



**THE STATES assembled on Wednesday  
23rd October 2024, at 9.30 a.m. under  
the Presidency of the Bailiff,  
Sir Timothy John Le Cocq.**

---

All members were present at roll call with the exception of –

Connétable Deidre Wendy Mezbourian of St. Lawrence – ill  
Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone – ill  
Connétable Andrew Nicholas Jehan of St. John – excused attendance  
Deputy Geoffrey Peter Southern of St. Helier Central – en défaut (arrived in the Chamber at 9:32)  
Deputy Mary Rose Le Hegarat of St. Helier North – excused attendance  
Deputy Ian Joseph Gorst of St. Mary, St. Ouen and St. Peter – absent on States Business  
Deputy Beatriz Borges de Sousa Vaz Moreno Porée of St. Helier South – absent on States Business  
Deputy Lucy Kate Frances Stephenson of St. Mary, St. Ouen and St. Peter – parental responsibilities

---

Prayers

---

**Standing Order 55A – remote participation**

THE STATES, with reference to their Act dated 14th September 2021, in which they had agreed that, notwithstanding Standing Order 55A(1), members who did not wish to attend in the States Chamber might continue to take part in States meetings using Microsoft Teams (until the States had considered and voted upon a proposition to re-apply Standing Order 55A(1) or to repeal or vary the terms of the Standing Order), assembled in accordance with Standing Order 55A with members able to participate remotely using Microsoft Teams. The following Members attended remotely, either for all or part of the meeting –

Connétable Richard Anthony Kingston Honeycombe of St. Ouen  
Deputy Carina Soares Alves of St. Helier Central

**Arrangement of public business for the present meeting**

THE STATES noted that, in accordance with Standing Order 34(1), Deputy David James Warr of St. Helier had informed the Greffier of the States that his proposition entitled ‘Management and Maintenance of Havre des Pas Bathing Pool and Café’ (P.68/2024) had been withdrawn.

**Urgent Oral Question**

Deputy J. Renouf of St. Brelade asked the following question of the Minister for Sustainable Economic Development which the Bailiff had allowed in accordance with Standing Order 15 relating to urgent oral questions –

“Will the Minister provide further information on the ramifications of the statement yesterday that the Chief Officer in the Economic Development is stepping aside from the ferry tendering process owing to an error of judgement?”

**Marine Spatial Plan P.44/2024**

THE STATES resumed consideration of the proposition of the Minister for the Environment entitled ‘Marine Spatial Plan’ (P.44/2024), and rejected part 1 of an amendment of the Environment, Housing and Infrastructure Scrutiny Panel (P.44/2024 Amd.) that, after the words “accompanying this proposition”, there should be inserted “except that page 124 and Figure 80 should be amended to include the area east of Les Ecréhous within the extension of the Marine Protected Area Network, as outlined in Action NB5a, with any consequential amendments to the Jersey Marine Spatial Plan made accordingly.”

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 15**

Connétable of St. Mary  
Deputy G.P. Southern  
Deputy M. Tadier  
Deputy L.M.C. Doublet  
Deputy S.M. Ahier  
Deputy I. Gardiner  
Deputy K.L. Moore  
Deputy T.A. Coles  
Deputy D.J. Warr  
Deputy H.M. Miles  
Deputy J. Renouf  
Deputy H.L. Jeune  
Deputy A.F. Curtis  
Deputy K.M. Wilson  
Deputy M.B. Andrews

**CONTRE: 27**

Connétable of St. Helier  
Connétable of St. Brelade  
Connétable of Trinity  
Connétable of St. Peter  
Connétable of St. Clement  
Connétable of St. Ouen  
Connétable of Grouville  
Connétable of St. Saviour  
Deputy C.F. Labey  
Deputy S.G. Luce  
Deputy K.F. Morel  
Deputy R.J. Ward  
Deputy C.S. Alves  
Deputy L.J. Farnham  
Deputy S.Y. Mézec  
Deputy P.F.C. Ozouf  
Deputy Sir P.M. Bailhache  
Deputy M.R. Scott  
Deputy C.D. Curtis  
Deputy L.V. Feltham  
Deputy R.E. Binet  
Deputy M.E. Millar  
Deputy A. Howell  
Deputy T.J.A. Binet  
Deputy M.R. Ferey  
Deputy R.S. Kovacs  
Deputy B. Ward

**ABSTAIN: 0**

THE STATES rejected part 2 of the amendment of the Environment, Housing and Infrastructure Scrutiny Panel (P.44/2024 Amd.) that, after the words “accompanying this proposition”, there should be inserted “except that page 124 and Figure 80 should be amended to include the part of the basin between Les Ecréhous and Les Anquettes within the extension of the Marine Protected Area Network, as outlined in Action NB5a, with any consequential amendments to the Jersey Marine Spatial Plan made accordingly.”

