



Economic and International Affairs Scrutiny Panel

Supply Chain Resilience Review

Witness: Ports of Jersey

Friday, 24th November 2023

Panel:

Deputy M.R. Scott of St. Brelade (Chair)

Connétable R. Honeycombe of St. Ouen

Witnesses:

Mr. M. Thomas, Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey

Mr. D. Scott, Chief of Staff, Ports of Jersey

Mr. W. Sadler, Harbour Master, Ports of Jersey

[12:05]

Deputy M.R. Scott of St. Brelade (Chair):

So welcome to this hearing regarding this Supply Chain Resilience Review of the Economic and International Affairs Scrutiny Panel, which will be asking questions. Its aims are to question and gather evidence in relation to supply chain resilience. I would like to draw your attention to the following: the hearing will be filmed and streamed live. The recording and transcript will be published afterwards on the States Assembly website. I would be grateful if you could turn off your electronic devices so that we are not interrupted. For the purpose of the recording and the transcript I would be grateful if everyone who speaks could ensure that you state your name and role. We will begin with introductions. I am going to suggest that the panel members introduce ourselves, followed by you, from the Ports of Jersey, so thank you very much for being here. So I am Deputy Moz Scott, Chair of the Economic and International Affairs Panel and attending by Teams ...

Connétable R. Honeycombe of St. Ouen:

I am Connétable Richard Honeycombe from the Parish of St. Ouen.

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

Shall I go next? I am Matt Thomas. I am the Chief Executive for Ports of Jersey.

Harbour Master, Ports of Jersey:

Bill Sadler, the Jersey Harbour Master, Ports of Jersey.

Chief of Staff, Ports of Jersey:

I am Darren Scott, Chief of Staff, Ports of Jersey.

Deputy M.R. Scott:

Okay. Well, welcome and thank you for being here. First, thank you for your submission of 29th August in which you answered a number of questions regarding the Island's supply chain. To start with an open question: what does the future of the Island's supply chain look like and how will we get there?

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

Shall I lead off? I will certainly bring in my colleagues on that. I think probably the most important starting point is the role that Ports of Jersey has in that, so we are a key player in both the air and the maritime supply chain, but we are one link in the chain. For us, the future of the Island's supply chains, both air and sea, is tremendously important. It is something that we take very, very seriously, but we approach it looking from the angle of its resilience, how efficient it can be and how it can accommodate the future needs of Islanders in whichever way, but obviously there is a number of other players in both the air and supply chains, you know, whether that is freight forwarders, airlines, ferry operators et cetera. So in terms of what will it look like, it would probably be impertinent to kid on that we are fully able to define what that will be. We certainly think long and hard about the infrastructure aspects and the supply chain resilience. As I am sure you are aware, we have responsibilities through incorporation to ensure that the infrastructure is fit for purpose, that it can accommodate future developments in the sector, that it is future-proofed and it is efficient; it gives Islanders what they need. I think to that end we are planning significant investment, both at the airport and at the harbour.

Deputy M.R. Scott:

So in order to future-proof, do you not have to have an idea of what the future is going to look like?

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

Absolutely, that is absolutely part ... and I think my career has been about developing infrastructure around the world and there are well-worn paths for how one goes about developing and trying to

understand the needs of the future, whether that is volumes of future capacity that we are going to need to handle, but what are the emerging technologies? Take very much the key one for all of us as we live today is, you know, the decarbonisation of operations, both our own but also our partners, and what does that mean from an infrastructure perspective.

Deputy M.R. Scott:

Is that happening?

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

It certainly will happen. I think exactly how it will happen is us decarbonising our own operations, so the things that are within our control. That is something that I could give very definitive answers about. How our partners ... you know, what will the ferries or the airlines of the future look like, the accountabilities and the responsibilities globally to decarbonisation are very clear, but there are emerging technologies coming both at air and sea.

Deputy M.R. Scott:

Is the cost justifiable, given the size of the Island?

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

It is probably too early to tell is the honest answer. You know, from a Ports of Jersey and our infrastructure perspective, I think it is about being smart and responsible and absolutely I think it is affordable. When we are starting to talk about big infrastructure like planes and boats, it would be wrong for me to say that I understand what a hydrogen-powered plane is going to cost in 10 years' time. I think we need to be very mindful of whatever we do with our infrastructure, it is going to be able to accommodate however our partners choose to fly or sail.

Harbour Master, Ports of Jersey:

I was going to say, think when it comes to particularly future fuels and emissions, particularly I think for ships, some of it will be outside of our control, so some of it may be regulatory. The International Maritime Organization has already been here to look at emissions from vessels, so while as an Island we manage our own laws and legislations, we are part of a broad international community when it comes to kind of maritime transport.

Deputy M.R. Scott:

Right, thank you. The panel has received a number of submissions identifying the importance of supply chain resilience to Jersey. How would you summarise this importance to the Island and its economy? Easy question first.

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

Well, the answer is easy. All the tentacles of the answer I think we could speak about for days on end. I think it is critically important that an Island of our size that relies on its connectivity, both for moving goods and people, it is of critical importance. I do not know if you would like to add anything.

Chief of Staff, Ports of Jersey:

To add to what you said, I think it is one of the most important things that the Island deals with, like any island community. As Matt said, I think the way the ... you know, the fact that virtually everything is imported, everything from our lifestyle to our lifelines are supported by the supply chain and its connectivity.

Deputy M.R. Scott:

Thank you. The panel has been questioning the quantitative analysis undertaken in regards to the Island's supply chain as well as its impact upon the economy. You have highlighted that Ports of Jersey do not hold a view regarding volumes and economies of scale and that this would be for Government to determine. Have you been requested to share any forecasts of port use, such as freight capacity, with the Government or the Jersey Competition Regulatory Authority?

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

Do you want to lead off on that one?

Chief of Staff, Ports of Jersey:

Yes. As part of the planning application for the proposed redevelopment of Elizabeth, there is kind of freight statistics, growth data that are published as part of the application. That information has been provided to Government, to the competition regulator and other parties. Basically the historic volumes and predicted growth forecasts basically underpin the redevelopment - the essential redevelopment - at Elizabeth Harbour.

