

Records of Meetings

2024

The following records of meetings have been approved by the Panel.

The constitution of the Panel changed in early 2024. Deputy Sam Mézec was appointed to a ministerial role on 30th January 2024. The Panel folded and Deputy Helen Miles was appointed to Chair of the Panel on 6th February 2024. Subsequently, the Panel was constituted on 27th February 2024.

Chair of the Panel to 29th January 2024

Signed

Chair

Deputy Sam Mézec

Chair of the Panel from 6th February 2024

Signed

Chair

Deputy Helen Miles

États de Jersey



L's Êtats d'Jèrri

Record of Meeting

Date: 9th January 2024

| Present | Deputy Sam Mézec, Chair |
|---------------|---|
| | Deputy Max Andrews, Vice Chair |
| | Deputy Lyndon Farnham |
| In attendance | Deputy Lyndsay Feltham [Item 2 only] |
| | Monique Magalhaes, Committee and Panel Officer Alex Cameron, Research and Project Officer |

| Agenda matter | Action |
|--|--------|
| 1. Records of Meetings | |
| The Panel noted and approved the record of the meeting held 19 th December 2023. | AC |
| 2. People and Culture Follow-up Review | |
| The Panel noted and discussed the progress of the review. The Panel considered options for further evidence gathering and agreed to invite to a meeting a private individual who had contacted the Panel in relation to its review. The Panel requested the Officers to arrange the meeting. | AC |
| The Panel considered and agreed the draft question plan for the upcoming review hearing with local trade unions, JCSA Prospect and Unite Jersey, scheduled for Friday 12 th January 2024. | AC |
| 3. Independent Taxation Legislation | |
| The Panel received an updated timeline for the lodging of the draft legislation, which was shared with the Panel in confidence on 14 th December 2023. The Panel noted that the draft legislation was not yet lodged, however, recalled the intention was for it to be lodged prior to it receiving the briefing on the draft legislation which was scheduled for 15 th January 2024. | |
| The Panel recalled its previous discussion around stakeholder engagement on the previous proposals (<u>P.41/2023</u>), which were subsequently withdrawn, and agreed to request further feedback from stakeholders once the draft legislation was lodged. | ММ |
| 4. Wills and Successions Legislation | |
| The Panel noted and discussed the Draft Wills and Successions (Amendment No.3 – Collateral Succession of Immovable Estate) Law 202- (P.105/2023), lodged on 22 nd December 2023 for earliest debate on 6 th February 2024. The Panel received an Officer update in relation to the briefing requested and, upon discussing its scrutiny approach, agreed to draft a Comments paper to inform the States Assembly debate on the | AC/MM |

proposition. The Panel noted that it was awaiting confirmation from Government regarding when the briefing could take place the following week. 5. Statistics and Census Legislation The Panel noted that a briefing on the Draft Statistics and Census (Amendment)(Jersey) Law 202 - was scheduled for the following day. The Panel recalled that the Government had requested the Panel's initial views on the draft legislation and its intended scrutiny approach of the proposals to allow for sufficient time for Scrutiny to undertake its work MM prior to the States' debate on the proposition. The Panel noted the intention was for the draft legislation to be lodged subsequent to the Panel receiving the briefing and providing an indication of its required timeline for the scrutiny process. The Panel agreed to discuss this further following the briefing. 6. Delivery Plans 2023 Progress Reports The Panel noted and discussed the 2023 Delivery Plan Progress Reports of the Chief Minister and Minister for Treasury and Resources. In respect of the Chief Minister's report, the Panel highlighted the cancellation of the States of Jersey Employment Law workstream and the decision of the States Employment Board (SEB) to not recruit for a Jersey Public Service Ombudsperson in advance of the legislation, overturning its previous decision. The Panel agreed to write to both Ministers to request greater detail on the proposed lodging timelines for the 2024 legislative programmes for the remits of the Chief Minister AC and the Minister for Treasury and Resources as outlined within the Ministerial Plans for 2024, so that it could further consider its work programme for 2024. The Panel additionally agreed to request further detail from the Chief Minister on the SEBs decision to not recruit for an Ombudsperson in advance of the legislation as previously suggested, as this decision conflicted with information provided in a letter received by the Panel from the Chief Minister on 18th August 2023. 7. Work Programme 2024 The Panel noted and discussed its upcoming work programme for 2024 and agreed to monitor the developments of the Government's proposals before considering it further. The Panel noted that quarter one appeared particularly busy, considering the carryover of legislative workstreams from 2023 to 2024. The Panel agreed to endeavour to complete its People and Culture Follow-up Review prior to the summer recess, if MM possible. The Panel was content with its upcoming work programme to date, however, agreed to consider and revert with any potential additional matters of interest for review which would likely be possible to commence in the summer, depending on how its work programme developed. 8. Next Meeting The Panel noted that its next scheduled meeting would be held at 10am on Tuesday 23rd January 2024 in the Blampied Room, States Building.

Record of Meeting

Date: 10th January 2024

| Present | Deputy Sam Mézec, Chair Deputy Max Andrews, Vice Chair |
|---------------|---|
| Apologies | Deputy Lyndon Farnham |
| In attendance | Francis Walker, Head of Policy, Strategic Policy, Planning and Performance Daniel Edmunds, Principal Statistician, Strategic Policy, Planning and Performance |
| | Monique Magalhaes, Committee and Panel Officer Alex Cameron, Research and Project Officer |

| Agenda matter | Action |
|--|--------|
| 1. Briefing: Draft Statistics and Census (Amendment) (Jersey) Law 202- | |
| The Panel received Francis Walker, Head of Policy, and Daniel Edmunds, Principal Statistician—both of Strategic Policy, Planning and Performance—for a briefing to amend the Statistics and Census (Jersey) Law 2018 to bring Jersey's statistical system in line with international best practice. The meeting was held in private in accordance with the Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011 (as amended) under Qualified Exemption Article 35. | |

Record of Meeting

Date: 12th January 2024

| Present | Deputy Sam Mézec, Chair |
|---------------|---|
| | Deputy Max Andrews, Vice Chair |
| | Deputy Lyndon Farnham |
| In attendance | Items 1, 2 and 3 |
| | Deputy Lyndsay Feltham |
| | Item 2 |
| | Chris Hopkins, President, JCSA Prospect |
| | James Turner, Regional Officer, Unite Jersey |
| | Monique Magalhaes, Committee and Panel Officer |
| | Alex Cameron, Research and Project Officer |
| | Gwyn Garfield-Bennett, Communications Officer [Items 2 and 3] |

| Agenda matter | Action |
|---|--------|
| 1. People & Culture Follow-up Review Hearing: Pre-hearing | |
| The Panel discussed and agreed the areas of questioning for the review hearing with JCSA Prospect and Unite Jersey scheduled to take place that afternoon. | |
| 2. People & Culture Follow-up Review Hearing | |
| The Panel received Chris Hopkins, President of JCSA Prospect, and James Turner, Regional Officer of Unite Jersey, for the review hearing. The hearing was webcast live, recorded and transcribed. | |
| 3. People & Culture Follow-up Review Hearing: Post-hearing | |
| The Panel discussed and agreed the areas to include in a media release to highlight the key areas of discussion that had taken place during the review hearing. | GG |

Record of Meeting

Date: 15th January 2024

| Dunant | Daniel Care Miles a Obelia |
|---------------|---|
| Present | Deputy Sam Mézec, Chair |
| | Deputy Max Andrews, Vice Chair |
| | Deputy Lyndon Farnham |
| In attendance | Item 1 only |
| | Deputy Ian Gorst, Minister for Treasury and Resources |
| | Deputy Steve Ahier, Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources |
| | Tom Queree, Deputy Director of Tax Policy, Treasury and Exchequer |
| | Richard Summersgill, Comptroller, Treasury and Exchequer |
| | Blair Davis, Manager - Tax Policy and Technical, Treasury and Exchequer |
| | Abbie Moore, Assistant Private Secretary, Office of the Chief Executive |
| | |
| | Item 2 only |
| | Connétable David Johnson, Legislation Advisory Panel |
| | Deputy Philip Bailhache, Legislation Advisory Panel |
| | Matthew Berry, Legal Adviser, Law Officers' Department |
| | Paul Bradbury, Head of Ministerial Support, Office of the Chief Executive |
| | Tom Leveridge, Assistant Legal Adviser, Law Officers' Department |
| | Ben Markwell-Sales, Governance and Business Officer, Cabinet Office |
| | |
| | Monique Magalhaes, Committee and Panel Officer |
| | Alex Cameron, Research and Project Officer |

| Agenda matter | Action |
|--|--------|
| 1. Private Briefing: Independent Taxation Legislation | |
| The Panel received Deputy Ian Gorst, the Minister for Treasury and Resources, Deputy Steve Ahier, Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources, and Officers, for a briefing to update them on the proposals for the Independent Taxation legislation. Following the adoption by the States Assembly of clause (b) of P.32/2023, the Minister for Treasury and Resources was required to take the necessary steps to ensure that the Independent Taxation proposals included a joint taxation option for - married couples and civil partners. The record of this meeting was classified as exempt in accordance with the Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011 (as amended) under Qualified Exemption Article 35. | |
| 2. Briefing: Draft Wills and Successions Legislation | |
| The Panel received Connétable David Johnson and Deputy Philip Bailhache from the Legislation Advisory Panel, and Officers for a briefing on the Draft Wills and Successions (Amendment No. 3 — Collateral Succession of Immovable Estate (Jersey) Law 202-(P.105/2023) (the 'draft Law'). The draft Law proposed to improve (modernise) the customary law relating to intestate collateral succession and bring Jersey into compliance with the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against | |

Women ('CEDAW'). The record of this meeting was classified as exempt in accordance with the Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011 (as amended) under Qualified Exemption Article 35.