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 17**

Connétable of St. Clement  
Connétable of St. Mary  
Connétable of St. Saviour  
Deputy G.P. Southern  
Deputy M. Tadier

**CONTRE: 25**

Connétable of St. Helier  
Connétable of St. Brelade  
Connétable of Trinity  
Connétable of St. Peter  
Connétable of Grouville

**ABSTAIN: 0**

Deputy L.M.C. Doublet	Connétable of St. Ouen
Deputy S.M. Ahier	Deputy C.F. Labey
Deputy I. Gardiner	Deputy S.G. Luce
Deputy K.L. Moore	Deputy K.F. Morel
Deputy T.A. Coles	Deputy R.J. Ward
Deputy D.J. Warr	Deputy C.S. Alves
Deputy H.M. Miles	Deputy L.J. Farnham
Deputy J. Renouf	Deputy S.Y. Mézec
Deputy H.L. Jeune	Deputy P.F.C. Ozouf
Deputy A.F. Curtis	Deputy Sir P.M. Bailhache
Deputy K.M. Wilson	Deputy M.R. Scott
Deputy M.B. Andrews	Deputy C.D. Curtis
	Deputy L.V. Feltham
	Deputy R.E. Binet
	Deputy M.E. Millar
	Deputy A. Howell
	Deputy T.J.A. Binet
	Deputy M.R. Ferey
	Deputy R.S. Kovacs
	Deputy B. Ward

THE STATES rejected part 3 of the amendment of the Environment, Housing and Infrastructure Scrutiny Panel (P.44/2024 Amd.) that, after the words “accompanying this proposition”, there should be inserted “except that page 124 and Figure 80 should be amended to include areas to the east and west of Les Minquiers within the extension of the Marine Protected Area Network, as outlined in Action NB5a, with any consequential amendments to the Jersey Marine Spatial Plan made accordingly.”

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 16**

Connétable of St. Mary  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Deputy G.P. Southern  
 Deputy M. Tadier  
 Deputy L.M.C. Doublet  
 Deputy S.M. Ahier  
 Deputy I. Gardiner  
 Deputy K.L. Moore  
 Deputy T.A. Coles  
 Deputy D.J. Warr  
 Deputy H.M. Miles  
 Deputy J. Renouf  
 Deputy H.L. Jeune  
 Deputy A.F. Curtis  
 Deputy K.M. Wilson  
 Deputy M.B. Andrews

**CONTRE: 26**

Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of St. Peter  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Deputy C.F. Labey  
 Deputy S.G. Luce  
 Deputy K.F. Morel  
 Deputy R.J. Ward  
 Deputy L.J. Farnham  
 Deputy S.Y. Mézec  
 Deputy P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Deputy Sir P.M. Bailhache  
 Deputy M.R. Scott  
 Deputy C.D. Curtis  
 Deputy L.V. Feltham  
 Deputy R.E. Binet  
 Deputy M.E. Millar  
 Deputy A. Howell  
 Deputy T.J.A. Binet  
 Deputy M.R. Ferey  
 Deputy R.S. Kovacs  
 Deputy B. Ward

**ABSTAIN: 0**

Deputy C.S. Alves

THE STATES rejected part 4 of the amendment of the Environment, Housing and Infrastructure Scrutiny Panel (P.44/2024 Amd.) that, after the words “accompanying this proposition”, there should be inserted “except that page 124 should be amended to allow for the introduction of immediate protection of the south-eastern edges of Les Ecréhous within the Marine Protected Area Network (rather than phased protection), with any consequential amendments to the Jersey Marine Spatial Plan made accordingly.”