Deputy M.R. Scott:

So how did you produce these?

Chief of Staff, Ports of Jersey:

Do you want to ...

Harbour Master, Ports of Jersey:

Yes. I mean, the additional work was undertaken by the consortium, which is doing the Harbour Master Plan, so that was a quantitative assessment of looking back at past freight volumes and then looking forward to what current freight volumes have been, so direct consultation with different

stakeholders, but also looking at things like the Government ... the future growth for the Island. That data was then taken and validated by a separate organisation to ensure that the growth assumptions made in it were fit for purpose and accurate.

Deputy M.R. Scott:

What was this separate organisation, please?

Harbour Master, Ports of Jersey:

So it is a company called MDS Transmodal.

Deputy M.R. Scott:

MDS Transmodal?

Harbour Master, Ports of Jersey:

MDST. Sorry, MDS Transmodal.

Deputy M.R. Scott:

Right, thank you. The consortium, sorry, just who are the members of the consortium?

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

Sorry, shall I take that? So we have ... it is very typical in projects of this scale. Ports of Jersey is primarily an operator and developer of the infrastructure, then when you have an enormous infrastructure project, you put something together called a managed service provider, so it is really providing additional engineering expertise, market intelligence, architectural et cetera.

[12:15]

The companies in the consortium are both local and international, locally from Hartigans, Mike Waddington Architects, MS Planning to, at an international level, Mark McDonald, who are an infrastructure specialist consultancy, a multinational one, as well as Broadway Malyan, Louise Brown, who is an architect by background from Northern Ireland, and peer review capabilities provided by Nigel Bodell, who used to work at Dover Harbour.

Deputy M.R. Scott:

So did this validation take ... sorry, was that ... no, it is all right, just checking Constable Honeycombe was not going to chip in there, as he is well entitled to do. But I just wanted to check, this validation that you talked about, that occurred before you drew up the plans or afterwards?

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

It is as part of the process, so we start with almost concept design. When you have got a concept design of: "Where are we building the harbour? What kind of scale do we think?" we then, at a very early stage, brought in somebody to do the projections forward of what kind of capacity do we need to accommodate, then as the design was developed further - which is probably 2 to 3 years later - to then look again at the volume projections and say: "Are these reasonable? Do these reflect ..." particularly when you have a period like the pandemic: "Are our estimates today still aligned with the trajectory we are on?" but also the Island's assumptions that are really captured in things like the Bridging Island Plan of: "Are we going to import sand or are we going to import aggregate or not?" So you are looking both at sort of long-term trends, but then are there any disruption factors that mean the long-term trend is not going to apply.

Deputy M.R. Scott:

Okay. Constable Honeycombe, before I go on, have you got anything to ask at this point? I have just got ...

The Connétable of St. Ouen:

No, not yet.

Deputy M.R. Scott:

Yes, you are fine. The J.C.R.A. (Jersey Competition Regulatory Authority), its 2022 freight logistics market study found that the situation in Jersey, in particular in freight logistics, does not reflect economic fundamentals, for example, that freight logistics cannot be characterised as a natural monopoly type activity and that there are options that would help improve competitive outcomes and benefit consumers. We - the panel - question the threats and benefits of single market operators and competition in our recent letter. Please could you outline why you hold the position that dependence on a single or limited number of suppliers can pose risks?

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

Yes, of course. I think our primary objective is one of resilience, so we are looking at resilience of entire supply chains first and foremost. I think for an Island like us, there are certainly arguments for and against single larger players or a multitude of smaller players. From a resilience perspective, both have pros and cons. I mean, in terms of the detail of the question, do you want to feed in?

Chief of Staff, Ports of Jersey:

Yes. I think, picking up on what Matt said, so our public response to the J.C.R.A.'s call for information obviously was used by them. I think we, as everyone else is, are cognisant of the recommendations that they have made, so I do not think it is for Ports of Jersey to opine necessarily on how a market

works. That is clearly within the remit of the J.C.R.A. I think, as Matt said, our primary function is resilience, so yes, I think we are working hard to implement the recommendations that the J.C.R.A. made in that report and the ones particularly that apply to us directly.

Deputy M.R. Scott:

Okay, Constable Honeycombe, would you like to come in now?

The Connétable of St. Ouen:

No, happy to continue.

Deputy M.R. Scott:

Well, I think yours is the next question.

The Connétable of St. Ouen:

Yes. Good afternoon, gentlemen.

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

Good afternoon.

Harbour Master, Ports of Jersey:

Afternoon.

The Connétable of St. Ouen:

The first question is please can you identify what effective competition means to you?

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

That is a very broad question. In the context of Jersey's supply chain or more broadly, almost at a philosophical level?

Deputy M.R. Scott:

I think we are talking about the context of the supply chain, given the nature of our review.

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

Okay. I think then the competition ... I guess we have sort of 2 sides to it. So as we previously mentioned in the last question, our primary concern is resilience, but closely followed by efficiency. I think we both ... I mean, my degree was in economics at uni. There are pros and cons. I remember studying the advantages of perfect competition in terms of driving down prices and much more efficient marketplaces, but then on the flipside there are also advantages of monopolies in terms of

the ability to innovate when you are secure in your market position. I think it is evenly balanced. From a Ports of Jersey perspective, which I assume you would want me to answer in, our primary concerns are resilience and efficiency, as we have laid out, and I think our view is with the J.C.R.A. report. For Ports of Jersey, as an infrastructure provider, it is not really our place to opine on government policy. What we are very, very interested in is the resilience of the entire supply chain and how it works together to promote efficiency. I am not sure if that answers or if there is a particular angle ...

Deputy M.R. Scott:

May I just ask a follow-up question, Constable? Just given your background in terms of your economic understanding and in terms of your experience, to what extent does the size of the jurisdiction perhaps affect this balance? We have heard about pros and cons between the single market operator and the competition, so how does that affect the balance?