Record of Meeting

Date: 5th March 2024

| Present | Deputy Helen Miles, Chair |
|---------------|--|
| | Deputy Lucy Stephenson, Vice Chair |
| | Deputy Max Andrews |
| | Deputy Alex Curtis |
| | Connétable David Johnson |
| | Deputy Jonathan Renouf |
| In attendance | Monique Magalhaes, Committee and Panel Officer |
| | Gwyn Garfield-Bennett, Communications Officer |

| Agenda matter | Action |
|--|--------|
| Procedural and Administrative Matters | |
| The Chair welcomed Members to the inaugural meeting of the Panel. The Panel noted it would be required to consider and agree a number of procedural and administrative matters. | |
| The Committee and Panel Officer and Communications Officer explained their roles and noted the support that was available to the Panel from Scrutiny Officers and the Digital and Public Engagement Team to assist the Panel in its work. | |
| The Panel noted and discussed a briefing paper on Panel working practices and reflected upon the Standing Orders and the Proceedings and Engagement Codes of Practice which determined Scrutiny's working practices. The Panel also noted and discussed the role of the Panel Chair. | |
| The Panel discussed the requirement to appoint a Vice Chair to the Panel and agreed to appoint Deputy Lucy Stephenson to the role. | MM |
| The Panel noted and agreed the scheduled meeting and public quarterly hearing dates for 2024. The Panel agreed that its regular meetings would take place on a Tuesday at 9:30am – 11:30am. The Panel noted it would receive the meeting and hearing invites following the meeting. | ММ |
| The Panel noted the process for receiving evidence from witnesses and agreed, whenever possible, that it would deliberate in private and take evidence in public. | |
| The Panel noted that, in principle, all written evidence received by the Panel would be published on the States Assembly website and that submissions would be treated in accordance with data protection legislation. Moreover, that confidential and anonymous submissions would be considered on a case-by-case basis by the Panel. It was further noted that any evidence received directly by Members of the Panel should be passed to the Committee and Panel Officer. | |

The Panel noted that in accordance with the Proceedings Code of Practice that it could not hold specific reviews into an individual matter and that any review topics that related to individual matters would be rejected. However, noted that correspondence in relation to an individual matter would receive an appropriate response from the Committee and Panel Officer and that, where possible, matters could be fed into relevant reviews.

The Panel noted the *declaration of interest* section in the Proceedings Codes of Practice. The Panel agreed to include a recurring item on its meeting agenda for any conflicts of interest to be raised.

MM

The Panel considered and agreed its working practices. The Panel agreed, where possible, it would attend its scheduled meetings, briefings and quarterly public hearings in person in the States Building. However, noted the option to attend meetings via Microsoft Teams should that be required.

MM

The Panel noted that all Panel correspondence would be shared with it via Microsoft Teams. The Panel further noted that it should be mindful of printing documentation unnecessarily, and where that was required, it must be requested prior to meeting.

The Panel discussed and noted any immediate training requirements and noted the inhouse training that could be provided as needed and further training that could be raised with the Scrutiny Liaison Committee (SLC) for its consideration and agreement. It was noted that the SLC was considering a training programme that would be confirmed in due course.

The Panel discussed how to navigate the filing system within Microsoft Teams and the Scrutiny pages on the States Assembly website. The Panel discussed the processes involved for the drafting of questions plans for public hearings and for undertaking hearings as well as the processes followed when scoping a review.

2. People and Culture Follow-up Review

The Panel noted and discussed the briefing papers received on the progress of the review and on the evidence analysis summary. The Panel agreed to conclude the review with the evidence gathered to date.

MM

The Panel noted that as the review was a follow up of previous work, it covered a broad scope. The Panel also noted that findings developing from the review could potentially be considered for further targeted reviews, which the Panel could agree subsequent to considering the findings and recommendation and the presentation thereof. Areas that were highlighted included the role and recruitment of the Chief Executive Officer and exit interviews.

The Panel noted and agreed the Heads of Report drafted for is consideration and requested the Officer to commence the report drafting process with the intention to present the Scrutiny Report to the States Assembly in April 2024, if possible.

MM/AC

3. P.6/2024 - Draft Income Tax (Amendment - Stage 2 of Independent Taxation (Jersey) Law 202-

The Panel noted and considered the progress of the review to date. The Panel noted that the Minister for Treasury and Resources had lodged new proposals, <u>P.6/2024</u> - *Draft Income Tax (Amendment – Stage 2 of Independent Taxation (Jersey) Law 202*-, to accommodate the adoption by the States Assembly of Part B of Deputy Farnham's

proposition, P.32/2023 - Removal of Compulsory independent Taxation for Existing Married Couples and Civil Partnerships: Amendment, which required the Minister to ensure an option for joint filing of taxes by married and civil partnered couples. The Panel noted that Deputy Doublet had subsequently lodged an amendment to P.6/2024, P.6/2024 Amd. which proposed the removal of Article 3 to remove the joint filing option for married and civil partnered couples to ensure alignment with Jersev's obligations under the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW). The Panel noted that the States' debate on P.6/2024 had been deferred by the Minister to 16th April 2024 on the Chair's request so that the Panel would have sufficient time to review the proposals. The Panel noted the upcoming briefing on P.6/2024 scheduled for the following day with the Minister for Treasury and Resources and Officers and agreed to consider its Scrutiny MM approach and further actions following that meeting. 4. Government Plan 2024-27 Review The Panel noted that, as a result of the formation of the new Government, the Ministerial Response to the Government Plan 2024-27 review, S.R.4/2023, was deferred for a MM response by the new Council of Ministers. The Panel agreed to write to the Minister for Treasury and Resources to follow up in that regard. 5. P.11/2024 - Andium Homes Limited Articles of Association The Panel noted and discussed P.11/2024 - Andium Homes Limited Articles of Association, lodged by the Minister for Treasury and Resources for' debate by the States Assembly on 16th April 2024. The Panel noted that the former Panel was briefed on the Articles of Association (AoA) and had not raised any concerns at that time. The Panel noted that a file note which recorded that briefing would be shared with it as well as the further correspondence in respect of the AoA between the former Panel and the former Minister. The Panel also requested to receive the Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) for Andium Homes Limited. It was noted that would be shared with MM The Panel requested to receive a briefing on the proposals to develop its understanding of particular articles outlined in the AoA and for it to be scheduled for early April 2024. MM 6. Correspondence The Panel noted and discussed correspondence that was outstanding and agreed to write to the Chief Minister and Minister for Treasury and Resources to follow up in that MM regard in particular regarding the ministerial priorities and legislative programmes for 2024 to assist in informing its work programme. The Panel also requested to receive an update on the States Employment Board records of meetings which were previously requested but remained outstanding. MM 7. Work Programme

The Panel noted and discussed the position paper received on the current status of the Panel's work programme. The Panel noted that an agreement would need to be reached between the Chair and the Chair of the Economics and Internationals Affair's (EIA) Scrutiny Panel on Scrutiny's approach regarding the Two Pillar Taxation workstream as the workstream crossed the remits of both Panels. The Chair agreed to raise that with НМ the SLC. The Panel considered its upcoming work programme and agreed to update it once confirmation was received on the Ministerial and legislative priorities in respect of the MM remits for the Chief Minister and Minister for Treasury and Resources. The Panel discussed the broader areas of the Ministerial remits and agreed to include an area of questioning for public hearings on these. It was noted that Commercial MM Services was such an area to consider with regard to the remit for the Minister for Treasury and Resources. The Panel discussed potential areas to consider for review. The Panel agreed that in addition to any focused areas that developed from the People and Culture Follow Up Review, that current matters regarding Island insurance and the role of the Cabinet Office should be noted as areas of potential interest for review. In addition, a piece of work with regard to MOU's for the Arm's Length Organisations and States Owned Entities. However, it was noted that subject matter may cross over with the remit of the EIA Panel, so the Panel would need to be mindful of that, should it consider a review in that regard. 8. Visits, Meetings and Briefings MM The Panel agreed to request a briefing from the Chief Minister on the role of the Cabinet Office to further its understanding ahead of considering any potential review work in that regard. 9. Next Meeting The Panel noted that its next meeting was an informal meeting without an agenda on Tuesday 12th March at 9:30am. As a number of Members would be unable to attend that MM meeting, the Panel agreed to cancel that meeting and noted its next scheduled meeting was scheduled for 26th March 2024, in the Blampied Room of the States Building.

Record of Meeting

Date: 6th March 2024

| Present | Deputy Helen Miles, Chair |
|---------------|---|
| | Deputy Lucy Stephenson, Vice Chair |
| | Deputy Max Andrews |
| | Deputy Alex Curtis |
| | Connétable David Johnson |
| | Deputy Jonathan Renouf |
| In attendance | Item 1 only |
| | Deputy Elaine Millar, Minister for Treasury and Resources |
| | Tom Queree, Deputy Director of Tax Policy, Treasury and Exchequer |
| | Blair Davis, Manager - Tax Policy and Technical, Treasury and Exchequer |
| | Abbie Moore, Assistant Private Secretary, Office of the Chief Executive |
| | |
| | Monique Magalhaes, Committee and Panel Officer |

| Agenda matter | |
|---|----|
| 1. Briefing: P.6/2024 - Draft Income Tax (Amendment – Stage 2 of Independent Taxation (Jersey) Law 202- | |
| The Panel received Deputy Elaine Millar, the Minister for Treasury and Resources and Officers for a briefing on the revised Independent Taxation proposals - P.6/2024, Draft Income Tax (Amendment – Stage 2 of Independent Taxation (Jersey) Law 202-, which was lodged by the Minister for debate in the States Assembly on 16 th April 2024. | |
| Following the adoption by the States Assembly of Part B of Deputy Farnham's proposition - P.32/2023, Removal of Compulsory Independent Taxation for Existing Married Couples and Civil Partnerships: Amendment, the Minister for Treasury and Resources was required to take the necessary steps to ensure that the proposals included a joint filing option for married and civil partnered couples. | |
| An amendment to the proposition, <u>P.6/2024Amd.</u> ,was lodged by Deputy Doublet on 13 th February 2024 and proposes to remove Article 3 of the proposition to revert the proposals to the independent form by removing the joint filing option. | |
| The record of this meeting was classified as exempt in accordance with the Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011 (as amended) under Qualified Exemption Article 35. | |
| 2. Post Briefing Meeting | |
| The Panel discussed the briefing received and its Scrutiny approach. The Panel agreed, in the first instance, to request to receive the responses from the Government's consultation process, which were used to inform the revised proposals as outlined within P.6/2024. | ММ |

The Panel agreed to write to targeted stakeholders to request their views on P.6/2024 once it received and considered the Government's consultation feedback. MM The Panel agreed to request to receive the Council of Ministers' view in respect of Deputy Doublet's proposed amendment (P.6/2024Amd) to the proposition. MM The Panel agreed to request clarification from the Attorney General regarding Jersey's commitment to meet its obligations under the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW) in respect of the draft legislation attaining MM Independent Taxation in light of both the proposition (P.6/2024) and the proposed amendment (P.6/2024Amd). The Panel agreed to further discuss the workstream at its next meeting on 26th March 2024 with the intention to present Comments ahead of the States' debate on the MM proposition, which was scheduled for 16th April 2024.

