessarily analytical skills along the lines that the Deputy is referring to. Clearly in the Treasury Department, or any Ministerial department, a Minister relies upon the advice of officers who are qualified, whether they be accountants or have analytical skills. A Minister's role is quite simply to be having the right ability to put together policies and strategies and assess the information that is brought forward by those that are employed by the department or, for that matter, externally. That is why professionals are brought in either within the department or from an external perspective to provide that advice that Ministers then have to deal with.

[10:00]

**1.1.10 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf:**

In most countries the relationship between a Minister for Treasury and Resources and the Prime Minister or Chief Minister is regarded as fundamental. If it does not work then Government does not work. Can the candidate see himself develop that special relationship with the Chief Minister?

**Senator A.J.H. Maclean:**

I would hope that I already have a special relationship with the Chief Minister on the basis that he has nominated me for this particular role. But clearly we have to continue to build relationships at all levels. I also wish to build much closer relationships with Members within this Assembly. If I am successful as Minister for Treasury and Resources, because it involves a solution over the next 3½ years, which are going to be challenging, which will need every single Member of this Assembly to be part of a team. But, yes, the Chief Minister and I, I am sure, will continue to build on our very good working relationship already.

### **1.1.11 Deputy S.Y. Mézec of St. Helier:**

The candidate spoke of the challenging situation he faces and he also said that raising taxes should always be a last option, so the necessary implication there is that if the savings he intends to find cannot be found then there will have to be cuts to public services. Can I ask him: which service is top of his list to cut if he cannot find the money he needs to and if it does come to tax rises, which tax is top of his list to rise, if necessary?

#### **Senator A.J.H. Maclean:**

I gave in my opening remarks a comment about tax. Yes, and that is absolutely right. I think any Government should be looking at tax raising options as the last option. Clearly it is damaging to the economy. It is not good for Islanders in a community to have more money taken out of their pocket. Consequently we have to make certain, first of all, that machinery of government is operating as efficiently as it possibly can. The reform programme, which has got a good foundation now, is beginning to deliver real benefit and real savings. We have got to roll that out much further and much faster. We can see more of those savings being delivered in different departments. Health and Social Security, in particular, have streamlined a number through the trial of areas and saved money and reduced cost. That exactly is what we should be seeking to do. It is only after one has been through that process, and also prioritising which services governments should be delivering. There are undoubtedly some as a Government that perhaps we should not be delivering, and that process is a process that we have to go through in order to arrive at the position of whether indeed in the long term there needs to be some adjustment to the tax system in terms of raising taxes.

### **1.1.12 Deputy S.Y. Mézec:**

Supplementary. I do not feel as if the Minister answered my question. It was quite specific. He said that it is not good for people to have less money in their pocket, and that is undoubtedly true. But it is also not good for vulnerable Islanders to have to suffer cuts to the public services that they rely on. So could we be quite specific? If he cannot find the money he needs to which public service is top of the list to be cut? Is it grants to university fees for students wanting to aspire to higher education? Is it the subsidy to G.P. (General Practitioner) visits? What is it? What is the top of the list to be cut, if need be?

#### **Senator A.J.H. Maclean:**

It certainly would not be around education because, as I said also in my opening remarks, education and health are clearly a priority. There needs to be a priority. In the past the way that we have operated, particularly for example through the comprehensive spending review, was all departments were asked to make a cut across the piece. I do not think that is an efficient way forward. I think what we need to do is look at prioritising services across the whole of Government. Health and Education are clearly important. That does not mean that Health, for that matter, cannot be more efficient. They are doing it through the Lean programme, as I have already mentioned. But they also need to make certain that there is more investment and the right investment in key services. As far as giving a list to the Deputy, I am not going to stand here and give him a list. That is a process you have to go through and that is part of the reform programme.

### **1.1.13 Deputy R. Labey of St. Helier:**

The Property Tax Green Paper had pages ripped out of it during the last election theatrically by his predecessor. Would the candidate plan on stapling any of those pages back in? **[Approbation]**

#### **Senator A.J.H. Maclean:**

No, I would not.

**1.1.14 Deputy R. Labey:**

Supplementary. Could he perhaps expand on his views on the property tax?

**Senator A.J.H. Maclean:**

I think it was well known, and I made it clear at the hustings, that I was not a supporter of the timing of the property tax being brought forward. My view now is it is in the public domain. It is going through its process, we will review it when it comes back and make some decisions, but I think my points about tax have been fairly clear, and it applies to property tax as well. That has to be a last option. There is a lot of work to be done as far as reform is concerned, efficiencies through the public sector and prioritising the types of services that we want to deliver. That comes first before we get anywhere near considering possible tax changes.

**1.1.15 Senator P.F. Routier:**

Would the candidate comment on his commitment to providing sufficient funds for the growing social services needs within our Island, particularly people with disabilities and people with mental health problems?

**Senator A.J.H. Maclean:**

Clearly this is an area that appears under-funded and I have already said that a priority, as far as I am concerned, is Education and Health; Health and Social Services for the avoidance of any doubt. We need to find the most appropriate solutions that are affordable but that deliver in an area that is clearly under-funded and under-resourced at the moment.

**1.1.16 The Connétable of St. Martin:**

Could the candidate tell the Assembly if he believes in reality whether anything can be done about non-local non-finance companies not paying tax on the Island?

**Senator A.J.H. Maclean:**

I think it has been problematic for some time. I would simply say that, of course, it is the shareholders that are the issue with regard to these particular businesses, and I think we need to continue to look at options that might be able to deliver some greater equity in this particular area. At the moment it is not particularly good. However many of these businesses do indeed employ people who pay tax and so there are contributions into the local economy that cannot be underestimated.

**1.1.17 Deputy J.A. Hilton of St. Helier:**

In a previous answer the Minister referred to not wishing to outline where he might make cuts but he did allude to that he believed that there were services being provided currently by Government that maybe should not be. He has obviously given this some consideration. Could he please enlighten Members as to what services he believes are being provided at the moment by departments that maybe should not be?

**Senator A.J.H. Maclean:**

I think this issue about cuts is something that gets misunderstood on many occasions. I gave again in my opening remarks an example of the R.N.L.I. That was a service that we could not afford within budget to manage at the time so we looked for a new solution. We appointed a new service provider in terms of the R.N.L.I. We cut the cost of the service but improved the quality of the actual outcome, plus 90 per cent of the lifeguards are now local people whereas before 100 per cent were imported. That is an example where you drive efficiencies not necessarily cuts. There is a difference between the 2. All I was making the point about was that we need to prioritise and

prioritise from the top. There are clear priorities, Health and Education being 2 areas specifically that need to be prioritised. There will be things further down. I do not know what they are. Maybe non-essential services. It will undoubtedly be non-essential administrative type functions that could be looked at or managed in a different way either within Government or outside of Government. But I cannot give specifics at this stage because I do not know. That is part of the States Assembly and all Members working as a team to understand the challenges and solution.

**1.1.18 Deputy G.P. Southern:**

Which one of the 3 questions I have got? What part does privatisation or outsourcing play in his version of cutting down costs in the delivery of public services?

**Senator A.J.H. Maclean:**

Privatisation does not particularly feature, as far as I am concerned, and if the Deputy is referring in particular to the proposed incorporation of the ports, it is incorporation not privatisation. There is a clear distinction although that gets lost by some people. There may be opportunities to outsource some services. In fact at Economic Development we have done exactly that. I have mentioned Jersey Enterprise that we used to have in-house and we had Jersey Business Venture that we grant-funded. We brought those 2 together, outsourced the service with a professional group of people providing support to small and medium-sized businesses. I think that is a good example of an outsourced service that created job opportunities.

**1.1.19 Deputy G.P. Southern:**

If he does have to resort to outsourcing services will he do so in full negotiation and consultation with the employees concerned?

**Senator A.J.H. Maclean:**

Of course. Absolutely.

**1.1.20 Deputy J.A. Martin of St. Helier:**

We are hearing again that he is a high-spend low-tax Minister, which is varied from the old conservative ranks. What I would ask him: how is he going to achieve keeping Health, Education and Social Security budgets without raising taxes and will he commit to not having across the board cuts in those 3 areas like his previous Minister did? Millions of pounds asked to be saved. How is he going to achieve this?

**Senator A.J.H. Maclean:**

That is exactly what I undertook a moment ago, when I talked about Health and Education being a priority. I made the point that both those departments, Health in particular can ...

**The Bailiff:**

I am sorry, Senator, I have to cut you off at the knees, to quote a former Connétable of St. John, and I will now ask you to retire and the Chief Usher will bring back Deputy Le Fondré. I need to ask the Greffier which cellar ... **[Laughter]** **[Approbation]** Very well, Deputy Le Fondré, when you are ready and gathered your papers you can start and have 10 minutes, and there will be a bell after 9 minutes.

**1.2 Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré of St. Lawrence:**

It is the first time I have ever been welcomed and people have been looking forward to a speech of mine. Technical competence, teamwork, transparency: a fresh approach from a professional who can hit the ground running. That is what I offer Members as a Minister for Treasury and

Resources. The Minister needs to be numerate, have good analytical skills, have focus and, given the technical nature of parts of Treasury, have experience of taxation and of finance. As a chartered accountant worryingly of some over 20 years' experience in the finance industry, both here and internationally, and with 5 years in Treasury, I am the candidate with the most experience in these areas. I believe my blend of analysis, careful, calm and reasoned decision making, combined with totally open approach is essential for the Island's next Minister for Treasury and Resources.

[10:15]

With me States Members would have a Minister who knows the ropes. The finance industry would have confidence that the person they are dealing with understands both their language and their business. Before I continue I think it is appropriate to address myself through the Chair directly to Senator Ozouf. Members will be aware that he and I have had disagreements over certain matters. I would like to take the opportunity to acknowledge all of his hard work in what has been a very difficult period to be Minister for Treasury and Resources. I do recognise his commitment to Jersey. But for the record, we have agreed to leave past history where it belongs and while accepting we have a different perspective on certain matters, looking forward all of us in this Assembly will have to work together to meet the challenges ahead. **[Approbation]** I started my speech by focusing on technical competence; why is that so important? Fundamentally it is about tackling the deficit and growing the economy. Good news is out there. There are green shoots. However, the latest economic advice is that recovery is taking far longer than expected and Jersey remains in a financially delicate position. Pressure on the public finances will continue for the foreseeable future. We must have a serious debate over what we spend and what we tax and it has to be done properly. What are the other issues? Defining long-term tax policy, assessing the outcome of the property tax review, and we must ensure throughout that we both respect and protect the independence of the Parish rating systems. No question. We have an Interim Treasurer and we have got a retiring Comptroller of Taxes, and as an external review action in the profession it might be an opportune time to look at the structure of the Tax Department. The T.T.P. (Tax Transformation Programme) has slowed, partially due to long-term care. Not only is that all about modernisation, it is also about dealing with the demands of F.A.T.C.A. (Foreign Account Tax Compliance Act), U.K. and U.S. (United States) and the C.R.S. (common reporting standard) of which we are early adopters, extending filing online, possible self-assessment, the debate on independent taxation, the margin rate, non-local non-finance companies, even the impact of F.O.I. (Freedom of Information) are all challenges facing this department. Externally pressures or possibly even opportunities, depending on your viewpoint, include B.E.P.S. (Base Erosion and Project Shifting), changes in the Swiss Forfait system, the impending visit of Moneyval and also the changes in the Gibraltar tax regime. I apologise if I might be using too much technical jargon but the point is that the Minister will need to have a clear understanding of these issues; any number of which have the potential to impact upon this Island, its economy and our base tax revenues, including Zero/Ten. It requires professional experience allied to proven financial acumen to know when to challenge the tough and searching questions. So how do I match up to the requirements of the job? I am a chartered accountant. I have been professionally qualified since 1993. I trained and qualified with one of the biggest accountancy firms in the world, including some time in a competitor jurisdiction internationally. In the document I sent to Members yesterday I set out examples of how I can resolve complex situations and then work collectively to deliver solutions, and that is all about teamwork. To establish, for example, the siting of the new dairy and facilities for Acorn Industries I led a team through 3 years of very careful negotiations between groups with conflicting views. That achievement helped secure the viability of the dairy and our precious dairy industry. I do not entertain short-term political fixes. I can also propose creative, simple solutions. The so-called Le Fondré proposals, which I always found embarrassing as a label, were approved by this Assembly back in 2008 as an alternative to exempting food from



G.S.T. (Goods and Services Tax). I came up with a simpler solution that used our existing systems to distribute monies and target them appropriately rather than clock-up greater bureaucratic costs by exempting food from G.S.T. That avoided spending between £200,000 to £300,000 per year. But equally importantly it targeted help to those who most needed it. During my time at J.P.H. (Jersey Property Holdings) we achieved many successes, most of which passed under the radar. We delivered £400,000 of annual savings in the retendering of maintenance contracts and £11 million to £12 million on property disposals; a figure which at the time was bang on target. I represented the Island and this Assembly on the international stage at both the British-Irish Parliamentary Assembly and also at the Assemblée Parlementaire de la Francophonie. These are both prime opportunities to promote Jersey to national politicians from a number of different jurisdictions. I am delighted we have secured the regional conference of the A.P.F. (Assemblée Parlementaire de la Francophonie) to take place next year. On a personal level I have redeveloped the El Tico. As Honorary Secretary of Le Vaux Housing Trust for 18 years I have helped deliver many projects and we have just announced the next step in the £25 million to £30 million redevelopment of Troy Court. Returning to my very first days in Treasury I was involved in the implementation of Zero/Ten, 20 Means 20, G.S.T., incorporation of Jersey Post, creation of the Stabilisation Fund, the Fiscal Policy Panel and the Common Investment Fund, as well as various budgetary measures, including the first increase in child allowance for quite some time. So I do have the foundation and the knowledge there and I do know the roots of a lot of the base of our present tax structure. I know many of the teams in Treasury and I still have a good and trusting relationship with them. If you chose me for Treasury today there will be little lead-in time. I can hit the ground running and that is vital considering the challenges we face. Successful teamwork requires both trust and transparency. We need to generate consensus, not risk further division, and that starts with this Assembly. The Code of Conduct requires Ministers to be as open as possible. I undertake throughout my tenure to hold regular one-to-one and small group surgeries in order to improve the information flow to States Members. Members must understand more about the income we receive and the money we spend. Transparency is not just lip service. In my profession it is actively encouraged. It is all about having a questioning mind about ethics, governance and having an independent approach. It is what we in the profession call professional scepticism. It is about giving more quality information to stakeholders, i.e. us, States Members in this instance, to allow them to make more informed decisions. That means more certainty and fewer surprises. Not only is it incumbent upon us but it is what the public expect: teamwork, trust and transparency demand far, far more and I undertake to address that, if elected. If appointed, within the first 100 days taking office I will work with the Chief Minister to produce a very clear statement of the present and future financial position of this Island for Members. Sir, as you reminded us on Monday, we are an Assembly of independent Members and that is one of our strengths. On at least 2 occasions Members have clearly stated they wish to keep the right to appoint Ministers themselves. The Dean in his sermon made the point about putting the right person into the right job. That is what today is about. My professional background along with my years in Treasury and J.P.H., my time in the Chief Minister's Department and T.T.S. (Transport and Technical Services), my time on Scrutiny and on P.A.C. (Public Accounts Committee) in my view makes me the right person for this role. Even under extreme pressure my approach is one of careful, calm and reasoned deliberation with independent thinking, leading to a clear decision. I have been asked why I want to take on this role and the answer is simple. I am passionate about Jersey. I want to be constructive in helping our Island community through the financial challenges ahead. I want to do this not because it is going to be easy but because it is going to be hard, and that does play to my skillset. But that has to apply to every Member in this Assembly, each and every one of us. Grappling with the deficit in States finances will be hard and hard for all of us. Our Minister for Treasury and Resources must be someone who will be able to carry the States with them and can demonstrate the ability to build consensus, irrespective of political viewpoints, someone with common sense and financial sense, a

safe, prudent pair of hands with a strong financial background. I hope I have demonstrated I have the right blend of technical competence, teamwork and transparency, and for all those reasons I would like to end by asking Members to consider supporting me with their vote. Thank you.

### **[Approbation]**

#### **The Bailiff:**

We now have up to 20 minutes for questions. Deputy Kevin Lewis.

#### **1.2.1 Deputy K.C. Lewis of St. Saviour:**

If successful what does the candidate see as his major challenges and objectives at Treasury?

#### **Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré:**

I think we need to split that between the internal challenges and the external challenges. Externally, there are a lot of pressures. Even in the headlines today Luxembourg and its tax situation is under pressure, so there is always going to be continuing pressure on the offshore finance centres. Gibraltar has got another investigation underway because it has just changed its Zero/Ten policy. All of those things impact down to our base tax structure, put pressure on it and that has an impact on Treasury. Internally we have still only got, I believe, an Interim Treasurer. We have the Comptroller of Taxes is retiring. That is, I think, 39 years of experience going out and leaving that department. We have things like the Tax Transformation Programme needs to come through. There has been a slowdown because of long-term care. There are various internal processes going on. There are some opportunities out there. One of the big programmes that is coming through at the moment is all to do with transfer pricing and base erosion of profit shifting. The point is that is an opportunity for Jersey because it could require more business to come into Jersey because of having more substance and that can be a positive. But those are all the type of challenges, they are of a technical nature, and some of my problem is I have got the knowledge but trying to express it concisely is always a problem. They are of a technical nature. But my base and the point of view I have got 20 years of experience in the accounting world. In fact I worked out my degree was 30 years ago, which is a bit worrying. I understand the language. I am in the position to be able to communicate well to the finance industry on those types of issues but I am also in the position to have the technical discussions with the officers and then translate them so hopefully Members can understand.

#### **1.2.2 Deputy G.P. Southern:**

The candidate almost lost my vote in the first sentence because I want to remind him that platitudes are easy, making things improve is the bigger challenge. However, given that he has still got my vote – just - does the candidate expect that the shortfall in tax revenues uncovered in the 2015 Budget will remain present in 2016 and if so, what is his 'Plan A' to deal with that and, secondly, what is 'Plan B', if that does not work?

#### **Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré:**

The short answer is we have, I think, extremely challenging times ahead. So, yes, I do expect there to be some level of deficit going forward. The problem we have is that we do not know the size of the deficit and we do not also know whether it is structural or temporary. As Members may have picked up, I have given an undertaking that within 100 days, if you do appoint me to post, I will issue a very clear statement, working with the Chief Minister as to where we are. That is also about communication and the transparency and the teamwork. To go to a second part of that one, how do we try and tackle the problem? We can all talk about public sector reform and e-Government and Lean and all that sort of stuff. The issue around there is we are going to need to do all of that. I want to give a flavour of thought processes. It is a long answer because it is a long question.

**The Bailiff:**

Well, not too long please, Deputy, because Members wish to ask questions.

**Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré:**

Not too long, 3 seconds. Three areas that I would like to look at. One is looking at the corporate structure and the Zero/Ten rate from the point of view, is there scope to get more revenue out of that area? Within the profession of the majority of people I speak to there is a view that there is some scope. Number 2, if we look at things like the Social Security Department and Treasury, there are efficiencies and synergies between the operational levels of those 2 departments. I think we should be looking at those. I do not want to get into involvement on policy, benefits, something along those lines, but you do have, for example, contribution collection and you have tax collection. In other parts of the world they do look at their department. We should at least have that discussion. Number 3, Treasury looks after 3 property sections. It has Property Holdings, it has S.o.J.D.C. (States of Jersey Development Company) and it has Andium now. There are synergies and overlaps between all of their operations. Number 4, and finally, one of my passions for example is about the office modernisation strategy. That could potentially save us £10 million a year and it has also got the advantage possibly of achieving urban regeneration in St. Helier. That gives a flavour because none of those are about front line services. That is my focus. If it is worse then I think everything is in. The only way you can square things is grow the economy, cut the expenditure and for me, the last resort, but it may well be something we have to be honest about, there may well be tax rises coming.

**1.2.3 Deputy G.P. Southern:**

May I be specific? The candidate has suggested that there was something he could do about the Zero/Ten structure. Is he prepared to say what scope he has discovered there because it has taken the previous Minister for Treasury and Resources 3 years to come up with nothing?

**Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré:**

The problem with Zero/Ten is that things keep moving at the moment. As I said, I made reference to Gibraltar. They have changed their system and they are under investigation by the E.U. (European Union). The issue there is that if the E.U. considered that as compliant then that gives us scope for more flexibility but we do not know the situation.

[10:30]

Even Guernsey slightly expanded its regime recently. I think it is on the peripheral. There is a view within the industry which has changed in the last 5 years that there is scope to tackle better the issues around U.K. companies operating over here because the regime has changed. They used to pay tax in the U.K. and therefore economically it was always an argument that they pay tax in the U.K. and they are not paying tax here, that is fine. That has changed. They do not pay tax in the U.K. now and they do not pay tax here. The professional view, for example, is that there is scope to use those measures to challenge that from our perspective. What I would say is that there are lots of views. There are some professional views saying that you cannot touch it. At the very least - and I am not aware of this having happened, maybe it has - we need to get all those people round the table and pin this down because things are shifting. There are officer views that there may be some scope around concept pricing to get some more revenue but it is a bit patchy. We need to bring the people together. That is about the team-working exercise. That is what I am saying, that hopefully I believe that with my knowledge of the industry and with the people I speak to I think we have to try a different approach to resolve that problem. Make no mistake, we do have to resolve that problem, both from a revenue point of view - it is not going to be Paris here,

there is some scope I believe - but also from the political point of view. It is not acceptable out there in the public domain that we have not been seen to address it.

**Deputy M.R. Higgins:**

I was going to ask my question on qualifications but he answered that and also my question on Zero/Ten has been answered, thank you.

**1.2.4 The Deputy of St. John:**

Would the candidate agree to an independent forensic account of public finances before work on the M.T.F.P. begins?

**Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré:**

Absolutely. My view is, as an accountant, one is coming into a system where there have been some changes which we are all aware of and I believe, and in fact I have always understood it was one of the Scrutiny recommendations from their review of the 2015 Budget. So absolutely. I would really hope if I was appointed that the Deputy of St. John would be able to participate, possibly even as the Assistant Minister.

**1.2.5 Deputy M. Tadier:**

The candidate threw us an interesting scrap of information saying there may be tax rises coming. Can he elaborate on that saying which tax rises are likely and which he prefers?

**Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré:**

What I caveated my response with is that we do not know the magnitude of the deficit. But if the inferred question is what is my view, for example, on G.S.T., I do not want to see a raise in G.S.T. If it helps I would absolutely no way support an increase in G.S.T. The issues there are the economic climate at the moment, I think it would damage business; and equally I think it would be unacceptable because I do not think the public perception is that they do not see we have done the public sector reform enough. I think from that point of view my history in terms of focusing on not doing increases because they are easy, I hope, will support that. My background as an accountant is that I think there are other ways within the existing tax system if we need to, but firstly let us focus on the corporate side.

**1.2.6 Deputy M. Tadier:**

A supplementary. If tax rises are required, which section of society is most able to pay those taxes?

**Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré:**

I have to say I am very much in favour of simple and broad-based and that does mean that a tax goes across everywhere and none of us like paying it. However, it has always been very clear that we make sure we protect the people who are less well-off in doing so.

**1.2.7 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf:**

I am grateful for the candidate's remarks about letting bygones be bygones but I will please, if I may, still press him. We need, as he says, to deliver economic growth. We need to find £50 million in healthcare costs for the next 5 years. That requires certainty on tax. Does the candidate really believe that I can be successful in bringing in economic growth to Jersey from Financial Services when effectively he has made a statement that we no longer have certainty on Zero/Ten?

**Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré:**

I did not say we did not have certainty on Zero/Ten. I said the world on Zero/Ten is changing and that we do not necessarily know what the position is going to be over the next few years. But as that world changes we have to consider whether there is an opportunity to increase our scope for Zero/Ten to bring in greater revenue. One always has to make sure that the message we send out to the world is that we are a stable, secure and sound location and jurisdiction, which I fundamentally believe we are. I have worked in the finance industry for over 20 years and certainly the message I want to see is that I am proud of Jersey. I am very supportive of the finance industry and I believe we have a good reputation.

**1.2.8 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf:**

Can I follow up that? He did not nail it. Zero/Ten in Guernsey has been extended to our scope. He must be aware of that. The Gibraltar issue is an entirely different matter. What is the scope for increasing Zero/Ten revenue, which he is going to say that is not going to destabilise getting the economic growth into Jersey? He has not explained it.

**Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré:**

Sorry, I thought I had covered that in one of the other answers. My understanding, for example, is that U.K. branches over here do not pay tax in the U.K. Professionals I speak to - senior professionals in the tax world - are of the view that we can use tax measures that the U.K. use themselves, apply it to Jersey, to get some of that income. I have also made it very clear that that is a majority view, it is not a universal view. What I have said is that one needs to look at it and have that discussion because if a professional who has been in the industry for 40 years and is at the senior level says to me: "I believe that it is possible" I think we should look at it. That is all I am saying. Bear in mind that if we are talking about the non-local non-finance companies then we are not talking about the finance industry, we are talking-up the margins. It is not going to destabilise. The people we are talking about have been embedded in the finance industry for a long, long time. They are some of the spokesmen of the industry and they are saying that they believe there is scope to do some changes. They do have to say you have to do it carefully, you have to at the very least look at it. That is not changing the base of zero or the base of 10. It is saying: "Can you extend?" If you extend the number of companies that are charged at zero and you then extend the companies that you can tax at 10 per cent. We have already done it, by the way, in terms of we redefined companies like oil companies as utility companies, as an example. We have changed things in the past and the world did not end. It was the right thing to do. In fact I think Senator Ozouf did that. It is that type of approach that is using the industry expertise that we have available ...

**The Bailiff:**

Deputy, I am sorry, I think I am going to have to ask you to be a little bit more concise so that all Members can ask their questions. Deputy Andrew Lewis.

**1.2.9 Deputy A.D. Lewis of St. Helier:**

Would the Deputy be prepared to work collaboratively with other competing jurisdictions when under attack from the likes of the E.U. and the O.E.C.D. (Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development)?

**Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré:**

The short answer is, absolutely. The longer answer is that we obviously already do because we obviously work within the Crown Dependencies. Is there scope to widen it? In certain cases I believe there is.

**1.2.10 Deputy K.L. Moore of St. Peter:**

Could the candidate explain how he would organise his time and other commitments in order to focus on this very challenging role?

**Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré:**

I was an Assistant Minister in Treasury for 5 years and so I am fully aware of the work that is involved and it is perfectly manageable. I am not quite too sure ... it is a responsible job but obviously I have the background and the knowledge as an accountant of, as I said, 20-plus years that gives the deeper understanding to enable me to do it properly.

**1.2.11 Deputy J.A. Hilton:**

In a previous answer the candidate referred to his preference for G.S.T. being simple and broad-based. Can we take it from that comment that if G.S.T. was to rise that he would support G.S.T. on food being increased?

**Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré:**

My fundamental principle on G.S.T. and food exemptions has always been to try and avoid them if possible, and I know the Deputy disagrees with me on that front. The principle we have always espoused is to try and use our existing systems to protect those who get hit worst by any tax increases. The measures I have promoted and we have put in place, which was basically increasing tax exemptions, increasing the G.S.T. bonus and increasing income support was specifically designed to protect those people who are least able to pay and to afford. What turned out is that the measures basically I recommended and were adopted have proved that we can put more money into those people's purses rather than the benefit they would receive from exempting food. So that principle holds and that principle holds at whatever point the rate starts at. I hope that answers the question.

**1.2.12 Deputy J.A. Hilton:**

Supplementary. Does the candidate not accept that generally speaking it is those at the least wealthy end and those most wealthy who are looked after and continuously it seems to me that it is middle-Jersey being squeezed and squeezed and facing [Approbation] any potential increases? That is why I am so against increases in G.S.T. on food because it affects everybody across the board.

**Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré:**

As a principle I agree entirely with the fact that I think middle-Jersey is struggling and that every time we put taxes up from this Assembly they are the ones who pick up the tab. The difficulty I have is that in terms of exempting food, I do not think they will see the benefits that the Deputy thinks it will achieve. One can tweak things by tweaking the exemption levels that does assist middle-Jersey, and those benefits go all the way up. You can be earning £80,000 or £90,000 and still be on the marginal rate so you do capture people defined as middle-Jersey by the proposals we put through. It does require some understanding from a technical point of view and again that is what my background is.

**1.2.13 Senator P.F. Routier:**

Can the candidate explain his commitment to providing funds for the growing needs of social services, specifically people with disabilities and the Children's Service?

**Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré:**

Sorry, can he repeat the question. There was some muttering.

**Senator P.F. Routier:**

Sorry, could the candidate explain his commitment to ensuring that sufficient funds are given to Social Services; that is the shortened version?

**Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré:**

I am sure when we produce the Medium Term Financial Plan all the priorities that will be established will be in there. I am sure we will all be supportive of that level of priority.

**1.2.14 Deputy S.Y. Mézec:**

The outgoing Minister in his role as Minister for Treasury and Resources visited some countries with some of the worst human rights records on the planet, including Saudi Arabia, the country with the second-worst human rights record on the planet; only North Korea being worse. If elected what would the candidate’s attitudes to visiting these appalling countries be?

**Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré:**

As a precept, the Minister for Treasury and Resources going forward for the next 3 years will have to be a lot more focused on what I will call the financial role of Treasury. The marketing role is going to be, and I think ably, in the hands of Senator Ozouf and the new Minister for Economic Development. To be honest, I do not want to blur those roles. I want to be very clear and very focused on the roles of the 2 Ministers and make sure we do not overlap.

**1.2.15 Deputy S.G. Luce of St. Martin:**

Could the candidate indicate his support or not for overseas aid contributions from Jersey and whether he sees there is a need for change?

**Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré:**

In the ideal world I would like to ...

**The Bailiff:**

He will never know, I am afraid, Deputy. **[Laughter]** I shall ask for Senator Maclean to be brought back and then we will move to the vote.

[10:45]

We will move to the vote. This will be an electronic vote as there are only 2 candidates. If you wish to vote for Senator Maclean you vote pour, that is P. If you wish to vote for Deputy Le Fondré you vote contre. If you wish to abstain you abstain. So to remind you: pour Senator Maclean, contre Deputy Le Fondré, or abstain. The Greffier will open the voting.