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

I think absolutely, there are ... I think there are, I am sure, a number of examples across the Island and in different sectors as well where the nature of competition will lead to a market consolidating around one major player in its own right. I think that is a natural circumstance. It is for the likes of the Competition Regulatory Authority to opine if that is affecting the market or not. So I do not think necessarily monopoly positions are something to be frowned on, because they can be a natural outcome of a market functioning. I guess where the concerns will come is: is that then inhibiting the efficiency of the market's operation? In smaller jurisdictions, of course it is harder to sustain many, many larger players all competing and serving different parts of the market. The smaller the market, really the minimum viable segments you can serve gets smaller as well.

Deputy M.R. Scott:

Just to be clear, you are saying the extent to which a single operator could inhibit the efficiency, or did I get the wrong ...

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

Sorry, I am not ...

Deputy M.R. Scott:

Like dictators generally are meant to be more efficient, you know?

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

No. It would be wrong for me to speak on behalf of the Competition Regulatory Authority, but you develop a dominant market position, for instance, then you have got more of an ability to raise prices, I guess, ultimately.

Deputy M.R. Scott:

So there is that potential - not that you are saying that - but there is ...

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

Sorry, and ...

Deputy M.R. Scott:

... there will be that concern for potential - dare I say it - abuse, possibly. That could be a concern that would need intervention in some way, shape or form?

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

Absolutely. I am sure that is where really the J.C.R.A. ... wherever there is a dominant sector or a sector that has a dominant player, that is where their concerns would be, I imagine.

Deputy M.R. Scott:

I see, thank you.

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

Ours are much more around resilience.

Deputy M.R. Scott:

Thank you. Back to you, Constable.

The Connétable of St. Ouen:

Would the financial sustainability of a single operator help to ensure continuity, servicing various ports and with the supply chain?

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

Do you want to ...

Chief of Staff, Ports of Jersey:

I mean, the simple quick answer to that is yes. I think where there is a single operator in any one of the different segments of the supply chain, obviously where there is a single operator, the financial

stability of that single operator is of enormous importance. I think that is the simple answer. Does that answer the question?

The Connétable of St. Ouen:

Yes, interesting. Could government action to support competition be regarded as a threat to the supply chain and how can certainty of outcome be achieved in the absence of quantitative analysis?

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

I guess we can offer an opinion, but of course that is more ... you know, it is Government through J.C.R.A. to say what is the right level of competition in a particular market. I think the nature of your question, it is almost the 2 sides of the same coin, is it not, that as consumers we want competition to get best possible prices, but the risk is do you have a number of players that are not financially sustainable into the future, where maybe a dominant player would be? I mean, detail of answer ...

Chief of Staff, Ports of Jersey:

No, I do not think there is much more to add. A single operator in a regulated market, I think there is certain levels of comfort and safety that are brought by regulation. I think where you have ... and again, I am thinking specifically about the different tranches of the supply chain, so you have got infrastructure - Ports of Jersey - regulated, you have got the ferry provider regulated through an operator ... a single ferry provider currently regulated through an operating agreement and then you have got the logistics market effectively as the glue in the middle.

Deputy M.R. Scott:

Sorry, Constable, can I just ask a question? So do you feel - and it may again be an answer you do not have - that the level of regulation is sufficient in that respect in terms of the competition and the ability to intervene in the case of the single operator then or are you not ...

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

Well, I suppose different aspects of the supply chain. So we are a single operator. I would argue we are probably the most heavily regulated company on the Island. I think the operating agreements with Condor kind of gives Condor a de facto monopolistic position, so it is maybe not quite as heavily regulated as we are, and then the freight logistics, as Darren was saying, there is less regulation again. So ...

Deputy M.R. Scott:

In terms of just generally the potential for abuse of market position, if you are a dominant operator, a single operator, which might be an awkward question, I suppose, in the circumstances, so I am thinking ...

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

Sorry, I could definitely say from a Ports of Jersey perspective, is the level of regulation robust and the process that the Jersey Competition Regulatory Authority goes through to understand our business and to ... where we have a monopolistic position to say: "Okay, this is an acceptable level of price change" I would say it is very robust, but ...

Deputy M.R. Scott:

What about other operators in the supply chain?

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

I think that is much trickier to judge and it would be wrong for us to say is it an appropriate level of regulation. It is certainly a lot less than the level of regulation on us. I would say that for us we definitely operate critical lifeline infrastructure for the Island, so it is appropriate. Probably with Condor, I would argue that the ferries are also critical infrastructure for the Island. I think it gets a little bit trickier because it is easier to compete. The investment and the capital investments for a port operator, where our assets are worth hundreds of millions, whereas a logistics operator are obviously a lot lower, so it is more feasible for competition to exist there.

Deputy M.R. Scott:

Thank you.

The Connétable of St. Ouen:

There are a number of examples of companies operating in the Island's supply chain which have ceased trading, particularly in the area of freight logistics. To your knowledge, what analysis has been undertaken to establish a reason for their demise?

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

That is probably ... do you want to take it first?

Chief of Staff, Ports of Jersey:

I think it is easier to talk about more recent times. I think there is no one ... there is no kind of silver bullet single factor. I think there is a combination of factors of why those businesses have not continued, so I think a number of those factors are ... I mean, ultimately it is underpinned by an inability to attract a reasonable market share and I think again a bit ... you know, without wishing to paraphrase the competition regulator's report, I think those factors are captured in that report. We can debate to what extent they have ebbed and flowed over time, but I think that report is a very good assessment of what those individual factors are. It is a complex business. I think all of those

... operationally, I think Jersey's supply chain, from a freight logistics perspective, works exceptionally well. I think the questions or the issues we are discussing and debating this morning are largely those that underpin this.

[12:30]

There are economic questions. Operationally I think the sector works well.

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

Just adding to that, I would say from the resilience, where our prime focus is, you would say the market is working phenomenally well. It has managed to weather Brexit, it has managed to weather the pandemic without any noticeable interruption to the flow of goods and services. The focus being on the efficiency, it is a lot greyer, is it not? It is a bit like: are the prices as low as they can be? I guess it is a very subjective thing.

The Connétable of St. Ouen:

In your view, what were the main reasons for the collapse of these businesses?

Deputy M.R. Scott:

Do you feel you have answered that?