Record of Meeting

Date: 26th March 2024

| Present | Deputy Helen Miles, Chair |
|---------------|--|
| | Deputy Lucy Stephenson, Vice Chair |
| | Deputy Max Andrews |
| | Connétable David Johnson |
| | Deputy Jonathan Renouf |
| Apologies | Deputy Alex Curtis |
| In attendance | Monique Magalhaes, Committee and Panel Officer |
| | Alex Cameron, Research and Project Officer |

| Agenda matter | |
|--|----|
| 1. Records of Meetings | |
| The Panel noted and approved the records of the meetings held on 5 th and 6 th March 2024. | AC |
| 2. P.6/2024 - Draft Income Tax (Amendment - Stage 2 of Independent Taxation (Jersey) Law 202- | |
| The Panel noted and discussed the Government consultation feedback shared with it on 11 th March 2024. The Panel agreed that concerns in respect of the communication of the proposals to Islanders remained prevalent and that clarity on the impact of the proposals on Islanders was required. | |
| The Panel noted and discussed the advice received on 20 th March 2024 from the Law Officers' Department in respect of the clarification requested. The Panel was satisfied with the clarification received and agreed that no further action was required in that regard. | |
| The Panel noted and discussed submissions received from targeted stakeholders in respect of the review and agreed to write to the Minister for Treasury and Resources to seek further clarity in respect of the concerns raised within the submissions. | ММ |
| The Panel noted and discussed the electronic petition titled Make independent Taxation Optional and raised concerns regarding the accuracy of the information included. The Chair agreed to raise the Panel's concerns in that regard at the next meeting of the Scrutiny Liaison Committee (SLC) and to seek clarity on the States Greffe process in respect of vetting the information which is published. | НМ |
| The Panel requested the Officer to commence drafting of the Comments for its consideration at its next meeting on 9 th April 2024. | ММ |
| 3. Correspondence | |

| The Panel noted and discussed the <u>response</u> received from the Chief Minister on 22 nd March 2024. The Panel agreed to write to the Chief Minister seeking further clarity regarding particular workstreams including the Jersey Public Services Ombudsperson, Charities Law 2014, and Control of Housing and Work legislation. | AC |
|---|----|
| The Panel noted that it was expecting a response to its letter from the Minister for Treasury and Resources by 28 th March 2024. | |
| 4. P.11/2024 - Andium Homes Limited Articles of Association | |
| The Panel noted the upcoming briefing scheduled for 2 nd April 2024 at 11am on the Proposition. The Panel discussed the information received to date. | |
| The Panel also noted that the debate on the Proposition was scheduled for 16 th April 2024 and agreed to present Comments ahead of the States' debate on the Proposition. | ММ |
| 5. Amendments to the States of Jersey Law 2005 | |
| The Panel noted the upcoming briefing scheduled for 2 nd April at 12:15pm on the proposals for developing the role of the Deputy Chief Minister. The Panel recalled that the draft legalisation was ready for lodging and agreed to prepare Comments to present ahead of the States' debate on the Proposition, once lodged. | ММ |
| The Panel noted that further amendments to the Law were anticipated in respect of suspending Ministers and was anticipated for lodging by the end of 2024. | |
| 6. Role of the Cabinet Office | |
| The Panel noted that it had been offered a briefing on the role of the Cabinet Office on 15 th April 2024 at 2:30pm. The Panel confirmed its availability to receive the briefing as scheduled. | ММ |
| 7. Work Programme | |
| The Panel considered its upcoming work programme and discussed the potential for a review in respect of the Island's insurance market and noted that the remit may cross over into that of the Economic and International Affair's (EIA) Panel. The Chair agreed, in the first instance, to raise the matter with the Chair of the EIA Panel and to discuss any potential review at the next meeting with the SLC. | НМ |
| The Panel noted the uncertain position in respect of the Jersey Public Services Ombudsperson workstream and agreed to stay abreast of the workstream as a potential review topic to consider further once clarity was received regarding how it would be progressed by Government. | ММ |
| The Panel requested that the 2017 report by the Jersey Law Commission, Improving Administrative Redress in Jersey, be shared with it for its consideration in respect of the Jersey Public Services Ombudsperson workstream. | AC |
| The Panel discussed the OECD Two Pillar taxation workstream and noted that it was awaiting a progress update from the Minister for Treasury and Resources in that regard. The Panel raised that it would be a substantial review, which would cross over with the remit of the EIA Panel. The Chair agreed to raise the potential for establishing a Sub-Panel to conduct any review in that regard at the next meeting of the SLC. The Panel | НМ |

| agreed that receiving a briefing in private on the workstream would be beneficial and to request that once the update was received from the Minister. | ММ |
|--|----|
| 8. Training | |
| The Panel noted and discussed upcoming training on questioning techniques in public hearings that was being arranged for Panels. The Panel agreed for the training to be held on the morning of 14 th May 2024, if possible. | ММ |
| 9. Any Other Business | |
| The Panel noted the Proposition Draft Income Tax (Payment of 2019 Liability) (Jersey) Amendment Regulations 202- [P.16/2024], lodged by the Minister for Treasury and Resources for States' debate on 30 th April 2024, which was proposing to delay payments of the Prior Year Basis taxation liabilities. The Panel agreed that no Scrutiny action was required in that regard. | |
| The Panel noted and discussed the recent <u>media</u> coverage in respect of the former Chief People and Transformation Officer and the Government's position. The Panel discussed whether it was inclined to undertake any actions in respect of the circumstances. It was agreed that no Panel actions would be taken, however, the Chair agreed to consider presenting a written question as appropriate. | НМ |
| 10. Next Meeting | |
| The Panel noted its next scheduled meeting was on Tuesday 9 th April 2024 at 9:30am in the Blampied Room of the States Building. | |

Record of Meeting

Date: 2nd April 2024

| Present | Deputy Helen Miles, Chair |
|---------------|---|
| | Deputy Lucy Stephenson, Vice Chair |
| | Deputy Max Andrews |
| | Deputy Jonathan Renouf |
| Apologies | Deputy Alex Curtis |
| | Connétable David Johnson |
| In attendance | Item 1 only: |
| | Deputy Elaine Millar, Minister for Treasury and Resources |
| | Steven Robinson, Head of Shareholder Relations, Treasury and |
| | Exchequer |
| | Abbie Moore, Assistant Private Secretary, Office of the Chief Executive |
| | Item 2 only: |
| | Francis Walker, Head of Policy, Cabinet Office |
| | David Le Marquand, Policy Principal, Office of the Chief Executive |
| | Monique Magalhaes, Committee and Panel Officer |
| | Alex Cameron, Research and Project Officer |

| Agenda matter | Action |
|---|--------|
| 1. Briefing: Andium Homes Articles of Association [P.11/2024] | |
| The Panel received Deputy Elaine Millar, Minister for Treasury and Resources, and Steven Robinson, Head of Shareholder Relations in the Treasury and Exchequer, for a briefing in relation to the Articles of Association for Andium Homes Limited [P.11/2024]. The meeting was held in private in accordance with the Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011 (as amended) under Qualified Exemption Article 35. | |
| 2. Briefing: States of Jersey (Deputy Chief Minister) Amendment Law 202 - | |
| The Panel received Francis Walker, Head of Policy in Cabinet Office, and David Le Marquand, Policy Principal in the Office of the Chief Executive for a briefing on the draft States of Jersey (Deputy Chief Minister) Amendment Law 202- which proposes amendments to the Deputy Chief Minister role. The meeting was held in private in accordance with the Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011 (as amended) under Qualified Exemption Article 35. | |
| 3. Teachers Pay Award: Allocation of Reserve Funding for 2024 | |
| The Panel noted and discussed the recent Ministerial Decision (MD) - MD-TR-2024-217 - made by the Minister for Treasury and Resources on 20 th March 2024 to approve an allocation of up to £7,556,000 to the Children, Young People, Education and Skills Head | |

of Expenditure from the Central Reserve to cover the budget allocation of the 2024 teacher's pay award. The Panel raised concerns on the decision-making process in reaching the decision, particularly in relation to allocating the funds from the Central Reserve Fund. The Panel agreed to write to the Minister for Treasury and Resources to understand the policy and process for allocating funds from the Central Reserve.

AC

Record of Meeting

Date: 9th April 2024

| Present | Deputy Helen Miles, Chair |
|---------------|--|
| | Deputy Lucy Stephenson, Vice Chair |
| | Deputy Max Andrews |
| | Deputy Jonathan Renouf |
| | Connétable David Johnson |
| Apologies | Deputy Alex Curtis |
| In attendance | Monique Magalhaes, Committee and Panel Officer |
| | Alex Cameron, Research and Project Officer |

| Agenda matter | Action |
|--|--------|
| 1. Record of Meetings | |
| The Panel noted and approved the records of the meetings held on 26 th March and 2 nd April 2024. | AC |
| 2. P.6/2024 - Draft Income Tax (Amendment - Stage 2 of Independent Taxation (Jersey) Law 202- | |
| The Panel discussed and approved the Comments on P.6/2024. | |
| The Panel discussed the communication strategy undertaken to date by the Treasury Department and whether communications could be improved via further proactive measures and increased responsiveness to public concern. | |
| The Panel shared feedback from constituents expressing concerns that independent taxation would make them worse off, which was believed to be caused by misunderstandings of the proposals. | |
| The Panel agreed to include a recommendation regarding communications of the proposals within its Comments and to present its Comments as soon as possible ahead of the States' debate on the proposition which was scheduled for 16 th April 2024. | мм |
| 3. P.11/2024 - Andium Homes Limited Articles of Association | |
| The Panel noted and approved the Comments on P.11/2024. The Panel agreed to present the Comments as soon as possible ahead of the States' debate on the proposition which was scheduled for 16 th April 2024. | MM/AC |
| 4. People and Culture Follow-up Review | |
| The Panel noted that the drafting of the Scrutiny Report for the review was progressing well and agreed to present its report by mid-May 2024, if possible. | AC |
| 5. Correspondence | |

The Panel noted and discussed the correspondence from the Minister for Treasury and Resources received on 28th March 2024. The Panel highlighted the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) as an important workstream moving forward which the Panel agreed to continue to assess and seek clarification on jointly with the Economic and International Affairs Panel. The Panel noted and discussed a letter received from the Chief Minister on 8th April 2024, providing further clarification on a number of workstreams, particularly the Jersey Public Services Ombudsperson (JPSO). The Panel discussed its potential scrutiny approach with regard to the JPSO and agreed to continue monitoring the workstream. 6. Work Programme The Panel noted and discussed its work programme and agreed to consider it further at a later date. 7. States Business The Panel noted The Codes of Conduct & Practice for Ministers and Assistant Ministers (R.31/2024) and requested the Officer to liaise internally in relation to a number of MM observations. It was also noted that the Common Strategic Policy (CSP) was due to be published that day. 8. Upcoming Briefings The Panel noted the upcoming briefing to be received from the Chief Minister on the Role of the Cabinet Office on 15th April 2024 at 2:30pm. The Panel noted that the briefing on the OECD Pillars workstream, that was due to be MM received on 22nd April 2024, was being rescheduled. It was noted that a new invite would be circulated once confirmed. 9. Any Other Business The Panel discussed scheduling meetings with the newly appointed Children's Commissioner for Jersey and the Comptroller & Auditor General to understand their roles and upcoming workstreams. The Panel agreed to contact the respective officers to MM explore potential meeting times. The Panel noted the creation of a review panel that would scrutinise the progress of the new hospital, with Deputy Renouf set to chair the panel. The Panel noted the extension of the interim CEO's tenure. The Panel agreed to continue monitoring the situation. 10. Next Meeting The Panel noted that its next scheduled meeting was at 9:30am on Tuesday 23rd April 2024 in the Blampied Room, States Building.