<b>SENATOR A.J.H. MACLEAN:</b>	<b>DEPUTY J.A.N. LE FONDRÉ:</b>	<b>ABSTAIN: 0</b>
Senator P.F.C. Ozouf	Connétable of St. Lawrence	
Senator A.J.H. Maclean	Connétable of St. Martin	
Senator I.J. Gorst	Connétable of St. Saviour	
Senator L.J. Farnham	Connétable of Grouville	
Senator P.M. Bailhache	Connétable of St. John	
Senator A.K.F. Green	Deputy J.A. Martin (H)	
Senator Z.A. Cameron	Deputy G.P. Southern (H)	
Connétable of St. Helier	Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)	
Connétable of St. Clement	Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)	
Connétable of St. Peter	Deputy M. Tadier (B)	
Connétable of St. Mary	Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)	
Connétable of St. Ouen	Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)	
Connétable of Trinity	Deputy S.Y. Mézec (H)	

Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)		Deputy A.D. Lewis (H)		
Deputy of Trinity		Deputy L.M.C. Doublet (S)		
Deputy E.J. Noel (L)		Deputy R. Labey (H)		
Deputy of St. John		Deputy S.M. Bree (C)		
Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)		Deputy of St. Mary		
Deputy of St. Martin				
Deputy R.G. Bryans (H)				
Deputy of St. Peter				
Deputy R.J. Rondel (H)				
Deputy of St. Ouen				
Deputy S.M. Wickenden (H)				
Deputy M.J. Norton (B)				
Deputy T.A. McDonald (S)				
Deputy G.J. Truscott (B)				
Deputy P.D. McLinton (S)				

**Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré:**

May I just congratulate Senator Maclean and thank those for voting for me.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Is there anyone present who did not vote or are there 2 people absent?

**The Greffier of the States:**

Two Members were absent when the vote was taken.

**The Bailiff:**

We move next to the next proposition from the Chief Minister. Chief Minister, who would you like to propose next?

**2. The Minister for Health and Social Services**

**Senator I.J. Gorst:**

I should like to propose the position of Minister for Health and Social Services - Senator Andrew Green.

**The Bailiff:**

Is that seconded? **[Seconded]** Are there any other nominations for that Ministerial post?

**The Deputy of St. John:**

Can I nominate Senator Zoe Cameron for the position of Minister for Health and Social Services?

**The Bailiff:**

Is that seconded? **[Seconded]** Are there any other nominations? Very well, then we have 2 nominations. First Senator Cameron will withdraw. I invite Senator Green to address the Assembly for up to 10 minutes.

**2.1 Senator A.K.F. Green:**

Our health service and social service like those in many other jurisdictions throughout the world finds itself in a very challenging position: growing patient numbers, increasingly complex procedures, an ageing population, greater mental health issues, a creaking infrastructure and greater demand for social services and community support. Yet, in many ways, the objectives today are the same as they were when Florence Nightingale was a nurse. That is one of putting patients at the



centre of everything that we do. I purposely used the term “patient” and not some modern politically correct description such as “customer” or “client”. No, hospitals and health services have patients. I have a vision. A vision that builds on the work and uses good solid foundations set by the Deputy of Trinity. A vision of a health service accessible to all, where Islanders take responsibility for their own wellbeing. A vision of a health service where people are, so far as practical, supported to stay in their own homes and in the communities that they know and love. A vision of a health service delivered to the highest standard, in the right environment, from the right agency at the right time, at the right cost, be that primary, community, hospital or third sector or social care. But this vision will not be achieved unless we all work together to get the best possible outcomes within the resources available rather than individual Ministries, organisations, or practitioners simply arguing for more money. Without us all collectively thinking of the best approach for the people of Jersey my vision will fail. If we are to have a fully integrated health and social service that we can all be proud of, teamwork across all disciplines will be essential. Lean will continue to be an essential part of this. Access to primary care and the range of services provided must be reviewed with a view to increasing services in the community and we must blur the lines between care in the community and in the hospital. This approach was reported on recently in the excellent King’s Fund report on Canterbury, New Zealand, and I urge Members to read it if they have not read it yet. I made no rash promises during my Senatorial campaign but I did promise to continue to work hard for the people of Jersey and, if elected as Minister for Health and Social Services, to review the proposed 2-centre hospital and report back within 100 days. I am proud to stand now before this Assembly as a newly elected Senator and reiterate that promise. That if elected as your Minister for Health and Social Services I will report back on the proposed 2-centre hospital within 100 days of my appointment. In many ways the decision to develop a new hospital is the easy bit. Or should I say the less difficult part. The harder task is delivering an appropriate facility in a timely and affordable way. One of the concerns I have is that under the current 2-site option the General Hospital site will be in continuous development and a building site for 10 years. This is right. This is what we would want for our mothers or fathers, our wives or husbands, our children or grandchildren. Of course there are a host of other considerations when reviewing the proposal for the new hospital. But when each factor is considered, the patient and their families must be at the centre of our thoughts and actions, along with those who deliver the service. It is my experience as a leader of considerable change that change can only be achieved if it is done with the staff not to the staff. I can cite the Housing Transformation Programme as being a successful application of this approach: homes and lives now being transformed as a result. The Chief Minister has given an undertaking that the site for a new hospital will come to this Assembly for debate and I welcome and support this. I have already stated that in many ways the provision of the new hospital was the easy part of the job. A much greater challenge however is securing the change in culture. By that I mean the way in which services are delivered. There is no quick fix for this, but it is an essential task that will need completing and it is arguably more pressing than the infrastructure. People talk of whistleblowing and the need for safe procedures. I will build on the new systems put in place by the previous Minister. I want to encourage a culture of continuous improvement where staff are valued. Where it is safe to report problems and errors in the spirit of continuous improvement and one where we learn together and support one another. I look to places such as Seattle in the U.S.A. where the Virginia Mason Hospital has made such a culture change that was described as inspirational by the U.K. Secretary of Health, Jeremy Hunt. We can do this in Jersey, and more. While on the subject of staff, I will encourage and support the excellent work of the Nurse Education Centre in the development and training of our own nurses along with the recruitment of specialist nurses where appropriate. Retention of staff has been a problem in the past and at the heart of this, I believe, is the lack of key worker accommodation. This must be resolved and ensuring appropriate levels of remuneration are paid to our front line staff as well. I know the States Employment Board are working on this. We are sitting on a time bomb. A bomb

that I and my Ministerial team can defuse. My research tells me that by 2020 mental health problems will be the second most common cause of illness after heart disease. As an Island unless we change things this will be unacceptable and unaffordable. 2020 sounds so far away, in fact it is not. I believe as a community and as a Government we need to work harder to ensure that the issues of stigma around mental illness are lessened and reduced. We must get to a position where our mental health is recognised as being just as important as our physical health. I believe that we need to invest in much earlier interventions and promote mental health wellbeing and we need to do this now. We need to do this in our schools. We need to do it in our workplace. We need to do it in the wider community. Prevention is so much better than cure and, for that matter, so much cheaper. Genuine partnerships between Health, Education, employers and the voluntary community sector have to be developed. Clearly there is more work to be done in the area of children and young person's services. No one can argue with the vision of the strategic framework that all children and young people should grow up in a safe, supportive community in which they achieve their full potential, in which they lead happy, healthy lives but we cannot allow ourselves to be complacent. It is time to deliver. It is time to co-ordinate the transition from child to young adult. I do not know why but it always seems to me that it comes as a surprise to professionals that children sometimes become adults. It is time for outcomes that are focused on the child and their family. Where families are listened to and supported with services such as respite. Moving on to the ageing community: like all western communities this is going to be one of our biggest challenges. It is both a problem and an opportunity. An opportunity to use the knowledge and experience of older folk to ensure inclusion within the community, not exclusion. Appropriate housing and support will be essential to ensure that elderly folk are supported correctly in their homes if the case allows when it comes for them to have a positive end of life experience rather than forcing individuals into homes or hospitals. Time does not allow me to explain all my thoughts but I am often quoted as saying: "If you always do what you have always done you will always get what you have always got." It is time for change. It is time to build on that feedback from the White Paper. I ask you to support me as your next Minister for Health and Social Services. I am no medic. I have no intention of getting involved in clinical decisions. I will leave that to the professionals. My role will be to ensure robust policies are in place. To ensure an appropriate infrastructure and facilities are in place. To ensure a culture of trust and continuous improvement. My track record shows I get things done. I build constructive teams with honest and frank dialogue to get things done. That I think independently and work collectively to get things done. I am no nodding dog. I urge Members to join me on my journey and to share my vision.

### **[Approbation]**

#### **The Bailiff:**

We now have up to 20 minutes. Can I just remind Members that Standing Orders say questions should be concise and so should answers? I do appreciate that in this particular questioning session Ministers or candidates need to elaborate a little longer than they would in normal sessions but nevertheless I would ask the candidates to be as concise as possible.

#### **2.1.1 Deputy M.R. Higgins:**

Will the candidate explain to Members what academic and professional qualifications he has and explain their relevance to the Minister for Health and Social Services role and explain what particular skills he has and that he can put to this?

#### **Senator A.K.F. Green:**

I do not know how far back you want me to go but I will admit to leaving school at 15 with no qualifications. However I joined the Army and they saw some huge potential in me and put me through the normal process of 'O' and 'A' levels and all the rest of it.

[11:00]

I have a diploma in management and I have many years of experience within the health service. Many of that at senior level. I probably led the most radical public sector reform that Jersey has ever seen but it is forgotten in the past; 1980, 1984, where we brought in new technology, reduced the number of kitchens to one and reduced the number of staff from 140 whole-time equivalent to 72. All in the spirit of having sufficient funds then to staff the new building that had been built then for 'A Block.' I have considerable experience in managing change, not only in the Housing Transformation Programme but in my voluntary unpaid work as national chairman of Headway U.K. where we now have 150 branches across the U.K. helping thousands of people who are suffering from brain injury. I am well experienced in order to lead this team.

### **2.1.2 Deputy L.M.C. Doublet of St. Saviour:**

Could the Senator please talk about what level of priority he will give to implementing their Scrutiny Panel recommendations on the C.A.M.H.S. (Child and Adolescent Mental Health Service) in Jersey?

### **Senator A.K.F. Green:**

That would be one of my utmost priorities and I have to say did I think that was one of the best reports I have ever seen come from Scrutiny, and I congratulate Deputy Hilton and the former Deputy Reed for the work that was done there. Utmost priority. It is not possible in a 10-minute speech to cover all the areas. I alluded to mental health and I link C.A.M.H.S. within that. Top priority.

### **2.1.3 Connétable M.J. Paddock of St. Ouen:**

The candidate I am sure does not realise at the moment that there is total confusion out there within Health and Social Services and Social Security with long-term care with regards to the members of the departments and also to the public. How would he get the message out to the public of how this long term care works?

### **Senator A.K.F. Green:**

I mentioned in my speech again that this is about teamwork, not just teamwork between Ministers, teamwork between departments, but teamwork between the Parishes. We do need to get that message out but I am not convinced that some of the officers understand the system either and we need to get that out. It is a clear one of messaging. I might investigate that.

### **2.1.4 Deputy P.D. McLinton of St. Saviour:**

In relation to mental health I think it is fairly safe to say that Health and Social Services do not have a track record to be proud of. The Chief Minister designate mentioned in his statement: "Mental health has for far too long not received the attention it deserves. I will be supporting plans to update the Mental Health Law and to radically improve the support available for those suffering from mental health issues." "Radically" is a big word. How do you propose to "radically" improve support for those suffering from mental health issues? **[Approbation]**

### **The Bailiff:**

Just, how does the candidate propose to do it?

### **Senator A.K.F. Green:**

This is probably one of the biggest challenges that the health service faces at this time. It has been a Cinderella service and that needs to be corrected. The improvements in the Mental Health Law have gone on far too long. I am aware that over 30 years ago work first commenced on that law.

So that is the first thing we need to do but facilities need to be provided. I hesitate at the moment to identify where those facilities should be but just to give one example, where people are inappropriately sent to prison instead of to mental health secure institutions must be resolved. There is no quick cheap fix and it will be one of my absolute priorities.

#### **2.1.5 Deputy S.Y. Mézec:**

I am sure the candidate will understand the importance of preventative care and making sure illnesses are dealt with in their early stages as something that is ultimately good for patients as well as good for public finances because of the savings in the long run. It was one of Reform Jersey's policies to improve accessibility to G.P. visits by making them easier for people on low incomes to afford. Does the candidate agree with this that this should be a priority, because time and time again I am constantly meeting constituents who just wait until things get really bad before they go see a G.P. because they cannot afford it? Does he agree that it should be fundamentally important and a priority to reduce the cost of seeing a doctor in Jersey?

#### **Senator A.K.F. Green:**

In my Senatorial campaign I made no rash promises; promises that I could not fulfil and I am not going to do that today. However, I do think a review is required in terms of access into primary care. A review is required to see what it is that encourages people. I think we know the answer but how we could handle it differently. What is it that encourages people to inappropriately use hospital services when they would be much better treated by primary care? I think the answer to that clearly is cost and that needs to be looked at. If by reducing the cost or increasing the subsidy in one area we can save costs in another area and not just financial cost but opportunity costs, i.e. patients get seen quicker. It is worth looking at. So I promise to look at it. I am not going to stand here and give out a load of magic answers.

#### **2.1.6 Deputy G.P. Southern:**

There is currently a fair degree of peace in the health service between the employees and the employers. However, I fear it is a temporary one. What will the candidate do to improve pay rates and conditions for employees in the health service so that the Island is seen as attractive and a place where we can recruit and retrain skilled staff?

#### **Senator A.K.F. Green:**

I know this is something that the S.E.B. (States Employment Board) are already working on in particular to ensure that equal value for work done and nurses have come out as needing to be adjusted in order to be fair to nurses and in order to attract people from the U.K. but it is not just about pay. It is about the way staff are treated. It is about the welcome they get when they get here. It is about their accommodation. It is about nursery. All of these issues need to be resolved, not just the pay.

#### **2.1.7 Deputy M. Tadier:**

The candidate has just presided over a department which incorporated housing which introduced rent hikes for the most vulnerable in society with the creation of Andium Homes. Does he have any plans to create Andium Health where members of our society will have to pay 90 per cent of the cost of private health care when they go to hospital?

#### **Senator A.K.F. Green:**

No.

#### **2.1.8 Deputy M. Tadier:**

A supplementary in that case. Can it really be the case in answering my colleague's question and when saying he is not going to make any hard and fast promises? The very basic problem in Jersey is that people cannot afford to visit the G.P.s. Can the Minister not even give a basic undertaking that he would like affordability to be able to go and see the doctor, to be an issue that he can resolve in the next 3½ years?

**Senator A.K.F. Green:**

Yes, and if the Member had been listening to my speech I mentioned that I wanted accessibility for all, and I have also said that I am prepared to look at it but I am not going to go there and make rash promises that cannot be afforded. An extra £50 million is required for the health service now. We need also to look at the way we spend our money and I do not just mean the way we spend our money in Health. We need to look at the way that the money is spent and allocated in Social Security and in Education. They all work together. They all have an effect on health. I agree with Deputy Mézec with his comment before that prevention is better than cure. We need to get that right as well.

**2.1.9 Connétable D.W. Mezbourian of St. Lawrence:**

Does the candidate intend to work with Parishes towards providing care facilities in the community and if so would he intend them to be funded by the department?

**Senator A.K.F. Green:**

Taking the last bit first. Again, I cannot say whether the department would fund the care in the community or whether it would be a shared responsibility or it might be one funded by Health but getting a third sector provider to do it. All these options are there. I commit absolutely to working with the Connétables and I want to work with the Connétables to provide proper sheltered housing as well as community services. By proper sheltered housing I do not mean some very nice, well designed, gentele accommodation. Yes, you need that as well but the elderly need to have access to services to support them in their own homes, access to meals maybe; not always. Access to support with cleaning and laundry not sheltered housing with a warden on site. Those are the sorts of things that I would want to work both with Andium and other social housing providers and the Constables.

**2.1.10 Deputy J.M. Maçon of St. Saviour:**

The candidate has said that he believes that prevention is better than cure and, therefore, there is a role within Social Services in order to achieve this. What specific objective does the candidate have in regard to social services?

**Senator A.K.F. Green:**

Social Services has always been, to my mind, the Cinderella service and that is where, probably, the majority of the investment needs to be done. Families deserve to be supported. Young people deserve to be supported and to have just 2 adult respite beds is just not acceptable. We need to find other ways of providing that sort of support for families in the community but we need the health service that we can afford at the same time.

**2.1.11 Deputy R.J. Renouf of St. Ouen:**

Will the candidate consider giving greater assistance to relatives of patients who are required to travel abroad for their treatment and assistance in travel and accommodation while over there, which do provide difficulties for people who cannot afford those at times of great stress?

**[Approbation]**

**Senator A.K.F. Green:**

I commit to reviewing this. I know it is a difficulty. I have been there myself with my own son when he had to visit Southampton Hospital. It is a difficulty but also conversely it is not a bottomless pit. So we need to come up with a system that is fair and perhaps those with more chronic conditions that need to travel more often; there might be a cap where those people would then get more support. I need to look at it but I know it is an issue for middle-Jersey more than anybody else.

**2.1.12 Deputy J.A. Hilton:**

The budget for the new hospital was decided at a time when I believe that there was expected to be modest returns on the investment returns from the Strategic Fund. In fact it performed spectacularly well last year and possibly this year. In light of that does the candidate believe it is good use of taxpayers' money to spend £300 million on a hospital split across 2 sites which only produces 44 per cent new build across the 2 sites; 30 per cent refurbished and 26 per cent of the existing hospital to stay as it is?

**Senator A.K.F. Green:**

I have grave concerns about the 2 sites for a number of different reasons. The first one is - and I do not know the answer to the question I am going to ask because I am not the Minister - have the revenue consequences of running 2 centres been looked at, the ongoing revenue consequences? The second one is... and in a much lower scale, I have renovated over 30 years my own house. It would have been far cheaper to have knocked it down and built a new one. **[Approbation]** If you applied that to the new hospital I need to be really convinced that what we end up with ... I do not want patients or their carers on a building site for 10 years. Those that are chronically ill coming in regularly to hospital will be on or in a building site for 10 years. I do not want that. I will be looking at the money and I will be looking at the effect on families and patients and listening to those that work in there as to what facilities they need to deliver the services to the patients that must be at the centre of everything that we do.

**2.1.13 The Connétable of St. Martin:**

I think the Constable of St. Lawrence was looking over my shoulder. I have changed my question. How would the candidate, if successful, inform the public that care in the community has changed and it is not coming from the State and it is coming from other organisations and the Parish? How do you get that across to the public?

**Senator A.K.F. Green:**

We do, I think not just in Health and Social Services to the Council of Ministers, but as an Assembly we need to get the way that we communicate with the public straight. We need to do it better. We need information going out and not spin. We need to get facts out there to individual carers. To answer the Constable's question, it will be a matter of having a very clear policy first and then communicating that, testing the water with workshops and Parish Hall meetings and the like. There is a lot of work to do. There is a lot of work to do but communication will be key to everything we do.

**2.1.14 Deputy R. Labey:**

I am not sure that Deputy Southern is correct when he says there is relative peace between employee and employer in the health service.

[11:15]

My evidence is purely anecdotal but every nurse and doctor one seems to speak to seems to complain of a remote management, overblown management, of being terrified to speak out, of being misunderstood. Only on Monday the Deputy of St. John and Deputy Rondel and I were

having a coffee across the road and we were accosted by a nurse at our table for 15 minutes speaking of just such things. I know Health is going through great changes but how can he improve the situation with taking the staff with them through these changes in the department?  
**[Approbation]**

**Senator A.K.F. Green:**

This is crucially important and as the Minister I hope to set the atmosphere and the culture in which work will be done and encourage the senior management, as well as me meeting with the staff, encouraging the senior management to manage the staff in an open, transparent way in line with that example I gave in Seattle. It has to be safe for people to say: "I made a mistake", not for other people to report another practitioner but for that practitioner to say: "I have made a mistake. What did I do wrong? How can I learn from it? How can we move forward and prevent it from happening again?" We have to have a culture of trust, transparency and safeness and that is my role, to provide that.

**2.1.15 The Deputy of St. John:**

If the candidate is successful he will be a member of the Children's Policy Group. Can he explain what his priorities are with regards to children's policy?

**Senator A.K.F. Green:**

My biggest priority, and I do not know everything about this yet, is to ensure that the children and their families are at the centre of what we do and that we have a proper ... I would like to see not a Children's Policy Group but a policy group that takes a child from whenever it needs help, which is probably sometimes at conception, almost right through to adulthood. Why do we suddenly discover at 16 or 18, they are becoming an adult, and we need then to change everything? We need to be starting with the planning right at conception if possible, right through for as long as that person needs support but a minimum of 25. My son is a different case but my daughter is 34, did I tell her at 18: "I have finished with you, you are on your own", which is what health services tend to do. We need joined-up care right the way through for as long as adults need it.

**2.1.16 Deputy A.D. Lewis:**

Many families are concerned about the affordability of dental care particularly for children. Would the Senator have any solutions as to how these costs could be, perhaps, mitigated in any way?

**Senator A.K.F. Green:**

No, but it is one of the things that we do clearly need to look at. You have only got to look around Jersey at some of the appalling dental examples of the less well-off walking through King Street, but again it is always the lower end of middle-Jersey, those with social security get some support. Those at the lower end of middle-Jersey get no support. I have got no magic answers but it definitely needs to be looked at.

**2.1.17 Deputy A.D. Lewis:**

Does the Senator feel that there should be some kind of review of charges within the dental service?

**Senator A.K.F. Green:**

I think access to primary services, not just dental services but access to all primary services needs to be looked at.

**2.1.18 The Deputy of St. Martin:**

A vast number of Islanders travel off Island for medical reasons. A lot of those are cancer sufferers. What does the candidate feel about those Islanders who are prescribed drugs in the U.K.

which are available there but not available in Jersey on cost grounds and will he commit to setting up a cancer drugs fund?

**Senator A.K.F. Green:**

Certainly. This is one area that I have already looked at and discussed. It seems to me - and it is very easy to say as a candidate, does it not - wrong that we send people to the U.K. to get absolutely the top support and help; that is right, and then tell them that they cannot have the treatment prescribed by that expert. So I do commit to looking at that and it would be about £500,000 a year and I need to talk to Treasury as to how we might fund that.

**The Bailiff:**

Deputy Doublet. She is not here. Right, that brings questions to an end so I will ask Senator Green to withdraw and we will ask Senator Cameron to come back. You will not be allowed in. **[Interruption]** Very well, when you are ready, Senator Cameron, when you have got your notes together and you start then you will have up to 10 minutes to speak.

**2.2 Senator Z.A. Cameron:**

Ten years ago Jersey's health service enjoyed an enviable reputation as one of the best places to work in the U.K. with doctors and nurses queuing to come here. In those days we had confidence in ourselves. We chose from the best ideas and progress around the world rather than blindly following U.K. policy. We had a "can do" innovative attitude and local people, such as myself, returning the Island were welcomed back and encouraged to put ideas into practice with a minimum of bureaucracy. Senior management at H.S.S.D. (Health and Social Services Department) now complain that we are finding it hard to attract and retain competent staff. Part of the problem certainly relates to U.K. training bias which has developed a tendency towards fragmented specialist silo-based care concentrated in large centralist hospitals. It has been an expensive mistake. Fortunately the N.H.S. (National Health Service) and Royal Colleges now realise the error of this way of thinking. In an age where 70 per cent of health care is about treating multiple chronic disease, a system that was based on a short lived acute illness model in patients with single conditions was never appropriate. Last week the new head of N.H.S. England announced a move back to investment in smaller locally-based hospitals offering generalist care. Better outcomes are achieved by doctors with generalist knowledge, especially those who understand how social and environmental factors also contribute an impact on health. All of a sudden the U.K. has realised it needs a lot more G.P.s and investment in community-based care. This is good news for Jersey because we have only recently started moving towards adopting a more specialist-based approach and many of us questioned KPMG's advice at the time of the White Paper with its focus on U.K. benchmarks which conflicted with research from international best practice. There is more to our recruitment problem than this however and this particularly relates to governance. Is it right, for instance, that when I stopped working early in the year criminal record checks on staff working in health and education were still not in place? On attending a lecture in London in September a professional in social work was describing what a healthy organisation looked like. It was one founded on relationships that fostered continuity, trust, concerned curiosity and due regard. Organisations that encouraged internal and external challenge had a learning culture and with staff that had sufficient resources, training and support. He then went on to describe a typical organisation with poor service as one which encouraged group think in order, work ... in other words only liked to see things from their own perspective and ostracised those with differing views. Those that operate under the rule of optimism but lack curiosity and challenge and were unwilling to acknowledge errors, engage in critical reflection, where lines of accountability are unclear or ineffective. He then went on to say those that operate like islands, such as Jersey, in an isolated, closed and secretive manner. I believe this reputation, along with our human resources practice and the pay review, lies at the heart of our recruitment problem. Sometimes it is worth taking good care



of staff to ensure you attract the right people. As every child who plays ... the football manager knows it is not the type of stadium that gets results; it is the makeup of the team that matters. Some people are better at scoring goals and others are better at saving them. Past experience and talents matter. As a G.P. I also recognise that staff need stability and security for their physical and mental health. The importance of this has been lacking from a current States policy which at times appears to be change for change sake, reduce front line costs at all cost regardless of the impact on human lives and cost to other parts of the system. There are plenty of other places where efficiency savings could be made. Doctors and other front line professionals are increasingly required to spend time filling in extra forms, doing tick box assessments and providing business cases to justify a need we can all clearly see. This takes time away from face-to-face caring for sick patients, delays recovery and increases distress. Places that empower people to manage their own condition and enable them to access help when they need to cut costs, improve outcomes and save patient's time. Public health is also important. At the end of the day how you choose to live your life is far more likely to have an effect on your health than any medication or technology I can prescribe as a doctor. Having said that, there are key times when good access to care does have a greater impact and significantly improves outcomes. Countries with access to family doctors with a good understanding of child health and development have significantly fewer child deaths than those that do not and their children go on to have much better long-term development, physical and mental and emotional health. Early access to health during adolescent health crises can change life chances and ensure education is minimally impacted. Prompt diagnosis of cancer, stroke, heart attacks, timely operations all reduce patient's needs and time-off sick and improve overall wellbeing. Wasting patient's and front line staff's time adds considerable cost to our economy. As a director of the primary care body I spent on average 64 hours a month last year in meetings representing colleagues discussing how to implement the Health White Paper. Unlike others in the room this was at my own expense. Others were there at taxpayers' expense and all of us taken away from front line care. This could have been time well spent developing partnership working and breaking down our silo mentality if the ideas that arose from those meetings were taken forward and listened to, but disappointingly many of the innovative changes we came up were lost like Chinese whispers as they travelled out of the room and into other meetings held by those higher up the establishment. I would like a chance to implement more of these ideas. We came close, for example, to implement integrated improved access to primary care for under-5s. We came close to agreeing an integrated out of hours service with A. and E. (Accident and Emergency) staff, paramedics and G.P.s working together to ensure patients are assessed by the right person at the right place at the right time. We started working on an integrated carer strategy that would identify and provide extra support for many of us who currently look after relatives and friends in need. There are many others too, more numerous to mention. Our Parish system has served us well over the centuries and I believe it also has a part to play. During my time in St. Ouen I was impressed how the Constable saw himself as the father of the Parish and someone to turn to in times of need. So long as parishioners did not mind I could discuss with Parish staff anyone I was concerned about and together with the help of neighbours, families and Parish volunteers we could usually provide much needed support and/or funds. I know some of you have plans to build on our Parish traditions, to develop more integrated community and social support service which I welcome. I heard on the *Today* programme coming in this morning how helping others during your retirement provides a feel-good factor which on average apparently adds another 2 years to life expectancy. So we need to regain our confidence and provide an environment where Islanders can flourish. Those who are deprived of their sleep, as regularly happens with our middle grade doctors, are as likely to make an error the next day as those that are over the legal level of alcohol. Good working practices are not just good for staff retention and satisfaction but makes sense for patient safety, prompt diagnosis and recognition of problems also. Staff who are overstretched, exhausted and distracted had limited capacity to solve problems and become overwhelmed. Our

brains have a limited capacity and function better when we have time and space to think. The airline industry has got collaboration and information-sharing down to a fine art resulting in far less costs and a much improved safety record. So my first priority as Minister for Health and Social Services would be to embed a culture of kindness and learning that rewards and encourages staff, patients, carers and Islanders to report concerns and come up with ideas for improvements. Today you have a choice of vision for our health service and I hope you will agree that one that is clinically and professional led, based on a Jersey tradition of cherry-picking from the best practice of the world, such as those found in Canterbury, New Zealand, Norway and Keiser Primanti that have managed to achieve sustainable care with improved outcomes is the way forward.

**[Approbation]**

[11:30]

**The Bailiff:**

Very well, we now have up to 20 minutes for questions. In fairness I will say the same as I did before the other candidate began which is, I remind Members of Standing Orders, questions must be concise but so must answers from the candidate given the subject. If candidates go on too long so as to prevent questions from Members I will stop them. Very, well, questions.

**2.2.1 Deputy R.G. Bryans of St. Helier:**

The Senator quoted that Jersey had a closed and secretive environment. I wonder what steps the Senator will take to address that problem, change the perception and provide a feel-good factor.

**Senator Z.A. Cameron:**

I think it is based on trying to change that culture. It has arisen, I think, because of the fear of errors and the backlash from the press and the blame culture that we see in places such as Rotherham and with Baby P. So it is learning that mistakes do happen. It is rarely one individual's point but we can learn from them. People can forgive mistakes but they do not forgive repeated mistakes and not addressing them.

**2.2.2 Deputy M.R. Higgins:**

The question I have for the candidate relates to unpaid care workers who are often members of families, perhaps giving up their own jobs and careers and in fact their lives to help others. What can and will she do to assist them with this highly important role both in terms of support and finance?

**Senator Z.A. Cameron:**

We have a considerable number of carers in our community but we, again, like so much of our health data, we do not know how many or what role they are playing. I would like to build on the Parish support system. Ideas such as the post office 'Call and Check', so that when relatives are away they could possibly know that a postman could call in once a day and check that relative is still safe. I know I have had the comfort, as a G.P., of that service that when I was not seeing a patient I could know that, perhaps, that they were still okay because somebody was keeping an eye on them.

**2.2.3 Deputy M.R. Higgins:**

Supplementary. Just following up on that. We know how vital it is and the fact that a tremendous amount of money is being saved to the public purse. Is there any way, or would you advocate trying to get some financial assistance for these people because many of them are extremely poor because of their choice in trying to help a family member?

**Senator Z.A. Cameron:**

I think we do need assessment on their needs and what exactly the problems that they face are and how we can help them because clearly it is saving us a huge amount of money by that kind of social capital that exists in our community and without which it would cost the Island far more, so yes.

**2.2.4 Deputy R. Labey:**

What is the candidate's assessment of morale at the coalface or rather on the wards at the hospital? As I explained to the other candidate anecdotally it would seem to be, we are in trouble here and how can we improve it?

**Senator Z.A. Cameron:**

I would say that a lot of front line staff are quite exhausted and demoralised. I hope I explained during my speech that it is trying to get rid of that sort of blame culture and looking at their workload, making it more focused. It is getting up to N.H.S. levels where a quarter of the time is spent on paperwork rather than face-to-face with patient care and that is counterproductive.

**2.2.5 Deputy G.P. Southern:**

It may be that there is scope, but to expand on that previous answer, the question would be, what changes are at the head of her priorities to ensure improved recruitment and retention rates for specialist and experienced staff?

**Senator Z.A. Cameron:**

It is making sure the job description fits the role. It is making sure they have got the correct resources and then giving them the freedom to develop services and listening to what their needs are because they are the experts in that particular field. It is quite frustrating when it comes from the top-down rather than a bottom-up approach.