Chief of Staff, Ports of Jersey:

Sorry, I did not quite hear that.

Deputy M.R. Scott:

I think you might feel you have answered that. In your view, what were the main reasons for the collapse of these businesses? I think that has been answered really, has it not? Unless you have got anything to add. No.

Chief of Staff, Ports of Jersey:

I do not ...

The Connétable of St. Ouen:

Would the failure of previously operating companies affect the ability for Jersey's economy to support multiple operations within the supply chain?

Chief of Staff, Ports of Jersey:

I think the answer to that question depends on which element of the supply ... I mean, following the question through, if we kind of set to one side ferries, set to one side the infrastructure and concentrate ...

Deputy M.R. Scott:

It was in the context of freight logistics, if that helps.

Chief of Staff, Ports of Jersey:

Yes, so it is the freight logistics bit in the middle. Yes, I think there are a multitude of factors as to why. I think the Government recently consulted on a sectoral policy for the port sector. There is references in there to the supply chain and how effective the freight logistics element is and what effective ... there is questions in there about what effective competition looks like, so I think that is an ongoing discussion for the Island, not necessarily for Ports of Jersey. It is something over which operationally we are responsible for. The economics of that sector are ultimately a matter for Government and the Minister, upon advice from the competition regulator.

Deputy M.R. Scott:

You mentioned Government. Was this a consultation? Sorry, we did not catch you there.

Chief of Staff, Ports of Jersey:

There was a consultation that finished I think a fortnight ago around a sectoral policy for the port sector.

Deputy M.R. Scott:

Right, okay.

Chief of Staff, Ports of Jersey:

Which is not just Ports of Jersey, it is basically everything we are talking about and more this morning.

Deputy M.R. Scott:

Thank you.

The Connétable of St. Ouen:

Ports of Jersey have identified the failure of the common operator could cause material problems to the resilience of the Island's supply chain. What will the impact of any future failures be upon the supply chain and what contingencies are being considered in the case of future collapses?

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

Do you want to have a go on that one?

Harbour Master, Ports of Jersey:

Yes. I think kind of looking back a few years, the Island was probably a bit naive around how the supply chain operated. Brexit was a great eye-opener for everybody, so the work which went into contingency planning around Brexit I think brought together operators, governments and everybody began to consider the supply chain as a whole. So the supply chain is an ecosystem, so there are individual blocks of it, but it is all reliant on each other. That contingency planning we carried out in Brexit has kind of continued on and so as we have kind of then moved through the pandemic, a lot of the things that we relied on were the contingency plans we had done for Brexit, and as we have moved out of the pandemic into what I would regard as relatively business as normal, we have continued that kind of contingency planning. As I say, that is done alongside with partners with the supply chain, but also alongside colleagues in emergency planning in government, but also working with agencies in the U.K. (United Kingdom) as well to kind of ensure that supply chain contingency.

The Connétable of St. Ouen:

The panel understands that Woodside Logistics, which is owned by Jersey Post, which is itself a States-owned entity, is one of the larger competitors to the majority market share in the Island's logistics services. What support, as the ports operator, do you give to Woodside Logistics?

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

If I take the first answer to that and I will pass on to Bill. Obviously as a States-owned entity, we do not receive ... if we are talking about pure financial support in the first instance and then Bill can answer regarding operational support, so we operate as an independent company with an independent board. We do not receive taxpayer funding, but nor do we ...

Deputy M.R. Scott:

Sorry, have you ... can I just interrupt there? The question is in relation to Woodside Logistics. It is not in relation to Ports of Jersey.

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

Sorry, was it the support that we give?

Deputy M.R. Scott:

Yes, so the question was that having identified that Woodside Logistics is a States-owned entity - or at least Jersey Port, its owner, is - the question was what support, as the ports operator, do you give to Woodside Logistics?

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

Sorry.

Deputy M.R. Scott:

No problem. It is just ...

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

Financially we were saying we do not receive nor do we give any financial support. So we have commercial ... at a financial commercial level, we have a commercial agreement in place with all of the freight operators, depending on, if you like, the amount of space they take and they pay harbour dues, but operationally - which I think is probably the nature of the question - of how does it work on the ground ...

Deputy M.R. Scott:

Let us come back to ... so these agreements are all separately negotiated, all commercial. I know you cannot give us too much in the way of specific commercial information, but in terms of them, the nature of those agreements, it is just getting an understanding of that.

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

Sorry, so the primary - and I will look to you in case I miss anything - agreements that we would have in place with the logistics operators would be a landlord/tenant relationship for property that would be rented from us in and around the harbour or on the harbour estate. I am trying to think of ... I am not aware of any other ...

Deputy M.R. Scott:

On commercial terms in each case?

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

Yes, depending on the size, the location, the quality of the accommodation.

Deputy M.R. Scott:

So basically the fact it is a States-owned entity is not relevant to the content?

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

No, no.

Deputy M.R. Scott:

Right, thank you.

The Connétable of St. Ouen:

Ports of Jersey have suggested that regulatory oversight and, where appropriate, intervention may be required in circumstances where there may be insufficient market scale to enable competition. To ensure similar outcomes that would be provided in a competitive market, what elements of economic regulation is possible within the supply chain, in your view?

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

I will look to my right and let Darren have a swing at this, but I guess it is the normal tools that would be open to any competition regulator. The point at which they believe that a market is consolidated to such an extent that market power could be levied, then there is a range of options that would be open to the competition regulator to address just how consolidated that market is, but in terms of ... and I am sure we are talking about the detail about the freight logistics market and particularly the maritime supply chain.

Chief of Staff, Ports of Jersey:

I am not entirely sure there is a great deal to add to that. I think the tools that are at the J.C.R.A.'s disposal are there in law. I mean, ultimately it is a question for them. I do not think there is a great deal we can add to that answer.

The Connétable of St. Ouen:

Do you have any views or experiences as to licensing conditions and enforcement for freight logistics companies?

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

I cannot ... personally I do not have them in a similar jurisdiction, so as we said earlier, the dynamics of a market like Jersey's, a relatively small Island with its geography and its size of total market, no, I do not have any comparable experiences.