Record of Meeting

Date: 15th April 2024

| Present | Deputy Helen Miles, Chair |
|---------------|--|
| | Deputy Lucy Stephenson, Vice Chair |
| | Deputy Max Andrews |
| | Deputy Jonathan Renouf |
| | Deputy Alex Curtis |
| Apologies | Connétable David Johnson |
| In attendance | Item 1 only: |
| | Deputy Lyndon Farnham, Chief Minister |
| | Andrew McLaughlin, Chief Executive Officer, Cabinet Office |
| | Tracy Mourant, Private Secretary, Ministerial Office |
| | Item 2 only: |
| | Francis Walker, Head of Policy, Cabinet Office |
| | Ian Cope, Chief Statistician and Director of Statistics and Analytics, |
| | Statistics Jersey |
| | |
| | Monique Magalhaes, Committee and Panel Officer |

| Agenda matter | Action |
|--|--------|
| 1. Briefing: Role of the Cabinet Office | |
| The Panel received Deputy Lyndon Farnham, Chief Minister, and Andrew McLaughlin, Chief Executive Officer, for a briefing in relation to the role of the Cabinet Office. The meeting was held in private in accordance with the Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011 (as amended) under Qualified Exemption Article 35. | |
| 2. Briefing: Draft Statistics and Census (Amendment) (Jersey) Law 202- | |
| The Panel received Francis Walker, Head of Policy, and Ian Cope, Chief Statistician and Director of Statistics and Analytics, for a briefing on the draft Statistics and Census (Amendment) (Jersey) Law 202- which proposes amendments to the Statistics and Census (Jersey) Law 2018 to bring Jersey's statistical system in line with international best practice. The meeting was held in private in accordance with the Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011 (as amended) under Qualified Exemption Article 35. | |

Record of Meeting

Date: 23rd April 2024

| Present | Deputy Helen Miles, Chair |
|---------------|--|
| | Deputy Lucy Stephenson, Vice Chair |
| | Deputy Max Andrews |
| | Deputy Jonathan Renouf |
| | Connétable David Johnson |
| Apologies | Deputy Alex Curtis |
| In attendance | Monique Magalhaes, Committee and Panel Officer |
| | Alex Cameron, Research and Project Officer |

| Agenda matter | Action |
|---|----------|
| 1. Record of Meetings | |
| The Panel noted and approved the records of the meetings held on 9 th and 15 th April 2024. | AC |
| 2. People and Culture Follow-up Review | |
| The Panel considered the draft Scrutiny Report for the People and Culture Follow-up Review and agreed to consider it further before agreeing on how to proceed at its next meeting on 7 th May 2024. | |
| 3. Draft Statistics and Census (Amendment) (Jersey) Law 202- | |
| The Panel discussed the briefing received on 15 th April on the draft proposals and agreed, once the proposition was lodged, to draft a Comments paper for presentation ahead of the debate by the States Assembly on the proposition. To inform its Comments, the Panel agreed to write to the Statistics User Group to request its views on the draft proposals. The Panel agreed to action this following the lodging of the proposition. | AC MM |
| 4. Draft States of Jersey (Deputy Chief Minister) Amendment Law 202- | |
| The Panel noted the imminent lodging timeline for the proposition and agreed, following its lodging, to draft a Comments paper for presentation ahead of the debate by the States Assembly on the proposition. | ММ |
| 5. Common Strategic Policy [P.21/2024] | |
| The Panel noted that the <u>Common Strategic Policy (CSP)</u> was lodged on 9 th April 2024 for earliest debate by the States Assembly on 21 st May 2024. The Chair noted that the Scrutiny Liaison Committee was due to consider the CSP and any actions to follow. The Panel considered the CSP and agreed that, presently, it would not require any further action from the Panel. | |
| 6. Briefing: Role of the Cabinet Office | |

| The Panel noted the briefing received on 15 th April and agreed that it would closely monitor any developments regarding the Cabinet Office workstream, with the view to consider a review of any areas that it identified as pertinent. | |
|--|-------|
| 7. Correspondence | |
| The Panel noted a <u>response</u> received from the Minister for Treasury and Resources on 10 th April 2024 to the Panel's <u>letter</u> dated 2 nd April 2024. The Panel discussed the response and agreed to inquire further when it received the Minister for a public hearing on 17 th May 2024. | AC |
| 8. Quarterly Hearing – Minister for Treasury and Resources | |
| The Panel noted the upcoming quarterly hearing with the Minister for Treasury and Resources scheduled for 17 th May 2024. The Panel discussed potential areas of questioning and agreed to begin drafting a question plan for the hearing. | AC |
| 9. Work Programme | |
| The Panel noted and discussed its work programme and agreed to consider it further at a later date. | |
| 10. Upcoming Briefings and Meetings | |
| The Panel noted the upcoming briefing on the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) Pillar two workstream on Friday 3 rd May at 1pm. The Panel acknowledged that the Chair of the Economic and International Affairs (EIA) Panel had extended an invite for a further briefing related to this workstream, that was to be held in private, scheduled for 25 th April 2024 at 1pm. The Panel agreed that it would attend this briefing jointly with the EIA Panel. | мм |
| The Panel noted that it was due to attend questioning training on the morning of Tuesday 14 th May. | |
| The Panel noted its meeting with the Children's Commissioner for Jersey on Tuesday 28 th May at 10am. | |
| The Panel noted an offer to receive a joint briefing with the Children, Education and Home Affairs Panel on the Crisis Resilience and Emergency Planning workstreams. The Panel was informed that the workstreams involved both the remits of the Chief Minister and Minister for Home Affairs. The Panel agreed to attend the briefing and requested for it to be arranged. | ММ |
| 11. Any Other Business | |
| The Panel discussed the work of the Privileges and Procedures Committee in relation to electoral register reforms. The Panel requested the Officers to informally inquire on the progress of the workstream and provide an update to the Panel. | AC/MM |
| 12. Next Meeting | |
| The Panel noted that its next scheduled meeting was at 9:30am on Tuesday 7 th May 2024 in the Blampied Room, States Building. | |

Record of Meeting

Date: 7th May 2024

| Present | Deputy Helen Miles, Chair |
|---------------|--|
| | Deputy Lucy Stephenson, Vice Chair |
| | Deputy Max Andrews |
| | Deputy Jonathan Renouf |
| | Connétable David Johnson |
| | Deputy Alex Curtis |
| In attendance | Monique Magalhaes, Committee and Panel Officer |
| | Alex Cameron, Research and Project Officer |

| Agenda matter | Action |
|--|--------|
| 1. Record of Meetings | |
| The Panel noted and approved the records of the meetings held on 23 rd April 2024. | AC |
| 2. People and Culture Follow-up Review | |
| The Panel considered the draft Scrutiny Report for the People and Culture Follow-up Review and agreed to consider it further before agreeing on how to proceed. The Panel agreed to schedule a meeting to discuss the report at 12:30pm on 14 th May 2024. | AC |
| 3. Quarterly Hearing – Minister for Treasury and Resources | |
| The Panel discussed and agreed the draft question plan for the upcoming quarterly hearing with the Minister for Treasury and Resources scheduled for 17 th May 2024. | AC |
| 4. Quarterly Hearing – Chief Minister | |
| The Panel noted the upcoming quarterly hearing with the Chief Minister scheduled for 7 th June 2024 and considered the questioning areas to include. | ММ |
| The Panel discussed how it could engage the public for the hearing and agreed to request a social media post seeking questions from members of the public for its consideration to include in its questioning of the Chief Minister. | |
| 5. P.26/2024 – States of Jersey Development Company Limited: New Articles of Association | |
| The Panel noted proposition P.26/2024 – The States of Jersey Development Company Limited: New Articles of Association – and discussed its scrutiny approach. The Panel agreed it would review the proposition further prior to agreeing a decision on its approach at its meeting on 28 th May. | ММ |
| 6. Hearing Questioning Training | |

The Panel noted and discussed its upcoming hearing questioning training scheduled for Tuesday 14th May from 9am -12:30pm in the Blampied Room of the States Building. 7. Upcoming Briefings and Meetings The Panel noted its upcoming briefings/meetings scheduled as follows: OECD Pillar Two Taxation - TBC Meeting with the Children's Commissioner for Jersey on Tuesday 28th May at Joint briefing with the Children, Education and Home Affair's Panel on Emergency Planning on Thursday 4th July at 3:30pm 8. Any Other Business Further to the Panel's request to receive the States Employment Board (SEB) meeting AC minutes, the Officer informed that the Chief Minister had informed that only individual requests for minutes would be considered. Upon discussion, the Panel noted that the SEB meeting agendas had not been made public and agreed to write to the Chief Minister in request of these. AC The Panel recalled a letter received from the Minister for Treasury and Resources in relation to the Teachers Pay Award and agreed to write to the Chief Minister requesting the minutes for the meetings of the SEB in that regard, given that the decision was made prior to the formation of the current SEB. The Panel discussed the role of Chief People and Transformation Officer and recalled information received during a public hearing on 1st December 2023 advising that full-time AC recruitment for a new permanent appointment was planned, as well as possible reshaping of the role. The Panel agreed to write to the Chief Minister seeking an update on the role. The Panel recalled a letter from the Chief Minister on 22nd March advising that a AC Ministerial Response to S.R.4/2024 - Proposed Government Plan 2024-27 Review was due to be received. The Panel agreed to write to the Chief Minister requesting an update on the response. 9. Next Meeting The Panel noted that its next scheduled meeting was at 9am on Tuesday 14th May 2024 in the Blampied Room, States Building.