**2.2.6 Deputy J.M. Maçon:**

I will ask the same question as I did the last candidate. If successful the candidate will become the Minister for Health and Social Services. What specific objectives does the candidate have in regard to Social Services? Thank you.

**Senator Z.A. Cameron:**

Social Services are currently undergoing a review and identifying which areas need better care. The most important thing is to recommend all of the things that have come from Williamson, from serious case reviews and make sure that we have got proper systems in place to identify children in need and put those services in place for them. If you have got early identification it costs far less than leaving children in those families without support and then you have got the adolescent problem that we are seeing currently.

**2.2.7 Deputy P.D. McLinton:**

The candidate and I spent some time in induction together so somebody called it being "induced" together which I thought was rather **[Interruption]** ... and so she is doubtless aware of my concerns about the mental health issues that face the Island. So in fairness I will ask the same question I asked the previous candidate. The Chief Minister designate mentioned in his statement that he will be supporting plans to update the Mental Health Law and to radically improve the support available for those suffering from mental health issues. If you are elected Minister for Health and Social Services how do you propose to radically improve support for those suffering from mental health issues?

**Senator Z.A. Cameron:**

When it comes to mental health that was part of the Task and Finish Group that I was involved with, and £1 million is already invested in I.A.P.T.'s (Improving Access to Psychological Therapies) talking therapies. Unfortunately there was not the usual needs assessment that goes prior to commissioning that happens in the U.K. so ... and I think that was a missed opportunity because at the coalface the problems that we had was not with low level support. It was far more significant problems that sometimes cannot access more specialist services because they find it difficult to even get to the clinic that exist within general practice. So I think we need a proper needs assessment and then ... mental health is not very well done in the U.K.; that is in crisis too. We need to look at countries like the Netherlands and Scandinavia and develop far better services appropriate to the needs that we have got within the community.

#### **2.2.8 Deputy A.D. Lewis:**

Does the candidate believe that the current system of funding for G.P. visits is equitable and sustainable?

#### **Senator Z.A. Cameron:**

It creates all kinds of bizarre incentives so we end up where 50 per cent of A. and E. visits could be seen in general practice. An A. and E. visit costs the taxpayer about £100. It leads to far more investigations usually and are far more likely to get admitted to hospital. So it is rather bizarre that our system that incentivise people into hospital care is probably costing us more and we were hoping to implement just a small trial of better equitable funding with the under-5s in the first instance to see what effect that would have. I suspect that you will probably find out that it will be cheaper to have lower G.P. cost and have some of that White Paper money coming out into general practice instead of based in the community. Currently that has not happened.

#### **2.2.9 Deputy L.M.C. Doublet:**

Could the candidate talk about how she will plan on working with other departments that provide services for children, such as Education and Housing, and prevent vulnerable children and families being lost in the gaps between these departments? Specifically does she support the children and family centres like The Bridge and the Pathway Centre and possibly creating more of these?

#### **Senator Z.A. Cameron:**

About 3 or 4 years ago I started running training sessions for G.P.s that introduced ... so that people from The Bridge, such as Patricia Tumelty and Nola Hopkins from the N.S.P.C.C. (National Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Children) and different agencies came to talk about what services they offered so that G.P.s became aware of the various other services that were out there, things like the Women's Refuge as well. Absolutely, we are far too much in our silos in the past and we can gain an awful lot of benefit for partnership working, avoid duplication and getting a few heads together to try and solve the patient's problems.

#### **2.2.10 Deputy M. Tadier:**

Does the candidate believe that sufferers of chronic pain who turn to cannabis as the only effective means of pain relief should be criminalised?

#### **Senator Z.A. Cameron:**

I personally feel that a criminal route should be the last resort. I think so many of society's problems could be addressed far more effectively with mental health or a therapeutic response in the case of pain also. Countries that do that, such as Iceland, have only 5 per cent of the prison population compared to the U.S.

#### **2.2.11 Deputy M. Tadier:**

The question does not relate, obviously, to the general criminality in the Home Affairs sense of the drug but specifically for those who take it for medicinal use. Because as Minister, she will be able to prescribe and allow the licensing of this drug if she chooses. Is that something she is willing to do bearing in mind her response may affect my vote? **[Laughter]**

**Senator Z.A. Cameron:**

Cannabis is not a drug that I am particularly fond of. It causes a reduction in I.Q. (Intelligence Quotient) during adolescence and it increases the ... significantly increases your risk of psychosis and paranoia. I tend to be somebody who tries to find other ways to tackle people's problems and use drugs as a last resort but, yes, if that is all that there is then ... and you have tried other avenues then it is obviously sometimes necessary.

**2.2.12 Deputy S.Y. Mézec:**

My question follows on from what I thought was a very good answer she gave to Deputy Lewis' question. Would she be prepared to say that if she were elected Minister for Health and Social Services that she would like to see some sort of plan moving forward to end up in a situation where nobody in Jersey has to pay to see a doctor? Does she believe that that as an end aim is something that would be a positive development and would she eventually like to see that in the future when budget constraints allow it?

**Senator Z.A. Cameron:**

I think it is an interesting concept and one that does need looking at. With the U.K. in 2004 when you had, before the last the G.P. contract, we had universal access and good access still in those days to general practice services. The actual percentage of G.D.P. (Gross Domestic Product) that the U.K. spent on the N.H.S. was 5 per cent. Since access to general practice has been reduced and more specialist-based tick box assessments, it is harder to get the G.P. appointment and people are ending up in A. and E. and more likely to be in specialist services, that has gone up to 9 per cent. If you look at countries such as the U.S. that is far more specialist-based; it is 19 per cent of G.D.P. so I suspect that it will probably be a cost saving.

**2.2.13 Deputy S. Pinel of St. Clement:**

What is the candidate's view on prescription charges please?

**Senator Z.A. Cameron:**

Medication is something that needs looking at. There is a tremendous waste currently and I think, unfortunately, the fact that the charges are free at the moment is probably adding to that. People do not necessarily appreciate the cost of their medication. If we did introduce charges for prescriptions however I would be keen to protect, perhaps, children and the vulnerable group who obviously could not pay.

**2.2.14 Deputy G.P. Southern:**

In terms of giving access to G.P.s and to medical services in general among the poorest and most vulnerable in our society, would the Minister welcome negotiations with the Social Security Department to arrive at solutions and cross-departmental solutions, which more globally cover the need for medical services in primary care?

[11:45]

**Senator Z.A. Cameron:**

Absolutely and there is a lot of evidence that, unfortunately, with current medical services the risk is that your wealthy get over-treated and over-diagnosed with problems and those most in need get under-diagnosed and under-treated and that will be costing our economy, so, yes.

**2.2.15 Deputy P.D. McLinton:**

Is the candidate aware of the N.H.S. Scotland initiative of Childsmile which involves sending dental nurses into schools to educate the children about dental health and also, I think it is twice a year, going and applying a chloride varnish to the teeth, which has improved the dental health of the children of Scotland immensely thus saving costs down the line? If so, what is your view on bringing it to Jersey?

**Senator Z.A. Cameron:**

There are a lot of improvements that we could do with dental health. In fact one of the dentists here has started an initiative like that, off her own bat, at Le Squez School so, yes.

**2.2.16 Deputy G.P. Southern:**

Still in that particular question. We have already got a system in place which is supposed to take care of young people's dental health care. Would she support refinancing that particular dental health scheme in order that it is updated and pays so that dentists want to join the scheme because the rewards are sufficient to make it worthwhile, which it currently is not, and was turned down by the Minister for Social Security and the Minister for Health and Social Services recently?

**Senator Z.A. Cameron:**

I do not really know enough about the pros and cons of the current scheme. I know it has got a low uptake so it clearly is not working in the way it was originally planned but I do know that the dentists out there are full of ideas of how we can improve dental health and I would like to enable them to start getting their heads around those problems. The hospital services and the dental departments have an 18-month wait; that is unacceptable.

**2.2.17 Senator P.M. Bailhache:**

Following on from the question of Deputy Mézec and in order to enable more people to have free access to a doctor, would the candidate favour the Government of Jersey or the Public Health Department employing more general practitioners?

**Senator Z.A. Cameron:**

We probably have sufficient. We are lucky that we have got a model at the moment which has got quite a high number of general practitioners and you have got a quite a lot of choice, so you can tend to choose somebody who suits you. We have got diversity. I think we have just got to steer away from the performance tick box assessments that are so the style of the N.H.S.

**2.2.18 Senator P.F. Routier:**

The Minister for Health and Social Services usually has a seat on the Adult's Policy Group and Children's Policy Group looking at safeguarding matters. Does the candidate have a view about whether there is an important role for this body of safeguarding and if she is aware of any needs for any improvements in the way we currently carry out safeguarding?

**Senator Z.A. Cameron:**

This is probably one of the areas where Jersey falls most behind in the U.K. currently. I think the work of the Children's Policy Group since it was set up has been excellent and has helped drive some progress but far more needs to be done. What is frustrating is we have got a lot of very good front line staff. I think with a little bit of extra training and support there is a common consensus

that we could really get things right and it could be outstanding here. When I was working within the Children's Services colleagues that were assessing children coming in to the care elsewhere, in London for instance, had 150 different languages to deal with and all sorts of departments. Here I knew everyone and it was so much easier. We could have a good service.

**Deputy S. Pinel:**

Sorry, it was a ring binder mistake.

**The Bailiff:**

A ring binder mistake.

**2.2.19 Deputy G.P. Southern:**

It is catching. Could the candidate highlight the essential differences between her approach to this particular role and that of Senator Green?

**Senator Z.A. Cameron:**

I do not know what [Laughter] ... so, no.

**Deputy G.P. Southern:**

I take it then that Senator Green has not talked to you about the role?

**The Bailiff:**

Very well, that concludes questions to Senator Cameron so we will ask Senator Green to be brought back. Very well, we will now move to the vote and if you wish to vote for Senator Green you vote pour. If you wish to vote for Senator Cameron you vote contre. The Greffier will open the voting.

<b>Senator A.K.F. Green, M.B.E.: 37</b>	<b>Senator Z.A. Cameron: 11</b>	<b>Abstain: 1</b>
Senator P.F. Routier	Senator Z.A. Cameron	Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)
Senator P.F.C. Ozouf	Deputy J.A. Martin (H)	
Senator A.J.H. Maclean	Deputy G.P. Southern (H)	
Senator I.J. Gorst	Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)	
Senator L.J. Farnham	Deputy M. Tadier (B)	
Senator P.M. Bailhache	Deputy of St. John	
Senator A.K.F. Green	Deputy S.Y. Mézec (H)	
Connétable of St. Helier	Deputy A.D. Lewis (H)	
Connétable of St. Clement	Deputy L.M.C. Doublet (S)	
Connétable of St. Peter	Deputy R. Labey (H)	
Connétable of St. Lawrence	Deputy of St. Mary	
Connétable of St. Mary		
Connétable of St. Ouen		
Connétable of St. Brelade		
Connétable of St. Martin		
Connétable of St. Saviour		
Connétable of Grouville		
Connétable of St. John		
Connétable of Trinity		
Deputy of Grouville		
Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)		
Deputy of Trinity		
Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)		
Deputy E.J. Noel (L)		
Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)		

Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)				
Deputy of St. Martin				
Deputy R.G. Bryans (H)				
Deputy of St. Peter				
Deputy R.J. Rondel (H)				
Deputy of St. Ouen				
Deputy S.M. Wickenden (H)				
Deputy S.M. Bree (C)				
Deputy M.J. Norton (B)				
Deputy T.A. McDonald (S)				
Deputy G.J. Truscott (B)				
Deputy P.D. McLinton (S)				

**The Bailiff:**

Very well, so I formally declare that Senator Green is elected as Minister for Health and Social Services. **[Approbation]** Chief Minister, would you like to move to your next nomination?

**3. The Minister for External Relations**

**Senator I.J. Gorst:**

If I may I should like to nominate for the post of Minister for External Relations, Senator Bailhache?

**The Bailiff:**

Is that seconded? **[Seconded]** Any other nominations? No other nominations?

**Deputy J.A. Martin:**

I would like to nominate Deputy Tadier.

**The Bailiff:**

Is that seconded? **[Seconded]** Any other nominations? Very well, so we have 2 nominations. So I shall asked Deputy Tadier withdraw in the care of the Greffe. I invite Senator Bailhache to address the Assembly for up to 10 minutes.

**3.1 Senator P.M. Bailhache:**

I have been fulfilling the functions of the Minister for External Relations for the last 3 years although for the first 2 of them I was an Assistant Minister to the Chief Minister. It was only in September 2013 that this Assembly appointed me to the then new post of Minister for External Relations. I hope that the new Assembly will show the same faith by reappointing me to a role that I have greatly enjoyed undertaking. I think it is still fair to say, as I did a year ago, that the portfolio has never been more important. To a greater extent than ever before we are expected to conduct our own foreign relations and to defend our own corner in the international sphere. The United Kingdom remains responsible, of course, in international law for our external relations but increasingly it is being recognised that we have our own international identity and our own national interests. The U.K. has agreed that it is legitimate for us to protect those interests and it is the duty of Ministers and, to an extent, of all Members too to play a part in doing so. You, Sir, reminded us a few days ago of that provision in the oath that Senators and Deputies take that obliges us to defend the privileges and liberties of the Island. Before I stood for election in 2011 as a Senator I had represented the Island in different capacities for a number of years. I was Solicitor General between 1975 and 1986 and Attorney General between 1986 and 1994. During that time I had many dealings with foreign governments and agencies in the context of extradition and the



investigation and prosecution of criminal offences and the resolution of legal disputes between Jersey and the U.K. Between 1995 and 2009 I held the office of Bailiff and in that capacity I gained a different experience of representing the Island in a number of other ways. In particular by receiving and entertaining royal and diplomatic visitors but also by protecting the Island's constitutional position in relation to the U.K. by giving advice to Ministers and to senior civil servants. I think that many of the skills that I learned during those periods are helpful in the context of the Ministerial role. Diplomacy requires other skills too. It involves finding the sometimes delicate balance between asserting one's position firmly and clearly without causing offence and with a view to making the best chance of achieving the desired aim. Sir Christopher Meyer, who was the United Kingdom's ambassador to Washington for a number of years, described it in one of his books as the art of getting one's own way. As a small non-sovereign state we have fewer levers to pull internationally than larger countries but that does not mean that the art of diplomacy is not important to us nor that we cannot occasionally prevail. A purpose of this speech is to enable Members to learn of the candidate's proposed policies in the Ministerial post. The Ministry of External Relations is unusual in that the principal policies are set not by the Minister but by the Council of Ministers. The law provides for the Council of Ministers to set the common external policy or the common policy on external relations and that has been done and reported to the Assembly and published and is in the public domain. I would obviously abide by it. I would, if elected, wish to give Members the opportunity from time to time to debate our foreign policy which has not so far been done and to articulate in particular any amendments to the common policy that they would wish the Council of Ministers to consider. I hope that the Assembly will entrust me with this important office. **[Approbation]**

#### **The Bailiff:**

Very well, we now have up to 20 minutes for questions to Senator Bailhache. Does any Member wish to ask any questions?

#### **3.1.1 Deputy S.Y. Mézec:**

The first one I would like to ask, stability is incredibly important for some of the main industries we have in Jersey and one of the most damaging things to stability ... sorry, I will start again just for the benefit of people listening on the radio. Stability is one of the most important things for Jersey's finance industry and other aspects connected to it. One of the most dangerous things you can do to a jurisdiction of stability is to put a big question mark above that jurisdiction's current position.

[12:00]

Given that, would the candidate pledge, if he is elected as Minister for External Relations, to stop talking about this prospect of independence for Jersey, which he has done on several occasions which does not have the backing of Islanders, which is not going to happen and which puts a dangerous question mark above this jurisdiction for outside investment?

#### **Senator P.M. Bailhache:**

I do not believe that I do generally go around talking about independence and I only mention it when I am asked questions about it in this Assembly. The policy of the Council of Ministers on this subject is absolutely clear and I have articulated it on several occasions in answer to questions, and that is that we are not seeking independence from the United Kingdom at the present time. The policy of this Government is not to seek independence but it is to be prepared for that eventuality should circumstances change and that is my position and I will continue to speak it.

#### **3.1.2 Deputy S.Y. Mézec:**

We know that the Minister, in a previous role, was involved in a committee or commission or whatever it was that looked into it as a possibility. We know that Senator Bailhache has featured in big articles in the *Guardian* about this when it is something that is not realistically going to happen to Jersey any time soon and which, if it were to be suggested, would undoubtedly be rejected by the public. So it is something that has been spoken of previously. He admits that it is not the policy. He admits that it should be on the table as a potential option. Well, equally, so should other options be on the table as well which are not given equal discussion, so can he pledge in future just to acknowledge that it is not going to happen and that it is bad for Jersey to constantly be put in the spotlight like this, which has happened in the past despite his previous answer?

**Senator P.M. Bailhache:**

As the Deputy rightly says, I was asked by a previous Government to chair a committee of experts looking into the practicality of Jersey seeking independence, if the circumstances should arise when that might become necessary. That group produced a report called *The Second Interim Report of the Constitutional Review Group* which is in the public domain and is available for Members to read. It is not my fault that journalists from the *Guardian* write articles on Jersey's constitutional and I do not encourage them to do so.

**3.1.3 Deputy G.P. Southern:**

The candidate suggested that there were circumstances under which we should be considering proposing independence or considering independence. Would he outline for Members briefly what those circumstances of conditions might be?

**Senator P.M. Bailhache:**

I do not think that I did say that. What I said was that the Island should be prepared for that eventuality if it were ever to become in the Island's interests that it should be considered. I do not at the moment foresee those circumstances coming to pass.

**3.1.4 Deputy J.A. Martin:**

The candidate said that this post was, probably with him in mind, developed over the last year. If this candidate was successful - and I do not know how long he intends after that to stay in the Assembly - it does seem that everybody thinks and put this post into place for just this candidate to be the Minister. What sort of succession planning does he have in mind for this post in the future?

**Senator P.M. Bailhache:**

I think the Deputy is wrong in her premise. The Assembly agreed to create the Ministry of External Relations because it has become increasingly important for Jersey to represent itself externally and to defend Jersey's interest. There are occasions when Jersey's interests are different from the interests of the United Kingdom and it is important that we are able to articulate those interests and to do what we can to protect them. It is good for our industries and it is good for the autonomy of the Island. I was asked a second question, before the Deputy asks a supplementary, on the succession plan. I do not think it is a function of this Minister to prepare for his own successor, if appointed.

**3.1.5 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf:**

I suppose just to get some balance and a friendly ball, if I may say, could the candidate, for the avoidance of doubt, explain how he might work with any new Ministry that might be set up with responsibility for financial services, technology and external trade?

**Senator P.M. Bailhache:**

If such a new Ministry were to be established, and if I were to be appointed as the Minister for External Relations, I would of course be very happy to work with any such new Minister. The conduct of external relations spreads over a number of different Ministers. It spreads over the Chief Minister's Department, over the Ministry for Economic Development, over the Treasury, and as the Senator has said, over the important areas of the digital economy and other areas too. It is very important, I think, that all Ministers who have responsibilities in those areas should work very closely together.

**3.1.6 Deputy R.G. Bryans:**

Can the Senator outline in his role what he sees are the greatest challenges for the Island moving forward?

**Senator P.M. Bailhache:**

The principal objective which the Chief Minister has outlined in his statement following his appointment as Chief Minister is to achieve economic growth. One of the important functions of the Ministry of External Relations is to assist those in the finance industry, and in other industries which are important in the Island, to develop external markets and to encourage the growth of those markets so that the Island can achieve income which is necessary for all the purposes of which Members will be well aware. I would certainly hope to play a part in that process.

**3.1.7 Deputy M.R. Higgins:**

Although the candidate does not envisage at this time the Island going independent, could he outline for Members the sort of issues or the matters that he would consider a redline which if the U.K. went beyond he thinks we should consider going independent? So it is what is your bottom line in terms of if the Island was going to go independent, what items?

**The Bailiff:**

What are the Senator's?

**Senator P.M. Bailhache:**

I do not think it is for the Minister for External Relations to make any such determination. I think it would be for the Islanders as a whole to decide in the future if they wish to see a change in the constitutional status of the Island. At the moment I cannot see any threats to our autonomy which are likely to give rise to the kind of crisis in which that kind of consideration might arise.

**3.1.8 Deputy S.Y. Mézec:**

Senator Bailhache has in the previous Assembly broken ranks with the Council of Ministers, and indeed what was meant to be his own portfolio, to propose as a Back-Bencher, delaying an important part of the introduction of an international tax agreement. Thankfully the then Assembly clearly showed its derision for such a proposal and the international media did not pick up on it because had they done so it could have risked Jersey's reputation as a transparent and co-operative jurisdiction, something that is absolutely fundamental for securing Jersey's leading industry. So my question is, given his history in that area, how could he justify being a safe pair of hands in the future for this portfolio?

**Senator P.M. Bailhache:**

I must say that I thought that the Deputy was opposed to collective responsibility.

**Deputy S.Y. Mézec:**

Misrepresenting my position, Sir.

**Senator P.M. Bailhache:**

There was certainly an occasion when I had the misfortune to differ from my fellow Ministers on the appropriate way to deal with a particular intergovernmental agreement. Those circumstances cannot arise in the future because the Assembly has agreed that all Ministers should henceforth be bound by collective responsibility and if there were to be a debate on an issue of that kind before the Council of Ministers and a majority view were formed then all Ministers would be bound by that decision.

**3.1.9 Deputy G.P. Southern:**

In recent times we have appeared on a blacklist of offshore centres from France, I understand due to delays in the courts and the cases proceeding through our courts. Is the Minister for External Relations - who was responsible for helping to sort that out - content now that we will not appear on any blacklists in future because of delays in our courts, and that our courts can deal with cases such as France was presenting last time, in a prompt and effective manner?

**Senator P.M. Bailhache:**

I am not sure that I would characterise the origins of the problem in quite the way that the Deputy did characterise it. I think there was a mismatch of understanding between the Finance Ministry in Paris and the competent authority in Jersey. It was that mismatch of understanding or mismatch of expectation which led the French Government to believe that Jersey was not a co-operative jurisdiction in terms of the exchange of information, and placed us on the blacklist. The Deputy has very kindly referred to the efforts made by my Ministry and officials in the Treasury in removing Jersey from that French blacklist, which was I think the first sterling achievement of the Ministry for External Affairs. Part of the process which involved persuading the French that things had changed involved a change in the legislation and in the ability of individuals to prolong the process by appealing to the court at different levels. That legislation has now been changed and I think it is unlikely that those problems will recur in the future.

**The Bailiff:**

Does any other Member wish to ask a question? No, then I will bring questions to an end. I will ask Senator Bailhache to retire and we will ask Deputy Tadier to come back.

[12:15]

**The Bailiff:**

Deputy Tadier, when you are ready if you would speak for up to 10 minutes.

**3.2 Deputy M. Tadier:**

This must be what we mean by States efficiencies because that certainly did not feel like half an hour to me. Now, why am I contesting this position? Not necessarily for the reasons that Members may think. It is not something I would have necessarily envisaged this morning. I am sad that there is nobody else putting themselves forward for this. I fundamentally believe that competition is good, it is good for democracy, just as it is good for business and the consumer. The real questions I have though - and it is more about asking questions even though I will be subject to up to 20 minutes of questions - I have lots of questions because many new Members in this Assembly would have stood on a platform of States efficiency, about streamlining government, about wanting to reform the public sector to get rid of bureaucracy and unnecessary tiers of management. But what we have seen from the Council of Ministers in this regard is very bizarre. We know that the post of Minister for External Relations is relatively new anyway, it was just created within the last 3 years. It was created, in my opinion, more to suit the individual than necessarily to suit the needs of the portfolio because we know that there already existed a role for Assistant Minister which was

quite clear and had been working very well in the Chief Minister's Department. So we already have that role now, that has become External Affairs. But on top of that we have another role which has been devised which we do not really get to talk about today, unless of course if it were not for the fact that I were contesting this election. Because I think it is fundamental to understand the relationship that will exist between this future position that will be created for another one of the boys, which is Senator Ozouf - and may I congratulate him on his re-election - I was not sure that we would both be sitting here to look at each but it has turned out that is the case. Now, I am not necessarily the best person for this role, but then again I do not think that Senator Bailhache is either. There is somebody in this Assembly who I think, objectively speaking, is the right person for this role and that is Senator Ozouf. That is why I do not understand why we are seeing a duplication of roles which we are trying to get rid of at Health, in other departments, but it seems to be quite acceptable to build yet more tiers in this Assembly which is becoming the Chief Minister's Department and the Council of Ministers. That needs explaining. I do not understand it because I think it will lead to duplication of roles. It is getting very crowded at the top and there are political moves to try and topple yourself in your role and remove your predecessor from this Assembly, which I am not necessarily **[Interruption]** ... successor, sorry. What did I say? Sorry, we cannot go back in time. **[Laughter]** Even though it feels like we are operating in mediaeval times sometimes. But when it comes to the role of external relations of course that is a forward-thinking role. Jersey is punching above its weight in many areas when it comes to the financial services industry, and there is a lot more work we can do in other areas to bring that up to scratch. So it seems strange that we should be proposing somebody who is, I think, in the nicest possible way, a relic and a guardian of Jersey as it was in the past. We have someone trying to get out there to sell Jersey, who fundamentally disagrees with F.A.T.C.A. to the point which he lodged an amendment in this Assembly. The comments from the Chief Minister were to say: "If we adopt this amendment it would be very dangerous for Jersey's finance industry." Fundamentally there is a cleavage - in the best possible sense of the word - between the one thought that we must be transparent on the one hand and be early adopters, and the Minister for Foreign Affairs who is representing our Island who is saying: "I am not sure I can support that." That does not bode well for the future. Similarly, we have the other candidate in this role who does not believe in another fundamental principle that the current Council of Ministers do, which is the separation of powers. We know that the current Chief Minister lodged a proposition to that effect. We know that Senator Ozouf, the previous Minister for Treasury and Resources, also notes that we need a clear separation of the roles, that as parliamentarians it is important that we elect our own speaker, one or the other. That is not important simply for this Assembly to be having the clear compartmentalisation and demarcation of roles, it is important for Jersey's international image. How on earth can we go around the world, look people in the eye, shake their hands, and say we are a forward-thinking, transparent democracy when we do not have the most basic separation, that fundamental principle, in our own Assembly? It cannot be done and if people are not laughing directly in our faces that is simply out of politeness, because they certainly talk about that in the back rooms. I know, as somebody who has travelled around, eyebrows are certainly raised and it does not fit with that image we are trying to put forward. So what would I like to do in the role? I think the first thing I need to say is that something needs to be scotched once and for all: the idea that I or my party colleagues are somehow anti-finance. We know that the finance industry in Jersey does play an important role and it is one of the key areas that the Minister for Foreign Affairs is involved in. There is a need to accept, however, that all the practices that take place in financial services - not just in Jersey but around the world - are not always helpful to the wider human situation around the planet. We see this if you look at today's paper, one of the advantages of being downstairs is that you get to read the front lines. Again, Luxemburg is being criticised for its perfectly legal way in which it helps multinational corporations avoid - not evade - tax duties, which has an impact on the residents of their country and the international community. So in exactly the same way that not all

tourism or agricultural practices are very good for humans or the planet, similarly there are practices in the finance industry which are not universally always to be welcomed. That needs to be flagged-up when that is the case. I also want to be able to go around the world, or whoever is going around the world, look people in the eye knowing that I have a clear conscience, not simply about finance but knowing that our house is in order more widely. I want to know that the children in our schools are being educated to their full potential, are leaving with qualifications and they are not falling behind their counterparts elsewhere. As I have said previously, I want to do more for cultural diplomacy in the Island, I think that is a key area. In many ways the finance industry takes care of itself. We have a marketing body called Jersey Finance which does a lot of those deals in China, *et cetera*, and that is fine. I think it is also important that the cultural areas in Jersey do not get left behind. I have been speaking this week to people in the Chinese community in Jersey, and those who have married into the Chinese community, about how we can look forward and train our students - even at primary school level - to be able to start learning the Chinese language, learning about Chinese culture. Would it not be great in 10 years' time to have Chinese people not simply coming to Jersey to do business but as tourists? I have spoken to David de Carteret in the past and we both agree that even if we could only tap into a fraction of a percent of Chinese tourists who go over to London every year, bringing them to Jersey, show them our culture, show them not just our Jersey cows, not just talk about our business community, but show them our States Assembly, our Parish system and the branchage - in both senses of the word, Branchage as a film festival and the Parish tradition. They would simply love that and it needs that young energy and vitality to make these synergies. Why is it that we have a very successful Alliance Française in Jersey, and there is scope to do more work culturally I think with them, they are already well supported both by the Island and by their own central Government. But there is an opportunity - and I would certainly push for it - to see something like, if not actually, the Confucius Institute being established in Jersey. Would that not be amazing to have a group which is set up to promote and teach Chinese culture and language in Jersey who would train teachers, probably at no cost to the Island, with all the tourist and business implications that come along with that. That could be set up very quickly and it would show that Jersey is prepared to act in the long term to build the relationships that are necessary to do business with that part of the world. I will leave the speech at that and I will allow Members to - as I am sure they want to - ask questions. **[Approbation]**

**The Bailiff:**

Very well. Then we now come to up to 20 minutes questioning of Deputy Tadier.

**3.2.1 Connétable J. Gallichan of St. Mary:**

When the Deputy stood for this position in 2013 I asked him if there were any of the 16 stated actions in the common external relations policy, which in turn underpinned the 6 principles of that policy, that gave him cause for concern. He could not be specific in his response at that time but he has had a few months now to think about it. Can he be specific now?

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

The last couple of days have been spent preparing my speech for Housing, not for the Minister for Foreign Affairs. That is because I never intended to contest this position but, as I said, it is important for democracy. So in the supplementary question if there is any specific areas of those parts that the Constable would like me to answer I am happy to focus on those, otherwise I shall not be able to.

**3.2.2 The Connétable of St. Mary:**

Nothing specific that I want to ask, my question is focused on drilling out the fact that this is really a half-hearted attempt by Deputy Tadier because he has not given the thought that he needed to before standing for this position.

**The Bailiff:**

Is that a supplementary question?

**The Connétable of St. Mary:**

So I would like to hear his views. Surely he knows what it is about the policy that he either supports or does not support.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

I certainly support general moves to a greater transparency. I think we would do well to listen to those who historically have told us that we need to front leaders, first adopters, if you like. That is not something I see coming forward from the other candidate. So in that general principle I am fully behind the policy that the Council of Ministers in the majority have adopted and I will be supportive of that.

**3.2.3 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf:**

I was grateful for the candidate's kind remarks but would he accept that there is a real difference between the diplomacy role of the Minister for External Relations and the trade role which the Chief Minister has asked me to fulfil in relation to a Ministerial lead on driving economic growth in financial services and technology? Would he not accept on reflection that asking both of us to fulfil our respective roles the Chief Minister is most likely to deliver on the need of this Assembly to get economic growth and raise our income line so that we can fund the services which he is so passionate about?