Deputy M.R. Scott:

Or views? Sorry, Constable, I was just following up, just asking about views.

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

I think the views are probably the obvious ones that Darren is alluding to, that competition regulators have certain arrows in their quiver that they could take if they believed that a market is not operating efficiently, and freight logistics would be no different to that.

Deputy M.R. Scott:

Thank you.

The Connétable of St. Ouen:

One submission to the panel suggested that the cost of freight deliveries in the Island is high. What opportunities can Ports of Jersey influence in order to minimise costs of operating in the supply chain?

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

Yes, I think that is a really good question. That is definitely ... it is very much a focus of our minds, that as the infrastructure provider we are one of the key links in the chain. I will offer it up to Bill in a second just on practically how we could go about that. I think the other side, both the airport and the harbour, they are both ecosystems of a number of different players and the reality is that Ports of Jersey is the airport authority and the port authority. Probably the analogy would be we are the conductor of an orchestra, so we can bring the parties together and then the more the parties collaborate, the more efficient the end-to-end process can be, but maybe Bill, just from a Ports of Jersey perspective and thinking about the Harbour Master Plan, the things that are forefront of our mind on how we can improve efficiency.

Harbour Master, Ports of Jersey:

A lot of it is around providing a level playing field, so particularly around the Harbour Master Plan, yes, consolidating activities into single areas so we are not running multiple operations over multiple sites, providing level and set access into those areas. I think again, by pulling ... as Darren has described it before, the supply chain is built in blocks. You have kind of got the ferry part, if you like, the bridge, then you have got the Ports of Jersey part, the bridgehead into the Island, and then you got the logistics part. It is kind of tying all that together. So we have all got our individual operations that we worry about, but of course our individual operations impact on each other's operations and it is trying to get the ... there is the physical infrastructure you need to provide and you want to get that as efficient as possible, but it is, as Matt is saying, playing that role as a conductor, bringing the parties together to understand the synergies between one part of the supply chain to the other. Certainly around the Harbour Master Plan, where we are kind of moving operations, the port has lots of different operations scattered around at the moment. By kind of collocating all those activities together, you have got freight coming into the Island in one place, a distribution zone directly adjacent to it, the onward distribution on from there, you can then begin to see how you can bring in processes of digitisation to start putting efficiencies into all the supply chain.

Deputy M.R. Scott:

So that is in the context of the ports and other areas, airports?

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

In some ways it is different players, but it is the same process, if you like. So the key players at the airport are the airport authority, so we do things like air traffic control, we do security, we do the negotiation and liaison with the airline. The airline, they sell the tickets that bring the volume of passengers - of freight, for that matter - but they will also set the service requirement of the ground handler, so how many check-in staff they have will almost determine how long a queue there is going to be at check-in. Then the other key player at an airport are the concessions, so the retailers, the car rental operators. Absolutely unequivocally, where all the links in that chain form a community and recognisably have one customer, and how do we work together to best serve that customer, they are the best-performing airport in the world.

Deputy M.R. Scott:

Coming back to the supply chain, I mean, what is the actual ... in terms of we were talking about the opportunities that you can influence in order to minimise costs of operating the supply chain. I mean, generally the constraints in terms of your own fees and costs and their impact on the supply chain, that is set out in your operating agreement?

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

That is right.

Deputy M.R. Scott:

You perhaps might inform ...

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

Well, we have a pricing framework on how our prices can change and then we have a regulated list of prices.

Deputy M.R. Scott:

So how does that work in terms of if you are thinking of for any reason increasing costs?

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

Yes. It is not a straightforward answer, but I will have a go. So at the harbour there is ... we have regulated prices and a good deal of those is where there is no realistic ... you know, the Island has one port, so for bringing goods into St. Helier, there is only one ... you know, the market has not got a list of ports that it could play off against each other, so I think it is quite right that the harbour dues are regulated and all the operators are paying the same amount in terms of a harbour due.

Deputy M.R. Scott:

How are they tested in terms of how does one establish whether they are commercial in a sort of objective way?

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

I guess that is more of a question for the Competition Regulatory Authority than for us, but again it is going to be ... they are looking at 2 things. They are looking at how efficiently are we operating to ensure that our prices are not excessive, but equally, it is not just for the infrastructure we have got today. The working assumption is the infrastructure is going to work tomorrow, in a year's time and in 10 years' time, so they are constantly looking at our future investment plans as well to say the harbour dues and also ...

Deputy M.R. Scott:

Sorry, that is Government, that is not the J.C.R.A., I take it, or ...

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

Well, it would be discharged - and correct me if I get it wrong here - it would be delegated to the Competition Regulatory Authority, so the Government would say ...

Deputy M.R. Scott:

So they are there, okay.

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

... "We want the market to be efficient." It would be for the J.C.R.A. to review the detail.

Deputy M.R. Scott:

Yes, they are the ones. Okay.

[12:45]

Just when Constable Honeycombe was asking about Woodside Logistics and you explained basically your landlord/tenant relationship you have got there, I want to just confirm: are any government resources used in this support? We have had what support, as the ports operator, do you give to Woodside Logistics. Are any government resources used in this support? So I am saying are there government-owned buildings on P.o.J. (Ports of Jersey) land that may be used that give support in any way?

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

Not that I am aware of.

Deputy M.R. Scott:

Yes, okay. I just thought I would check that.

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

No, we have a shareholder relationship with Government.

Deputy M.R. Scott:

Okay, thank you. We will just move on. All right, I am going to have some quick-fire questions generally to try and move things along.

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

No problem.

Deputy M.R. Scott:

But thank you. The J.C.R.A. have indicated that ... sorry, this is the topic of the Ports Policy Group. The J.C.R.A. have indicated that consistent with their general approach to market studies, they engaged with key government officials as part of the market study to ensure their concerns and viewpoints were captured. Did the Ports of Jersey provide direction on the need for the establishment of terms of reference of the freight logistics market study and, if so, can details of any such direction be given in writing?

Chief of Staff, Ports of Jersey:

It is a quick question. The quick answer is no.

