

# STATES OF JERSEY



## MINISTER FOR HEALTH AND SOCIAL SERVICES: VOTE OF NO CONFIDENCE

---

Lodged au Greffe on 8th April 2009  
by Deputy R.G. Le Hérissier of St. Saviour

---

STATES GREFFE

## **PROPOSITION**

**THE STATES are asked to decide whether they are of opinion –**

that they have no confidence in the Minister for Health and Social Services.

DEPUTY R.G. LE HÉRISSIER OF ST. SAVIOUR

Note: In accordance with Standing Order 22(a) this proposition has been signed by the following additional members –

Deputy A.E. Jeune of St. Brelade

Deputy A.T. Dupré of St. Clement

Deputy T.A. Vallois of St. Saviour

The reasons for bringing this proposition are set out in the report below.

## **REPORT**

It gives me no pleasure whatsoever to move this Proposition.

I had hoped that the Minister would resign and then test the mood of the House by re-submitting himself for election.

I am prepared, along with other members, to accept that the Minister may have been subject to provocation. We all experience such situations and usually learn coping mechanisms. However, we are not dealing here with a spontaneous outburst. We are dealing with two serious situations. In one case, the Senator was recorded by a newspaper journalist suggesting that Senator Syvret “slit his wrists”. The second situation in the Assembly is even more worrying. Here the Senator has denied the words attributed to him by Senator Syvret but, other than saying he whispered unpleasantries to Senator Syvret, he has not actually stated the words which were used. Senator Syvret maintains that part of the “unpleasantries” was an invitation “to top himself”.

There is considerable concern amongst the general public that a Health Minister should have spoken in such a way, irrespective of the alleged provocation. There is also a similar concern about the ambiguity surrounding the second incident where the Minister issued a denial that he had spoken the words attributed to him by Senator Syvret, but yet will not place on record that which he did say to the Senator.

Part of my reluctance in moving the Proposition is that, if successful, it will require a new Minister to settle in and some of the momentum surrounding the Williamson Report will be lost. However, there is now a delay with aspects of Williamson as it is subject to Scrutiny. Furthermore, Children’s Services is currently in the hands of an Assistant Minister who can, pro tem, give the matter detailed attention.

Since Clothier there has been much reassuring talk from Ministers that there is now clear accountability applied to Ministers. However, we also seem to have a major reluctance to enforce this accountability. In my view, and that of the signatories, the Minister’s remarks were totally out of order, caused enormous distress and should have been a resigning matter.

### **Financial and manpower statement**

There are no manpower or financial implications associated with this proposition.