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

The issue I have is that we do not know enough yet about why these roles have been separated. The Senator himself will not face an election for that role because it will be initially an Assistant Minister's role which may develop into a fully blown role later. I am concerned that Members of this Assembly who have been primarily elected by the public to serve in this Assembly, if we are sending so many of them away doing jobs, which on the face of it seem to be very similar they will not be able to fulfil their requisite roles in this Assembly.

**3.2.4 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf:**

Can I just press the candidate? He knows exactly the fact that my role is going to be external trade and financial service and technology. Does he not see the urgent need for us to dedicate Ministerial time at the highest level for the difference between diplomacy and trade, and does he not see the difference?

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Frankly I do not see the difference yet because I thought that is what Senator Bailhache had already been doing for the past time of his office. There is always going to be some overlap but presumably whoever is going away in terms of foreign affairs will partly be selling trade and encouraging business to come to the Island. Unless of course Senator Bailhache is going to be charged with selling potatoes and carnations and Senator Ozouf is going to be promoting the finance and digital areas.

**3.2.5 Deputy S.Y. Mézec:**

We know that this candidate is one of only 2 States Members who are members of the Jersey Human Rights Group, and I know that because I am the other one. We know that Jersey has signed up to shockingly few United Nations conventions and things to do with human rights. I would like to ask him if in his role, not just as Minister for External Relations but within the Council of Ministers as well, would he be pushing up for Jersey to sign up to some of these international conventions: things like the U.N. (United Nations) convention on the rights of women, the Venice Commission is obviously one I am quite fond of as well, so what would he think about that?

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

I stand to be corrected but last time I checked I think that Jersey had only signed up to one international convention in terms of human rights, which puts us slightly ahead of North Korea but behind Myanmar. It is a strange statistic that we do not often hear in Jersey.

[12:30]

So I think, yes, certainly there is scope to work in those areas and I would certainly be pushing for Jersey to catch up when it comes to human rights matters.

**3.2.6 Deputy R.G. Bryans:**

I think we need to be a little bit more generous to the Deputy in allowing his intention really to open up the dialogue with regard to this particular role that is an important role. I would just simply ask him the same question as I asked of the previous candidate: what does he see are the greatest challenges for the Island moving forward?

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

As I have said, we know that Jersey has traditionally in recent terms been dependent on one particular industry - and it is been over dependent in my opinion - and we are seeing massive uncertainty in that area, even though that is not always acknowledged. We have certain Ministers who constantly talk-up Jersey in a certain way which is not always realistic, it is understandable. But we have to be aware that the world is changing. I think the dialogue that we enter into, the discourse, has already changed. I remember a time when it was not even acknowledged that tax avoidance was questionable, now it is in the mainstream. It is questionable. We are seeing shifts in what is acceptable to massive nations that are on our doorstep, so we need to be mindful of that. But in terms of locally I think it is making sure that education is the key, and it is something the Minister will know about, and making sure that there are jobs but that also we are producing well rounded individuals that can contribute to our society, not just economically but socially.

**3.2.7 Deputy G.P. Southern:**

The candidate I am sure will be aware since he was talking about expanding links with China that there is of course already a link between Hautlieu School and China, which I think some 20 years ago had a teacher exchange and certainly had an exchange of students with China. Whether or not he achieves this position will he promote and encourage further links between Hautlieu and China?

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

Absolutely and that is no doubt something I will touch on later on in my speech for E.S.C. (Education, Sport and Culture). But the point is it can only be a good thing for us to have cultural links as well as business links with the Far East, with China. Hautlieu is one of the areas where we need to build on. They have done that pretty much off their own bat and they are to be commended for it. We do not need to go into all the advantages of having to learn different languages, especially when they are completely different, but it does have a wider social benefit to the Island.

**3.2.8 Deputy S.Y. Mézec:**



The role of Minister for External Relations is obviously a very new Ministry and so it will probably be a few years before it finally falls into a slot in terms of its clear responsibilities in the future. So far it has been very, very focused on things like finance and Deputy Tadier in his speech spoke about doing more in that role for tourism and culture. I would like to ask him just to expand upon that. What role does he think the Minister for External Relations could play in terms of encouraging tourism abroad? Would he agree with me, in terms of promoting Jersey culture, how would he like to see the Minister for External Relations role in terms of engaging with other countries which are seeing their indigenous languages dying out, which is something we have had a problem with in Jersey but to some extent recently has seen a turnaround? Would he like to see within that External Relations role that to be something, engaging with other countries to find out what they have done to boost their indigenous languages and give them new life?

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

I think that is definitely a role that needs to be developed and in fact this is probably an area where the other candidate and myself agree in terms of cultural diplomacy. It would be good if - now that there is going to be a different role for finance and digital - the Minister for Foreign Affairs could perhaps engage culturally with such events as the Venice Biennale just to name one, where Jersey could have representation over there. It could be something we could seek to enter installations ourselves. But whenever these kind of events are happening throughout the world it is important that Jersey has a presence because it can seem sometimes that we are purely focused on the pounds, yen, and dollar sign - or yuan rather than perhaps yen - as the case may be. Certainly in terms of our local heritage and culture it is important to promote J rriaise and all the culture that goes with that. Clearly I have something of an interest in that. I think there is also scope for Jersey J rriaise to be promoted and protected as one of the regional European languages and that is something I would certainly push for to give that official recognition.

**3.2.9 The Conn table of St. Lawrence:**

I was reminded when the Conn table of St. Mary questioned the candidate that I myself questioned him in 2013 regarding his skills in diplomacy. Clearly they are necessary in a Minister for External Affairs and I would like him to advise the Assembly how his skills have improved since I questioned him in 2013 and give us an example of his skills at diplomacy.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

I think answered to some extent about the C.P.A. (Commonwealth Parliamentary Association). We were part of a delegation, including the Constable of St. Mary in front, who have been to not just the one in Cardiff but other ones and we are always complimented across the board I think on how well Jersey does, including the individual delegates. We punch above our weight and we are always very polite and diplomatic, which is not always the case when you go to some of these C.P.A. events, you have some very outspoken delegates and that is fine. I think the other point is that since I contested the last position we have seen an example where I have brought something to the Assembly in terms of housing, the minimum housing standards which required a lot of background work with the department officers and the Minister himself, which received virtually unanimous support from the Assembly so it shows that diplomacy. You see one thing in the States Assembly where views are often entrenched but the real politics happens around the table when you put your views down and say: "How can we work together towards collective goals?" I think that would be exactly the same at the Council of Ministers table or outside of Jersey.

**3.2.10 Deputy M.J. Norton of St. Brelade:**

Given that the candidate has already stated that he did not envisage standing for this post, and given that he has also indicated that he wishes to stand for 2 others at least, is this the half-hearted attempt or are the others the half-hearted attempt?

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

The difference is that I put my heart into everything I do. So whether I come in here at the last minute and I find myself in a situation where the individual I thought might have been contesting the position is not going to do that then I think it is important to step up to the plate. So I will give 3 very hearty speeches, my colleague from St. Brelade will be very pleased to hear. I am doing this partly obviously to have it contested but I will be happy to serve in any position that the States seems apt to put me in.

**3.2.11 Deputy M.J. Norton:**

Just to continue this I do applaud the Deputy for obviously opening this up for debate but having said that if he were to get this position would he be then disappointed to miss out on one of the others that he has already indicated his interest for?

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

We do not normally answer hypothetical questions. **[Laughter]** But given the fact that it may not be hypothetical the way I would answer is that there are clearly synergies, as I have indicated, between this role and other roles like Education, perhaps less obviously with Housing, and I think as a Minister you are able to bring something to the table and directly communicate with your Ministerial colleagues to get things done, whether or not it is your direct department.

**3.2.12 Deputy G.P. Southern:**

The candidate has pointed out the dangers of duplication between this role and another one which is about to be proposed sooner or later, which may be Assistant Minister or may end up being a Minister, who appears to be concentrating on selling Jersey to the City, based in London. Will the Minister eliminate this danger of overlap by concentrating instead on France and on Europe, who are our close neighbours? Or will he be going further afield and avoiding - apart from transport - going through London?

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

I think that is the case that we do need to look further at home. There are already good business opportunities and work going on further afield but I think we need to concentrate with our immediate neighbours, certainly France, that is something we need to build on. We have not been close enough to France, politically or culturally, in my opinion for decades. It was not always the case. When it comes to initiatives like wind and water in particular, energy with our tides, when it comes to Normandy being so close that you can see it, but it seems like a million miles away sometimes and we need to do more in that regard.

**3.2.13 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf:**

*Monsieur le Président, nous avons la possibilité de poser de poser des questions en français?*

**The Bailiff:**

*Oui, bien sûr. [Laughter]*

**Senator P.F.C. Ozouf:**

*D'accord. Alors, le français est la langue de la diplomatie, donc peut-être je pourrais demander au candidat, comment pourrait-il respecter un collectivité, s'il vous plait.*

**Deputy M.R. Higgins:**

Sir, a point of order, should the Senator not have provided an English translation for those of us who do not speak French?

**Senator P.F.C. Ozouf:**

*Nous avons la possibilité d'adresser l'Assemblée en français, monsieur.*

**The Bailiff:**

You have, but if you want some of the Members to follow what the question is ... **[Laughter]**

**Senator P.F.C. Ozouf:**

I was asking the candidate - because it is a friendly question, he speaks French - I was asking him the language of diplomacy is French and perhaps he could answer in French how he would respect a collective responsibility.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

*Je suis content que le Sénateur a précisé la question, parce que j'allais demander exactement ce qu'il voulait dire avec la collectivité. Je pense qu'il parle dans un sens du Conseil des Ministres, c'est ça? Je pense que c'est ça. Peut-être qu'on pourrait avoir le Conseil ouvertement et seulement en français? Je pense qu'on pourrait faire beaucoup de liaisons dans cet égard et on va continuer à parler en français continuellement en ce qui concerne le Conseil des Ministres.*  
**[Approbation]**

**Deputy M.R. Higgins:**

Could I ask the candidate also to read that in English? **[Laughter]**

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

If I can paraphrase it is essentially we should have Council of Ministers meetings not just only open but entirely in French and let us see how some of the other Ministers get on with that.

**The Bailiff:**

Does any other Member wish to ask a question? No, then I will bring questions to this candidate to an end. I invite Members to return to their seats and we will ask for Senator Bailhache to return. Very well, the Senator is with us again so we will move to the vote on this occasion. If you wish to vote for Senator Bailhache you press the P button, if you wish to vote for Deputy Tadier you press the C button. The Greffier will open the voting.

<b>Senator Sir P.M. Bailhache: 41</b>	<b>Deputy M. Tadier: 5</b>	<b>Abstain: 1</b>
Senator P.F. Routier	Deputy G.P. Southern (H)	Deputy J.A. Martin (H)
Senator P.F.C. Ozouf	Deputy M. Tadier (B)	
Senator A.J.H. Maclean	Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)	
Senator I.J. Gorst	Deputy S.Y. Mézec (H)	
Senator L.J. Farnham	Deputy S.M. Wickenden (H)	
Senator P.M. Bailhache		
Senator A.K.F. Green		
Senator Z.A. Cameron		
Connétable of St. Helier		
Connétable of St. Clement		
Connétable of St. Peter		
Connétable of St. Lawrence		
Connétable of St. Mary		

Connétable of St. Ouen				
Connétable of St. Martin				
Connétable of St. Saviour				
Connétable of Grouville				
Connétable of St. John				
Connétable of Trinity				
Deputy of Grouville				
Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)				
Deputy of Trinity				
Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)				
Deputy E.J. Noel (L)				
Deputy of St. John				
Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)				
Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)				
Deputy of St. Martin				
Deputy R.G. Bryans (H)				
Deputy of St. Peter				
Deputy R.J. Rondel (H)				
Deputy A.D. Lewis (H)				
Deputy of St. Ouen				
Deputy L.M.C. Doublet (S)				
Deputy R. Labey (H)				
Deputy S.M. Bree (C)				
Deputy M.J. Norton (B)				
Deputy T.A. McDonald (S)				
Deputy of St. Mary				
Deputy G.J. Truscott (B)				
Deputy P.D. McLinton (S)				

[12:45]

## **LUNCHEON ADJOURNMENT PROPOSED**

### **The Bailiff:**

The adjournment is proposed so we will reconvene at 2.15 p.m. to continue with the next proposal from the Chief Minister.

## **LUNCHEON ADJOURNMENT**

[14:15]

### **The Bailiff:**

The next matter is ...

## **4. ADJOURNMENT UNTIL 3.15 p.m. PROPOSED**

### **Senator I.J. Gorst:**

Sir, I am loath to stand but I think it is only right that I should. I have very belatedly sent an email to colleagues saying that it has come to my attention over the lunch recess that a number of Members wish to or are indeed already attending former Deputy Hacquoil's funeral and will not be available to be back in the Assembly until after 3.15 p.m. I know it will add an extra hour to our proceedings but I do want to ask the Assembly whether they would consider extending the recess

now until 3.15 p.m. to allow those Members to return. I have no idea what their voting intentions are either way but they, I assume, would want to listen to candidates speaking and to have the ability to question them.

**The Bailiff:**

Do we know how many Members have gone?

**Senator I.J. Gorst:**

That I do not know either, Sir. As I say, I was caught rather on the hop during the lunch recess.

**The Bailiff:**

We seem to be minus by about 8 or 9. So you want to propose ...

**Senator I.J. Gorst:**

Could I ask the Assembly if they would be satisfied just to go into adjournment again for another hour?

**The Bailiff:**

Until 3.15 p.m.?

**Senator I.J. Gorst:**

Yes.

**The Bailiff:**

It is a matter for Members.

**4.1 Deputy J.M. Maçon:**

Sir, can I offer the other argument? On Monday we took an oath to call upon and be here in the States Assembly when called upon to do so. Less than a week later we are being asked to defer the States Assembly. We have a number of important positions which we need to get through and get done and I do not support losing another hour in that process.

**4.2 Connétable S.A. Le Sueur-Rennard of St. Saviour:**

Sorry, Sir, I think that is out of order. We had no idea this poor person was going to pass away and the funeral was going to be arranged today.

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

If we just move to the vote, Sir, I think.

**The Bailiff:**

If any Member wants to say anything they are entitled to. Very well, is the proposition seconded? **[Seconded]** Does any other Member wish to say anything very briefly? It is a simple decision. Very well, the appel? The appel is called for then, so if you wish to adjourn until 3.15 p.m. you vote pour, if you do not and wish to continue you vote contre. The Greffier will open the voting.

<b>POUR: 31</b>		<b>CONTRE: 9</b>		<b>ABSTAIN: 0</b>
Senator A.J.H. Maclean		Connétable of St. Clement		
Senator I.J. Gorst		Connétable of St. Ouen		
Senator L.J. Farnham		Deputy J.A. Martin (H)		
Senator A.K.F. Green		Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)		
Senator Z.A. Cameron		Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)		
Connétable of St. Helier		Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)		
Connétable of St. Lawrence		Deputy L.M.C. Doublet (S)		

Connétable of St. Mary		Deputy S.M. Wickenden (H)		
Connétable of St. Martin		Deputy G.J. Truscott (B)		
Connétable of St. Saviour				
Connétable of Grouville				
Connétable of St. John				
Connétable of Trinity				
Deputy G.P. Southern (H)				
Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)				
Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)				
Deputy of Trinity				
Deputy M. Tadier (B)				
Deputy E.J. Noel (L)				
Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)				
Deputy of St. Martin				
Deputy R.G. Bryans (H)				
Deputy of St. Peter				
Deputy S.Y. Mézec (H)				
Deputy of St. Ouen				
Deputy R. Labey (H)				
Deputy S.M. Bree (C)				
Deputy M.J. Norton (B)				
Deputy T.A. McDonald (S)				
Deputy of St. Mary				
Deputy P.D. McLinton (S)				

**The Bailiff:**

Very well, the Assembly will adjourn and reconvene at 3.15 p.m.

**ADJOURNMENT**

[15:16]

**The Bailiff:**

I invite the Chief Minister to propose the next Minister.

**5. The Minister for Transport and Technical Services**

**Senator I.J. Gorst:**

Can I thank the Assembly for their understanding? For the position of Minister for Transport and Technical Services I should like to propose Deputy Noel of St. Lawrence.

**The Bailiff:**

Is that seconded? [**Seconded**] Any other nominations?

**Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré:**

I would like to nominate Deputy Kevin Lewis for re-election as Minister.

**The Bailiff:**

Is that seconded? [**Seconded**] Any other nominations? Very well, we have 2 nominations then. So Deputy Lewis then I would ask you to withdraw with a member of the Greffe staff. Then I invite Deputy Noel to address the Assembly for up to 10 minutes.

### 5.1 Deputy E.J. Noel of St. Lawrence:

To deliver the same level of services in addition to increasing budgets at Health and Education, then all departments, including T.T.S. (Transport and Technical Services), will need to do more with the same. I would like for the benefit of new Members to give a brief résumé of my time in this Assembly. I have served 2 terms, the first as Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources and as Assistant Minister for Health. I have deputised for the Minister for Treasury and Resources in addition to working alongside him, almost a full-time job in itself. I have had full delegated responsibility for the entire States property portfolio. I have been an active member of the States Employment Board, led on strategies and policies for the States investment portfolios, been a member of a number of Ministerial oversight groups including T.T.S.'s own liquid waste, Health, the Housing Transformation, Ports of Jersey, as well as sitting on a cross-departmental 'Back to Work' steering group. I chaired the Fort Regent steering group and delivered a new plan for Fort Regent. A planning application is being submitted this week to finally provide a home for the sea cadets, rowing clubs, and other maritime users at the Les Galots site at no additional cost to the taxpayer. Further, I have delivered a new school for St. Martin, new centres for the Youth Service at St. James and at Crabbé. Health has also been looked at with the refurbishment of Clinique Pinel, Rosewood House and new I.C.U (Intensive Care Units) units, additional wards, and soon to be coming online some additional theatres. I brought all of Property Holdings staff on to one floor of Maritime House, which has proved an exemplar of what the remains of the States office portfolio can become. At Treasury I have ensured that T.T.S. has had additional funding in the current M.T.F.P. to provide for States village improvement schemes, schemes such as the improvement at St. Aubin, St. Mary, and in due course at St. John and St. Lawrence. I will be pushing for this funding to be extended, allowing for other Parish schemes to be developed and delivered. I want to build a relationship of trust with St. Helier, working with the Constable of St. Helier and the town Deputies. I want strong relationships with all 12 Parish Constables, and in doing so meet the needs of both as it is not an either/or situation. My time at Treasury can be best characterised as one of hard work, of team work with a can-do attitude. I have supported the former Minister for Treasury and Resources throughout and indeed often substituted for him. In short, I have delivered whatever has been asked of me and I want to carry on delivering the Island's infrastructure. I have seen first-hand how T.T.S. and Property Holdings already interact and the symbiotic relationship which can be nurtured and built upon. A combined Ministry will be better placed to deliver more with the same resources than the current 2-department setup. During the summer recess I approached the Chief Minister with this idea and it quickly became apparent that this was a path worth following. Currently, in their own rights, both departments already provide efficient and effective services to the public, but a combined entity strips away the final remnants of silo mentality, avoiding duplication, and releases officer time to achieve more output. On my own initiative I have held discussions with both the chief officers of T.T.S. and Property Holdings to explore the idea and they are in agreement that combined we can do more, be faster to react, indeed be more proactive, and lead on the modernisation of the public sector. The Isle of Man already has an Infrastructure Ministry developing a range of services and co-ordinated continual infrastructure and investment, as do many other jurisdictions, large and small, deliver their infrastructure in such a single-department manner. Having gained approval of the idea I am delighted that the Chief Minister has asked me to lead on it. So what would I do? I want to safeguard the funding for road repairs, resurfacing, and our sea defences; ensure that the Parish village improvements funding continues; ensure that the streetwise legislation progresses in short order. I hope that the former Constable of St. John is listening. I will be committed to working towards finding solutions for dealing with unfairness in the current system for those not on main drains. **[Approbation]** I am committed to increasing the levels of recycling, but I must stress, not by centralising the collection. I want to progress - and if I may borrow the Chief Minister's phrase - with more pace on reforming the taxi legislation. **[Approbation]** I actively lobbied the National Trust in the run up to the last Plémont

debate to ensure a solution was found between all parties, and T.T.S. for a cycle track up St. Peter's Valley to become a reality in the near future. I spend my family summer holidays on the French island of Ré, an Island whose tourism unique selling point is its extensive network of cycle tracks. I want the same for Jersey. I believe that creative solutions can be found in delivering much of the eastern cycle track. We need to adopt the can-do attitude and culture. It is good for tourism, it is good for relieving the traffic congestion, and it is good for our health. Liberty Bus are introducing a rural Parish service and I want to see if similar principles can be adopted to provide additional connectivity in the urban areas, linking up the north of town to Overdale, to the hospital, to Liberation Square and to Fort Regent. As a former Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources I know that Senator Maclean in his new role will expect my department - if I am elected - to fund such initiatives from within our existing cash limits. Joining T.T.S. and J.P.H. together on its own will not deliver sufficient funding, but we need to be creative, we need to be bold. We do have some potential new resources, an example, a voluntary M.O.T. (Ministry of Transport) certificate which may benefit both buyers and sellers of second-hand motor vehicles. We could pilot the scheme in the first instance using T.T.S.'s existing facilities and if successful the revenue could be reinvested in road safety projects around the Island. We could explore expanding the issues of personalised number plates, auctioning, for example, J007. Surely that would raise enough for at least one additional bus shelter. A further example, which admittedly could be more challenging but in these times of financial pressures we should at least consider it, as how we currently fund the 30,000 tonnes of commercial waste being currently treated at the Energy from Waste plant. This has a current cost to taxpayers of some £3 million per annum. So let us just clarify. When a property developer demolishes a building and all the burnable waste from that development is treated for free at the Energy from Waste plant, one tonne of plastic windows alone costs the taxpayer £500 per tonne in chemicals and lime to process for the Energy from Waste plant. Such a charge would incentivise private companies to recycle and provide additional local employment. These are just examples of creative thinking that is needed. T.T.S. is an important employer that provides alternative careers to our school leavers. The provision of infrastructure services can offer just that via apprenticeships, graduate engineering programmes. I want to nurture lifelong employees with proper career paths. We must invest in local labour and train and empower these individuals to provide efficient services for the future. It is often said that politics is the art of the possible. Well I believe that infrastructure is a facilitator of the possible. The merger between J.P.H. and T.T.S. is not a slash-and-burn exercise, it is not a Trojan horse for privatisation. It is about protecting Jersey and its infrastructure for future generations. I believe that I have served my apprenticeship in one of the more demanding departments and I have the drive and commitment to deliver on infrastructure. If elected, I will work in partnership with other Ministers, other Members, departments, Parishes and stakeholders to provide the best services possible in the most efficient manner and ensure that our Island is well maintained, clean and has fit-for-purpose infrastructure. Thank you. **[Approbation]**

**The Bailiff:**

Very well, we come then to 20 minutes questioning and first of all I saw Deputy Tadier.

**5.1.1 Deputy M. Tadier:**

I will ask the candidate a question about recycling. It was only a couple of months ago that the previous Assembly decided to unanimously adopt a proposition to investigate the feasibility of Island-wide kerbside collection. The Minister-to-be possibly, has already said that he would not be in favour of centralising collection. Does he think that it is appropriate to have come out with an outcome already of the preferred solution given the fact that the investigation still has not been carried out?

**Deputy E.J. Noel:**



I welcome that investigation to be carried out but my current view is that I believe the Parishes... and we have it in St. Lawrence and there are other Parishes as well, that the Parish system is the preferable route. I am open minded and I will look at the evidence when it has been produced.

**5.1.2 Deputy M. Tadier:**

Can the candidate expand on how we might have an Island-wide collection system across the Island but not centralised?

**Deputy E.J. Noel:**

Well, as I said, Government, the State, have to work with the Parishes. We need to build on the strengths of the Parishes. The Parish system works in terms of refuse collection.

**5.1.3 The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

Could I ask the Deputy if he would say precisely what solutions could he offer to those not on mains drains?

**Deputy E.J. Noel:**

Funding is always going to be an issue for the mains drains but I believe that with the funding now available for replacement sewage works at Bellozanne, that we should be able to help in some respects to increase the network. Some parts of the Island we will never be able to get to but again working with our Parish colleagues because there may be ways of crossing fields, *et cetera*, to connect properties up. We need to work as a community and together we will find the solutions.

**5.1.4 Deputy G.P. Southern:**

But no more than that possibly. But nonetheless, when the Minister talked about modernisation of the structures of the new body that he wishes to form and talked about efficient delivery of services, that word “efficient delivery” often masks what is going to happen which is privatisation or outsourcing of the workforce. Will the Minister commit, in his 3½ years, not to privatise or outsource his entire workforce?

[15:30]

**Deputy E.J. Noel:**

It would be rather difficult to outsource an entire workforce in excess of 500 people, even in a 3-year period. But talking to the Deputy more directly; I have already said this is not about privatisation. I can give you a small example whereby simply by bringing Property Holdings and T.T.S. together we will derive efficiencies. In St. Lawrence we want to put a Parish-funded scheme through part of the Education, Sport and Culture’s property. This cannot be done by Government but it potentially could be done by the Parish. The school is, in principle, in favour of it and the Education officers are in principle in favour of it. They need to speak to their colleagues in T.T.S. and Property Holdings. That is 2 different people being contacted with 2 different emails trying to get one or 2 different meeting dates. That is not efficient. They should have one point of contact.

**5.1.5 Deputy G.P. Southern:**

Can I ask the specific question then? By how much does he expect to reduce his 500 workforce?

**Deputy E.J. Noel:**

I do not intend to reduce that 500 workforce at all; in fact it is going to increase because I am going to put Property Holdings staff in with T.T.S.

**5.1.6 Senator P.F. Routier:**

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services has responsibility for the Energy from Waste plant. The residents of Havre des Pas were promised that the building itself would be disguised in some way with planting. This was done at the initial outset and everybody agreed that this would happen. It has not happened. Can the candidate give any assurances to the residents of Havre des Pas and everybody in St. Clement that this may happen in the future?

**Deputy E.J. Noel:**

Those that know me well will realise that I do not believe when people tell me that something cannot be done for this reason or for that reason. I think we need to look at that and I believe that we should be able to come up, again, with a solution that works for the residents of Havre des Pas to help mask that particular aspect of the Energy from Waste plant.

**5.1.7 The Connétable of St. Ouen:**

I would just like to ride on the back of the Deputy of St. Ouen's question. In the previous position that the candidate held, he advised the Assembly that in the Medium-Term Financial Plan funding had been made available for the extension to the infrastructure, main drains, *et cetera*. I would like a guarantee that in the next 3 years, if he was successful, this work would be undertaken in the outlying Parishes and preferably starting in St. Ouen. **[Laughter]**

**Deputy E.J. Noel:**

I cannot promise the latter but I will promise to work with the Parishes, with the Constables, to find solutions to get our sewage works across fields, across properties, so we can link up more houses to the main drains. **[Approbation]**

**5.1.8 Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré:**

The candidate talked about creative thinking which is great, particularly coming from an accountant and to an accountant. But a lot of it did seem to be about putting up charges. Can the Deputy confirm or commit that he will not bring in charges on domestic waste during any part of his term?

**Deputy E.J. Noel:**

I believe currently that it is not possible to bring waste charges in on domestic waste due to the covenant with St. Helier. So it is not my remit to implement that even if I wanted to, which I do not. But I do believe there is a strong argument for charging commercial waste.

**5.1.9 Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré:**

Supplementary. Does that mean as well that the Deputy will not seek to rearrange or renegotiate the covenant that St. Helier has in place?

**Deputy E.J. Noel:**

Anything to renegotiate or rearrange the covenant with St. Helier would require, I would have thought, the approval of this Assembly and so if it was a desire from the Parish and from Government to renegotiate the contract, then Government and the Parish will seek to do that. But, again, I would imagine that it would be a decision of this Assembly to do that.

**5.1.10 Deputy M.R. Higgins:**

The Energy from Waste plant has not been working to full capacity. Does the candidate envisage accepting rubbish from Guernsey to bring it up to the capacity that it should be operating at?

**Deputy E.J. Noel:**

Deputy Higgins is quite correct, the Energy from Waste plant has been designed for an increased capacity. The beauty about it being designed in such a way is that we can use it in 2 cycles. With

regard to Guernsey waste, we need to see if we can be more competitive in our tender because currently we are not, and if we can be competitive it has got to be a win-win situation. It has to be a good thing for Guernsey, it has to be a good thing for Jersey. But above that, there is a commitment, again, to bring that decision back to this Assembly and that is what would have to take place.

**5.1.11 Deputy M.R. Higgins:**

Supplementary. Could the candidate explain why the energy for efficiency plant is not operating at optimum capacity, why it is less than efficient and, other than accepting rubbish from Guernsey, what he would do to make it more efficient and effective?

**Deputy E.J. Noel:**

I do not want it running at full capacity because I want it to last longer. I want it to be able to use both cycles and both of the boilers and the grids and the - I cannot remember what the actual racks are called now. I want to be able to eke the life of that plant out longer. If it is in our interest and it is in Guernsey's interest to take their waste at a realistic charge then that will have to come back to this Assembly and we would have to look at it. But as I said, I do not want that plant to run at its capacity because it will run out. Running it at less than full capacity will give us the energy that we want out of it and it will extend the life of that plant.

**5.1.12 The Connétable of St. Helier:**

Although the Parish of St. Helier has enjoyed relatively harmonious working with T.T.S. during the last 6 years, there remain several small but significant obstacles which are regularly placed by the Minister in the way of the Parish's efforts to improve the town centre. The most recent surprise being the felling of mature trees in Union Street with no consultation with the Parish. If elected, will the Minister back the Chief Minister's avowed wish to give the Parish and all the Parishes more control in how they operate?

**Deputy E.J. Noel:**

As I mentioned in my speech and I have had discussions with the Constable, I want to build up a relationship of trust between Government and the Parishes, Government and St. Helier. St. Helier is our future. If we want our economy to grow it will grow out of St. Helier. So there must be a symbiotic relationship between the States and the Parishes for the benefit of all our Islanders.

**5.1.13 Deputy R. Labey:**

What I am looking to hear from the candidate is that he has the confidence and tenacity to go into T.T.S., shake it up, take hold of it, not take everything at face value, challenge his officers. I am told by those who know more about these things than I do that with the proper and diligent management of green waste there is no reason why it should smell, and yet the residents of La Collette have had to put up with that smell for far too long. The Green Street traffic situation is complete carnage, it cannot wait until 2018 to be sorted out. Will he bring a new energy to the department, look at these long-running problems afresh and get results?

**The Bailiff:**

I am delighted to hear the loss of Deputy Le Hérissier is not ... **[Laughter]** **[Approbation]** At last somebody who speaks with appropriate volume, Deputy.

**Deputy E.J. Noel:**

In one word: absolutely. **[Approbation]**

**5.1.14 The Deputy of St. John:**

P.A.C. identified potential issues pertaining to the future funding of the Car Park Trading Fund going forward, yet Treasury took an additional £2.6 million away from this fund in the 2015 Budget. What is the candidate's view on car parks and their future funding?