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 19**

Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Deputy G.P. Southern  
 Deputy M. Tadier  
 Deputy L.M.C. Doublet  
 Deputy S.M. Ahier  
 Deputy I. Gardiner  
 Deputy K.L. Moore  
 Deputy Sir P.M. Bailhache  
 Deputy T.A. Coles  
 Deputy D.J. Warr  
 Deputy H.M. Miles  
 Deputy J. Renouf  
 Deputy H.L. Jeune  
 Deputy A.F. Curtis  
 Deputy K.M. Wilson  
 Deputy M.B. Andrews

**CONTRE: 23**

Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of St. Peter  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Deputy C.F. Labey  
 Deputy S.G. Luce  
 Deputy K.F. Morel  
 Deputy R.J. Ward  
 Deputy L.J. Farnham  
 Deputy S.Y. Mézec  
 Deputy P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Deputy M.R. Scott  
 Deputy C.D. Curtis  
 Deputy L.V. Feltham  
 Deputy R.E. Binet  
 Deputy M.E. Millar  
 Deputy A. Howell  
 Deputy T.J.A. Binet  
 Deputy M.R. Ferey  
 Deputy R.S. Kovacs  
 Deputy B. Ward  
 Deputy C.S. Alves

**ABSTAIN: 0**

THE STATES rejected part 5 of the amendment of the Environment, Housing and Infrastructure Scrutiny Panel (P.44/2024 Amd.) that, after the words “accompanying this proposition”, there should be inserted “except that page 124 should be amended to allow for the introduction of immediate protection of the south-eastern edges Les Minquiers within the Marine Protected Area Network (rather than phased protection), with any consequential amendments to the Jersey Marine Spatial Plan made accordingly.”

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 16**

Connétable of St. Mary  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Deputy G.P. Southern  
 Deputy M. Tadier  
 Deputy L.M.C. Doublet  
 Deputy S.M. Ahier  
 Deputy I. Gardiner  
 Deputy K.L. Moore  
 Deputy T.A. Coles  
 Deputy D.J. Warr

**CONTRE: 26**

Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of St. Peter  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Deputy C.F. Labey  
 Deputy S.G. Luce  
 Deputy K.F. Morel

**ABSTAIN: 0**

Deputy H.M. Miles  
 Deputy J. Renouf  
 Deputy H.L. Jeune  
 Deputy A.F. Curtis  
 Deputy K.M. Wilson  
 Deputy M.B. Andrews

Deputy R.J. Ward  
 Deputy L.J. Farnham  
 Deputy S.Y. Mézec  
 Deputy P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Deputy Sir P.M. Bailhache  
 Deputy M.R. Scott  
 Deputy C.D. Curtis  
 Deputy L.V. Feltham  
 Deputy R.E. Binet  
 Deputy M.E. Millar  
 Deputy A. Howell  
 Deputy T.J.A. Binet  
 Deputy M.R. Ferey  
 Deputy R.S. Kovacs  
 Deputy B. Ward  
 Deputy C.S. Alves

THE STATES, resuming consideration of the proposition of the Minister for the Environment, commenced consideration of an amendment of the Environment, Housing and Infrastructure Scrutiny Panel (P.44/2024 Amd.(2)) and rejected an amendment of Deputy Jonathan Renouf of St. Brelade (P.44/2024 Amd.(2).Amd) that, after the words “Marine Protected Area Network” there should be inserted “, with a final status to be assigned to areas undergoing such further research by the end of 2025 and with all subsequent amendments to the Marine Spatial Plan to be completed by the end of the Assembly’s current term of office.”.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 16**

Connétable of St. Mary  
 Deputy G.P. Southern  
 Deputy M. Tadier  
 Deputy L.M.C. Doublet  
 Deputy I. Gardiner  
 Deputy K.L. Moore  
 Deputy Sir P.M. Bailhache  
 Deputy T.A. Coles  
 Deputy D.J. Warr  
 Deputy H.M. Miles  
 Deputy J. Renouf  
 Deputy H.L. Jeune  
 Deputy R.S. Kovacs  
 Deputy A.F. Curtis  
 Deputy K.M. Wilson  
 Deputy M.B. Andrews

**CONTRE: 26**

Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of St. Peter  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Deputy C.F. Labey  
 Deputy S.G. Luce  
 Deputy K.F. Morel  
 Deputy S.M. Ahier  
 Deputy R.J. Ward  
 Deputy C.S. Alves  
 Deputy L.J. Farnham  
 Deputy S.Y. Mézec  
 Deputy P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Deputy M.R. Scott  
 Deputy C.D. Curtis  
 Deputy L.V. Feltham  
 Deputy R.E. Binet  
 Deputy M.E. Millar  
 Deputy A. Howell  
 Deputy T.J.A. Binet  
 Deputy M.R. Ferey  
 Deputy B. Ward