Record of Meeting

Date: 14th May 2024

| Present | Deputy Helen Miles, Chair |
|---------------|--|
| | Deputy Lucy Stephenson, Vice Chair |
| | Deputy Max Andrews |
| | Deputy Jonathan Renouf |
| | Connétable David Johnson |
| Apologies | Deputy Alex Curtis |
| In attendance | Monique Magalhaes, Committee and Panel Officer |
| | Alex Cameron, Research and Project Officer |

| Agenda matter | Action |
|---|--------|
| 1. People and Culture Follow-up Review The Panel discussed the draft report for the People and Culture Follow-up Review. The Panel approved the body of the report and agreed to publish it in the absence of any findings and recommendations as a result of the change in Government mid-review process. The Panel requested for the Officer to initiate the fact-checking process for stakeholder feedback. The Panel also requested that a letter be drafted to be sent to stakeholders to relay the rationale for its approach with respect to the report, considering that findings and recommendations would not be included. | AC |
| 2. Quarterly Hearing – Minister for Treasury and Resources | |
| The Panel discussed the draft question plan for the upcoming quarterly hearing with the Minister for Treasury and Resources scheduled for 17 th May 2024 and requested the Officer to finalise it. | AC |

Record of Meeting

Date: 17th May 2024

| equer |
|--------|
| - |
| |
| |
| |
| d |
| ۱ |
| |
| equer |
| |
| |
| |
| nents, |
| |
| |
| |
| Panel |
| fairs |
| idilo |
| Danal |
| Panel |
| |
| |
| |
| |
| |
| ly] |
| r |

| Agenda matter | |
|---|---|
| Quarterly Public Hearing with the Minister for Treasury and Resources: pre hearing discussion | |
| The Panel discussed and agreed the areas of questioning for the quarterly public hearing with the Minister for Treasury and Resources scheduled to take place that morning. | 1 |

| 2. Quarterly Public Hearing with the Minister for Treasury and Resources | |
|--|----|
| The Panel received Deputy Elaine Millar, Minister for Treasury and Resources, Deputy Ian Gorst, Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources and Officers for the quarterly public hearing at 11:00am. The hearing was webcast live, recorded and transcribed. | |
| 3. Quarterly Public Hearing with the Minister for Treasury and Resources: post- hearing discussion | |
| The Panel discussed and agreed the areas to include in a social media post to highlight the key areas of discussion that had taken place during the quarterly public hearing. The Panel requested that a press notice be drafted for release following the social media post. | GG |
| The Panel noted the upcoming quarterly public hearing with the Chief Minister on 7 th June 2024 and agreed to request that the hearing be extended to two hours. | |
| 4. Briefing: Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) Pillar 2 International Taxation | |
| The Panel received Deputy Elaine Millar, Minister for Treasury and Resources, Deputy Ian Gorst, Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources, and Officers, for a briefing jointly with the Economic and International Affairs (EIA) Panel on the OECD Pillar 2 International Taxation initiative. The meeting was held in private in accordance with the Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011 (as amended) under Qualified Exemption Article 35. | |

Record of Meeting

Date: 28th May 2024

| Present | Deputy Helen Miles, Chair |
|---------------|---|
| | Deputy Max Andrews |
| | Deputy Jonathan Renouf |
| | Connétable David Johnson |
| | Deputy Alex Curtis |
| Apologies | Deputy Lucy Stephenson, Vice Chair |
| In attendance | Item 2 only: |
| | Carmel Corrigan, Children's Commissioner for Jersey, Office of the |
| | Children's Commissioner for Jersey |
| | Tara Murphy, Senior Policy Officer, Office of the Children's Commissioner |
| | for Jersey |
| | |
| | Monique Magalhaes, Committee and Panel Officer |
| | Alex Cameron, Research and Project Officer |

| Agenda matter | Action |
|---|--------|
| 1. Record of Meetings | |
| The Panel noted and approved the records of the meetings held on 7 th , 14 th and 17 th May 2024. | AC |
| 2. Meeting with the Children's Commissioner for Jersey | |
| The Panel received the Children's Commissioner for Jersey and the Senior Policy Officer of the Office of the Children's Commissioner for a private meeting in respect of the Children's Commissioner's role and work programme. The meeting was held in private in accordance with the Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011 (as amended) under Absolute Exemption Article 26. | |
| 3. People and Culture Follow-up Review | |
| The Panel noted the progress of the review and that the fact-checking process had commenced. The Panel also noted the response deadline of 6 th June 2024 for any suggested changes to be received. | AC |
| 4. P.26/2024 – States of Jersey Development Company Limited: New Articles of Association | |
| The Panel discussed the areas to raise within its Comments on P.26/2024. The Panel noted that the Comments would be drafted for its consideration at its next meeting on 4 th June 2024. | |
| 5. P.29/2024 - Draft Statistics and Census (Jersey) Amendment Law 202- | |

| The Panel noted that a submission was due to be received from the Statistics Users Group by 31st May 2024 for the Panel to consider at its next meeting on 4th June 2024. The Panel agreed to begin drafting Comments to present ahead of States' debate on the Proposition, which was scheduled for 25th June 2024. | мм |
|--|----|
| 6. OECD Pillar 2 Workstream | |
| The Panel discussed its Scrutiny approach for the Organisation of Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD) Pillar 2 workstream, which was likely to be conducted jointly with the Economic and International Affairs (EIA) Panel. The Chair agreed to arrange an informal meeting with the Chair of the EIA Panel to agree the approach and to update the Panel at its next meeting on 4 th June 2024. | НМ |
| 7. Planning for Hearings | |
| The Panel discussed the process to follow when preparing for its hearings and agreed that arranging focus sessions prior to hearings would be beneficial. The Panel recalled that it had requested its quarterly hearings with the Chief Minister and Minister for Treasury and Resources to be extended and noted that, although the Minister for Treasury and Resources had confirmed the Panel's request, confirmation had not yet been received from the Chief Minister. | ММ |
| 8. Quarterly Hearing – Chief Minister | |
| The Panel noted the upcoming quarterly hearing with the Chief Minister on 7 th June 2024 at 11:30am. The Panel discussed the question plan for the hearing and agreed the areas to be shared with the department that week. The Panel agreed to hold a focus session on the question plan at its meeting on 4 th June 2024. | мм |
| 9. Correspondence – Chief Minister | |
| The Panel noted and discussed a <u>letter</u> received from the Chief Minister on 24 th May 2024, providing clarification on a number of the Panel's requests. The Panel discussed the response and agreed to follow up with regard to the recruitment process for the Chief People and Transformation Officer. | ММ |
| 10. Work Programme | |
| The Panel agreed to request a briefing from the Chief People and Transformation Officer to understand Government's Occupational Health strategy as the initial step in its wider approach towards scrutinising this workstream. | ММ |
| 11. Upcoming Briefings and Meetings | |
| The Panel noted its upcoming briefings and meetings scheduled as follows: | |
| Meeting with the Comptroller and Auditor General on 18th June 2024 at 11:30am Meeting with the Minister for Treasury and Resources and Officers on Commercial Services on 27th June at 11am Joint briefing with the Children, Education and Home Affair's Panel on Emergency Planning on 12th September at 2:30pm | |
| 12. Next Meeting | |

The Panel noted that its next scheduled meeting was at 9:30am on Tuesday 4th June 2024 in the Blampied Room, States Building.

Record of Meeting

Date: 4th June 2024

| Present | Deputy Helen Miles, Chair |
|---------------|--|
| | Deputy Lucy Stephenson, Vice Chair |
| | Deputy Max Andrews |
| | Deputy Jonathan Renouf |
| | Connétable David Johnson |
| Apologies | Deputy Alex Curtis |
| In attendance | Monique Magalhaes, Committee and Panel Officer |

| Agenda matter | Action |
|--|--------|
| P.26/2024 – States of Jersey Development Company Limited: New Articles of Association | |
| The Panel noted and discussed the draft Comments on Proposition P.26/2024 – The States of Jersey Development Company Limited: New Articles of Association. The Panel approved the Comments, subject to the suggested changes being made, and requested they be presented as soon as possible that week. | ММ |
| 2. P.29/2024 – Draft Statistics and Census (Jersey) Amendment Law 202- | |
| The Panel noted the submissions received from the Chief Statistician and the Statistics Users Group on 31 st May 2024 in relation to the draft Law. The Panel noted that Comments were being drafted for it to consider at its next meeting on 18 th June 2024. | ММ |
| 3. OECD Pillar 2 Workstream | |
| The Panel discussed the scrutiny approach for the Organisation of Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD) workstream and agreed that a Sub-Panel of the Panel would be established to undertake this work. The Panel agreed the Sub-Panel membership, remit and timescale for the review. The Panel noted the Government's intention to lodge the Proposition in mid-July for debate in the States Assembly in October 2024. The Panel agreed for a first meeting of the Sub-Panel to be arranged where the Chair and Vice-Chair would be appointed. | ММ |
| 4. Quarterly Hearing – Chief Minister | |
| The Panel discussed and agreed the draft question plan for the upcoming quarterly hearing with the Chief Minister on 7 th June 2024. | ММ |
| 5. Upcoming Briefings and Meetings | |
| The Panel noted its upcoming scheduled briefings and meetings and agreed to arrange a public hearing in relation to recruitment and retention following the presentation of its Scrutiny Report for the People and Culture Follow-up review, which it intended to present later that month. | ММ |

6. Any Other Business

The Panel discussed the scrutiny approach previously undertaken in respect of reviewing the Government Plan and noted that the approach provided the Panel with leadership over the review as well as the overarching elements. The Panel noted that the previous approach appeared appropriate to follow in respect of reviewing the upcoming Proposed Government Plan 2025-28, however, the Chair agreed to raise the approach with the Scrutiny Liaison Commission (SLC), in the first instance, to consider its views.

The Panel noted that the fact checking process for its People and Culture Follow-up review was underway with any suggested changes due by 6th June 2024. The Panel discussed and agreed the process in relation to presenting its Scrutiny Report later that month.

MM

НМ

7. Next Meeting

The Panel noted that its next scheduled meeting was at 9:30am on Tuesday 18th June 2024 in the Blampied Room, States Building.