**Deputy E.J. Noel:**

Treasury was able to take that funding out of the Car Parking Fund because the fund did not need it. We can eke out ... we have seen what is happening currently as a good example in Pier Road car park. That car park is being refurbished. If we continue to do that with our car parks, they do not need to be replaced as quickly as we thought they needed to be. That is why Treasury was able to release that money and use it elsewhere.

**5.1.15 The Deputy of St. John:**

Supplementary. So, could the candidate explain what his views on car parks are and how we are going to fund them going forward?

**Deputy E.J. Noel:**

As Members already know, some of them were not too pleased with the fact that I did it but I provided more shopper parking at Snow Hill to the detriment of some States Members. I believe we do need more shopper parking in town. I have heard many words being said about providing additional short-term shopper parking around our central and fish markets. It is not difficult to achieve if we work with the Constables, with the town Deputies, we can deliver on providing better and more shopper parking for St. Helier to keep our capital, for want of a better word, vibrant and sustainable. [Approbation]

**5.1.16 Deputy P.D. McLinton:**

The Chamber may be aware that next year we are having what is the highest tide on record. Quite how they know that, I do not know, but still next year it is a big one and I am sure the residents of Beaumont and the area would quite like to know how the candidates would be dealing with the looming problem that even this Chamber cannot stop happening.

**Deputy E.J. Noel:**

It is a good question by the Deputy. Just last week, I, along with the Deputy from St. Peter, visited T.T.S. and we were briefed on what they were going to be doing next summer to improve the seawall infrastructure from the Gunsite Café going east to hopefully alleviate the flooding problems that the residents get at Beaumont on such high tides.

**5.1.17 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf:**

Having attended the funeral of a former President of Public Services, Mr. Robin Hacquoil, there is a strong tradition in public services and Ministers for T.T.S. of going out with flak jackets, getting on diggers, going down drains, visiting parks and gardens. Is the candidate prepared to do the same as his predecessors, if elected?

**Deputy E.J. Noel:**

If elected and hopefully even if I was not elected, I want to go out and I want to meet the staff. I want to meet the people who serve this Island, day in, day out, for the benefit of all. So, yes, I will be donning, if they can find a Hi Viz jacket that is short enough for me, I certainly will be.

**5.1.18 Deputy M. Tadier:**

I just hope the Deputy does not get lost when he is down those drains, it would be a loss to the Assembly. My question is, and the Deputy will know, he was at the Grouville hustings for Senators when there was talk, and I think almost all of the candidates endorsed the need for

disabled people to have free bus passes. Is this something that he will reintroduce and how quickly can he do it?

**Deputy E.J. Noel:**

I do not know if that is a fact about reintroducing, I am not sure if they have ever had them. But I was appalled when I heard that at the Grouville hustings and I have had another instance of a parishioner in St. Lawrence as well. So, yes, that is going to be high on my priorities. It is not just a T.T.S. issue, it goes wider than that. But, yes, it makes sense; these people do need to be able to have access to public transport which is free. **[Approbation]**

**5.1.19 Deputy M. Tadier:**

How is that done? Is it up to the bus providers to provide that or is it really at directions from the Minister for Transport and Technical Services?

**Deputy E.J. Noel:**

As I said, it is across departments. It is not just T.T.S. it is Social Security, it is other departments as well. But I am a team player I believe in working with people, taking people with us and together between T.T.S., Treasury and Social Security we will find a solution and implement that in short order.

**5.1.20 Deputy G.P. Southern:**

Again, a specific question. The candidate mentioned urban connections for the buses. Will he promise to support funding in the 2016 M.T.F.P. for a Hoppa bus in town?

**Deputy E.J. Noel:**

I do not know if Deputy Southern has had any exposure to what is going on in the Parishes. Our Liberty Bus, which is a social responsibility corporation, is investing in effectively a countrified version of a Hoppa bus system linking up to the main bus network. That revolves around using volunteer drivers, and when I first heard this I thought: "Well, they are not going to get any." But they have been inundated and I think that is an example that we could use and bring into the urban areas **[Approbation]** on a volunteer basis to link up with the bus network and provide that urgent and vital service particularly for our older residents to be able to move around St. Helier and indeed the rest of the Island.

**5.1.21 Deputy G.P. Southern:**

The Minister is aware that this House has voted for a Hoppa bus, by which I mean a bus which is free or low cost, to get people around town. Now, it failed last time despite the wishes of this Chamber because the Minister for T.T.S. said it was not high enough priority and did not support the funding. Will he support the funding for the equivalent of a Hoppa bus, by which I have just defined what it should be, in town in the next M.T.F.P.?

**Deputy E.J. Noel:**

I can give an undertaking that I want to make sure that it happens. It does not necessarily need the level of funding that we first thought. If we can take the model that is going to be used in the country Parishes, that can be rolled out in the urban Parishes.

[15:45]

**5.1.22 Deputy M.R. Higgins:**

Is the candidate prepared to give Members a guarantee that all the previous promises that were given at the time of the Lime Grove decision regarding car parking in Green Park and associated areas will be fulfilled?

**Deputy E.J. Noel:**

The contractor is on site now building the extra floor in the Green Street car park.

**5.1.23 Deputy M.R. Higgins:**

Supplementary. I mean all the additional parking beyond Green Street that was promised as well.

**Deputy E.J. Noel:**

The police headquarters project and what was linked to it, the Green Street car park, is being actioned and nothing is being left out.

**5.1.24 Senator P.F. Routier:**

The candidate spoke about the vision of bringing together both T.T.S. and Property Holdings. Can he expand on his views on the real benefits of bringing these 2 functions together?

**Deputy E.J. Noel:**

I have only got a minute. Just from my time in the last 3 years working with Property Holdings and how we interact with T.T.S., it is as clear as the desk in front of me that we can create real savings and use those savings to reinvest in providing ... doing more for the same. That is my vision, combining both departments and doing more with the same. But I could go on for an extremely long time in detail but I do need to take other questions as well.

**5.1.25 Deputy G.P. Southern:**

Just briefly to revisit a question asked before. Will he commit himself not to outsource or privatise parts, any parts, of his workforce?

**Deputy E.J. Noel:**

That is a commitment I am not willing to make because this is not about privatisation but any part ...

**The Bailiff:**

Sorry, that is the end of questions to Deputy Noel. So I would ask Deputy Noel to withdraw and we will ask Deputy Kevin Lewis to come back. You may come back, Deputy Lewis, thank you very much. Very well, then I invite Deputy Lewis to speak for up to 10 minutes.

**5.2 Deputy K.C. Lewis:**

As you know I do not believe in long speeches so it will be relatively brief. My term of office as Minister for Transport and Technical Services has certainly been challenging. In the early days we had a capacity problem with the buses. This was helped by my suggestion to reintroduce double-decker buses. We had 2 buses over for an experiment which proved successful. With the introduction of the new bus contract there were problems to start with but the service has now doubled and the company has increased their workforce with more improvements and refining to come including a community bus service to link-up the Island. There are also plans to turn the company into a John Lewis Waitrose type of company where the employees receive a share of the profits. This is an initiative that has my full support. I have also accelerated the building of as many bus shelters as possible to make the bus ridership more comfortable. My department has made substantial savings through efficiency and the Lean project and we have also taken on 17 apprentices at T.T.S. who are doing extremely well, which shows that we are certainly planning for

the future. It was my election promise when I first put my name forward for Minister for Transport and Technical Services that I would deal with the toxic ash and asbestos legacy at La Collette. I was determined that this would not remain for our children and grandchildren. There are huge obstacles with regard to the transportation of toxic ash to another jurisdiction. We had to take into consideration international agreements such as the Basel Convention and DEFRA, the Department for the Environment, Food and Rural Affairs in the U.K. It took a long time but with all the permits in place we are now shipping over 8 articulated lorry loads of toxic A.P.C. (Air Particle Contaminants) ash residue, that is air particle contaminants, per week to the U.K. for remediation and disposal. I think it works out roughly about 200 tonnes per week and this backlog will be cleared by April. Other challenges were to follow. The Jersey Electricity Company losing one of their high voltage cables from France and urgently needing to bring forward the installation of the new cable coming ashore at Grouville then following the road to St. Helier. This was followed by the heavy rock fall at Mount Bingham causing several thousand tonnes of rock to fall on to the road, which caused absolute traffic chaos. With regard to Mount Bingham, I must pay tribute not only to my own engineers at T.T.S., but to the Geomarine rope access team who were hanging off 100 foot ropes in gale force winds and rain with kango hammers to secure the rock face and reopen the road as soon as possible. The Island was also hit by snow followed by high winds which brought down many trees, and of course this year's winter storm floods which battered the Island. I have been out with the standby crews on many a stormy early morning putting out sandbags to prevent flooding of low-lying areas. Although the Island's seawalls and infrastructure sustained severe damage during the winter storms, this was repaired in record time. I have overseen the demolition of the old Energy from Waste plant which will make way for the new sewage treatment plant at Bellozanne. The Phillips Street shaft and tunnels through to Bath Street have now been completed and is now being fitted out and lined. This will protect the north of town from severe flooding as happened a few years ago. Once this is complete the Anne Court area will be returned to car parking. Enough of the past, into the future. In the next States session I intend to fulfil my promise to not only complete the toxic ash removal but also to remove the mountain of asbestos for possible vitrification. The old sewage plant at Bellozanne has served us well but we can no longer expand and update it. So it is a new sewage treatment plant which will be built over the next 3 years. The new plant will be more efficient and cheaper to run and will also help in the fight against sea lettuce by reducing nutrients discharging into St. Aubin's Bay. A major new recycling park will also be built at La Colette. This will increase our recycling enormously and construction is expected to start mid-2015. The schools transport action plan for St. Saviour and St. Helier is in its final draft and will be in the T.T.S. works programme and will alleviate much of the school congestion. The Parish village centre improvement schemes are ongoing with St. Mary's starting this winter and workshops being organised for St. John and St. Lawrence. More flood protection at Beaumont; as I mentioned earlier I have instructed my officers to treat this project as a priority and talks have commenced with the Parish. As part of the Sustainable Transport Policy we are building and improving the cycling and walking routes around the Island. With regard to the western cycle and walking route it is now possible to cycle from La Corbière to Havre des Pas, and I hope, in the not too distant future, that we may join this up with the eastern cycle route which now runs from Gorey Harbour to Ville ès Renauds in Grouville. A further scheme to improve the safety of pedestrians and cyclists in Ville ès Renauds is almost complete, including speed restrictions, pedestrian crossings at the fuel station and the cemetery layby parking. Coloured surfacing and gateway treatment will remain to be applied once the asphalt has sufficiently weathered, and part-time flashing "20 miles per hour" on Rue à Don for Grouville School. My officers are also developing proposals to develop parking facilities at Grouville School to provide parents with pick-up and drop-off parking. The A.N.P.R. (automatic number plate recognition) system at Sand Street car park has been a success and we are at present looking at several systems to roll out across the Island. The 6 multi-storey car parks are also being upgraded and spaces repainted and enlarged to

bring them up to modern standards. It has been suggested that Property Holdings be merged with T.T.S. Surely if anything, Property Holdings should be merged with Housing; this would have more synergy. Transport and Technical Services is a public service for the people of Jersey and should remain so. The Street Works Law is in its final stages which will prevent utility companies from digging up the roads indiscriminately and will simplify a permit system to co-ordinate all road works. So I have some very important projects in the pipeline and would ask that Members re-elect me for a further term as Minister for Transport and Technical Services to see these vitally important projects through. Thank you, I will leave it there and invite questions.

**The Bailiff:**

Very well. We now have up to 20 minutes for questions to Deputy Lewis. I saw first the Connétable of St. Helier.

**5.2.1 The Connétable of St. Helier:**

Although the Parish of St. Helier has enjoyed relatively harmonious workings with T.T.S. during the 6 years of the Minister's tenure, there remain several small but significant obstacles which are regularly placed by the Minister in the way of the Parish's efforts to improve the town centre. The recent surprise felling of the mature trees in Union Street being the most recent example. If elected, will the Minister back the Chief Minister's avowed wish to give the Parish more control in how the town centre operates?

**Deputy K.C. Lewis:**

I have always been under the impression that I have worked very well with all 12 Constables. The trees in Union Street had to be felled because the roots were bringing up the tarmac in the road, as the Constable was notified by the department at that time. But always willing to talk to the Constable regarding that.

**5.2.2 The Connétable of St. Helier:**

Supplementary, please. The Constable was not notified nor was the Director of Parks and Gardens. Does the Minister not agree with me that the highway authority of each Parish, the Roads Committee, which in the case of St. Helier is accountable and transparent because it meets in public; does he not believe that the Roads Committee should be kept much more fully aware of what is going on in each Parish?

**Deputy K.C. Lewis:**

Absolutely. I think the Parish should always be aware of what is happening with T.T.S. roads, *et cetera*, I do not have a problem with that. More than happy to attend the Constables' Roads Committees.

**5.2.3 The Connétable of St. Ouen:**

Just listening to the candidate, it all seems to be going on in the south and the south-east coast of the Island. Bearing in mind my question before was that funding was announced from the previous Assistant Minister for Treasury for the funding for the extension of the main drains throughout the Island, could he give us some guarantee of what his future plans are for the extension of these drains?

**Deputy K.C. Lewis:**

Yes. It has been a topic for some time. We have long since tried to plan sewer extensions in the northern Parishes but subject to funding I would like to progress that as soon as possible.

**5.2.4 Connétable J.E. Le Maistre of Grouville:**



The candidate made reference to the school parking at Grouville School and I wonder if he could make a total commitment to make sure that my proposition to provide 60 extra spaces will happen.

**Deputy K.C. Lewis:**

Yes, indeed. That was the subject of the Constable of Grouville's proposition, more than happy to carry that out. We do have some funds, as the Constable is aware, but we would need more funds from Treasury to complete the actual project.

**5.2.5 Deputy G.P. Southern:**

Does the Minister have any regrets over his failure to ensure that the bus drivers' terms and conditions were transferred over to the new company following the transfer and undertaking to Liberty Bus as guaranteed previously by a States decision resulting in a loss of services for a certain length of time, and certainly a loss of trust on the part of those bus drivers?

**Deputy K.C. Lewis:**

As I mentioned in my speech, it was problematic, the transfer of the staff from the old company to the new but all the legal advice received was that everything was complied with.

[16:00]

**Deputy G.P. Southern:**

So, in answer to my question, no regrets.

**Deputy K.C. Lewis:**

I am not a legal expert I can only go on legal advice. I regret people were upset by what happened but there was an awful lot happening in the background at the time, there was very much industrial unrest. But as I mentioned, everything seems to be settled now and, as I mentioned in my speech, it looks like it will be transferred to a Sainsbury's Waitrose type of company where all staff have a share in the profits and that has my full support.

**Deputy G.P. Southern:**

For clarification, it is not a legal question it is the words of Edith Piaf.

**5.2.6 Senator P.F. Routier:**

When the Energy from Waste plant was planned and built the residents of Havre des Pas were promised that the large building would be disguised by appropriate planting. Can the Minister give any indication to the residents of Havre des Pas and those people on the east of the Island that this might happen in the future?

**Deputy K.C. Lewis:**

Yes, indeed. There was quite a bit of planting done along the eastern side of the Energy from Waste plant. Sadly, a lot of the trees died through windburn, *et cetera*, and a lot of it has been replanted. If the Senator comes a bit closer you can see that there are trees growing there but I would think you would need Californian Redwoods to really cover the Energy from Waste plant and I am all in favour of extra planting there to try and conceal it. It was a planning decision before my time that it should go there and it will take an awful lot of screening, but I am more than happy to try other methods.

**5.2.7 Deputy C.F. Labey of Grouville:**

The eastern cycle network from Gorey to town and other places to create the network, I secured the funding or some funding, £500,000 in 2009. I secured the services of a visiting regiment which were turned down by T.T.S. I put together a diverse group of people that could help progress it,

which are now disbanded because I did not feel I could waste their time any longer. Short of getting the shovels out ourselves and building it, could the Deputy please explain when it might progress further?

**Deputy K.C. Lewis:**

As soon as possible. As the Deputy of Grouville is aware, there are land ownership issues there. I am not aware that anything was turned down by T.T.S., I was not aware of that. There is development happening on the corner of Ville ès Renauds, as the Deputy is aware, so we cannot put anything in until that is complete. What I would like to see, as I mentioned in my speech, the western cycle track and the eastern cycle track joining up at some point.

**5.2.8 Deputy M. Tadier:**

I was tempted to ask a question about how profits can be shared from a company that is non-profit making, but I will not ask that question. Instead I will ask about recycling which the candidate did mention. Does the candidate believe that we need a centralised recycling system for kerbside collection in Jersey? If so, can he elucidate, and if not, what is the system that we need to put in place so that the recycling plant may be fully functional?

**Deputy K.C. Lewis:**

A very good question. The Deputy himself brought this to the States and I fully supported that I would consult with all Constables, I think it was before the end of 2015, to some kind of resolution. We do have a problem inasmuch as we have 12 Parishes and 12 authorities that deal predominantly with their own refuse. So it would not be sensible to duplicate any systems but I agree that it would be sensible to have a central recycling unit. But these talks will be had in 2015 and if we could hammer out some kind of agreement with the Parishes I would be all in favour.

**5.2.9 The Deputy of St. Martin:**

I think I can say with some conviction that the greatest disappointment of the last Environment Scrutiny Panel was the failure of T.T.S. to resolve the taxi situation, a situation that the public of the Island still consider to be completely unsatisfactory. Given that the Minister had the results of consultation, instructions and all the paperwork ready to go, many, many months ago, can he inform the Assembly why he has not taken action?

**Deputy K.C. Lewis:**

Yes, it was far more complex than we had originally envisaged plus it is still on the cards for, I believe, the first quarter for next year. It was complex and a lot of people thought we should deregulate in one block and if we follow the example that happened in Ireland, quite a number of people went bankrupt who were private taxi owners, followed by many suicides. We have to do this incrementally. It is happening but it will not happen in one jump. We have got several things in the pipeline; we have new billing systems coming in where everybody will have a print-off receipt. There are lots happening now with taxi apps. We have not abandoned the taxi scheme whatsoever but there are complications.

**5.2.10 The Deputy of St. Martin:**

I am very disappointed that the Minister has used the Dublin example and bring suicides into it. The consultation was quite clear; it was not going to deregulate taxis completely and I would just like the Minister to acknowledge that.

**Deputy K.C. Lewis:**

A lot of people were calling for a complete deregulation and I thought that was a step too far. It will be done but it will be done incrementally. What I stated before was a statement of fact.

**5.2.11 The Connétable of St. Martin:**

Just a general question: we have been questioning the candidate on previous things. I am a little concerned and I may have misheard but I think it is quite important. Can the candidate advise the Assembly how he would take on this role when he appears not to support the transfer of the responsibility of Property Holdings to T.T.S. that is to take place?

**Deputy K.C. Lewis:**

As I said in my speech, I just think it should not really sit with Transport and Technical Services. I think there are other places where Property Holdings could sit that would be more appropriate.

**5.2.12 The Connétable of St. Martin:**

The new Minister will have to take this on; it is not a question of candidates not wishing to take it on. Is that correct?

**Deputy K.C. Lewis:**

Indeed. That was my advice but I will do whatever the Assembly instructs me to do.

**5.2.13 Deputy M.R. Higgins:**

The candidate as a Minister was 100 per cent loyal to the Chief Minister who has been less than loyal to the candidate by not nominating him again for the position and also by not consulting him over the move of the Property Holdings Department to T.T.S. Can the candidate work with complete loyalty and confidence in the future with the Chief Minister when this has been the case?

**Deputy K.C. Lewis:**

I work with whoever the Assembly tells me to work with. I work with people from varying sides of the House. Excuse me. I beg your pardon. I work with people from the left and the right. Excuse me, my voice is on the way out. But not a problem. Can I say, more than happy to bury the hatchet with the Chief Minister. [Laughter]

**5.2.14 The Deputy of St. Peter:**

In his speech the candidate mentioned that he felt Property Holdings would sit better with Housing. I wonder if the candidate could elaborate, please, on those thoughts when Housing no longer manages housing stock or even property stock; that has now been outsourced to Andium Homes.

**Deputy K.C. Lewis:**

Exactly that. Housing is more or less a non-Ministry now but it is still there and would be a suitable place for it to reside.

**5.2.15 Senator L.J. Farnham:**

Could the Deputy please explain what has happened to the road traffic safety strategy that was promised for presentation earlier this year?

**Deputy K.C. Lewis:**

That is still in the pipeline and we are trying to progress that as soon as possible. I have pulled out the, was it “death by dangerous driving” and that is going to be stand alone and that is with law draftsmen now to be progressed as soon as possible.

**5.2.16 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf:**

I say this as a friendly question to the Deputy who has been a good colleague of mine on the Council of Ministers. But is he really saying that he does not see real opportunities for Property

Holdings and T.T.S. working together and that it should just be parked in Housing? Does he really think that?

**Deputy K.C. Lewis:**

I think there are lots of opportunities throughout and I think it just needs further discussion. It was just suddenly dropped on me with very little notice.

**5.2.17 Deputy G.P. Southern:**

Will the Minister, this time, promise to put his full weight behind funding in the 2016 M.T.F.P. for a Hoppa bus in town which he singularly failed to do last time, despite an instruction from this House to do so?

**Deputy K.C. Lewis:**

Absolutely. As I have mentioned previously, I will do whatever this Assembly instructs me to do. Deputy Southern brought, was it a proposition, I believe, regarding the Hoppa bus and that was pursued but sadly it was unfunded. We put in the bid but the bid was not funded.

**Deputy G.P. Southern:**

It was unfunded because you did not give it enough priority and put your full weight behind it when you should have done.

**The Bailiff:**

Is that a question? Connétable of St. Helier.

**5.2.18 The Connétable of St. Helier:**

The Minister will recall that when the Jersey Gas development was brought forward his department negotiated the removal of all the shopper parking that the Island Plan had included in the scheme. If the Jersey Gas scheme should come back to this Assembly would the Minister undertake to make sure that shopper parking and visitor parking is included in any scheme?

**Deputy K.C. Lewis:**

Yes. My only recollection of that particular development was that I attended the meeting, which I believe the Constable did also. I had a message saying there would be a problem putting all the parking on site and would I mind parking being removed. I said on the condition ... I agreed on the condition that very nearby alternative parking would be provided. That was my only proviso.

**5.2.19 Deputy M. Tadier:**

Will the Deputy give an undertaking not to outsource or privatise any of the current 500 jobs which exist in his department?

**Deputy K.C. Lewis:**

Not if I get my way. But, as I say, that could quite possibly be out of my hands.

**5.2.20 Deputy M. Tadier:**

Would the current Minister expand? Are there plans, as far as he knows, to outsource and privatise some of those 500 jobs? If so, which and why does he oppose them?

**Deputy K.C. Lewis:**

Not from myself. There was a move at one point to outsource tankerage, *et cetera*, but I do not believe there was sufficient take-up. But I am not aware of any plans to privatise anything.

**Deputy G.P. Southern:**

Sorry, yes, Deputy Tadier just pinched my question. **[Laughter]** He wants to feed me his.

**5.2.21 The Connétable of Grouville:**

The candidate praised the bus service and the improvements that have been made to it. Could he comment on the number 2 bus route which has had significant cuts made to it, including no service whatsoever on a Sunday, and whether that situation can be remedied, and if it can, how?

**Deputy K.C. Lewis:**

Yes. Apparently there was very little take-up on that particular service so the bus company re-routed the bus elsewhere where there was more demand but I have asked them to look again at the number 2 route.

**5.2.22 Deputy G.P. Southern:**

The previous candidate promised to institute several apprenticeships in his department as restructured. What is the candidate's record so far on apprenticeships in T.T.S. and how does he intend to progress this in the future?

**Deputy K.C. Lewis:**

Yes, I believe I mentioned in my speech that we have taken on 17 apprentices. In a few years' time quite a few of our long-serving workforce will be retired and it is succession planning. I fully support apprenticeships. As I say, we have got 17. I believe most of them are on day release to Highlands, they are doing extremely well and that is an initiative I fully support.

**5.2.23 Deputy G.P. Southern:**

The previous candidate seemed to indicate that these were permanent jobs; not quite jobs for life but permanent jobs. Does he see these apprenticeships as staying and forging their career with the department?

**Deputy K.C. Lewis:**

That would be up to the individual but as far as I am concerned it is ... once they qualify they will be with us hopefully for life. It is predominantly engineering and, as I say, we will have quite a few people retiring in the not too distant future so, as I said, with succession planning I hope they remain with us.

**5.2.24 Deputy M. Tadier:**

Can the candidate explain to us whether he has learnt any lessons in the last 3 years or about what improvements may be able to be brought forward in the inner workings of the Council of Ministers? Clearly we are electing one of those Ministers here and can he shed any light or any instruction for the future?

[16:15]

**Deputy K.C. Lewis:**

A tricky one. What lessons have been learnt? Yes, I suppose it is to work collaboratively with all colleagues. I am not sure what I can add to that. We are all from different walks of life, different interests, different personalities but I do my best to work with everyone.

**5.2.25 Deputy M. Tadier:**

Was that collaborative approach that the Deputy favoured always shared by other Ministers around the Ministerial table?

**The Bailiff:**

One minute to go.

**Deputy K.C. Lewis:**

I think there is a lot of straight talking around the table. We do not agree on everything but that is all part of the political makeup of the Council of Ministers. I always speak my mind. If there is something I am not happy with I will say so.

**The Bailiff:**

Any other questions? No. Then we will bring the questions to Deputy Kevin Lewis to an end. I would ask that Deputy Noel be brought back to the Assembly. Very well, so now we have of course the vote for the position of Minister for Transport and Technical Services. If you wish to vote for Deputy Noel you press P. If you wish to vote for Deputy Lewis you vote C. The Greffier will open the voting.

<b>Deputy E.J. Noel: 33</b>	<b>Deputy K.C. Lewis: 10</b>	<b>Abstain: 4</b>
Senator P.F. Routier	Senator Z.A. Cameron	Deputy G.P. Southern (H)
Senator P.F.C. Ozouf	Connétable of St. Ouen	Deputy M. Tadier (B)
Senator A.J.H. Maclean	Deputy J.A. Martin (H)	Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)
Senator I.J. Gorst	Deputy of Grouville	Deputy S.Y. Mézec (H)
Senator L.J. Farnham	Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)	
Senator P.M. Bailhache	Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)	
Senator A.K.F. Green	Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)	
Connétable of St. Helier	Deputy A.D. Lewis (H)	
Connétable of St. Clement	Deputy L.M.C. Doublet (S)	
Connétable of St. Lawrence	Deputy P.D. McLinton (S)	
Connétable of St. Mary		
Connétable of St. Brelade		
Connétable of St. Martin		
Connétable of Grouville		
Connétable of St. John		
Connétable of Trinity		
Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)		
Deputy of Trinity		
Deputy E.J. Noel (L)		
Deputy of St. John		
Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)		
Deputy of St. Martin		
Deputy R.G. Bryans (H)		
Deputy of St. Peter		
Deputy R.J. Rondel (H)		
Deputy of St. Ouen		
Deputy R. Labey (H)		
Deputy S.M. Wickenden (H)		
Deputy S.M. Bree (C)		
Deputy M.J. Norton (B)		
Deputy T.A. McDonald (S)		
Deputy of St. Mary		
Deputy G.J. Truscott (B)		

**The Bailiff:**

Very well. I declare that Deputy Noel is elected as Minister for Transport and Technical Services.  
**[Approbation]**

**Deputy K.C. Lewis:**

May I congratulate Deputy Noel on his election and just inform him that he is going to inherit a fantastic team at T.T.S. and it is time for me to hand in my hard hat and fluorescent jacket and move on to pastures new. I wish the Deputy well. **[Approbation]**

**Deputy E.J. Noel:**

If I may, I would just like to thank Members for showing their support for me today but I also would like to thank Deputy Lewis and indeed his former Assistant Minister, Deputy Le Fondré. They have done some sterling work at T.T.S. and I hope to build on that and make them proud. Thank you. **[Approbation]**

**The Bailiff:**

Very well. Chief Minister.

**6. The Minister for Home Affairs**

**Senator I.J. Gorst:**

For the position of Minister for Home Affairs I should like to nominate the Deputy of St. Peter. Thank you.

**The Bailiff:**

Is that seconded? **[Seconded]** Any other nominations for Minister for Home Affairs?

**Deputy J.A. Martin:**

Yes, I would like to propose Deputy Sam Mézec.

**The Bailiff:**

Is that seconded? **[Seconded]** Any other nominations? No. Well, we have 2 nominations so Deputy Mézec, would you please retire from the Chamber? Yes. I now invite the Deputy of St. Peter to address the Assembly for up to 10 minutes.