Deputy M.R. Scott:

Right, okay.

Chief of Staff, Ports of Jersey:

We provided a public written response to that review, along with everybody else.

Deputy M.R. Scott:

Thank you. The panel is aware that there are a number of Government of Jersey officer groups that relate to the Island supply chain. Can you outline how you interact with these?

Chief of Staff, Ports of Jersey:

I will have a first go. Again, in the interests of time, there are, as you have pointed out, a variety of government groups, from the Emergencies Council through to a supply chain group that was formed about the recent storm. I think we are - Ports of Jersey are - part of all of those groups in one form or another, so colleagues will sit on all of those groups. Matt is a member of the ... the C.E.O. (Chief Executive Officer) is a member of the Emergencies Council.

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

The Resilience Forum, as it is now called.

Chief of Staff, Ports of Jersey:

The Resilience Forum, as it is now called. So yes, we are involved in all of those groups.

Deputy M.R. Scott:

Right, thank you. In your submission you have highlighted liaison and consultation with the Ports Policy Ministerial Group.

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

Yes.

Deputy M.R. Scott:

Please can you elaborate as to the information and advice you give to this group?

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

If I set the scene, the Ports Policy Ministerial Group was a construct that was created at incorporation and it was for ... so we have a shareholder relationship with the Minister for Treasury and Resources. I believe the Ports Policy Ministerial Group is designed for the other Ministers to give advice to the Treasury to give a broader perspective on whole of Government ... what they would like to see from Ports of Jersey. In my time, so I arrived on the Island 4 years ago, obviously with the pandemic those meetings did not take place. We have had meetings starting earlier this year. I think the nature of those meetings, it is a strategic level view on Ports of Jersey and ensuring that our activities are prioritised and our ambitions are aligned with Government's.

Deputy M.R. Scott:

Okay, thank you. What role and responsibilities will the Ports of Jersey have in working with the trade associations, namely the Chamber of Commerce Logistics and Supply Chain Group?

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

Do you want to ...

Chief of Staff, Ports of Jersey:

Yes. We have worked extremely closely with them, primarily since they were formed on the redevelopment of Elizabeth. That has been a constructive relationship and we will continue to do so. I think I would hope that the focus of that group widens from purely around one thing, which has been the redevelopment of Elizabeth Harbour, on to some of the things Bill covered in an earlier answer around more operational issues. But no, anything that gets groups of people together with the supply chain and the resilience of the Island is good for us to work with.

Deputy M.R. Scott:

In your view, what powers do the trade association have, if any?

Chief of Staff, Ports of Jersey:

As it stands, there is not one. There is a working group of the Chamber of Commerce, so it has natural powers. It is a powerful voice, it provides us with knowledge and expertise, but they do not have any formal powers in that sense.

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

If I may, I think when you are developing infrastructure, particularly of scale, particularly the nature of a company like Ports of Jersey on an Island of this size, taking account of and understanding the different stakeholder perspectives is tremendously important. I think both the Chamber of Commerce and the likes of the I.o.D. (Institute of Directors), they provide a way of aggregating and consolidating those opinions. So we very much welcome the engagement and while I think the strict "what powers do they have" ... I think there is both hard and soft. I think the soft, it is tremendously important to us.

Deputy M.R. Scott:

Thank you. Does this meet ... sorry, I am trying to work out how this question fits in myself. So we are basically talking about your roles and responsibilities and do they meet the vision to drive efficiency and support? So this combination, your roles and responsibilities, the trade association, do they meet the vision to drive efficiency and to support innovation in the sector, as set out in the recommendation of the J.C.R.A. 2022 report?

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

I will have first go again and defer to my colleagues. I think alignment. If I have learnt anything over sort of 25 years' worth of business, the importance of identifying alignment and then understanding how we deliver an aligned outcome together is phenomenally important. I mean, I think the detail ... so I think they are a great mechanism for enabling that, but the detail of it ...

Chief of Staff, Ports of Jersey:

Yes, it has worked extremely ... I think the knowledge that that group and that sector possess, working with the knowledge that Ports of Jersey possess, has worked extremely well and has led to a solid plan so far for the redevelopment of Elizabeth, because that is what we have focused on with that group since they formed, but as Matt alluded to in the previous answer, the power of that group, we do not have ... Ports of Jersey, like any organisation, do not have a monopoly on being right. I think we come up with a powerful solution by the challenge that is represented by working with the knowledge and wisdom that is represented by that group.

Harbour Master, Ports of Jersey:

I think the other good thing about that group is then how it plays into other Chamber groups as well, does it not? I think we have talked today about the logistics chain from kind of the seaside to the distribution side, but of course that then feeds into the retail side as well, so of course there is an equivalent retail group, so it is then again how you pull the supply chain all together. I think it is an important recommendation by J.C.R.A. to make and I think it is an important first step or first step stone into doing that.

Deputy M.R. Scott:

Have any concerns been raised by this group in relation to the Elizabeth Harbour proposals?

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

Has there?

Harbour Master, Ports of Jersey:

Yes, so I think through many of these processes, within that group you have got individual operations, which look at their operations and then kind of looking at the broader operations. So I think you see some quite dynamic conversations about how the space in Elizabeth is used, so how much is prioritised for freight forwarding, how much is prioritised for passenger handling and how much is prioritised for parking, how much is prioritised for what we call restricted zone, and I think it has been really useful in that. I think there are differences of opinion, so if you ask the ferry operator how much space they want for passengers, all of it. If you ask the freight distribution company: "How much space do you want for freight distribution?" "All of it." The reality is using the space we have got, we have got to accurately and fairly distribute the zones to make the port efficient.

Deputy M.R. Scott:

So you do not have enough space to accommodate all the requirement, what they ...

Harbour Master, Ports of Jersey:

No, we do have enough space to accommodate all the requirements, but I suspect each industry ... it is like anything. If you have a single garage, you might want a double garage. There is enough space within the redevelopment to provide the operations we need, but I think during those conversations I think there has been a desire from some operators to have more space.

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

I think it was probably ...

Deputy M.R. Scott:

So you mean more space than what? More space than at present or more space than are in the plans?