Record of Meeting

Date: 7th June 2024

| Present | Deputy Helen Miles, Chair |
|---------------|--|
| | Deputy Lucy Stephenson, Vice Chair |
| | Deputy Max Andrews |
| | Deputy Jonathan Renouf |
| | Connétable David Johnson |
| | Deputy Alex Curtis |
| In attendance | Items 2: |
| | Deputy Lyndon Farnham, Chief Minister |
| | Deputy Carina Alves, Assistant Chief Minister |
| | Deputy Malcom Ferey, Assistant Chief Minister |
| | Andrew Hacquoil, Group Director, Strategic Finance, Treasury and Exchequer |
| | Paul Wylie, Group Director of Policy, Cabinet Office |
| | Tracy Mourant, Private Secretary to the Chief Minister, Ministerial Office |
| | Monique Magalhaes, Committee and Panel Officer |
| | Gwyn Garfield-Bennett, Communications Officer [Items 2 and 3 only] |

| Agenda matter | Action |
|---|--------|
| 1. Quarterly Public Hearing with the Chief Minister: pre-hearing discussion | |
| The Panel discussed and agreed the areas of questioning for the quarterly public hearing with the Chief Minister scheduled to take place that morning. | |
| 2. Quarterly Public Hearing with the Chief Minister | |
| The Panel received Deputy Lyndon Farnham, Chief Minister, Deputy Carina Alves, Assistant Chief Minister, Deputy Malcom Ferey, Assistant Chief Minister, and Officers for the quarterly public hearing at 11:30am. The hearing was webcast live, recorded and transcribed. | |
| 3. Quarterly Public Hearing with the Chief Minister | |
| The Panel discussed and agreed the areas to include in a social media post to highlight the key areas of discussion that had taken place during the quarterly public hearing. The Panel requested that a press notice be drafted for release following the social media post. | GG |

Record of Meeting

Date: 18th June 2024

| Present | Deputy Helen Miles, Chair Deputy Lucy Stephenson, Vice-Chair [Items 2 and 6-8 only] Deputy Max Andrews Deputy Jonathan Renouf |
|---------------|---|
| | Deputy Alex Curtis |
| Apologies | Connétable David Johnson |
| In attendance | William Millow, Deputy Greffier, States Greffe [Item 4 only] |
| | Monique Magalhaes, Committee and Panel Officer |
| | Alex Cameron, Research and Project Officer |

| Agenda matter | Action |
|--|--------|
| 1. Record of Meetings | |
| The Panel noted and approved the records of the meetings held on 28 th May, 4 th and 7 th June 2024. | AC |
| 2. Meeting with the Comptroller and Auditor General | |
| The Panel received the Comptroller and Auditor General for a private meeting in respect of her role and work programme. The meeting was held in private in accordance with the Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011 (as amended) under Absolute Exemption Article 26. | |
| 3. People and Culture Follow-up Review | |
| The Panel considered feedback received from stakeholders as part of the fact-checking process for the People and Culture Follow-up Review. The Panel agreed to finalise the report with consideration of the feedback received and to publish the report on 12 th July. | AC |
| 4. P.29/2024 - Draft Statistics and Census (Jersey) Amendment Law 202- | |
| The Panel noted and discussed a letter from the Chair of the Privileges and Procedures Committee (PPC) to the Chief Minister in relation to the PPC's observations on specified provisions within the draft Statistics and Census (Jersey) Amendment Law 202 The Panel welcomed William Millow, Deputy Greffier, to provide further clarity on the PPC's observations as raised within its letter. | |
| The Panel agreed to request a briefing, jointly with the PPC, from the Minister for Sustainable Economic Development to receive clarification on the PPC's observations. | ММ |
| The Panel also agreed to request the Chief Minister to defer the States Assembly debate on the Proposition from 25 th June 2024 to September 2024 to allow it more time to | ММ |

| consider the proposals, the proposed amendments to the Proposition as well as any further submissions from the Statistics Users Group. | |
|--|----|
| 5. Commercial Services Meeting – Minister for Treasury and Resources | |
| The Panel noted the upcoming meeting with the Minister for Treasury and Resources scheduled for 27 th June 2024 and agreed the question areas for the meeting. | AC |
| 6. Quarterly Hearing – Minister for Treasury and Resources | |
| The Panel noted the upcoming quarterly hearing with the Minister for Treasury and Resources on 12 th July 2024 and discussed the question areas to include in the question plan for the hearing. The Panel agreed to consider and approve the draft question plan at its next meeting on 2 nd July 2024. | мм |
| 7. Upcoming Briefings/Meetings/Hearings | |
| The Panel noted a meeting on Modernisation and Digital workstreams scheduled for 12 th July 2024 and, considering that the Chair and Vice-Chair would not be available to attend, requested the Officer to establish whether an alternate date for the meeting would be possible. | ММ |
| The Panel agreed to request a briefing on the proposed changes to the Wills and Successions (Jersey) Law 1993. | ММ |
| The Panel noted the Annual Report 2023 [R.100/2024] of the Jersey Appointments Commission (JAC) presented on 14 th June 2024 and agreed to request a presentation from the JAC on the report and the role of the Commission. | ММ |
| 8. Next Meeting | |
| The Panel noted that its next scheduled meeting was at 9:30am on Tuesday 2 nd July 2024 in the Blampied Room, States Building. | |

Record of Meeting

Date: 24th June 2024

| Present | Deputy Helen Miles, Chair |
|---------------|--|
| | Deputy Lucy Stephenson, Vice-Chair |
| | Deputy Jonathan Renouf |
| | Deputy Alex Curtis |
| | Deputy Max Andrews |
| Apologies | Connétable David Johnson |
| In attendance | Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone, Chair, Privileges and Procedures |
| | Committee |
| | Deputy Carina Alves, Vice-Chair, Privileges and Procedures Committee |
| | Deputy Steve Ahier, Member, Privileges and Procedures Committee |
| | Deputy Tom Coles, Member, Privileges and Procedures Committee |
| | Deputy Kirsten Morel, Minister for Sustainable Economic Development Francis Walker, Head of Policy, Strategic Policy, Planning and Performance |
| | William Millow, Deputy Greffier, States Greffe Monique Magalhaes, Committee and Panel Officer Justine Lepp, Research and Project Officer |

| Agenda matter | Action |
|---|--------|
| 1. Briefing: Draft Statistics and Census (Jersey) Amendment Law 202- [P.29/2024] | |
| The Panel, jointly with the Privileges and Procedures Committee, received Deputy Kirsten Morel, Minister for Sustainable Economic Development, and Francis Walker, Head of Policy, for a private meeting in respect of matters of privilege and proposed amendments to the draft Statistics and Census (Jersey) Amendment Law 202-[P.29/2024]. The meeting was held in private in accordance with the Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011 (as amended) under Qualified Exemption Article 35. | |

Record of Meeting

Date: 27th June 2024

| Present | Deputy Helen Miles, Chair |
|---------------|--|
| | Deputy Lucy Stephenson, Vice Chair |
| | Deputy Alex Curtis |
| | Deputy Max Andrews |
| | Connétable David Johnson |
| Apologies | Deputy Jonathan Renouf |
| In attendance | Item 2 |
| | Deputy Elaine Millar, Minister for Treasury and Resources |
| | Caroline Hastings, Interim Director of Commercial Services, Treasury and Exchequer |
| | David Le Marquand, Acting Private Secretary to the Minister for Treasury |
| | and Resources, Ministerial Office |
| | Monique Magalhaes, Committee and Panel Officer |

| Agenda matter | Action |
|---|--------|
| 1. Commercial Services Meeting: Pre-meeting Discussion | |
| The Panel noted its upcoming Commercial Services meeting scheduled for that morning and discussed the areas to address during the meeting. | |
| 2. Commercial Services Meeting | |
| The Panel received Deputy Elaine Millar, Minister for Treasury and Resources, and Caroline Hastings, Director of Commercial Services, for a meeting in relation to Commercial Services. The Chair explained that a public record of the meeting would be taken for publishing on the States Assembly website. | |
| The Panel requested an update on the current position of Commercial Services, noting that Commercial Services had moved into the Treasury and Exchequer in 2022 and subsequently its services were being transformed. The Interim Director for Commercial Services explained that work was continuing to transform the services provided by Commercial Services, considering that the delivery was impacted by the Covid-19 Pandemic and other competing priorities since the move. | |
| The Panel asked for a brief outline of the functions of Commercial Services. It was noted that Commercial Services included the following three primary functions: | |
| Commercial Advisory Procurement Business Services | |

It was explained that Commercial Advisory provided services to assist with the delivery of contracts such as contract management and commercialisation models and the provision of support on commercial related matters.

The Procurement function was explained as the approach to solicit services or the purchase of goods and services from an external source. The Panel was informed that Procurement assisted with the delivery of value for money and quality outcomes for Government through adopting a strategic approach in procurement matters, reducing risk, increasing supply chain efficiency and building relationships.

It was further explained that Business Services was a support function that encompassed a small team who delivered services in relation to compliance and included consideration for breaches and exemptions in accordance with the Public Finances Manual (PFM). The Panel was informed that data gathered by Business Services was used to inform business compliance for best practice and risk management when delivering policy decisions.

It was raised that the understanding of the role of Commercial Services was not always clear and that the differences between the three primary functions could benefit from rebranding to provide enhanced clarity of their functions within Government.

The Panel asked what other areas of Commercial Services still required transformation. It was noted that changes to the functioning of Commercial Services was still being considered and that further transformation was likely.

It was noted that the Procurement team led on the procurement of corporate contracts and some major projects whilst providing advice and guidance to external contractors who provided a service to major capital projects ensuring compliance with Government policies and procedures. All procurement projects in excess of a value £100,000 must be accompanied by a procurement strategy. It was explained that the procurement strategies were considered and approved by the Commercial Services Advisory Board which was chaired by the Interim Director of Commercial Services and supported by Commercial Services Procurement category leads.

The Panel asked whether certain Ministerial departments were more accepting than others of the model used for the procurement of services and questioned whether any concerns had been raised by departments in respect of the procurement process. It was highlighted that the Public Finance Manual (PFM) must be complied with in respect of procurement and that it was a legal requirement to follow the rules as prescribed to ensure public money was not placed at risk. It was raised that Commercial Services provided the support to departments for the procurement process to ensure that it followed best practice, complied with the legal thresholds, and associated processes as set out in the PFM.