**6.1 Deputy K.L. Moore of St. Peter:**

Some may be surprised that I am the Chief Minister's choice for this role. My previous job as Chairman of the Health, Social Security and Housing Scrutiny Panel was not directly linked. But there is a big connection and one that I hope Members will see has provided a good base of experience for serving as the Minister for Home Affairs. This is a challenge but I can remind Members I am not afraid of challenges or hard work for that matter and I would particularly encourage new Members to consider putting themselves forward for chairmanship of a panel as I did 3 years ago. **[Approbation]** Although I was a newcomer in the Assembly I think it ... I can be bold enough to say that it is widely agreed we did a good job at H.S.S.H (Health, Social Security and Housing). Of course it was a team effort. I was very ably assisted by the Deputy Hilton and the former Deputy of St. Ouen. I have learnt a great deal from working with these industrious, driven and experienced States Members and the 3 excellent officers who supported us in our work. We hit the ground running starting a review within a month of being sworn in. During our time on the panel we challenged all 3 of the Ministers and we influenced some of the major policies that were agreed by the previous States Assembly; the long-term care scheme, the housing reform and the health reform. We also amended the Chief Minister's strategic plan bringing the seventh priority, promoting family and community values, and that priority is very closely allied to the work of Home Affairs, I believe. If I take on this Ministry I would inherit a department that is in an excellent position and I must congratulate and thank the outgoing Minister, former Senator Ian Le

Marquand and his Assistant Minister, Senator Lyndon Farnham, who have supported a great team, one that in some areas has been turned around and is now very fit to lead our fire, ambulance, customs and immigration, field squadron, registrar, prison and police services. This role is not just about championing our uniformed officers however. Of course I would do that but we have the Police Authority now who are here to lead and assist the Police Force in operational matters, and their first annual report will be presented towards the end of this month. It is vital that this authority should be allowed to offer operational independence. Of course that extends to Customs also. The role of the Minister would be to concentrate on policy which includes working with fellow Ministers on the many areas where our remits overlap. There are many examples such as the Mental Health Law with Health, Fire Safety Standards with Housing, early intervention with Health and Education and alcohol and licensing policy with Health, Economic Development and a member of the Comité des Connétables. This is why it is so important to achieve the Chief Minister's proposed slate of Team Jersey candidates who will not be "yes" men or women but they will work together with shared vision and together we will challenge ideas and break down the silo mentalities that have hampered progress of States policies of the past. As a supporter of the 1,001 Critical Days manifesto, I firmly believe that we have to support families from pregnancy to 3 years. In doing so we reap the benefits later in reduced crime and also seeing these children grow up to be balanced people who are able to function well in our community. This philosophy of early intervention transposes to the community engagement work of the Police Force. They spend a large amount of their time interacting with people, and as a matter of policy I would support the continuation of this work. It is important to make my support of this area clear because the next 3½ years are not going to be easy. There will be pressures on the budget and the absolute priority will be to maintain front line services and protect our community and keep it safe. Yes, our crime figures are falling; they are down 40 per cent in fact. This is excellent news but the world is changing at a fast and challenging pace and our service needs to have the ability to adapt and respond in this climate. But officers are only dealing with crime 30 per cent of the time. Much of their work revolves around the welfare of our community; helping people in need and anticipating crime. I will now outline some areas that would be priorities. Safeguarding was an area of interest to my Scrutiny Panel and we met occasionally with the J.C.P.C. (Jersey Child Protection Committee), now the Joint Safeguarding Board and this will be a big area of work. It is a key part of maintaining a safe and caring community. The Minister for Home Affairs will have a place on the Adult's Policy Group as well as the Children's Policy Group and I would work towards changing legislation to give the Joint Safeguarding Board the statutory powers they need to conduct their work at the same level as their colleagues in other jurisdictions. Members will be aware of the story in yesterday's press about the officer from the new Cybercrime Unit whose work has cracked an international paedophile network. This is the perfect example of how we must support the uniformed to rise to the challenges we face in the modern world and this success is a great credit to the organisation. In order to help this team in their work I would progress the development of up-to-date legislation to protect the public in the online community as well as our on Island community. An area where we have not seen a fall in the reported crime figures is domestic abuse. While it is hoped that the rise in this area is due to people feeling empowered to report this crime rather than suffering in silence the fact that this accounts for one in 6 of every incident reported to the police, twice the U.K. average highlights what a significant problem we face. We need to understand why this is so prevalent and target the cause of the issue. Another challenge is in the area of psycho-active substances, the legal highs. Sadly we have seen the devastating effects that these drugs can have on our families. We need to continue and enhance education programmes so that young people in particular are aware of the dangers of using them. As part of the Ministerial team I would like to work with the new Minister for Health and Social Services as his department drafts a new Mental Health Law. Between the 2 departments we must find suitable alternatives to locking people up when they have episodes of mental health. This practice is recognised as being



inappropriate but it is currently the only solution we have to keep them and the public safe. We must find a place of safety for people experiencing mental health issues. As crime levels have fallen so too has the prison population. The last inspection report was complimentary but there is still room to rethink the way our young prisoners are accommodated and to provide for minority groups. I intend to address these issues. In December 2016 the police will move into a new purpose-built headquarters for the very first time. We also need to find a good home for the Fire and Ambulance Services. I hope that I have illustrated the key priorities and my intention to work hard on behalf of the public as I have done in my previous role. The intention is to reduce crime by continuing to engage with the public on a number of levels and to ensure that our services keep up and are equipped to anticipate the changing trends of modern life. I look forward to joining officers on their various shifts to see what life is like for them on the ground and by working with my fellow Ministers and Assistant Ministers the ultimate goal will be to do what is best for Jersey. **[Approbation]**

**The Bailiff:**

We now come up to 20 minutes questioning of the Deputy of St. Peter. Deputy Tadier.

**6.1.1 Deputy M. Tadier:**

I fully support the comments about mental health issues and the fact that we should not be incarcerating people. We must find a safe place for those to be looked after. Given the fact that the previous incumbent of the role did not manage that job in 6 years how does the postulating candidate think that she may fare better and how to do that in real terms?

**The Deputy of St. Peter:**

The situation has changed in the past 6 years. People are much more aware and the authorities are much more aware of the situation. I think through working collaboratively with the new Minister for Health and Social Services I would certainly be able to find that location. I already have some ideas about where that might be. It might be an existing building. We might be able to design it into the new hospital or part of the mental health facility that will be built as a part of the redevelopment of the hospital.

[16:30]

**6.1.2 Deputy J.A. Martin:**

Can I ask the candidate: I think she said in her opening speech that as Minister she would not have to champion or support front line officers because there is now the Jersey Police Authority to do that? Can she expand on that and explain her understanding of what the Jersey Police Authority is there for because that is not my understanding?

**The Deputy of St. Peter:**

I believe there are some issues over the understanding of what the Police Authority does. I most certainly would like to champion our uniform services and that is what I did say. The Police Authority, I believe, are there to support and assist the Police Force in the operational matters and they will in fact be working with and presenting the annual report shortly. I have looked at other Police Authority reports that have been produced by other areas and it is very clear that those authorities work closely with their forces in assisting them with matters such as producing budgets and how to deal with those.

**6.1.3 Deputy J.A. Martin:**

Supplementary. The Jersey Police Authority, I do not know what authorities the candidate has looked at; the Metropolitan Police Authority is the toughest critic of the Metropolitan Police Force

and they have to jump through hoops to get things through like tasers, like other things that are controversial. The Jersey Police Authority should not and will not, while I am working on it it may not be, but it has never been intended to set up to assist the uniformed officers in Jersey. Could the candidate please expand on her answer?

**The Deputy of St. Peter:**

I quite understand what the questioner is saying. When I mean “assist” I perhaps mean assist in the term that the Scrutiny Panel might assist the police force as the critical friend and I believe a recent example would be the use of the operational cameras that officers are now wearing. That is another issue that the Authority has assisted the force by looking at and deliberating on.

**6.1.4 Deputy M.R. Higgins:**

Will the candidate expand on her statement that she wanted to protect the public on the Island in the online environment on how she will ensure that the police will address these and other issues?

**The Deputy of St. Peter:**

Sorry, did the questioner ask these? To address these? No.

**Deputy M.R. Higgins:**

These issues.

**The Deputy of St. Peter:**

These issues. Yes, we need a cybercrime strategy and we need to make sure that our legislation is up to date and moves with the adapting circumstances of our online environment as well as our community environment.

**6.1.5 Deputy M.R. Higgins:**

Supplementary. The candidate missed what I was getting at. She has mentioned that she wants to protect the public in the online environment. Could you please expand on you mean by that?

**The Bailiff:**

What the Deputy means?

**Deputy M.R. Higgins:**

What the Deputy means on that. What measures do you propose ...

**The Bailiff:**

What she proposes.

**Deputy M.R. Higgins:**

Sorry, I stand corrected, what the Deputy...

**The Deputy of St. Peter:**

Of course. We have a new Cybercrime Unit which has been functioning. It is not that new. It has been there for about 2 years but it is a growing unit in the police force and just yesterday and this morning we were hearing about one of successes of the Cybercrime Unit. This unit uses intelligence and its abilities to crack online crime and that is what I support the continuation of that service.

**6.1.6 Deputy G.P. Southern:**

I too have a read 1,001 days pledge and it is relatively straightforward to agree to absolutely but what it lacks is anything concrete. In the position of Minister for Home Affairs what concrete action does the candidate think she can bring about to offer support in these first 1,001 days?

**The Deputy of St. Peter:**

The lesson we learned from the 1,001 days is that targeting help and assistance to those who need it and getting in and offering early intervention is what we have to do. The Police Force already does this by their community engagement and we have also groups such as Brighter Futures and N.S.P.C.C. on the Island who are here to help and assist us with those families. I believe we ought to carry on our work and target the help where it is most needed.

**6.1.7 Deputy G.P. Southern:**

How does the candidate believe that the police offer assistance to young mothers and their babies during this 1,001 days? Could the candidate illustrate a concrete example of what help is offered?

**The Deputy of St. Peter:**

Perhaps with the mother and her baby it might be that they offer the assistance of another agency that would be more appropriate in that case but perhaps there might be a crime issue within the home environment. I am thinking of domestic abuse where the police are well trained in going into a home environment and assisting a person who is suffering domestic abuse, and it is those families where abuse does occur that we most need to focus our attention and offer the assistance that would fit the early attachment and early intervention priorities.

**6.1.8 Deputy A.D. Lewis:**

In my recent capacity as a member of the Youth Court Panel I had reason to visit the prison to observe how the Youth Detention Centre was working and I was impressed with the new development of the prison. It is working very well. However I was most unimpressed with the way that youth detention was being managed at the prison. It currently sits right above an adult wing. You can hear everything that is said and you can hear the smells, the noise, everything. If that situation still exists what would the prospective Minister wish to do about it?

**The Deputy of St. Peter:**

I have not recently visited the prison and it is one of the first things I would like to do if I was elected Minister. I have read the recent reports of the Prison Inspectorate which took place last year. They were complimentary of the services available for youth offenders but I would sit down with the prison officer and discuss the matter if it is still of concern to the questioner.

**6.1.9 Deputy M.R. Higgins:**

Following on the online questioning: cyberbullying, does the candidate believe that cyberbullying is a problem and what does she propose to do about it?

**The Deputy of St. Peter:**

That would be part of the cyber strategy and it is something that is dealt with by the Cybercrime Unit. That manifests itself in many different ways. I believe that cyberbullying is a problem in our society. It is something that people cannot walk away from because it follows them wherever they go in their daily life whenever they use their smart phone or device and it is difficult to escape. It is something that we need to learn how to assist people so that they can break these habits, not bully people via the internet and we need to support those who find themselves in the position where they are being bullied online.

**6.1.10 Deputy G.P. Southern:**

Would the candidate agree that 26 weeks paid maternity leave funded from Social Security contributions would be in fact a direct and concrete way to support mothers and young children during their first 1,001 days, and which way did she vote on the proposal for 162 days of that 1,001 in the actual debate?

**The Deputy of St. Peter:**

I did vote for the Minister for Health and Social Services' proposal because I believed the Health, Social Security and Housing Scrutiny Panel agreed that it was better to get this policy entrenched in legislation and in the future we will move forward and hopefully be able to offer a greater length of time to mothers and fathers of children. To answer the other part of your question: yes, being able to have that opportunity to bond at home with a child is part of early attachment, most definitely, and we need to look at ways to offer that to parents.

**6.1.11 Deputy G.P. Southern:**

Would the candidate support any fresh proposal to introduce 26 weeks statutory maternity leave in order to deliver concrete support over the 1,001 days initiative in the near future?

**The Deputy of St. Peter:**

It depends what the near future is. That could be an indefinite period, could it not? Not too much in the near future but hopefully with time, as I said in my previous answer, that will become a reality but we have to work with the community, particularly the business community, and make sure that our economy can offer those benefits to people.

**6.1.12 The Connétable of St. Mary:**

Even before I became a Connétable my work on the Education and Home Affairs Scrutiny Panel of the day showed me the value of the Honorary Police to the Island as a whole. Does the candidate share my supporting the Honorary Police system and does she see that the contribution of the force being bolstered in any way?

**The Deputy of St. Peter:**

Very much so. In recent years the relationship between the Honorary Police and the States of Jersey Police has in fact improved greatly and I very much value and support the work that our Honorary Police do around the Island. We are very fortunate in St. Peter to see our numbers rising and I hope that this is a trend in other Parishes and I would be happy to work with Parishes where they do suffer from finding enough volunteers to staff their Honorary Police services because their work is vital and an essential part of Island life.

**6.1.13 The Connétable of St. Ouen:**

Successive Education and Home Affairs Scrutiny Panels over the last 3 years have had concerns over the level of cover and control at the ports - harbours and the airport. There seem to be significant gaps in cover at various times. Would the candidate be prepared to carry out a review of cover at the harbours and airport to ensure the safeguard of entry points into Jersey?

**The Deputy of St. Peter:**

Yes.

**6.1.14 Deputy J.M. Maçon:**

Does the candidate support succession planning within the public sector and can the candidate please outline her stance on training budgets within the department?

**The Deputy of St. Peter:**

This is not an area of my expertise at the moment but something that I will definitely learn about. One thing I do know is that we have a very strong team at Home Affairs. We have a number of excellent chief officers and so are their deputies. I obviously intend to meet all of those people in the coming week if I am successful in this election today. Most importantly we will have, first of all, the issue of the retirement of the chief officer of Home Affairs to deal with and that will be a most important issue to deal with and it will be an absolute priority.

**6.1.15 Deputy J.M. Maçon:**

Supplementary. Can I ask though what is the candidate's position on training budgets within the department? Is this an area which the candidate will give an undertaking to protect those types of budgets within the department?

**The Deputy of St. Peter:**

I do not know the specifics of the training budgets and what is available but I do believe in investing in people and also making sure that there is a good line of succession for all roles.

**6.1.16 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf:**

Having worked with Customs in relation to revenue control I know just how good Customs is in terms of succession planning, training young people and getting through the ranks. Would you not agree that Customs might well prove to be an excellent example of succession planning within her department potentially?

**The Deputy of St. Peter:**

There we are, I thank my colleague for his assistance.

**6.1.17 Deputy A.D. Lewis:**

In the interests of creating economies of scale and more efficiencies in the department would the candidate consider it may be viable to merge, for example, the airport fire service with the town fire service and getting the retained fire service at Les Quennevais to work more closely with airport service and use the resources they have much, much more effectively?

**The Deputy of St. Peter:**

That is an issue that I could not be drawn on now because I lack the knowledge to do so but it is something that would have to be discussed very carefully with the relevant officers and, given the situation with the impending retirement of the chief officer, looking at synergies within the department would be a very important thing to do.

**6.1.18 Deputy M. Tadier:**

The Deputy will no doubt be aware of a constituent of hers who I also know who is wheelchair-bound who suffers from chronic pain and for whom conventional medicine does not do the trick. He would like to be able to use a different form of medication which he and his G.P. deem appropriate but which is currently illegal. Does the Deputy and the potential Minister give an undertaking to tackle this issue head on, and is she sympathetic to the fact that people who are suffering pain should not be criminalised for taking what is essentially a herbal medicine?

**The Deputy of St. Peter:**

I am sympathetic to the plight of this individual but, much like Senator Cameron in her speech, have concerns about the use of this drug. I would however work closely with the Minister for Health and Social Services to see if there is some accommodation that could be made but can hold no promises at this time.

**6.1.19 Deputy M. Tadier:**

Does she acknowledge that the drug - of course we are talking about is cannabis - in the grand scheme of things when studies have been done is much less harmful than things that are currently legal such as tobacco, alcohol, opiates which are currently prescribed which are heroin-based but given to patients freely? All of these things can be purchased by this individual and sufferers like him. Five bottles of vodka, that is perfectly legal, but he is not allowed to grow his own medication at home, is that something that she could comment on perhaps further?

[16:45]

**The Deputy of St. Peter:**

The questioner makes a very good point and it is something that needs to be very carefully thought about and we need to learn more about the area.

**6.1.20 Deputy J.A. Martin:**

There was a Scrutiny recommendation that the Board of Visitors especially to the Y.O.I. (Youth Offenders Institution) were not Jurats and the overall Prison Board could be Jurats but also made up of laypeople. This fell at the last hurdle in the old House because the old Minister for Home Affairs did not support it at the last minute. What is the view of this candidate on who the Board of Visitors should be made up of visiting the prison?

**The Deputy of St. Peter:**

The Board of Visitors in my view should be made up of a comprehensive group of people who reflect different parts of society, sensible people, right thinking people who can make good judgments.

**6.1.21 Deputy M.R. Higgins:**

The States of Jersey Police failed to follow the Data Protection (Jersey) Law with regard to answering subject access requests within 40 days. In fact some have not been answered after one year. They have also refused to correct inaccurate reports and records which have been submitted to the court. What would the candidate do about this unacceptable position?

**The Deputy of St. Peter:**

It sounds like a great level of detail, I am afraid, and also perhaps an operational matter that I would have to be briefed on before I could give a useful response.

**6.1.22 Deputy M. Tadier:**

I have a question relating to current child abuse. It seems that every day or too often, whether it is in the local or national papers, we hear about child abuse taking place often based on online images and so on which seems to be only on the increase. Is there anything in Jersey that the Minister would be willing to undertake to review why this is becoming such a problem and what can be done not simply to tackle the symptoms because we know in the U.K. the police force are saying they simply cannot deal with this level of what is happening but to look at the causes in reality as to why that is such a problem in the Island and elsewhere?

**The Deputy of St. Peter:**

I do not think this is an Island-wide problem. It is more of an international issue looking at the root cause but what I can say, and I referred to in my speech, was that we have a Cybercrime Unit in the Island and they have made a recent success of cracking an international paedophile ring as we learned of the excellent by D.C. (Detective Constable) Forde and his colleagues.

### **6.1.23 Deputy M. Tadier:**

Does the Minister acknowledge that there are things that need to be worked at between the Health Department and Home Affairs in order to crack the underlying issue in this area?

#### **The Deputy of St. Peter:**

The question is perhaps suggesting the cause of this concern. It is not one that I had given any consideration to. If this theory is that it is an underlying health issue then I will most certainly discuss that and work with the Minister for Health and Social Services.

### **6.1.24 The Connétable of St. Martin:**

Would the candidate be prepared to carry out a review of compensation and appeal cases that have occurred in the last 3 years on dismissed members of police staff?

#### **The Deputy of St. Peter:**

I cannot say yes or no to that. I am afraid I would not want to commit myself to carrying out too many reviews before I know the full facts. I would need to learn more about that area.

#### **The Bailiff:**

That brings questions to the Deputy of St. Peter to an end. I will ask her to leave the Chamber and we will ask for Deputy Mézec to be brought back. Yes, Deputy Mézec then, when you are ready. You have up to 10 minutes to address the Assembly.

### **6.2 Deputy S.Y. Mézec:**

I should start by saying a few days ago I was walking home and a constituent approached me and asked if I was going to run for anything today and I said no. On the off chance that he is listening on the radio I apologise to him. Like Deputy Tadier before me this was a last minute decision to run for this simply to ensure that there is a contest here. I understand that some Members, both of this Assembly and the public, are obviously going to find it frustrating that we have these sorts of debates when it looks like the answer is probably a foregone conclusion. I hope Members will understand that the purpose of this is to have a debate so we have an opportunity to draw out the policies that are going to be in place for the next 3½ years in the Home Affairs Department, and most importantly so we are able in future to hold Members to account for what they said on this day so we know what they succeeded on and what they failed on. I hope Members respect the intention behind that. Of course it is not just about this portfolio. It is also about a place on the Council of Ministers, so I will talk more about that after. It would be churlish not to start by paying tribute to the former Senator Ian Le Marquand who has held this position for the past 6 years. **[Approbation]** It is well known that he and I did not always agree. There was one issue in particular where we disagreed very, very strongly but it is a fact simply to point out that the statistics for crime have gone down under his leadership and that is something that all of us should absolutely rejoice in. Living in a safe environment is absolutely fundamental to being free. People must be able to enjoy their lives and pursue their ambitions free of harassment and that should be the absolute top priority for a Home Affairs Department and Minister. The States of Jersey Police Force obviously has a fundamental role to play in this and what has been noticeable over the past few years is the increased presence of Bobbies on the beat. This is something I welcome. I spent time out of Jersey when I was studying and I remember coming back on holidays and it was very noticeable, but what I found is that it did not take any form that was intimidating. I thought it was quite good. It made the police seem more approachable and part of the community because policing, of course, is meant to be by consent and that is the approach we should always have rather than a police presence being about intimidation. Obviously as a St. Helier Deputy in particular I want to make sure that the streets of St. Helier continue to be safe, become even safer if possible;

one area in particular is that in the early hours of the morning on the weekends so that we strike an appropriate balance between people, locals and tourists, being able to enjoy our local nightlife, making sure order is kept and making sure that residents are at ease. I have some ideas on how to move forward with that. I hope that particular point will resonate with some Members of this Assembly, particularly since the general election there are now more faces in here that you might occasionally be likely to run into in the dark depths of Kasbar on a Friday night, and I am one of them obviously. We have recently seen our Police Force recognised by the U.S. for its help in tackling crime. I hope that in the future our high tech and digital skills base expands and develops and that Jersey is able to have better skills in the Island to be able to contribute to tackling high tech crime in an effective way and help other jurisdictions along that. We know that some of the most important ongoing projects are public sector reform and also eGovernment. Of course there is lots of scope for getting more effective and efficient delivery of service, including savings that can be made; things like ending duplication, getting departments talking together better and reducing bureaucracy which is obviously something very important moving forward especially with our difficult situation with public finances. The obvious elephant in the room here is that I am someone who does not necessarily agree with everything the other Ministers who have already been elected and the Chief Minister what they stand for and what they may want to do but I think in the interests of inclusivity it would be important to have somebody who represents an alternative point of view at the table so criticism can be incorporated. So far the entire Chief Minister's slates have been accepted and when we are an island that does represent a vast array of different views, values and perspectives I do not think it is fair for only people from one particular political persuasion to be represented on a Council of Ministers when we do not have a party system. That is not democratic and I would hope that the Assembly would see the value in that point. Two very important points that the Home Affairs Department needs to make progress on are the issues of drugs and cyberbullying. We know drugs are a huge problem in Jersey. The 2 times I have stood for election I have been absolutely amazed when I have been out canvassing just how often you will find alcoholics at very early hours during the day. It is something that is quite distressing to witness. All around the world we are having a debate about what is seen as the perceived failure of the war on drugs. We have to accept that being a small island means that our solutions to the problems caused by drugs are inevitably going to be unique. It will not be the same as if you are dealing with them in a country on a large continent. I think we need to have that discussion. We need to be talking about these points and coming up with a solution that matches our values and our situation as a small island. The impression I got from the previous Minister was that he was held back by what I think were his socially conservative views. Of course, if there is one thing I am not it is socially conservative. I would represent a break from that. I come from the position of someone who perhaps surprisingly, given my appearance and my immersion in the heavy metal subculture, I have never taken drugs before. That includes cannabis, especially when I have been in countries where it is legal to smoke cannabis. I am someone who does not find myself at the opposite end of the spectrum that we have seen previously in terms of being liberal about drugs. I, like everyone else, entirely disapprove of them. I cannot for the life of me understand and figure out how it is beneficial for our community to pursue recreational cannabis users with such rigour when I cannot see any notable benefit from it. Yesterday I briefly spent some time with somebody who Members of this Assembly will become familiar with soon enough, because she is the subject of a States petition, brought by Deputy Tadier to give a licence to possess cannabis. She uses cannabis to counter the symptoms she suffers from due to her quite severe illness. She is not hurting anyone. She is just trying to make her life more bearable for herself. You might think that is mostly a health issue, but it is not. It is also a Home Affairs issue, because she recently had her home raided by the police. Now, I am sorry, but I cannot see how doing that helps this Island in any way, shape or form. It is simply money wasted when we should be saving money. It is a waste of resources and it makes this person, who is vulnerable, quite distressed. I think that that is absolutely wrong. I



think we need to be having a discussion about whether we have the balance right at the moment and in what direction we could move to. Not just about making savings, but about making people's lives better. I think we need that sensible discussion and not take it to the extent of some sort of Russell Brand 'legalise all drugs' attitude, but something that is pragmatic and works for all people. We should be trying to help and rehabilitate addicts, not criminalising them. The other area I want to talk about is cyberbullying. Cyberbullying not only ruins lives, but it often ends lives. With the rise of Facebook and Twitter, it is a pandemic that we absolutely need to deal with. The anonymity and unaccountability that the internet gives people is a toxic combination that can bring out the worst in people who then prey on the vulnerable to get their sick satisfaction. We have seen in the U.K. one person led a Twitter campaign to try and get a woman on the new designed bank notes. For having the temerity to be the wrong gender and having an opinion in public she had people attacking her with rape and murder threats. We have seen police in the U.K. slowly making progress on it. We are regularly reading now about people being jailed for this. I think that is a direction Jersey should absolutely be heading down as well. I do not think we have had the political will, simply because social media is something new and people often do not really understand it. I think it would benefit the Home Affairs Department by having somebody in there who gets social media, simply because I have been brought up with it and I understand the issue of cyberbullying.

[17:00]

One occasion I know is of a pregnant woman, who was ill, persistently threatened by someone who was saying he was going to get her sacked from her job when she had given birth. Something we would all agree is absolutely despicable behaviour. Her husband had real trouble trying to make progress. That is something that has absolutely got to change. One problem we have at the moment is that the department tasked with the cyberbullying law is E.D.D. (Economic Development Department). That is completely and utterly illogical. I would insist that it would be with Home Affairs, so that that department can take a lead on it in future. That is a speech that was written in an hour, last minute, and I look forward to taking questions. Thank you very much.

**[Approbation]**

**The Bailiff:**

Very well. Then we have 20 minutes for questions to the Deputy Mézec. The Connétable of St. Lawrence.

**6.2.1 The Connétable of St. Lawrence:**

I think that was a very good speech from Deputy Mézec. He did not touch on the lack of the Law of Trespass. I would like to ask him to give us his views on the fact that we do not have that.

**Deputy S.Y. Mézec:**

I studied law at university in the U.K. When I would tell people that we did not have a Law of Trespass there it was something that they perceived as being completely barmy. It is quite strange, is it not? Yes, I think that not just in terms of the Law of Trespass, but there are lots of other areas of law in Jersey that could do with having some sort of look into again. We have obviously got our own legal system. We have areas of law which are very different from English Common Law, which is not necessarily a bad thing. I do think that in the modern world we should be open to looking at this. People trespassing on other people's property can cause a huge amount of distress. It is important that it is something that is looked into and that the right of people to enjoy the property they own is protected. So, that is something I would support looking into.

**6.2.2 Deputy M. Tadier:**

Can the candidate talk about the mental health implications for having prisoners either with mental health issues being housed currently as they are at the prison or people who are not criminals, but there is nowhere else for them to go, also being housed in inappropriate conditions?

**Deputy S.Y. Mézec:**

Absolutely. The subject of mental health is one that is, again, very close to my heart because of an experience I have with a family member, who I believe has been let down very badly. Our whole outlook of people with mental health problems, not just in the Home Affairs Department, but in general is very poor at the moment. I think it needs to be completely overhauled. Most people just do not really understand mental illness. There is a perception that people do not have a problem, that they are just weak, which is completely incorrect and is an attitude that has desperately got to change, specifically in terms of where people are housed. It is not right for people to be housed or kept in areas that are unsuitable for somebody in their condition. I think it is something we need to be more sensitive about. The obvious problem there is going to be the resources and whether we have the ability in this difficult time to fund and provide a dedicated place for people in that situation. I think that would be the job of the Minister for Home Affairs to identify what the needs are and then push for the budget to meet those needs. That is what I would be seeking to do.

**6.2.3 Deputy M.R. Higgins:**

The States of Jersey Police have failed to follow the Data Protection (Jersey) Law, with regard to answering subject access requests within 40 days. In fact, some complaints have not been answered after one year. They have also refused to correct inaccurate reports and records which have been submitted to the courts. What would the candidate do about such an unacceptable position?

**Deputy S.Y. Mézec:**

You obviously have to be careful about a politician having day-to-day involvement in particular cases, which is something that has previously been brought up, and I understand the conflict there. If it is true the allegations of people not abiding by the Data Protection Law then that is obviously completely unacceptable. If it can be shown that the evidence is that that is the case then politicians should not be shrugging it off. They should not be not giving answers in the States, which I would guess that Deputy Higgins has felt has been the case previously. It should be something treated seriously. Where there are anomalies in the law where it is not working properly, they have to be looked at seriously. I think just in general, the whole point of the police is that they are meant to be able to tackle problems where people are in danger, where people are being harassed and they should be doing that. The job of the Minister for Home Affairs should be to be giving some sort of oversight and when it is clear that the police are not doing what they are meant to be doing they should be able to be held accountable. The Minister should be open and honest about that, not just shrugging it off.

**6.2.4 Deputy A.D. Lewis:**

I just wondered if the Deputy felt that it was possible for Jersey to have laws relating to, what he calls, recreational drugs, although quite different and out of step with the U.K. and Europe. Does he feel that that is feasible and indeed desirable? Thank you.

**Deputy S.Y. Mézec:**

Yes, I think that is a really important question. I said in my opening speech that I think going down the Russell Brand route of legalising all drugs would be a negative thing, particularly because, as I said, our nature as a small island means we have subsequent problems to that, in terms of smuggling, for example. If we were going to legalise all drugs tomorrow or make drugs like

cannabis readily available the authorities in Saint-Malo and Portsmouth are obviously going to be pretty annoyed with us. You could not blame them for that. In terms of whatever is moving forward there is going to have to be some co-ordination with the U.K. and France. Some of the moves that would potentially be made in terms of drug reform we would have to follow the lead of other jurisdictions. There are certain things I do not think we could take the lead on. In terms of the specific examples I used, I think a good start would be to just not raid people's home when they are using cannabis for medicinal purposes. I think that would be a good start. We could do that without having to worry about what France or the U.K. are going to think. I think that as an immediate step forward is one that could be done, I would hope, reasonably easily; just stop pursuing people who are not doing anyone any harm.

#### **6.2.5 Deputy S. Pinel:**

I agree with the Connétable of St. Lawrence that Deputy Mézec made a very good speech. I was pleased that the Deputy welcomed the increased police presence on the streets. As for the Jersey Field Squadron, which is under the remit of Home Affairs, how does the candidate perceive their future?

#### **Deputy S.Y. Mézec:**

The job of the Minister for Home Affairs should, I think, be to protect whatever services come under his or her oversight and to make sure that where cuts to funding would potentially damage the level of service that they are able to provide, should be opposed. The Minister should obviously always be open-minded in terms of if there is scope for reorganisation of certain services to make them more efficient. I am not going to give any specific examples of something I think that could be done for that particular service, but I would certainly be open-minded in wanting to hear if people think there is a way that that service can be provided more efficiently and effectively. If there are problems with funding to make the Minister aware of it, so that at the Council of Ministers' table he could make the case to the Minister for Treasury and Resources.

#### **6.2.6 Deputy M.R. Higgins:**

Does the candidate believe that the police should investigate themselves or should complaints against them be investigated by an independent police complaints commission?

#### **Deputy S.Y. Mézec:**

Absolutely I believe they should be investigated independently, if there is a need for that. My views in terms of overlaps like that are well known. I do not believe that it is right, especially in small jurisdictions, for places to be investigating themselves, especially when it comes to criminal matters. I think that is completely unacceptable. When, of course, there is a vested interest in coming up with some verdict that is obviously not going to be damning if it needs to be damning, then people who are involved in that should have absolutely no role, should be kept well at arm's length. No, that would be completely inappropriate. It should be an independent body. When it is something fundamental then I think it should even be an outer body from Jersey, somewhere else outside looking in, because then there is no vested interest whatsoever.

#### **6.2.7 Deputy J.A. Hilton:**

I just wanted to ask the candidate what his opinion is on the policy of sentencing prisoners serving two-thirds of a sentence and being released for the final third. In the U.K. I believe they serve half a sentence. I am interested to know whether you agree with that policy, whether it is something you would look at and whether you think it is pitched about right.

#### **Deputy S.Y. Mézec:**

Yes, thank you for that question. When I was studying criminal law we learned that there were objectives for sentencing someone. Those were punishment, rehabilitation, deterring them from committing crimes, deterring the public from copying their crimes and protecting the public. My view is that those 5 purposes of sentencing someone or punishing someone if continuing to punish them is not serving any of those purposes, if someone is genuinely rehabilitated, if someone is genuinely deterred from committing any other crimes, they are not going to be a threat to somebody else. I think it is wrong to arbitrarily keep someone in prison if there is not any benefit from doing that, I would potentially be a bit more open-minded about that. There have to, of course, be exceptions when people have committed very, very serious crimes where, I think, the idea of an arbitrary sentence may well be something that should be considered. Thank you, unless there is a supplementary to elaborate on any of that.