Harbour Master, Ports of Jersey:

I think both at times.

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

I think what the group does really well, it has almost got 2 purposes. One is to ensure there is a common understanding of what it is that we are trying to do and then the second level is when we have got that understanding, almost the driving of how do we allocate space, for instance. You know, something that J.C.R.A. would have a very keen eye on is the more space you build, ultimately the higher the price that is going to get passed on to the customer is going to be. You could build the most enormous port in the world. Would that represent value for the taxpayer? Possibly not.

Deputy M.R. Scott:

So the nature of the concerns then, if you were talking about space, that you are kind of having feedback that perhaps the space is not as much as you would like, but the response to that is that that will mean it will cost more for you to use that space?

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

I think there is probably 2 sides to that. I think the first one is the understanding, so it is the understanding of: how did you determine that the space that we are creating - and we are talking about providing 30 years' worth of resilience - is appropriate? I think naturally, if I had a freight forwarding business or if I was a retailer on the Island, I would be very interested to know: is the port going to work in the future and how is it going to affect my pricing in the future? So there is kind of both sides. I think where the discussions have gone through is to explain: "Here is the approach. Here is how much additional space we are creating. In the light of things such as the J.C.R.A.'s

feedback, here is how we are looking at allocating between the different uses within the supply chain.”

Deputy M.R. Scott:

So how did you determine the space was appropriate?

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

I think that is the output of all the projected ... it is what space do we think we are going to need to accommodate for in the future, so right back to the role of the consortium and the things like the Bridging Island Plan and the work that MDS Transmodal undertook to say: “This is what we think the volume is going to be in the future.” So then the engineering guys would say: “Okay, if this is the volume we are going to need to accommodate, this is the space that we are going to need to require.”

Deputy M.R. Scott:

So is there like a disagreement in that respect and about how much volume they are going to need? Because I am just trying to establish the difference between, you know: “Well, nice to have, but we would like so much more” opposed to: “Well, we think you need that much more” and they are saying: “Well, we think we need different” so what ...

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

How would you answer that?

Chief of Staff, Ports of Jersey:

I was trying to tie all this together with the original question that you just asked. I think some of it, it is a bit like the difference between a States Member and the chair of a panel. I think being a freight forwarder and then representing the group, I think there is different interests and I think you have to ...

Deputy M.R. Scott:

I find that very difficult to relate in terms of my role, so ...

Chief of Staff, Ports of Jersey:

But just in terms of ... so I think you are asking the ... so when you are a member of the group, of the supply chain group that are a subset of the Chamber of Commerce, you are kind of wearing an Island hat rather than an individual business hat and I think that was the struggle. So ultimately the answer to the question is, yes, that group, the Chamber of Commerce, support the redevelopment

of Elizabeth Harbour. It creates additional space. How that space is utilised and allocated is the subject of additional work.

Deputy M.R. Scott:

Do they feel it is going to meet their needs? The people who are going to be using this then in terms of we are talking about freight space, do they feel that it will meet their future needs? Is that established? I am ...

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

I guess the ultimate is within the context of the Chamber of Commerce and the sub-committees of the Chamber of Commerce, we have had a number of interactions with them to explain the scheme, to all the different dimensions that you could look at that from. I think, as you would expect in any sort of stakeholder engagement, where that is now concluded is the Chamber of Commerce has come and said: "We endorse this scheme. We think this is the right scheme for the Island."

Deputy M.R. Scott:

So they do believe it supports their needs?

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

Yes, yes.

Deputy M.R. Scott:

Right, thank you. A ports policy framework was recently consulted upon and apparently it closed on 14th November, which will provide direction to both Ports of Jersey and the J.C.R.A. How will this influence work being undertaken regarding the Island's supply chain?

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

I think it is a document that we welcome. I think Darren touched on this earlier, that is much more than Ports of Jersey, it is Ports of Jersey and the wider ecosystem that operate at the airport and the harbour, so I am sure you have had a chance to skim the document.

[13:00]

It is everything from safety and security and sustainability to strategic air connectivity, maritime supply chain resilience, how we develop the harbour and airport estates, our P.S.O.s (public service obligations) et cetera. I think more than anything else - being terribly parochial here - as a C.E.O., the clearer it is for me to understand the wishes of my shareholder, the easier it is to put a strategic business plan in place that is aligned to deliver those. So from a documenting and clarifying exactly

what it is that Government are looking for from the wider port sector, very much a document that we welcome and it provides very helpful direction. I do not know if there is anything you would add to that.

Deputy M.R. Scott:

Or have you any elements of the draft framework that you would like to comment on?

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

Yes. I mean, I think there is things such as strategic air connectivity - it is an obvious one - that it does not say anywhere today that connectivity is a good thing for the Island. I think intuitively we all know it is and it is very much the lifeblood of the Island. I think this provides a mandate for saying: "We are looking to grow our connectivity" and the particular areas we would like to see that growth, such as off-peak or growth into Europe or exploring opportunities for the Channel Islands to act as a hub between northern France and here. So there are many, many areas that we could pull on and say: "Okay, it provides clarity."

Deputy M.R. Scott:

We note that ... sorry, did you want to add anything?

Harbour Master, Ports of Jersey:

No, no.

Deputy M.R. Scott:

We note that the Government Plan 2024-27 indicates that the Government will be seeking to work jointly with Guernsey where possible. What interaction has the Ports of Jersey had with counterparts in Guernsey in relation to the Island's supply chain?

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

Yes, at an operational level, we have very, very close links. Maybe that is one for Bill.

Harbour Master, Ports of Jersey:

Yes. Certainly operationally we work really closely with our colleagues in Guernsey Harbours, so when we are looking at things like contingency plans for the supply chain, that will be very much done with Guernsey, and kind of on a day-to-day basis, the way that ferries are routing through the islands, that is a thing that the operational teams are in close contact with, so operationally I would say there is a strong relationship.

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

Very much the same at the airport, where things like the way that we manage the Channel Islands airspace, it is very much a collaboration operation, where again our interests are very much aligned. We want flows of goods and people in and out of the Island to be as smooth and resilient as it can be.