The Panel asked whether Commercial Services had a responsibility to manage a contract after the contract was agreed and signed as well as during the delivery of the project. It was noted that contract management was important and that guidance for contract management was provided by Commercial Services through training sessions and campaigns and Guidance on the Commercial Services website. However, it was emphasised that performance measurement and holding suppliers accountable was not entirely the responsibility of Commercial Services. It was noted that the department with responsibility for the project would be required to manage the procurement activity and the management of the resulting Contract with support and guidance from Commercial Services as appropriate. Where a Contract was let by the central team for commonly

bought items and services the central team was responsible for the management and delivery in accordance with the contract.

The Panel asked what role Commercial Services had in auditing whether the agreed contracts were appropriately managed. It was noted that the final check of a contract with Commercial Services was at the time that the contract was awarded and that subsequently, Commercial Services would not always be involved in the Contract Management of that contract.

The Panel questioned whether it would be good practice for Commercial Services to have further involvement in the managing of contracts for improved oversight of the process. It was reiterated that the department with responsibility for the project would be responsible for contract and supplier management. Corporate contracts were managed by Commercial Services to ensure delivery of goods and services was in accordance with the contract, which would follow on from Commercial Services undertaking its role in awarding the contract. However, it was highlighted that Commercial Services was always available to provide guidance and support at any stage of the process.

The Panel asked whether contracts included performance mechanisms to ensure accountability. It was noted that performance measurement through Key Performance Indicators (KPIs) were included in contracts that were led by the Corporate Procurement Team and guidance was provided for contracts developed by the department.

The Panel asked what role Commercial Services had in 'joining the dots' with regard to the entire procurement process (from the initial stages through to delivery) to identify any areas of challenge or where improvements could be made. It was raised that Commercial Services was not currently appropriately positioned to undertake that function in detail, however, data from the Commercial Services Approvals Board was used to identify improvements. Feedback from the category managers was also used to improve understanding. The PFM and Procurement Best Practice documentation was regularly updated. It was emphasised, that as Commercial Services had no in-house training programme currently, that steps were being taken to 'build their own' people. However, without an in-house training programme, delivering training in the areas of Commercial Services was challenging.

The Panel noted that in respect of legislation governing Statistics and Census, the Chief Statistician had responsibility and leadership for training of the analysts and ensuring that they acquired the skills needed for their role. The Panel questioned whether that professional leadership type model could be considered for use in Commercial Services. It was noted that the Head of Profession model was being considered as part of a future delivery model.

In respect of resourcing, it was explained that recruiting the necessary skills was challenging, particularly for the Procurement section of the service. It was noted that Business Services and Commercial Advisory was adequality resourced, however, Procurement could benefit from having more people.

The Panel questioned whether the challenges being faced in relation to recruitment was specific to a Jersey context or was being seen nationally. It was noted as Jersey specific. It was explained that it was challenging in Jersey to attract people into the Procurement area in particular. The Panel asked why that was the case and was provided with a viewpoint that a different recruitment campaign was needed, which was being considered.

The Panel asked whether the Minister would be supportive of an apprentice scheme to support recruitment for Commercial Services. The Minister confirmed that she would be supportive of such a scheme, however, noted that an apprentice scheme would necessitate for a training programme to be in place.

Noting that Commercial Services was now within the Treasury and Exchequer, the Panel asked from where Commercial Services enlisted support for training. It was noted that training support was provided through the Learning and Development team.

Highlighting that the Chief Minister had noted his priority to curb growth within the public sector, the Panel asked what impact that would have on Commercial Services. It was explained that as part of the transformation process for Commercial Services that to date it had already slimmed down substantially. In addition, in respect of consultant use, that Commercial Services complied with strict rules. It was noted that a wider area of work was being undertaken within the Treasury and Exchequer in respect of roles and their definitions in the context of Commercial Services to further clarify and better align roles with functions. It was further noted that these definitions would be published once finalised.

The Panel asked how social value was determined and delivered by Commercial Services as part of the procurement process. It was explained that a member of the team was responsible for considering social value as part of any procurement strategy. The importance of ensuring that a balanced and proportionate approach was achieved when delivering on project requirements and social value was emphasised. it was explained that it was not always possible to simultaneously deliver on both the social value elements and the requirements of a project. However, where social value could be achieved, delivery of it would be considered. An example was provided of the Jersey Opera House project where it was possible to deliver on both the social value and business value elements. It was emphasised that it was important that the delivery of social value was not tokenism.

Discussions took place on the protocol and policy for local and national procurement. It was explained that the approach followed was one which aimed to ensure that public money was spent wisely within the local economy whenever feasible. However, it was highlighted that local procurement was not always possible and that skills and services which were not on Island would be required to be sourced nationally. It was raised that benefit could be achieved by improving communications with local suppliers to better understand what skills were available locally and from where.

The Panel asked what consideration was underway in respect of the Hogs Robinson Group (HRG) service. It was noted that the retender for a travel service was a priority of Commercial Services for 2024.

The Panel requested an organisational chart for Commercial Services. It was agreed that this would be shared with the Panel.

MM

The Panel thanked the Minister and Officers for attending the meeting and the meeting concluded.

Record of Meeting

Date: 1st July 2024

| Present | Deputy Helen Miles, Chair |
|---------------|--|
| | Deputy Lucy Stephenson, Vice Chair |
| | Deputy Alex Curtis |
| | Deputy Max Andrews |
| | Connétable David Johnson |
| Apologies | Deputy Jonathan Renouf |
| In attendance | Matthew Berry, Legal Adviser, Law Officers' Department |
| | |
| | Monique Magalhaes, Committee and Panel Officer |

| Agenda matter | Action |
|--|--------|
| 1. Briefing – Wills and Successions (Jersey) Law 1993 | |
| The Panel received Matthew Berry, Legal Adviser, Law Officers' Department, for a private briefing on the changes being proposed to the Wills and Succession (Jersey) Law 1993. The <u>proposed changes</u> were advised by the Legislation Advisory Panel, which functioned to provide advice to the Chief Minister on laws which did not fall under the responsibility of a specific Minister. The meeting was held in private in accordance with the Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011 (as amended) under Qualified Exemption Article 35. | |

Record of Meeting

Date: 2nd July 2024

| Present | Deputy Helen Miles, Chair |
|---------------|--|
| | Deputy Lucy Stephenson, Vice Chair |
| | Deputy Max Andrews |
| | Deputy Jonathan Renouf |
| | Connétable David Johnson |
| | Deputy Alex Curtis |
| In attendance | Monique Magalhaes, Committee and Panel Officer |

| Agenda matter | Action |
|---|--------|
| 1. Record of Meetings | |
| The Panel noted and approved the records of the meetings held on 18 th and 24 th June 2024. | MM |
| 2. Meeting with the Jersey Appointments Commission | |
| The Panel received Chris Stephenson, Chair of the Jersey Appointments Commission (JAC), and Kate Wright, Member of the JAC, for a private meeting in respect of the JAC's role. The meeting was held in private in accordance with the Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011 (as amended) under Absolute Exemption Article 26. | |
| 3. People and Culture Follow-up Review | |
| The Panel requested that minor amendments be made to the draft Scrutiny Report and subsequently approved the Scrutiny Report for presentation to the States Assembly on 12 th July 2024. It was agreed that a news release would not accompany the presentation of the Scrutiny Report. | ММ |
| 4. P.29/2024 - Draft Statistics and Census (Jersey) Amendment Law 202- | |
| The Panel noted and discussed the further submissions received from the Statistics Users Group on 28 th June 2024 in relation to the Panel's review of the draft Statistics and Census (Jersey) Amendment Law 202- (draft Law). The Panel discussed the meeting held, jointly with the Privileges and Procedures Committee (PPC), on 24 th June 2024 and the PPC's observations in respect of the draft Law. It was noted that a request was made on behalf of the Panel and PPC to the Chief Minister to defer the debate of the Proposition to September 2024. The Panel noted that the PPC was scheduled to meet the following week to further discuss the draft Law and agreed to finalise its Comments following the meeting of the PPC. | мм |
| 5. P.33/2024 – Draft States of Jersey (Deputy Chief Minister) Amendment Law 202- | |
| | |

| The Panel noted and discussed the Comments Paper drafted in respect of the draft States of Jersey (Deputy Chief Minister) Amendment Law 202 The Panel agreed minor changes and, subsequent to those changes being made, approved the Comments Paper for presentation that week. | мм |
|--|----|
| 6. Government Plan 2025-28 Review | |
| The Panel noted and discussed Scrutiny's agreed approach for reviewing the proposed Government Plan 2025-28 and noted that it would lead on the review and all overarching themes. The Panel noted that the proposed Government Plan 2025-28 would no longer be lodged on 9 th July 2024 as previously anticipated but instead was now expected to be lodged mid-late July for debate in the States Assembly in November 2024. | |
| 7. Sub - Panel: OECD Pillar 2 Implementation Review | |
| Deputy Renouf, Chair of the Sub-Panel, updated the Panel on the progress of the Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD) Pillar 2 workstream. The Chair noted that the first meeting of the Sub-Panel was held on 20 th June 2024. It was further noted that only initial discussions took place at that meeting and it was agreed that the Sub-Panel would commence the scoping of its review once it received sight of the proposals. The review timeline was highlighted as very tight, considering that it was anticipated that the review would fall between July and October 2024 and would likely require the appointment of an advisor. | |
| The Chair of the Sub-Panel informed the Panel that a briefing to update the Sub-Panel on the progress of the workstream, and on the results of the Government consultation undertaken with targeted businesses, would be received on 11 th July 2024. | |
| 8. Wills and Succession (Jersey) Law 1993 | |
| The Panel discussed the private briefing received on 1 st July 2024 in respect of the proposals to update the Wills and Successions (Jersey) Law 1993 and noted that the proposals were currently undergoing a Government public consultation which was due to conclude in September 2024. The role of the Legislation Advisory Panel in respect of the proposals was discussed. The Panel agreed that it would consider this workstream further once the consultation responses were received and the proposals were finalised. The Panel agreed that a further briefing would be required at that time and anticipated it would undertake a review of the Proposition once it was lodged. | мм |
| 9. Quarterly Hearing – Minister for Treasury and Resources | |
| The Panel discussed and agreed the draft question plan for the upcoming Quarterly Hearing with the Minister for Treasury and Resources on 12 th July 2024. The Panel agreed to a meeting on 9 th July 2024 to further discuss the question plan and prepare for the hearing. The Chair gave her apologies for that meeting and requested that the Vice Chair lead the meeting in her absence. | ММ |
| 10. Upcoming Briefings and Meetings | |
| The Panel noted its upcoming scheduled briefings and meetings and agreed to arrange a public hearing in relation to recruitment and retention following the presentation of its Scrutiny Report for the People and Culture Follow-up review, which it intended to present later that month. | ММ |

11. Next Meeting

The Panel noted that its next scheduled meeting was an informal meeting (without an agenda) at 9:30am on Tuesday 9^{th} July 2024 in the Blampied Room of the States Building.