#### **6.2.8 Deputy M.R. Higgins:**

One of the things I find is a problem in Jersey is we continue to penalise those who have done wrong, in fact in many cases for the rest of their lives. I have mentioned it in terms of jobs, where people who have had a conviction cannot get employment in the Island, because of their criminal record. Yet people from outside the Island, who we cannot check on their criminal record, get a job, and may have committed rather heinous crimes. We also have firms who are making the prospective employee go to the police station to get their criminal records so they get around the Rehabilitation Law. What would the candidate do to address the problem with these firms who are making people go and get their records, which will deny them employment, but doing nothing to try and find out about the criminal record for the others?

#### **Deputy S.Y. Mézec:**

I think it would be quite an easy thing to say that I suspect it would be a very, very popular move; probably most Members of the Assembly and the public to say that there should be some sort of criminal record check of people who are coming into the Island. I would be amazed if there was some sort of mass public opinion that thought that would be a bad idea. I think that is right, not just because it is unfair to the employment prospects of locals, but it also contributes to this vicious cycle where somebody can commit a crime, they can go to prison, they can theoretically completely learn their lesson from what they have done and never, ever want to commit a crime again because of their experience. Then they go back into the real world, find they cannot get a job, end up living in nasty conditions, because they have got no money and end up wanting to commit crime again. That is a vicious cycle that absolutely must be broken. That unfairness that has been described about people from outside the Island not being subject to criminal record checks is absolutely absurd. If any employers are trying to get around a rule by trying to send the actual prospective employees themselves to get their record, I do not think that is fair. I think that there should be set procedures for employees to be able to communicate directly with the relevant departments when they need to be able to get that information, rather than sending an employee to do that, which could theoretically be humiliating and demoralising for them at the same time.

#### **6.2.9 The Connétable of St. Lawrence:**

What value does the candidate put on the contribution to the Island of the Honorary Police?

#### **Deputy S.Y. Mézec:**

Immense value, not just in terms of our community and culture, but also in terms of value it brings in terms of cost effectiveness for our States Police. I do not know the numbers off the top of my head, but I have had them told to me before, that if we did not have an Honorary Police, and that function that they undertook had to be then undertaken by paid police, the amount of money it would cost would be absolutely absurd. So, we have to be grateful on that level. We also have to

be grateful for the fact that there are lots of ordinary Island residents who feel strongly about their communities, who want to get out there and contribute, sometimes in all sorts of bad weather, which we may be experiencing over the next few months, unfortunately. You cannot thank these people enough for the work that they do. I am a strong supporter of the Honorary Police system, because I think it brings up so much good in terms of community respect and also the financial savings it brings. How could anyone disagree with that?

**6.2.10 The Connétable of St. Lawrence:**

Supplementary. The Connétables are the head of the Honorary Police in their respective Parishes. If the Deputy was elected to the post of Minister for Home Affairs, what sort of relationship does he think he would have when working with the Connétables?

**Deputy S.Y. Mézec:**

I would hope that despite my well known views and their position in this Assembly, now that that issue has been inclusively put to bed by a referendum I accept that their position in this States is as it is, we have to move forward. I like lots of the Constables on a personal level and I would hope that in that position of Minister for Home Affairs I would be able to have a professional relationship with them. I know that they are all very, very reasonable people, who are in the jobs for the right reason. I am going for the job of Minister for Home Affairs for the right reason. I would hope that when everybody has got the same objective, which is to act in the best interest of the Island, that we could all get on together hopefully.

[17:15]

**6.2.11 Deputy M. Tadier:**

The candidate will be aware that we are currently marking human rights week this week with a series of films, *et cetera*, in the Island. In his position, if he is Minister, would he be willing to recognise the good work of the Jersey Human Rights Group, which has been set up previously by former Deputy Bob Hill, by giving the group a grant of money from the budget of his own department, to be able to carry out its much-needed work in the Island for the promotion and discussion of human rights issues in the Island?

**Deputy S.Y. Mézec:**

Sir, I declare a conflict of interest. As I mentioned previously, I am a member of the Jersey Human Rights Group. I joined it because I had a huge amount of respect for the work it does in trying to bring a solution to human rights issues. There is obviously that aspect of conflict of interest. Trying to be objective about it, I do think that there is a very sound argument that there should be some sort of body, maybe an arrangement similar to what the Jersey Community Relations Trust gets, where public money goes to an organisation that tries to raise awareness about human rights issues, tries to get in experts and speakers from outside, who will come in and look at aspects of Jersey Laws and community and contribute ideas as to how we can improve human rights here. When you bring human rights up some people often think it is just about protecting terrorists from being sent out to nasty countries somewhere else. But it means so much more than that. It can affect people at a very, very basic level, whether it is someone with a guide dog who has been told to leave a restaurant because they do not want an animal in there or do not believe that they should be giving up the room for that. Human rights affect all of us. I do think that is important. I would even go further and say that whether or not I were elected Minister for Home Affairs there are things I want to pursue in the area of Home Affairs in terms of improving information for States Members about the human rights implications of laws when they are brought to the Assembly and in terms of wider public awareness as well. So, yes, that would be something I definitely want to support, regardless of whether I am elected or not.

### **6.2.12 Deputy M. Tadier:**

We still have 3 or 4 minutes, if there is no one else who wants to ask a question: the candidate will be aware that there is much talk of legal highs these days. That is a misnomer, because they are often illegal and they are not necessarily always highs either. Does the candidate acknowledge that in Jersey the 2 legal highs that are the biggest problem for our Island are alcohol and tobacco, both of which are fully supported by our Government and our Treasury, which requires our population to keep on smoking and keep on drinking until they die, in order to pay the revenues for the public services that we all enjoy. Can the candidate explain what action he might take to try and disentangle these 2 conflicting interests for a more coherent home affairs policy?

### **Deputy S.Y. Mézec:**

In my opening speech, of course, I did mention in my campaign the amount of alcoholics I have come across. I am sure other Members of the Assembly will have noticed that as well, when they are knocking on doors, perhaps as early as 11.00 a.m. in the morning and finding people who, because of whatever the circumstances in their life are, feel that the only option they have left to go to is to drink. It is a very, very difficult subject, but I personally do not believe it is right to compare drugs which are already legal to drugs which are illegal. By definition, the solutions to the problems they both cause are going to be different in nature. We have to accept that. I have always, always been a passionate anti-smoker. I have never tried a cigarette in my life. I have seen what it does to people. I have seen what it has done to family members of mine. It is a thoroughly, thoroughly nasty thing. I would one day really like to be in a position where Jersey could declare itself a smoke-free island, by going down routes where people have voluntarily decided that they want to give it up and with government incentives. I am not sure I necessarily buy the argument that Government relies on that expenditure, because we have to remember the health consequences that tobacco and alcohol contribute to. Not just the health implications, but also the social implications. It costs us money in other areas as well. So, whether we would know for definite if the money we raise on tobacco or alcohol duties balances out what is spent on the health service I do not think we can say for sure, but I would not be surprised if it was not. As I said, legal drugs have to have, by definition, a different solution to illegal ones, because the context they find themselves in is different.

### **6.2.13 Deputy M. Tadier:**

The candidate may well be aware that in the past there was a very good Scrutiny report – I thought, even though I was one of the co-authors - which said that it was necessary to stop Jurats automatically being on the Board of Visitors. Does the candidate have any thoughts on that?

### **Deputy S.Y. Mézec:**

I would agree.

### **6.2.14 Deputy M. Tadier:**

A question about domestic abuse, we know that crime has been falling, but domestic abuse is one of those areas which has not been falling. Can the candidate outline what action he might take in that regard?

### **Deputy S.Y. Mézec:**

Could I just clarify for Members that I do not know these questions before he is asking me them. **[Laughter]** Just by being party colleagues they are a complete surprise. In terms of the rise of domestic abuse that is absolutely horrific. I think that people who use violence against other people I think is an absolutely monstrous thing to do. I have always been anti-violence my whole life, despite the fact I did karate for 10 years. I think that we need more ... is that the last one?

**The Bailiff:**

Questions have come to an end, yes, Deputy. We will ask for the Deputy of St. Peter to be brought back to the Chamber.

**CONTINUATION OF MEETING BEYOND 5:30 P.M.**

**Senator P.F. Routier:**

Sir, while we are waiting for the candidate to come back, could I just test the mood of the Assembly? We have quite a few other nominations to be made and positions to be filled. I just wondered whether Members would consider how we are going to deal with that and perhaps even consider staying and perhaps taking one more this evening. Just to try and help us with our agenda. It is just a proposition I would like to suggest.

**The Bailiff:**

Do you wish to formally propose that, Senator?

**Senator P.F. Routier:**

Yes, I do, Sir.

**The Bailiff:**

Does anyone second it? **[Seconded]** Does anyone wish to say anything about it?

**Deputy M.R. Higgins:**

Yes, Sir, if I may. Obviously the funeral today, which resulted in Members leaving for over an hour, which cost us time, was unexpected. But, many of us have arrangements outside the States this evening. We have not, obviously, allowed for it. I would ask we start afresh tomorrow morning and work perhaps speedier through it.

**The Bailiff:**

Very well.

**Senator I.J. Gorst:**

If I could perhaps comment? It is for the Assembly to decide, but when I look at the arrangements that we need to complete for Ministerial positions, for chairmen of Scrutiny Panels, for a chairman of P.P.C. (Privileges and Procedures Committee), chairman of the Jersey Overseas Aid Commission, we know that some of those are going to be contested. We know that at least one Ministerial position is going to have a 3-way contest. If we do not stay this evening - I accept the view of the Assembly - then we really do need to consider whether we ought to be staying tomorrow evening, because we do need to complete them prior to Tuesday. We know that we have a very distinguished visitor coming on Monday. Ministers and Members of the Assembly have meetings with that visitor. So, we do need to try and find a solution.

**The Bailiff:**

Very well. The proposition before the Assembly is to stay on to do one more Minister. Do you ask for the appel? The appel is asked for then. If you wish to stay on to do one more Minister you vote P, if you do not you vote C, contre. The Greffier will open the voting.

<b>POUR: 34</b>		<b>CONTRE: 11</b>		<b>ABSTAIN: 0</b>
Senator P.F. Routier		Connétable of St. Clement		
Senator P.F.C. Ozouf		Connétable of St. Mary		
Senator A.J.H. Maclean		Connétable of St. Martin		

Senator I.J. Gorst		Deputy G.P. Southern (H)		
Senator L.J. Farnham		Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)		
Senator P.M. Bailhache		Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)		
Senator A.K.F. Green		Deputy M. Tadier (B)		
Connétable of St. Helier		Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)		
Connétable of St. Peter		Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)		
Connétable of St. Lawrence		Deputy S.Y. Mézec (H)		
Connétable of St. Ouen		Deputy P.D. McLinton (S)		
Connétable of St. Brelade				
Connétable of Grouville				
Connétable of St. John				
Connétable of Trinity				
Deputy J.A. Martin (H)				
Deputy of Grouville				
Deputy E.J. Noel (L)				
Deputy of St. John				
Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)				
Deputy of St. Martin				
Deputy R.G. Bryans (H)				
Deputy of St. Peter				
Deputy R.J. Rondel (H)				
Deputy A.D. Lewis (H)				
Deputy of St. Ouen				
Deputy L.M.C. Doublet (S)				
Deputy R. Labey (H)				
Deputy S.M. Wickenden (H)				
Deputy S.M. Bree (C)				
Deputy M.J. Norton (B)				
Deputy T.A. McDonald (S)				
Deputy of St. Mary				
Deputy G.J. Truscott (B)				

**The Bailiff:**

I think the Deputy of St. Peter is returned. Therefore, we come to the vote for the Minister for Home Affairs. If you want to vote for the Deputy of St. Peter, you vote P. If you wish to vote for Deputy Mézec you vote C. The Greffier will open the voting.

<b>Deputy of St. Peter: 39</b>	<b>Deputy S.Y. Mézec: 7</b>	<b>Abstain: 0</b>
Senator P.F. Routier	Deputy J.A. Martin (H)	
Senator P.F.C. Ozouf	Deputy G.P. Southern (H)	
Senator A.J.H. Maclean	Deputy M. Tadier (B)	
Senator I.J. Gorst	Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)	
Senator L.J. Farnham	Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)	
Senator P.M. Bailhache	Deputy S.Y. Mézec (H)	
Senator A.K.F. Green	Deputy L.M.C. Doublet (S)	
Connétable of St. Helier		
Connétable of St. Clement		
Connétable of St. Peter		
Connétable of St. Lawrence		
Connétable of St. Mary		
Connétable of St. Ouen		
Connétable of St. Brelade		
Connétable of St. Martin		



Connétable of Grouville				
Connétable of St. John				
Connétable of Trinity				
Deputy of Grouville				
Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)				
Deputy of Trinity				
Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)				
Deputy E.J. Noel (L)				
Deputy of St. John				
Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)				
Deputy of St. Martin				
Deputy R.G. Bryans (H)				
Deputy of St. Peter				
Deputy R.J. Rondel (H)				
Deputy A.D. Lewis (H)				
Deputy of St. Ouen				
Deputy R. Labey (H)				
Deputy S.M. Wickenden (H)				
Deputy S.M. Bree (C)				
Deputy M.J. Norton (B)				
Deputy T.A. McDonald (S)				
Deputy of St. Mary				
Deputy G.J. Truscott (B)				
Deputy P.D. McLinton (S)				

**The Bailiff:**

Very well. I declare then the Deputy of St. Peter is elected as Minister for Home Affairs.

**[Approbation]**

**Deputy S.Y. Mézec:**

Could I just congratulate the Deputy of St. Peter. I hope she does a brilliant job. I am looking forward to seeing what she can offer. Thank you.

**The Bailiff:**

Very well. Chief Minister, do you wish to make your next proposition?

**7. The Minister for Economic Development**

**Senator I.J. Gorst:**

If I may, I would like to propose for the office of Minister for Economic Development, Senator Farnham.

**The Bailiff:**

Is that seconded? **[Seconded]** Any other nominations? No?

**Deputy S.M. Bree:**

Yes, Sir. I propose Deputy Andrew Lewis.

**The Bailiff:**

Is that seconded? **[Seconded]** Any other nominations? Very well. We have 2 nominations. I ask Deputy Andrew Lewis to withdraw from the Assembly.

## **The Bailiff:**

So then I invite Senator Farnham to address the Assembly for up to 10 minutes.

### **7.1 Senator L.J. Farnham:**

Can I start by saying I am extremely grateful to have received the Chief Minister's nomination for this position. I am pleased to ask the States for their approval during this important process of electing and appointing Ministers; and I am pleased that so far there have been contestable positions. I apologise to those Members who already know this, but I start for the benefit of those who do not know a little bit about my background. I was first elected to the States in 1999 as a Deputy for St. Saviour No. 2 District and I was returned in 2002 but stepped down in 2005 to focus on my family and business commitments. I was born and educated in Jersey, attending St. George's, Les Quennevais and Hautlieu schools. Upon completion of my education I moved to London after being selected for the then prestigious Harrods' Retail Training Scheme, attending the college while at the same time attending the London College for the Distributive Trades, and I spent 4 very informative years in the U.K. Since then I have been fortunate enough to enjoy a business career that has been both challenging and rewarding. I have a very solid and longstanding experience of local commerce and the economy as well as overseas economies and international markets. Working with small, medium and large companies, my experience extends from wholesale and retail to hospitality and leisure, to finance, property and online commercial activity. In 2011 I relinquished the vast majority of my business interests and commitments in order to return to politics and was subsequently elected Senator, being returned very recently together with most Members here today. At this stage I just wanted to remind Members that I am still a director of a local hotel. Although I am no longer a shareholder I do have a small financial interest and I work for the business on a consultancy basis. I just wanted to be absolutely clear that Members understood this. During my 9 years as a States Member I have gained a wealth of experience both broad and varied. I have served on the Tourism Committee, the Industries Committee and as Vice-President of both the Harbours and Airport and Economic Development Committees. I was also president of the Gambling Control Committee, and I mention these particularly because all of these positions are relevant to and have provided invaluable experience for the role for which I have now been nominated. It is time to put economic prosperity back to the top of the agenda, not least because in real terms in 2012 and 2013, notwithstanding the very good news that the economy has levelled-off slightly, our G.V.A. (Gross Value Added) was at its lowest level since 1998. It is time once again to really get behind the traditional industries of tourism and agriculture and ensure that they are properly resourced and re-established so they can once again become the important pillars of our economy that they once were. If appointed I will ensure that the Visit Jersey Board is fully established and properly resourced so it can quickly get on with the job of delivering more visitors to us on a year-round basis. We can be in no doubt that following the success and legacies of the London Olympics and Glasgow Commonwealth Games that sport and culture, as well as being essential to the health and wellbeing of our society, are now major economic contributors.

[17:30]

If appointed I will seek to establish a new sports conference and events body to develop Jersey as a leading venue for sports, festivals, conferences and event-led tourism. We must be serious about economic diversity. Economic diversity helps to defeat economic decline and offer new opportunities in employment, skills and the availability of goods and services. If appointed I will ensure investment in emerging industries and small business start-ups by fully utilising innovation and development funding and support. There is no point in having money sitting there doing nothing. Let us put it to good use. I will also demand a complete red tape review to lower the costs, barriers and hurdles for businesses wishing to start-up and grow, and for existing businesses wishing to develop. I am mindful of the cost of doing business in Jersey work that is currently

taking place. I understand that in reality economic performance is somewhat dependant on the Treasury's fiscal policies, particularly in relation to budgeting and the setting of levels of taxation. I will seek to ensure that a new partnership is established between the Treasury and the Economic Development Department and any other relevant department to ensure a vital and productive flow of ideas, and that the appropriate level of influence exists between the departments; and I have to say that I am very much looking forward to working with the new Minister for Treasury and Resources, Senator Maclean, and Senator Ozouf with his new responsibility for Financial Services and Technology. My aims are straightforward. My aims are to return the economy to growth while creating jobs and opportunities. A growing economy will benefit us all. A growing economy will deliver lower unemployment because with higher output businesses tend to employ more workers, creating more employment. A growing economy will deliver stronger States finances. Economic growth creates higher tax revenues and there is less need to spend money on benefits. Therefore economic growth helps to improve States finances. Economic growth will deliver improved public services because with increased tax revenues the States can invest more on health and education and other essential services. A growing economy will mean that more money can be spent on sports and leisure facilities and protecting the environment. A growing economy will deliver investment. Economic growth encourages new investment into the local economy and therefore encourages a worthy cycle of economic growth. I am keen, especially keen, to ensure that as much of the Jersey pound stays in the Jersey economy as possible because that is good for jobs, it is good for business and it is good for Jersey. As the U.K. and many European countries make cautious progress towards economic recovery, I believe Jersey is very well placed to follow. The previous Minister and his team have left strong foundations to build upon which, combined with our strong fiscal position, presents some unique opportunities. But there is a lot of work to do and I am going to review the existing structure in the lines of communication because a new Economic Development Department has a big job. It will bring together responsibility for tourism, retail, sport, culture, gambling and the lottery, air and sea links, farming, the rural economy, business development and inward investment in order to attract new visitors and businesses and to encourage more participation in our economy and in our community. I hope therefore to be able to seize this opportunity to provide the leadership, motivation and determination to bring together a new reorganised Economic Development Department, together with the policies that will deliver the results our Island so sorely deserves and needs. The States as a whole will also have to decide whether it is prepared to make some bold decisions, decisions that will deliver investment in our key industries to provide the economic infrastructure on which to build our future prosperity. To that end I am greatly encouraged by the calibre and zeal of the new intake class of 2014 States Members, many of whom I know or have met recently, and I am very much looking forward to working with them over the course of the next 3½ years. To conclude, I stand before Members as one of their Senators having won an Island-wide mandate on a manifesto which clearly set out my aims and objectives in relation to the economy and my intention to seek the position as Minister for Economic Development. I do hope therefore that the Assembly will endorse the electorate's decision and support my nomination for this extremely important position. Thank you, and I look forward to answering Members' questions.

**The Bailiff:**

Very well. So we now have up to 20 minutes for questions to Senator Farnham. Deputy Southern.

**7.1.1 Deputy G.P. Southern:**

It is very pleasant to revisit the platitudes that came out in the Senatorial elections again - not. However what we are after is concrete initiatives, not platitudes. So the first question specifically is will he bring forward whatever investment is required to deliver a new, vibrant Fort Regent or not?

**Senator L.J. Farnham:**

Members will know I have been a constant critic of the lack of action over the development of Fort Regent and a champion of event-led tourism. It is absolutely imperative that Fort Regent is developed and I hope to be able to persuade the Minister for Treasury and Resources and the new Minister for T.T.S. and Infrastructure that investing in Fort Regent is absolutely vitally important.

**7.1.2 Deputy G.P. Southern:**

So: "I hope to be able to persuade" - this is what happens when there are 49 individuals in a department. They always have a bolt hole: "I will seek to persuade the Minister for Treasury and Resources." Come on. Insist; say you have a commitment to delivering whatever is required to do something about Fort Regent instead of just this vague: "Oh, yes, maybe".

**Senator L.J. Farnham:**

Unfortunately I do not sign the cheque and being realistic it is about working as a team and persuading people that you know, we work together and deliver the right ideas. So regrettably I cannot just sign a cheque and meet Deputy Southern's wish unfortunately; I am being realistic.

**7.1.3 The Connétable of St. Lawrence:**

A small business in my Parish has regrettably had to lay off staff because of competition from the grey economy. How does the candidate intend to address this as we know it is affecting many small local businesses?

**Senator L.J. Farnham:**

That is a very good question. There is no short answer to it, I am afraid. We have to get behind the local economy, the local towns and villages and the High Street and give them as much support as we possibly can. They are having enough outside of the grey economy. There is the online economy which is providing huge competition. But I think we need to do more. I am particularly keen to see that some of the latest initiatives coming from small towns in the U.K. which are supporting small business; having Small Business Week. As I say, there is no quick answer. I will do whatever I can to make sure small businesses and medium-sized business can continue to survive and prosper.

**7.1.4 The Connétable of St. Lawrence:**

I wonder how the candidate would work with the Chief Minister's Department to police this because clearly it comes under the remit of the Chief Minister because clearly we are talking about immigration.

**Senator L.J. Farnham:**

We absolutely have to make sure that we only let into the Island people that are needed to help business and that they are going to provide a positive benefit to the Island. Now we have made a start. The introduction of a proper immigration policy is absolutely essential, but when we do that we have to make sure we get it right and I am absolutely committed to working with the Chief Minister's Department to ensure that we get the right balance and get it right.

**7.1.5 Deputy S.Y. Mézec:**

To what degree is the candidate's model for economic growth predicated on population growth? How does he reconcile that with the fact we have been having population growth for years and years now while our income tax receipts have been going down? How does he justify it being good for the economy to create all of these low paid, low skilled jobs?

**Senator L.J. Farnham:**

The Deputy is jumping to conclusions. I am not talking about low-paid, low-skilled jobs, and I do not really like that description. There is no difference between somebody that we would class as high value or low value. I think people working in the economy all deserve equal recognition. But I wanted to touch briefly anyway on this population and dispel the myth that economic growth leads to excessive population growth. It does not. We all know that the population is going to increase. It is unrealistic to think otherwise. There are more births than deaths and we are all going to live longer, I hope. So we need to plan for sustainable growth which, if carefully and consistently managed in line with an economic policy, will not only assist us but be essential to us in developing as an economy in the community. But if we do this then massive scaremongering about massive population growth really is a myth.

#### **7.1.6 The Connétable of Grouville:**

The Chief Minister's current proposal is to separate agriculture and fisheries, with agriculture going to the Ministry for Economic Development and fisheries going to the Ministry for the Environment. Does the candidate think that this makes sense when they are both currently serviced together, albeit with budgets coming from those 2 different departments?

#### **Senator L.J. Farnham:**

I have not really had time to give the matter full consideration. I must say that it did make sense for both areas to be closely aligned and I still think they can be closely aligned. I have spoken also to Deputy Labey, who was the former Assistant Minister with responsibility for it, who also has views. So there are a number of different views and I think we need to sit down and just make sure we are absolutely clear about how the separation is going to work, bearing in mind the 2 are invincibly linked in many areas.

#### **7.1.7 Deputy S.N. Wickenden of St. Helier:**

Currently the Innovation Fund, the lead time to get funds or an agreement on whether they get funds or not is 6 months. Now in this current climate in additional industry 6 months is too late. What would you do to try and reduce the time to get money out of the Fund so we can get businesses started? **[Approbation]**

#### **Senator L.J. Farnham:**

That is a very good question and I have been frustrated at the funding or lack of funding. I mean, the Tourism Development Fund, that is perhaps for another question another day, but the Innovation Fund really has just sprung into action. There has been some activity in the last few months and I understand, although some of these requests have been taking months, the last one was done in a matter of weeks. I think they are getting the message. If they are not getting the message, I will make sure they will because the idea of innovation funding is to be quick, especially in the technological age now where the start-ups are needing funding quickly.

#### **7.1.8 Deputy M.R. Higgins:**

How will the candidate deal with his colleagues and the civil servants in the Economic Development Department who do not believe in tourism and especially an event-led tourism and who want high productivity, low footprint business instead?

#### **Senator L.J. Farnham:**

I would be surprised if there was such a civil servant because in my experience with Economic Development I think it needs reorganising and restructuring and more focus. But I am convinced that the majority of the officers there are on-side. But they will be if they are not.

#### **7.1.9 Deputy M.J. Norton:**

Knowing the candidate's championing of Fort Regent and knowing his very public calls for a 50-metre swimming pool, I wonder if he could explain why he would want a 50-metre pool?

**Senator L.J. Farnham:**

If we look at sports and event-led tourism and the opportunity for such sports, and I am looking across at my good friend and colleague, the Constable of St. Brelade who almost swam round the Island recently, 50 metres would not be much good to him; I know that much. I think it is about realising opportunities. We have to be bold; we have to invest in some infrastructure. We currently have 4 25-metre pools and a plan for a fifth 25-metre pool. A 50-metre pool is not just one 50-metre pool. It is slightly longer, boomed in the middle. So 90 per cent of the time it is used as 2 25-metre pools for leisure and lane swimming and then converted to 50 metres for international competitions. I think it gives us great opportunity because we have a huge catchment area of the other Channel Islands, Brittany and Normandy and the U.K. for bringing over competition.

[17:45]

So I would, instead of 5 25-metre pools in different locations, I would like to see maybe 2 or perhaps 3 25-metre pools and a 50-metre pool, and perhaps it is time to look at relinquishing or realising the value in the site that is currently occupied by Aquasplash and using those funds to create a brand new world-class facility.

**7.1.10 Deputy M. Tadier:**

Is the candidate supportive of a new art centre/gallery exhibition space, and if so where would it go and what funding or support could his department give to that?

**Senator L.J. Farnham:**

In principle I am in favour of that sort of space. I think the idea is something that Senator Bailhache has championed, I believe, when he was a Bailiff. The idea of our own national gallery is a good idea. Unfortunately I do not have enough information at hand really to answer your question fully, but it will certainly be relatively high on the agenda because I think there is huge not only cultural potential but, as I said before, culture is an important economic driver and we need to make sure we start realising some of those opportunities.

**7.1.11 Deputy R. Labey:**

In a department that has already been nicknamed Leisure and Pleasure, agriculture I fear does not necessarily sit comfortably in that and I just wonder how that is going to play with farmers because farming at the moment is for many of them neither leisure nor a pleasure. I would just implore the Minister, if elected, to be proactive and go up there and talk to farmers and listen to them. My other worry is when the words "sport and culture" are lumped together. It is a bit like multipurpose sports hall. The culture side, the art side are always going to lose out and culture is under-funded as compared with sports in the Island. The access to culture is enshrined in the European Convention of Human Rights; people's right to culture is in Article 67 which I must confess Deputy Tadier let me know about. I worry that culture is slipping behind in this Island.

**The Bailiff:**

Deputy, I am sorry. Can you come to your question?

**Deputy R. Labey:**

Yes, I am so sorry. What comfort can the candidate give me?

**Senator L.J. Farnham:**

I was just enjoying letting the Deputy carry on there. Look, sport and culture are 2 completely different and separately very important areas, and I certainly do not intend to use those words in the same breath very often. They are very separate and important issues. In relation to farming, I have made it my business to speak to a number of farmers recently and other interested parties at a fairly high level. We have for Jersey created a Visit Jersey Board which is essentially the job of marketing Jersey for tourism run by people involved in the business. I think we need to put some more of the agricultural quality. We need to bring in more of the agricultural community, perhaps on a separate committee with States Members to put them in control of their own policies a little bit more. But I can certainly commit to being as enthusiastic about sporting, agriculture as I am with tourism and all the other areas of the economy.

**7.1.12 The Deputy of St. Peter:**

Staying with the agricultural theme, organic farmers have recently had their funding reduced. Would the candidate be prepared to reverse that decision or if not, how would the candidate maintain the presence of organic producers in the Island?

**Senator L.J. Farnham:**

That is another issue I need a little bit of time to consider, but in principle the answer is yes. I think a lot of money has been invested in creating these organic farms. It seems rather pointless just to let them drift away or drift back into traditional farming methods. So in principle yes, but I need to get more information.

**7.1.13 Senator P.F. Routier:**

Could the Senator give me some idea of how he would set out to provide the emphasis to sport in the department? How he would go about doing that; and perhaps explain how the provision for cadets, improvers and through to elite sports people would be dealt with as well.

**Senator L.J. Farnham:**

Let me look at sport. I do not envisage an Economic Development Department where we have a team of Economic Development officers managing all of these different portfolios. I said before, I am absolutely keen for them to have their own identities and their own champions. It is imperative with sport as well once we recognise that in Jersey there are a number of our very good sportsmen and women seem to get to a level and then there is nowhere to go. So I would like to see a sports ambassadorial scheme developed which would provide some seed funding for some of our very good amateur sportsmen, just to help them, give them that bit of an extra boost and credibility, so then they can go out as a sports ambassador for Jersey and work for Jersey and represent Jersey and promote Jersey when they are away. But I think it will also help them to gain commercial sponsorship being made an official sports ambassador. But we must not be all about elitist; we must make sure all sports as far as possible are available to the whole community.

**7.1.14 Senator P.F. Routier:**

Supplementary. Could the Senator give any indication of how he would deliver that? Would he be taking on that responsibility himself or delegating it to an Assistant Minister?

**Senator L.J. Farnham:**

I think sport needs a separate champion to help its own identity. It is something that needs considering, but I had one very good candidate in mind that is likely to be delegated to an Assistant Minister at this stage. But there is a lot to talk about and we need to get round the table and discuss all the opportunities.

**7.1.15 Connétable C.H. Taylor of St. John:**

Following the recent proposed separation from Economic Development of the tourism industry to Visit Jersey, can the candidate give assurance that he will explore and debate with the industry the initiative of a Farm Jersey initiative so that we can have something run by farmers, by professionals for their own industry?