Deputy M.R. Scott:

Good. The panel has heard of the importance of Portsmouth in the Island supply chain. What interaction do you have with stakeholders there?

Harbour Master, Ports of Jersey:

It is very similar to Guernsey. Again, I have talked about Brexit quite a bit, but Brexit was a key change in that. Portsmouth International Port is owned by Portsmouth City Council and they are part of the Hampshire Resilience Forum. As we went through the contingency planning, I think Portsmouth understands the important role it plays, not only for the Channel Islands really but also for the Isle of Wight's resilience, so it understands its role almost as a remote lifeline port for the Island. But yes, we are in regular contact and have regular interaction with them around our contingency plans.

Deputy M.R. Scott:

Are there any port authorities you interact with?

Harbour Master, Ports of Jersey:

Yes. We are part of the British Ports Association, which is a broader group of British ports. We are also part of the U.K. Harbour Masters' Association and specifically the South Coast Harbour Master Association, so I mean, all the ports along the south coast - Poole, Southampton, Portsmouth, Newhaven - we are all part of that group and, yes, we meet twice a year and discuss port and harbour master type things.

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

There are similar things on the airport side as well through the Airport Operators Association.

Deputy M.R. Scott:

I am just going to draw your attention ... yes, more or less we are just running over the scheduled time for the hearing, so we may well ... I do not know if you are able to just stay another couple of minutes and perhaps we can just try and squeeze another question or 2 in, Constable Honeycombe. But would you be happy just to stay on just for a couple more questions ...

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

Of course.

Deputy M.R. Scott:

... and for us to follow up in writing? Just to explain, I mean, I am sure you already know this, part of the reason why we are questioning you now in this way is for transparency so that we can ... people can see and understand these answers disclosed, and likewise that is what we hope to do with our questions in writing, you know ...

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

Of course.

Deputy M.R. Scott:

... and the response can be publicised. So perhaps if I could just move on to you, Constable Honeycombe, to ask a couple of questions. Thank you.

The Connétable of St. Ouen:

Yes. We have received submissions from stakeholders that they feel their information in the government consultation was not taken into account. Can an example be given as to the changes in policy direction following the consultation by Ports of Jersey, the stakeholders and the supply chain?

Chief of Staff, Ports of Jersey:

I mean, we sound a bit like a stuck record, but it has taken a lot of attention over the last 2 years. I think the best example or the first one that springs to mind is the plans for the redevelopment of Elizabeth Harbour, which obviously is the biggest piece of infrastructure that the Island supply chain has. I think we have almost been in ... or it feels like we have been in almost permanent consultation mode with stakeholders, and at time the public, around the plans for Elizabeth. I think it is fair to say - I think Matt echoed this in the speech to the Chamber last week or the week before - the planning application has Ports of Jersey's name on it, but it feels much more than that. It feels like the Island's submission to planning because of the support we have had from stakeholders. That support has been challenging at times in terms of they have got different ideas, but I think ultimately we have ended up with a very strong planning application, not because just of the efforts of Ports of Jersey, but because of the efforts of the entire community, importantly stakeholders, who have a lot of knowledge around that planning application. It is a model that we would repeat.

Deputy M.R. Scott:

That was recently revised though, was it not, to allow longer, so what should we understand from the consultation that has led to this?

Chief of Staff, Ports of Jersey:

It is a massive planning application. It has been revised. The reason for the revisions were effectively ongoing conversations. It almost perfectly answers the question for us. Those revisions were because of improvements to the plan, not fundamental changes, but refinements and improvements because of the ongoing regular consultation and dialogue that we have with stakeholders. It is much more, it is much deeper than we send out a survey, we get responses back and we do or do not do something. You know, there is weekly dialogue with a range of stakeholders around Elizabeth.

Deputy M.R. Scott:

Thank you. Constable?

The Connétable of St. Ouen:

How will that consultation with stakeholders be undertaken moving forward?

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

I think we have a range of stakeholders and a range of different ways in which we engage, so one of the things that we will be looking to do next year is having ... we have completed ... or sorry, we are in the process of completing a master plan for the future development of the airport, so there will be a very close engagement with a raft of stakeholders from, you know, if you imagine ... and at different levels, so the engagement with an airline that will be really interested in: "How quickly can I turn around my aircraft, boarding and disembarking passengers, and how much is this going to cost me?" right down to what opportunities will it create for real estate development or for people within the wider aviation supply chain for them to develop. As we move through the development - and fingers crossed we receive approval for our planning application for Elizabeth - we will eventually move into a construction phase, so ensuring that the construction is undertaken in a very sensitive way. We will look to develop and regenerate the wider harbour estate. There will be again very ... we are very conscious of our role, you know, not just as custodian of the airport and the harbour infrastructure, but we are a really sizeable lever for economic growth, for transition in how we decarbonise our economy, for how we, as an Island, become more diverse and more inclusive in the way that we operate. So the engagement that we have will be very, very multifaceted, but it is something that we are absolutely committed to.

Deputy M.R. Scott:

Okay.

The Connétable of St. Ouen:

So the redevelopment of the port, will you be able to use a local contractor or do you have to go to a specialist marine contractor for this sort of work?

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

I think it will be a multitude of contractors. So the procurement process is something that we are ... it is one where it is very easy to get the cart before the horse, so we need to get the planning application before we can confirm the best way to undertake the procurement. If you were to ask me how I envisage that will work, I think it will be a mixture of the local supply chain and specialist contractors from off-Island.

Deputy M.R. Scott:

Right.

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

But that combination is very important to us.

Deputy M.R. Scott:

Constable, I am going to suggest that we pause here, at least finish this hearing so that we perhaps can pursue the rest of the questions in writing. I am afraid there are a few. Time has run away.

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

No problem.

Deputy M.R. Scott:

But basically thank you very much for attending our hearing and for giving these answers, publicly too, and addressing our panel. Thank you to the supporting Greffe officers who have been attending to us and to any members of the public who were watching or who will watch it. Thanks once again.

Chief Executive Officer, Ports of Jersey:

Thank you very much.

[13:10]