Record of Meeting

Date: 9th July 2024

| Present | Deputy Lucy Stephenson, Vice Chair |
|---------------|--|
| | Deputy Max Andrews |
| | Deputy Jonathan Renouf |
| | Connétable David Johnson [item 2 only] |
| Apologies | Deputy Helen Miles, Chair |
| | Deputy Alex Curtis |
| In attendance | Monique Magalhaes, Committee and Panel Officer |

| Agenda matter | Action |
|---|--------|
| 1. Government Plan 2025-2028 Review | |
| The Panel noted and discussed a letter received from the Chief Minister on 5 th July 2024 to provide an update on the preparations underway for the Government Plan 2025-2028. The Panel agreed to write to the Chief Minister to seek clarity on particular areas raised within the letter and to request further detail regarding matters that were not suitably addressed. It was noted that the letter would be published. | ММ |
| The Panel noted that the letter was shared with the Scrutiny Liaison Committee (SLC) for discussion at its meeting that afternoon and requested that any feedback from the SLC be shared with it to help inform its response. | LS |
| 2. Quarterly Hearing – Minister for Treasury and Resources | |
| The Panel discussed the question plan for its upcoming hearing with the Minister for Treasury and Resources, scheduled for that Friday. The Panel agreed the allocation of the questions to Members and noted that the question plan would be updated accordingly ahead of the hearing that Friday. | ММ |

Record of Meeting

Date: 12th July 2024

| Present | Deputy Helen Miles, Chair Deputy Lucy Stephenson, Vice Chair Deputy Max Andrews Deputy Jonathan Renouf Connétable David Johnson Deputy Alex Curtis |
|---------------|---|
| In attendance | Items 2: Deputy Elaine Millar, Minister for Treasury and Resources Richard Summersgill, Comptroller, Treasury and Exchequer Richard Bell, Treasurer, Treasury and Exchequer Andrew Hacquoil, Group Director, Strategic Finance, Treasury and Exchequer |
| | Monique Magalhaes, Committee and Panel Officer Gwyn Garfield-Bennett, Communications Officer [Items 2 and 3 only] Abigail Thompson, Intern, States Greffe [Items 1 to 3 only] |

| Agenda matter | Action |
|---|--------|
| Quarterly Public Hearing with the Minister for Treasury and Resources: prehearing discussion | |
| The Panel discussed and agreed the areas of questioning for the quarterly public hearing with the Minister for Treasury and Resources scheduled to take place that morning. | |
| 2. Quarterly Public Hearing with the Minister for Treasury and Resources | |
| The Panel received Deputy Elaine Millar, Minister for Treasury and Resources, and Officers for the quarterly public hearing at 10:00am. The hearing was webcast live, recorded and transcribed. | |
| 3. Quarterly Public Hearing with the Minister for Treasury and Resources: post-meeting discussion | |
| The Panel discussed and agreed the areas to include in a social media post to highlight the key areas of discussion that had taken place during the quarterly public hearing. | GG |

4. Government Plan 2025-28

The Panel discussed the <u>letter</u> received from the Chief Minister on 5th July 2024 in relation to the preparations underway for the Government Plan 2025-28. The Panel discussed its draft letter to the Chief Minister and requested that minor changes be made prior to obtaining the Chair's final approval later that afternoon and, subsequently, sharing the letter with the Chief Minister soon after, if possible.

MM

The Panel discussed its scrutiny approach for the Government Plan 2025-28 and agreed that Deputy Gardiner would be co-opted onto the Panel for its review of the Government Plan 2025-28.

MM

Record of Meeting

Date: 18th July 2024

| Present | Deputy Helen Miles, Chair |
|---------------|---|
| | Deputy Max Andrews |
| | Connétable David Johnson |
| Apologies | Deputy Lucy Stephenson, Vice Chair |
| | Deputy Jonathan Renouf |
| | Deputy Alex Curtis |
| In attendance | Lesley Darwin, Chief People Officer, Cabinet Office |
| | Jean Rhodes, Business Partner - Health and Safety, Cabinet Office |
| | James Seargeant, Consultant – People Services, Cabinet Office |
| | Andrew Harris, Committee and Panel Officer |
| | Alex Cameron, Research and Project Officer |

| Agenda matter | Action |
|---|--------|
| 1. Private Briefing – Occupational Health in the Government of Jersey | |
| The Panel received an Officer-led briefing on the Government of Jersey's current Occupational Health services and any future enhancements. The meeting was held in private in accordance with the Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011 (as amended) under Qualified Exemption Article 35. | |
| The Panel noted that the current Occupational Health services contract was <u>due to expire</u> on 31 st October 2024 and agreed to continue its consideration of this area over the coming months. | |

Record of Meeting

Date: 22nd July 2024

| Present | Deputy Helen Miles, Chair Deputy Lucy Stephenson, Vice Chair |
|---------------|--|
| | Deputy Alex Curtis |
| | Deputy Max Andrews |
| | Connétable David Johnson |
| Apologies | Deputy Jonathan Renouf |
| In attendance | Jason Whitfield, Chief Information Officer, Cabinet Office |
| | Ruth Galloway, Head of Business Enablement and Customer Support, |
| | Cabinet Office |
| | Jenny Hully, Head of Digital Delivery Services, Cabinet Office |
| | |
| | Andy Harris, Committee and Panel Officer |

| Agenda matter | Action |
|---|--------|
| 1. Briefing – Modernisation and Digital | |

The Panel received officers from Modernisation and Digital (M&D) which sat within the Cabinet Office for a briefing in relation to the priorities of the department from early 2024 through to initial plans for 2025 and 2026. It was also intended as a fact finding briefing in order to inform the Panel of the work of the section. Prior to the briefing, the Panel identified key questions that it wished to ask officers.

The Chief Information Officer explained that M&D offered a wide range of digital support and IT dependent change services to departments across Government. It was noted that there had been eight high priority IT operational incidents at the beginning of 2024 that affected several departments and public services. This highlighted the fact that the IT systems had not been sufficiently invested in to be kept up to date.

There had been a proliferation of applications across the organisation which had resulted in an increase in technical debt, which had become increasingly costly to maintain. Also, M&D had hundreds of suppliers that provided the hundreds of applications and over multiple IT platforms that had been implemented across Government departments. Due to the push to digitise Government, projects were currently in progress pulling on resources within M&D which was also running maintenance and support activity. It was noted that this complexity, combined with a lack of sufficient resources to maintain the scale of IT systems was materially impacting how digital services were being delivered to the front line and Government departments.

Given the issues experienced with the IT incidents the Government Chief Information Officer had initiated a health check review to inform the required turnaround plan. The current IT and Digital Services environment was explained as being too complex. There was a requirement to go through a process of simplification in nearly all the key management domains of IT Services, in addition to a risk reduction programme. Investing

in and implementing recommendations derived from this M&D health check review was intended to strengthen digital services to deliver a more robust and secure offering for Islanders. It was noted that this required capital investment to mitigate risks and position the organisation for sustained success in an increasingly digital landscape.

It was explained that the implication of the above was that some major change projects would need to be delayed if the remediation of the old legacy IT infrastructure, networks and applications was to be achievable given the funding envelope, along with a desire to reduce the use of consultants, focus on must-haves and reduce overall risk position.

The review had showed that there were areas that required investment to upgrade and update IT infrastructure, networks, and applications. The turnaround plan was intended to deliver the required implementation of up-to-date IT solutions to mitigate the risks from aging hardware and software as well as aligning internal processes and governance to best practice, with a major focus on systems simplification of the current complex IT and digital estate. The turnaround plan was based around four programmes of work to mitigate the risks identified in the health check:

- Security Remediation
- IT Network Remediation
- IT Application Remediation
- IT Infrastructure Remediation

Information was highlighted to the Panel in order to provide an indication of the size of the digital technology estate across the Government including in respect of:

- User accounts and network devices
- Wireless access points and network connections
- Virtual servers, IT platforms and IT applications
- Infrastructure for supporting emails, Microsoft Teams interactions and web pages
- Storage and servers

The Panel was also informed that 170 colleagues supported M&D.

The Chief Information Officer noted that it had been a challenging six months since he had taken up post, noting the significant outage on 23rd February 2024 within Health and Community Services as well as the global outage reported on Friday 19th July 2024. He explained that the plan to address the overall issues within Government IT systems was in place and the core issues had been identified.

The Panel questioned what level of cross cutting oversight M&D had in relation to projects across Government. It was noted that the Head of Architecture had oversight of this for identifying good practice and limiting the number of programmes. It was explained that there was not currently an architectural blueprint for the Government, however, this was intended to be in place by the end of 2024. It was noted that work on the overall IT strategy had been paused so that attention could be paid to addressing the immediate issues within the systems. Once this had been completed, and controls had been put in place with the correct resources, then further work on the strategy could be taken forward.

It was noted that in terms of reducing the reliance on external suppliers for systems, this would be a complex process over a number of years. It was highlighted that HCS currently had a high number of systems, some of which needed urgently replacing. It was

noted that funding had been allocated over the next three years in order to address these issues. This further highlighted the need for an overall architectural plan.

It was noted that the move to the new office accommodation provided a challenge for M&D in terms of its logistics. It was noted that this was currently being planned with a view to staging moves for colleagues over weekends. It was also noted that the records management project had been paused whilst M&D addressed some of the more immediate issues.

The Officers noted that they would provide the Panel with a briefing paper highlighting the points raised within the briefing. The Panel thanked the Officers for attending and they left the meeting.

AΗ

Record of Meeting

Date: 24th July 2024

| Present | Deputy Helen Miles, Chair Deputy Max Andrews Connétable David Johnson |
|---------------|---|
| Analogica | Deputy Alex Curtis |
| Apologies | Deputy Lucy Stephenson, Vice Chair |
| | Deputy Jonathan Renouf |
| In attendance | Russell Crowe, Head of Treasury and Investment Management, Treasury and Exchequer |
| | Sean O'Regan, Group Director of Education, Children, Young People, Education and Skills (CYPES) |
| | Anne Homer, Head of Finance Business Partnering – CYPES, Treasury and Exchequer |
| | Alex Cameron, Research and Project Officer |

| Agenda matter | Action |
|---|--------|
| