

EXTRACT FROM HANSARD – 16th JANUARY 2007

17. Jersey Police Complaints Authority: Appointment of Chairman and Members (P.165/06)

The Deputy Bailiff:

We come next to Jersey Police Complaints Authority: Appointment of Chairman and Members - Projet 165 - in the name of the Minister for Home Affairs and I will ask the Greffier to read the proposition.

The Greffier of the States:

The States are asked to decide whether they are of opinion in accordance with Article 2 of and the Schedule to the Police (Complaints and Discipline) (Jersey) Law 1999; (a) to reappoint Mr. Leslie May F.C.C.A. as Chairman of the Jersey Police Complaints Authority for a further period of 3 years; (b) to reappoint the following as members of the Jersey Police Complaints Authority for a further period of 3 years, Mr. Anthony Beaumont, Mr. Andrew Cornish, Mrs. Toni Roberts and seek to appoint the following member of the Jersey Police Complaints Authority for a period of 3 years, Mr. Stephen Luce.

17.1 Senator W. Kinnard (The Minister for Home Affairs):

I think I might ask my Assistant Minister to do this in case it gets referred to Scrutiny. Thank you.

Deputy A.D. Lewis of St. John (Assistant Minister for Home Affairs):

I certainly know of all the individuals as cited in this document as being fine upstanding individuals. I am not sure, perhaps, whether we need to go into camera for this one or not?

The Deputy Bailiff:

No.

The Deputy of St. John:

Well, I would like to propose the proposition that Leslie May continue as Chairman and that Anthony Beaumont, Andrew Cornish and Toni Roberts get reappointed as members of the Panel and that Stephen Luce should become a new member of the Panel, Sir. I move the proposition, Sir.

The Deputy Bailiff:

Is the proposition seconded? **[Seconded]** Does any Member wish to speak on the proposition?

17.2 Deputy G.C.L. Baudains:

I am going to oppose this and I hasten to add it is not because I have a problem with any of the candidates but I do have a problem with the organisation because, in my view, it is completely ineffective and, as such, I see no point in appointing people to it, Sir, because it is not as people suppose - and I believe the Minister shares this view - an independent organisation that investigates complaints against the police. This much I do know, Sir, from...

Senator W. Kinnard:

Excuse me, Sir, I take exception to his assumption that I share any view that he may have.

Deputy G.C.L. Baudains:

If the Minister cared to listen to what I said, Sir, I was not insinuating that at all, as she may find out in a moment. The problem I have with this organisation, Sir, stems from personal experience, because when I was made aware of an unsatisfactory situation I was unable to pursue it because basically the police told me a pack of lies. I took that to the authorities, Sir, and I asked them to investigate. They told me they could not because it was outside their terms of reference and all

that they can do is review the police investigating themselves. I find that quite unsatisfactory, Sir, and I see no point in perpetuating such a situation.

17.3 Deputy R.G. Le Hérissier:

The only thing I would recommend to the Deputy is he bring a proposition forward to reform the whole system rather than use this particular proposition.

The Deputy Bailiff:

Yes. This is a debate simply on membership of the existing body.

17.4 The Deputy of St. Martin:

It was just a quick one, Sir, for the Assistant Minister. Mr. Luce is replacing a member. Who will he be replacing and who is resigning?

The Deputy Bailiff:

Does any other Member wish to speak? I call upon the Assistant Minister to reply.

17.5 The Deputy of St. John:

Thank you for Deputy Le Hérissier's intervention there. If Deputy Baudains feels strongly about that particular issue then, yes, he is able to bring a proposition to the States to disband this organisation. I happen to believe that it is very, very effective. All the members are very independent. They have no association with the police and I am very confident that every complaint, of which there are very few, that is brought before them is dealt in a very impartial and satisfactory manner. However, we are reviewing the situation at the moment, not because we think it is ineffective but because we are in the process at the moment of looking at a police authority which may combine the auspices of the Police Complaints Authority if we feel that it would work that way. So we are looking at that at the moment. So I would like to propose the proposition, Sir.

The Deputy Bailiff:

There was a question, I think, from the Deputy of St. Martin.

The Deputy of St. John:

I beg your pardon, Sir. It was Mr. Le Maistre. I do not have the full details of the candidate. It was before my time, Sir.

The Deputy Bailiff:

Very well. The appel is called for then on the proposition of the Minister for Home Affairs. I invite Members to return to Chamber. The Greffier will open the voting.

POUR: 44

Senator S. Syvret

Senator L. Norman

Senator F.H. Walker

Senator W. Kinnard

Senator T.A. Le Sueur

Senator P.F. Routier

CONTRE: 1

Deputy G.C.L. Baudains (C)

ABSTAIN: 0

Senator M.E. Vibert

Senator T.J. Le Main

Senator B.E. Shenton

Senator F.E. Cohen

Senator J.L. Perchard

Connétable of St. Ouen

Connétable of St. Saviour

Connétable of St. Mary

Connétable of St. Peter

Connétable of St. Clement

Connétable of St. Helier

Connétable of St. Lawrence

Connétable of Grouville

Connétable of St. Brelade

Connétable of St. John

Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)

Deputy A. Breckon (S)

Deputy J.J. Huet (H)

Deputy of St. Martin

Deputy P.N. Troy (B)

Deputy R.G. Le Hérissier (S)

Deputy J.B. Fox (H)

Deputy G.P. Southern (H)

Deputy S.C. Ferguson (B)

Deputy of St. Ouen

Deputy of Grouville

Deputy of St. Peter

Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)

Deputy G.W.J. de Faye (H)

Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)

Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondre (L)

Deputy D.W. Mezbourian (L)

Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)

Deputy A.J.H. Maclean (H)

Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)

Deputy of St. John

Deputy I.J. Gorst (C)

Deputy of St. Mary