**ABSTAIN: 0**

THE STATES resumed consideration of the proposition of the Minister for the Environment entitled ‘Marine Spatial Plan’ (P.44/2024), and, adopting the amendment of the Environment, Housing and Infrastructure Scrutiny Panel (P.44/2024 Amd.(2)), designated the existing paragraph as paragraph (a) and, after that paragraph, agreed that the following should be inserted –

“(b) to request the Minister for the Environment to establish a framework, timeline and tracker for monitoring the implementation of the Jersey Marine Spatial Plan and for conducting any further research on areas remaining for inclusion in the Marine Protected Area Network.”

THE STATES resumed consideration of the proposition of the Minister for the Environment, as amended, and, adopting the proposition –

- (a) agreed that the proposed Jersey Marine Spatial Plan was the roadmap to managing Jersey’s marine environment, as set out in Appendix 1 to the report accompanying the proposition; and
- (b) requested the Minister for the Environment to establish a framework, timeline and tracker for monitoring the implementation of the Jersey Marine Spatial Plan and for conducting any further research on areas remaining for inclusion in the Marine Protected Area Network.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 40**

**CONTRE: 0**

**ABSTAIN: 0**

Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of St. Peter  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Deputy G.P. Southern  
 Deputy M. Tadier  
 Deputy S.G. Luce  
 Deputy L.M.C. Doublet  
 Deputy K.F. Morel  
 Deputy S.M. Ahier  
 Deputy R.J. Ward  
 Deputy I. Gardiner  
 Deputy L.J. Farnham  
 Deputy K.L. Moore  
 Deputy S.Y. Mézec  
 Deputy P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Deputy Sir P.M. Bailhache  
 Deputy T.A. Coles  
 Deputy D.J. Warr  
 Deputy H.M. Miles  
 Deputy M.R. Scott  
 Deputy J. Renouf  
 Deputy C.D. Curtis  
 Deputy L.V. Feltham  
 Deputy R.E. Binet  
 Deputy H.L. Jeune  
 Deputy M.E. Millar  
 Deputy A. Howell

Deputy T.J.A. Binet  
Deputy M.R. Ferey  
Deputy R.S. Kovacs  
Deputy A.F. Curtis  
Deputy B. Ward  
Deputy K.M. Wilson  
Deputy M.B. Andrews

### **Changes in Presidency**

The Bailiff retired briefly from the Chamber during consideration of the of the proposition of the Minister for the Environment entitled ‘Marine Spatial Plan’ (P.44/2024) and the meeting continued under the Presidency of Mrs. Lisa-Marie Hart Greffier of the States, until the Bailiff’s return.

### **Delivery of three bilingual primary schools P.45/2024**

THE STATES commenced consideration of a proposition of Deputy Sir Philip Martin Bailhache of St. Clement entitled ‘Delivery of three bilingual primary schools’ (P.45/2024) and, adopting an amendment of Deputy Sir Philip Martin Bailhache of St. Clement (P.45/2024 Amd.) agreed to re-designate the existing paragraph as (a) and that, for the words “to request the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning to take the necessary steps to convert, by the beginning of the academic year 2025-2026, a minimum of three” there should be substituted the words “to approve in principle the conversion of at least two”; and that the words “in 2025” should be deleted; and after paragraph (a) there should be inserted the following new paragraphs (b) and (c) –

- “(b) to request the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning to conduct a survey, in cooperation with Statistics Jersey, of the views of parents of pre-school children as to the desirability of establishing bilingual English-French primary schools in Jersey, and their willingness to send their children to such a school; and
- (c) to request the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning to appoint, subject to a positive outcome from the survey referred to in paragraph (b) above, an appropriately qualified project manager to ensure a smooth transition to bilingual teaching, and to establish at least two bilingual English-French primary schools by the beginning of the academic year 2026-27.”

### **Adjournment**

THE STATES adjourned, having agreed to reconvene on Thursday 24th October 2024 to continue consideration of the proposition of Deputy Sir Philip Martin Bailhache of St. Clement entitled ‘Delivery of three bilingual primary schools’ (P.45/2024) and the other outstanding propositions listed for consideration at the meeting.

THE STATES rose at 5.25 p.m.

**L.-M. HART**

*Greffier of the States*