**Senator L.J. Farnham:**

Yes, absolutely. I did allude to that as being one of the possibilities and a subject that had come up in discussions with other members of the agricultural community. I think it is an interesting idea that has potential. I will undertake to follow it up.

**7.1.16 Deputy S.M. Bree of St. Clement:**

The candidate mentioned in his speech encouraging inward investment into the Island. Other than tourism, he does not really seem to have come up with any other options that are viable. Perhaps he could expand on what he means by inward investment?

**Senator L.J. Farnham:**

We need to make sure we have created an economy that is attractive to investors, whether they are local investors or people wanting to come in and invest in new business. Tourism aside, while our economy has been falling or is stagnant we are not a very attractive proposal. So my aims, as I said in my speech, are straightforward. It is to generate economic growth and that is ensuring that we give the right support to small businesses, to business start-ups and existing businesses by helping them to develop. An important part of doing that is understanding the cost of business and reducing it and reducing the amount of red tape and opening up the gateways to start business and encourage new investment.

**7.1.17 Deputy S.M. Bree:**

Supplemental, please. Basically you have spoken about the businesses that already exist in the Island and encouraging those, and encouraging Islanders possibly to start their own businesses. If we follow what the economists are saying and we are seeing a global shrinkage of the finance industry, what incentives or action are you going to take to encourage external business or new business into the Island?

**The Bailiff:**

Deputy Bree, I just remind you as a new Member: “What is the Minister going to do”, not: “What are you going to do?” Oh, it is not the Minister: “What is the candidate going to do?”

**Senator L.J. Farnham:**

First of all I believe in the finance industry. I believe that although we know the G.V.A. related to the finance industry was about a third less than it was in 2008, I believe that is changing and I believe it is going to grow; and I am encouraged that we are going to have another Member whether in a Ministerial or Assistant Ministerial role focusing on promoting our financial services and our technology and digital industries on a global scale. I think that is going to present us with some tremendous opportunities. I just want to make sure that in Jersey we have lowered the hurdle for business; we have lowered the barriers; we have lowered the cost. It should be easy to start a business. It should be one form, not 15 to fill in. I will do whatever I can to reduce the red tape, make it easier for people to start their own businesses.

**7.1.18 Deputy J.A. Martin:**

Very quickly, no soliciting on the radio, or as they once said, on the black and white TV and the pink boys behind the black ball. The candidate keeps pointing to the Constable of St. Brelade as



the sports champion. Will he just not come out and say: “This is the candidate who is going to be the champion for sport”?

**Senator L.J. Farnham:**

If I get the job I will make the announcement very promptly.

**The Bailiff:**

Very well. Any other questions in the time that remains? Yes, Deputy Southern. I had seen you first.

**Deputy G.P. Southern:**

Trying to get one in. Rope a dope, that is what that is.

**The Bailiff:**

Very well. Then I will ask Senator Farnham to withdraw and we will ask for Deputy Andrew Lewis to return. So, Deputy Lewis, when you are ready to start, you have 10 minutes to address the Assembly.

**7.2 Deputy A.D. Lewis:**

Anyone looking at Jersey from the outside can see from just a cursory glance that our economy punches well above its weight. That said, it faces challenges on a number of fronts, the greatest of which is the ongoing pressures being placed on our finance sector by other countries and supranational organisations. The most effective response to such pressures is to diversify our economy. This will not be achieved overnight and will require a dedicated, strategic approach. It must never be forgotten that the economy is about people; the Islanders we serve, whom we must encourage to take part in what is an exciting project to build a stronger, more dynamic economy that provides opportunities for all. Having wide-ranging experience of Jersey’s economy and doing business in the Island is, I believe, an important qualification for a prospective Minister for Economic Development. I have worked hard as an entrepreneur for most of my working life, building and growing a business that employs Islanders and contributes to Jersey’s economy. I am sorry to say that my business, as with many others, succeeded not because of Government but in spite of Government. This is a situation which I passionately believe must change and evidence suggests it already is beginning to change. Jersey has always had a fantastic enterprise culture. The proof of it can be seen in the fact that of Jersey’s 7,000 businesses, the majority employ fewer than 5 people. One of the roles of Government must be to encourage enterprise, to act as a facilitator of economic success by creating the right conditions in which business can thrive. So why is this important? Well, if we wish to continue to maintain high levels of public services, then businesses must grow to generate the income that we need to supply those services. To do this, a business needs 3 main ingredients: a highly skilled and educated workforce, access to capital, and access to land. Unlike other successful economies, we have few natural resources other than limited land that is available. However, what we do have is a vibrant and capable workforce and, as I have said, the economy is about people. We must nurture Jersey’s workforce, giving Islanders every opportunity to make the most of their working lives by enabling them to train and retrain so people have the opportunity to be flexible in terms of their careers because flexibility is not a nice to have, it is a crucial component of any modern economy.

[18:00]

Equally, we must ensure that our school leavers are properly equipped to enter Jersey’s workforce. If elected, I will work closely with the Education Department to align our education system with the needs of our economy. However, in a small economy, it will not always be possible to provide all the skills and talent required. Therefore, to ensure that we are attractive to investors and

international entrepreneurs, we must offer a welcoming environment that judges people on the expertise they bring and ensure that they pass that knowledge and skill on to our indigenous workforce. Our low tax environment already provides a strong incentive to entrepreneurs and businesses to locate here but this is not enough. We can see in the digital sector that there needs to be more in place, whether that is skills base, access to business funding or other incentives. It is the Minister for Economic Development's role to ensure that Jersey offers the right packages to attract the right people and the right businesses. So what are the right businesses? These can be characterised as being high yield and low impact. This is a mantra that we have all heard many times before but I caution tiring of it. Jersey's small size, lack of natural resources and sensitivity to population growth means that this is an area that we must target. While this is a difficult task, the value of success should not be underestimated. Already, because of the success of Locate Jersey, we have attracted multinational companies who have headquartered in Jersey and now employ local people and have made significant contributions to our economy. We must build on this success but this is just a start. Imagine what we could achieve if we promoted Jersey's assets on a truly global scale. I believe that we can attract a Google or a Microsoft, a Yahoo or a Facebook to Jersey. Those who disagree need only look as far as Malta for proof of that. Given the right conditions, the businesses will come. How has Malta succeeded? Well, they have created the right environment. They have invested highly in technology and skills training for the entire population. They provided incentives for skills development and they have even managed to solve the problem of the brain drain by encouraging their brightest students to study abroad, while giving them reasons to come back home. We must do the same here. As well as attracting new businesses of value to Jersey, it is just as important to create the environment in which Islanders can start businesses and grow them successfully. Entrepreneurship is, I believe, the driving force of our economy. If elected, I will be dedicated to ensuring that starting new business is an attractive option for Islanders, rather than a struggle. Time and again I am told by Jersey's businessmen and women that they fear increasing the size of their workforce because they think they will become a burden by bureaucracy or litigated against for not following correct H.R. (Human Resources) procedures. They need to be shown how to get it right. We must make sure that these fears are addressed and that entrepreneurship is seen as a genuinely appealing career choice. The economy is about people and a balance needs to be struck between protecting the rights of employees and freeing businesses to do what they do best, which is growing Jersey's economy. With this in mind, I will support a review of the zero hours contract that looks into measures to safeguard any threat of abuse of such contracts. Companies must understand that tools like this can be useful for employees and employers but they are only useful if they are not abused. It does not help our economy to keep people guessing as to whether they will have work today or tomorrow. In my view, the role of Government is to ensure that a good tool is not blunted by misuse. Equally, I believe our economy will be improved by the removal of discrimination in the work place. I also believe that the minimum wage should be a living wage. This is an essential economy tool that ensures people are paid enough to be economic contributors. Such issues are about balance and, if appointed, I will listen to the concerns of business and I would act where the balance was perceived as being lost. The economy is there to improve our lives; it is not just there to increase profits. I have run a marketing business for many years. I have worked with companies right across the economic spectrum. I strongly believe that this is an all-round understanding of different business sectors that will greatly assist me in undertaking the role of Minister for Economic Development. But in order for Members to fully evaluate my candidacy, you are entitled to expect to know a little more about my credentials. I possess a Business Studies qualification with marketing and tourism. I am a past chairman of the Institute of Directors. I have been an Assistant Minister and a Minister. I have both private and public sector experience. I have built one of the Channel Islands' largest design, marketing and digital agencies from scratch and now offices in Jersey, Guernsey and Gibraltar. I have helped develop and remain a shareholder in one of the U.K.'s largest online

beauty, perfume, eCommerce platforms, employing over 120 staff in the Channel Islands. I have participated in development of online businesses in emerging markets. I have experienced the development of commercial property as an active investor and a project manager. I have worked in the travel and tourism sector, in aviation, corporate jet sales and charter as well as luxury yacht management and charter. I also possess experience in launching new airline routes, including 2 premium class products. I have significant experience in corporate communications, both on- and off-line including reputation management and crisis P.R. (Public Relations). As you are now aware, tourism features strongly in my C.V. (Curriculum Vitae). This sector is a key element of Jersey's economy but one of which struggled over the last decade. There is no doubt that tourism continues to have great potential and I believe that the move to include Sports and Culture within E.D.D. is a wise one that will help the Island to move further into event-led tourism. It is, however, important that we all understand that greater success in the tourism industry will not be easy. It is going to take hard work for the Minister for Economic Development and Visit Jersey. But this year, numbers are up and I want to work with the industry to ensure that this trend is continued. Although making a smaller contribution to G.V.A., agriculture and fisheries is a pillar to our economy, which must be protected and enhanced. Our farmers are not only custodians to our countryside but play an important role in our economy. I believe that we can build further on recent export success. The knock-on effect on Brand Jersey should not be underestimated. I have spoken much about diversification. We must not forget that the finance industry is the engine room of our economy. We must make sure the engine is kept in good running order. For continued diversification, this sector also is critical and should be encouraged and our high standards of regulation must be maintained. Finally, I would like to say that if elected, I would champion innovative thinking. Not only does this go hand in hand with our fledgling digital sector but if we are willing to think outside the box, Jersey could emulate small jurisdictions such as Estonia, Gibraltar and Malta. I will leave you with just one final thought. Take a look at Estonia's new eResidency concept. This has the potential to massively grow their economy without adding a single person to their population. It is this kind of innovation that will develop Jersey into a society powered by a dynamic 21st century economy that will benefit all. Thank you.

**The Bailiff:**

Very well. We now have up to 20 minutes for questions. Senator Routier?

**7.2.1 Senator P.F. Routier:**

Can the candidate just clarify what he just said in his comments regarding the minimum wage and the living wage? How would he expect they would work?

**Deputy A.D. Lewis:**

At the moment, minimum wage is just over £6 and there is a call to say that that is not a living wage. If we do not pay people enough money they are not economic contributors. The living wage is higher. I hear from my voices behind me that they would like to see a living wage - we all would - and yes, it could be a burden on small business but if they are successful and they want to employ the right people and maintain those employees and keep them, then I believe a living wage should be considered. Not compulsory. S.M.E.s (Small to Medium Enterprises) still need to create jobs for new individuals and I believe that S.M.E.s do struggle sometimes even paying the minimum wage. Get the business plan right and they can afford it. A living wage is what most people should be being paid, if not everybody.

**7.2.2 Deputy M.R. Higgins:**

The candidate in his speech appears to be all things to all people in the sense he was promoting tourism and also the digital sector and so on. How will he deal with his colleagues and civil

servants in the Economic Development Department who do not believe in tourism, especially event-led tourism, and who want a high productivity, low footprint business sector instead?

**Deputy A.D. Lewis:**

That is not my experience. I have spent time talking to the head of the Economic Development Department and others and they are very much supporting the tourism industry. The tourism industry needs to change and it already is changing. It needs to be higher value, so we already have that. We have improved the quality of our product and as a consequence, tourism is an important part of our economy. It does not only just provide tourist beds, it provides business beds, it provides airline routes, and it provides shops and retail. Without the tourist, those shops, retailers and airline routes may not exist, which would severely hamper the success of other elements of our economy.

**7.2.3 Deputy G.P. Southern:**

Both candidates having emphasised the importance of growing the economy and yet it seems to me that you cannot grow an economy independently of the communities and businesses around you. The fact is, today, we have seen consumer spending go back through the floor in the U.K., we have seen Europe flat-lining and we have seen the massive growth rates in China peaking and coming down slowly. What actions will the candidate take to ensure that we can grow when nobody else is? Is he expecting economic recovery in 2016 or when? Because I do not think it will come by 2016.

**Deputy A.D. Lewis:**

The important thing here is that we have had various parts of our economy contract. Banking and finance has not made the profits it has in past years so that is why it is important to diversify our economy. By doing so, we will increase G.D.P., and we will increase G.V.A. Diversification in the finance sector is important as well. We cannot just sit here and do nothing and that has not been the case for the last few years. The Minister for Economic Development in the recent past has worked with his department and worked with Locate Jersey and if he had not had Locate Jersey operating in the department, you would not have created 300 of the jobs that have been created in the recent recession by encouraging new businesses to locate to Jersey. That is exactly what we should be doing more of. There are other small countries like Malta that I mentioned are doing this already, very successfully, and we can continue to do the same.

**7.2.4 Deputy M. Tadier:**

If elected, the candidate will be part of the Council of Ministers, subject to the collective responsibility and the Ministerial Code of Conduct. Does he think that there should in future be greater sanctions for Ministers who mislead the Assembly?

**Deputy A.D. Lewis:**

We already have P.P.C. and that is the policing body for the States and we should adhere to the rules in the Standing Orders, and I would intend to do exactly that. When it comes to collective responsibility the Council of Ministers is a board. If we are to get things done then it needs to be collectively discussed and it needs to be agreed upon. I am not frightened of objecting about a particular issue and if I felt strongly, particularly on matters of conscience, I would state them to the Council of Ministers. I am not a nodding dog, I will challenge other Ministers on their ideas and I will come up with many of my own.

**7.2.5 The Connétable of St. Lawrence:**

If elected, where on the candidate's "to do list" would he place the incorporation of the ports?

**Deputy A.D. Lewis:**

It is on the “to do list” and I think it should be fairly high up there. It is essential for our tourism industry. It is essential for the importation of goods and services. Everything that we eat, drink ... everything in this room has come on a boat or on an airplane so it is essential to the lifeblood of the Island. So if we do not have a well-running, well-functioning port and airport, which I believe has done better as an incorporated body and it becomes more commercial, then unfortunately, we are doomed. So, yes I think it is a very high priority though we have many other priorities as well and until I understand the full remit of the department, it will be difficult to prioritise it effectively.

**7.2.6 The Connétable of Grouville:**

The Chief Minister’s current proposal is to separate agriculture and fisheries, with agriculture going to the Economic Ministry and fisheries going to the Environment Ministry. Does the candidate think that this makes sense when they are currently serviced together, albeit with the budgets from the 2 departments?

**Deputy A.D. Lewis:**

Yes, I found out about this one the other day and I was discussing it with Deputy Labey and I struggle with it a little bit. Fisheries is a part of our economy, as is agriculture and I struggle with why it would be sitting in Environment, other than the fact that our fish stocks must be protected and the 2 departments should be working together to ensure fish stocks are protected and the Economic Development Department should be developing new markets for our seafood products and ensuring that they are sustainable. But the unsustainability element should be with the Environment and the export and the promotion of the product and service should be with Economic Development, in my view.

**7.2.7 Senator P.F. Routier:**

The decision to have sport within the remit of the E.D.D. is something that is being proposed. I would like to know the candidate’s views on that and whether he thinks that it is the right thing to do and also, if it is, how would he anticipate ensuring that sport was up the agenda and how it would be administered within the department.

**Deputy A.D. Lewis:**

I have been to the Education Department to discuss this very matter with the person responsible for sport and I was a little bit concerned to find out that he was finding out about it third hand. The internal communications are clearly not quite as they could be.

[18:15]

However, I do believe that sport has a really strong, big role to play in event-led tourism. The Island Games next year; a fantastic opportunity to market Brand Jersey and we should build on that. Only this year I was speaking to an hotelier who had his hotel full of people that had brought cars to the Island for the car rally. So yes, there is a strong link between E.D.D. and sport and I think we could make that link even stronger and benefit the Island and also benefit local sports clubs because they then get to compete against people of high calibre, more experience and it brings our own sports people on. Also, Education should be focusing on education. The distraction of sport, as important as it is in the curriculum, I think is a distraction. We have got a lot of work to do in Education and I hope the Deputy on my left here gets elected and gets on with that work without the distraction of sport.

**7.2.8 The Deputy of St. Peter:**

Organic farmers have recently had their funding reduced. Would the candidate be prepared to reverse that decision? If not, how would the candidate maintain a presence for organic production in the Island?

**Deputy A.D. Lewis:**

It has been reduced but it still exists. There is still a single area payment made to organic farmers and if they are producing quality milk, they still get a subsidy with that as well. But, at the moment, they are getting £11 per vergée, which, I am sorry, is not really very much. If we really want to encourage this type of farming then of course it needs assistance but it is a very, very small market and there are other priorities as well in the agriculture and fisheries sector. So I need to have a look at all of the data and see if it is viable. But there are other forms of organic farming. If we do not just do pure organic farming but we look at very fresh produce that is capable of being produced in a very healthy manner but is not susceptible to having to have soil association recognition and pesticide control and so on. There are pesticides you can use that are almost organic. We should be looking at other ways of producing this type of fruit and vegetable and food that is not pure organic and then it becomes more viable and that is what I would like to discuss with the organic farmers. I think we have a real opportunity here to grow, for example, a lot more market gardening products. We should have a farmers' market. Every week there should be a farmers' market in the Royal Square selling local produce. **[Approbation]** I would like to try and make that happen.

**7.2.9 Deputy G.P. Southern:**

I would like to thank the candidate for his marketing skills. He has almost sold himself to me. **[Laughter]** Before I am totally bought and wrapped up, can he explain to me what he views as the consequence of economic growth? Does he, unlike the previous candidate, deny history and say that can be done without population growth, immigration growth, or does he accept that inevitably there will be a fight between business and limiting immigration and population growth?

**Deputy A.D. Lewis:**

The fascinating thing is when you look at statistics is that in 1991 we had 84,000 people in Jersey. In 2012 we had 99,000 and in fact there are over 100,000 now. That is 15,000 more people and yet we have had exponential economic growth but only 15,000 more people. I think we have done an excellent job controlling our population already. People would disagree with me on that but if we are to continue with those types of strategies, those types of policies, yes, I really do believe we can grow our economy with that many people. I just mention one small example that Estonia is doing, developing their economy by having an ePopulation, effectively, with no extra footprint in their country. Google it, find out about it, it is really interesting. These are the sort of things that we need to do and yes, I do believe that we can grow our economy without growing our population very much, particularly if we get the education bit right. We should have our own people working in these jobs. At the moment we are still importing lots and lots of highly qualified, highly experienced people. We should have our own pipeline. We should have our own people being educated in the right skillset. I was at Education last week, talking about construction. The lecturer told me he was running a brick laying class. Great, beautiful ... it was fantastic, the bricklaying that the students were doing. I said: "Well, hang on. We do not do much bricklaying in Jersey. We do block laying." The lecturer said: "But it is on the syllabus. I have to teach the syllabus." I am sorry; we need to adapt our education syllabus to the jobs and economy that we have and that way we can grow our economy without more people.

**7.2.10 Deputy G.P. Southern:**

I thank the candidate for his answer and congratulate him on rewriting a different bit of history because, as far as I am aware, in the past 10 to 15 years, we have grown very slowly, not enormously, and yet we have still increased the population. So thank you for that.

**The Bailiff:**

Deputy, that was going to be a question. You, of all people, know it is question. Deputy? Are you posing a question?

**Deputy G.P. Southern:**

Sorry, was there not a question up there?

**The Bailiff:**

No, there was not.

**Deputy G.P. Southern:**

Does the candidate not accept that growth rates for the past 10 to 15 years have been very, very slow? We have been almost flat-lining.

**Deputy A.D. Lewis:**

Sorry. I am slightly confused. I thought the Deputy was claiming that there had been too much population growth. Are you now saying that that is not the case?

**Deputy G.P. Southern:**

The candidate seemed to say, I think I heard him right, that we had fantastic economic growth over the past 15 years when in fact, it has been flat, very low growth, in fact.

**Deputy A.D. Lewis:**

No, in the last 6 years, it has been very low and flat and it has dipped, but not in every sector. I can take agriculture because in 2009 we increased agricultural output. Not many people realised it, it was very small numbers but it showed positive growth. But obviously banking is down. That is down to the interest rates. These are things out of our control but there are other areas, people have mentioned today mining. We have encouraged several mining firms to set up in Jersey and they have created jobs so yes, there has been economic growth over the last 15 years but absolutely we all know the last 6 years have been a struggle. Not just for us but every country around the Western world. We have fared better than most because of what we have been doing in our economy but there is still a long way to go.

**7.2.11 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf:**

The Deputy is a well-respected marketer and answering questions quite powerfully but I want a colleague that is going to operate as a team player. How can I work with a colleague who has consistently voted against the Chief Minister's other nominations?

**Deputy A.D. Lewis:**

I have not voted against all the nominations. I voted against some of them and I had good reason to do that. I make promises and some people came to see me, they rolled out their slate and I was impressed and I felt that they deserved my vote. Today, I felt they performed adequately enough to deserve one of my votes. Others may disagree with that. We live in a democracy and that is why I voted for them. **[Approbation]** I am a team player. I have run a number of companies. I have chaired many boards. I have been a Minister before. I am a team player. I would be delighted to work with a team of Ministers that has been selected so far and I would definitely work as a team player. That is the only way to get things done. But it is not just about the Council of Ministers; it

is about the whole Chamber here. **[Approbation]** I would like to create an Economic Development Enterprise Advisory Board. We have one for tourism, we have one for J.F.L. (Jersey Finance Limited), we have one now for the airport and harbours. We do not have one for Economic Development. So I would like an advisory board. Those Members here that have come to see me and talk to me about Economic Development, I would like to have them around a table. I want a think tank. I want ideas. There are loads of ideas in this Chamber and they do not get out. I want to hear those ideas with that consultative board, bring them to the Council of Ministers and brainstorm. We are all in this together and I believe that with that type of board and independent experts as well, we can create some fantastic ideas for Jersey and we can really punch above our weight. **[Approbation]**

**7.2.12 Deputy M.R. Higgins:**

I was not going to get into this area until I heard the answers that the candidate gave to Deputy Tadier and to Senator Ozouf. First of all, I would like to know what specific academic and professional qualifications he has got and, secondly, how he can reassure us that he will be his own man rather than merely the voice or the tool of the Chief Minister when he played a major role in the unfair dismissal of the former Chief of the States of Jersey Police at the behest of the former Chief Minister.

**Deputy A.D. Lewis:**

Deputy Higgins has had a mantra on this for the last 6 years. My family and myself have been plagued by this since I made that decision. But I am not frightened of making difficult decisions. I made decisions based on evidence in front of me. I had outstanding evidence. I had consultation with law officers, with the Solicitor General, who is now our Attorney General. I spoke to H.R. professionals. I do not take decisions without taking advice. I am not an expert on everything and that is why I took strong advice on that particular issue. My academic qualifications? Yes, I have qualifications in marketing, tourism, travel. I have run businesses, which I have elaborated in my speech, so I feel I am eminently qualified to take on the mantle of Minister for Economic Development. I repeat again, I am not frightened of making difficult decisions. I did not commit any kind of illegal act and I have never lied to this House and I never will lie to this House.

**7.2.13 Deputy M.R. Higgins:**

Supplementary. The candidate just told us that he took advice before he took the action he did do. The advice from the Attorney General at the time was to not take action unless you have a very, almost damning report from the Metropolitan Police, who were investigating the conduct of Operation Rectangle. Not as a disciplinary matter but as a method of trying to see what they did right, what they did wrong. The candidate failed to mention he did not have that advice from the Metropolitan Police, although he told the States that he had. He said he had absolute evidence, he had no choice, but the truth of the matter is, as he later admitted to the inquiries, he did not see the Metropolitan Police report. Is that not the case?

**Deputy A.D. Lewis:**

I had unequivocal evidence to make a decision. I am not frightened of making difficult decisions. The Deputy has continued to pursue this for the last 6 years. I have not ever had the opportunity to say anything about this. This was a local disciplinary matter. I was the Minister responsible legally to take action. I am not going to elaborate further on this today, simply because I was the employer. The subject, or the person you are talking about, was the employee. He has a duty of confidentiality. I am not going to discuss the case of a member of staff of the States of Jersey, who I was effectively the employer and that is the position when you are a Minister. You have to



respect confidentiality. There is a difference between confidentiality and secrecy and conspiracy and this is confidential.

**The Bailiff:**

Deputy Higgins, thank you very much. We do not need a running commentary. Deputy Tadier?

**7.2.14 Deputy M. Tadier:**

I am not sure if this question will have time. It is to do with the skills gap. The candidate has mentioned the fact that it is one thing to get our school leavers trained up for brick layers, *et cetera*, but can we get them, once they are trained up, to work for the minimum wage, live in bedsits, which they are currently not prepared to do but the immigrant population is prepared to do.

**Deputy A.D. Lewis:**

Good employers pay realistic wages.

**The Bailiff:**

Very well. That brings questions to Deputy Lewis to an end. So we will ask for Senator Farnham to be brought back. So we will now move to the vote for the Minister for Economic Development. If you wish to vote for Senator Farnham, you vote P. If you wish to vote for Deputy Andrew Lewis, you vote C. The Greffier will open the voting.

<b>Senator L.J. Farnham: 35</b>	<b>Deputy A.D. Lewis: 9</b>	<b>Abstain: 3</b>
Senator P.F. Routier	Senator Z.A. Cameron	Deputy G.P. Southern (H)
Senator P.F.C. Ozouf	Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)	Deputy M. Tadier (B)
Senator A.J.H. Maclean	Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)	Deputy S.Y. Mézec (H)
Senator I.J. Gorst	Deputy R.J. Rondel (H)	
Senator L.J. Farnham	Deputy A.D. Lewis (H)	
Senator P.M. Bailhache	Deputy of St. Ouen	
Senator A.K.F. Green	Deputy L.M.C. Doublet (S)	
Connétable of St. Helier	Deputy S.M. Bree (C)	
Connétable of St. Clement	Deputy P.D. McLinton (S)	
Connétable of St. Peter		
Connétable of St. Lawrence		
Connétable of St. Mary		
Connétable of St. Ouen		
Connétable of St. Brelade		
Connétable of St. Martin		
Connétable of Grouville		
Connétable of St. John		
Connétable of Trinity		
Deputy J.A. Martin (H)		
Deputy of Grouville		
Deputy of Trinity		
Deputy E.J. Noel (L)		
Deputy of St. John		
Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)		
Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)		
Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)		
Deputy of St. Martin		
Deputy R.G. Bryans (H)		
Deputy of St. Peter		
Deputy R. Labey (H)		

Deputy S.M. Wickenden (H)				
Deputy M.J. Norton (B)				
Deputy T.A. McDonald (S)				
Deputy of St. Mary				
Deputy G.J. Truscott (B)				

**The Bailiff:**

Very well. So I declare that Senator Farnham is elected as Minister for Economic Development.

**[Approbation]**

**Deputy A.D. Lewis:**

Sir, could I just congratulate Senator Farnham and I would be delighted to bring some of my business experience to assist the department if he so wishes. Well done and I look forward to working with you.

**Senator L.J. Farnham:**

Sir, could I in turn thank the Deputy for his challenge and thank all Members for placing their confidence in me. I will do my very best not to let them down.

**The Bailiff:**

Chief Minister, do you wish to say anything?

**9. ARRANGEMENTS FOR CONTINUATION OF MEETING**

**Senator I.J. Gorst:**

Sir, an issue has been brought to my attention, which I wish for your advice on and for Members to be aware. I understand that the Royal Court tomorrow at 10.00 a.m. will be considering the issue raised in St. Helier District No. 1 and therefore Members of the Assembly will need to be present. One of those Members wishes to contest one of the Ministerial nominations, which would be the first nomination tomorrow morning. So I am wondering whether I do need to change order and perhaps take Education prior to Social Security or whether we might start at 9.00 a.m. I am not sure what the court procedure will be, which is why I have had to ask for your advice.

[18:30]

**The Bailiff:**

This will just help Members and I have spoken to at least 2, I think, of the Deputies who are involved. Having been alerted to this problem via Deputy Labey, arrangements have been made at the moment for this to be dealt with first thing by the Royal Court at 10.00 a.m. It should be a short hearing because it is simply a procedural hearing, so that one would hope that the relevant Members could be back here by about 10.10 a.m. But, if there were to be a discussion and argument, then the Commissioner has indicated he would put it off until 12.45 p.m. so that the Members could attend, because clearly it is important that they be here for the business of the States. So that is what the court has attempted to do to assist.

**Senator I.J. Gorst:**

Sir, that is extremely helpful because, as I understand it, and perhaps those Members will indicate otherwise, I think that Social Security is one of those positions that will have a 3-way contest. I am aware of another Member who is wishing to put their name forward, therefore, if we sat at 9.30 a.m. that should allow the Chief Minister's nominee, the other Member and then the Member

that might be involved to be back here by 10.30 a.m. if that is what is going to happen in the Royal Court.

**Deputy J.A. Martin:**

Procedurally, Sir, the person locked in the room downstairs cannot be in the Royal Court at the same time so it would make it very awkward. I would take your advice on that, Sir.

**The Bailiff:**

I am sure we can arrange for somebody from the Greffe to stand beside the person [Laughter] in the Royal Court before escorting them down to the cellar. [Laughter]

**Deputy M.R. Higgins:**

Sir, would it not be simpler simply to put that particular position one behind the other so it comes after 10.30 a.m. or even 11.00 a.m.

**The Bailiff:**

That is a matter for the Chief Minister.

**Senator I.J. Gorst:**

Sir, I am happy to do that. I just simply wondered what the process was and what was the easiest ...

**The Bailiff:**

Right. Well, perhaps that might be the cleanest solution, Chief Minister. If you are happy to take Education, Sport and Culture, do we believe that is to be contested?

**Deputy R.G. Bryans:**

I am happy with that, Sir. [Laughter]

**The Bailiff:**

Do we believe it is to be contested, as far as we know?

**Senator I.J. Gorst:**

As far as I know, all Ministerial positions are going to be contested. Perhaps we could ask members of the Reform Party.

**The Bailiff:**

It is just that if it is not, then of course it will take a very short time. Can anyone assist as to whether the Minister for Education, Sport and Culture is likely to be contested, in which case we have at least one hour on that topic?

**Deputy M. Tadier:**

I think it is likely to be contested.

**The Bailiff:**

Very well.

**Senator I.J. Gorst:**

In that case, it is only fair on the Assembly if I make the decision that we, first thing tomorrow at 9.30 a.m., take the nominations for Education, Sport and Culture first.

**The Bailiff:**

Very well. Yes. So that is how the Assembly will proceed tomorrow then so that the Members can then go to the Royal Court at 10.00 a.m. and hopefully be back in good time for any vote. Very well, so the Assembly will adjourn and reconvene at 9.30 a.m. tomorrow morning.

**ADJOURNMENT**

[18:33]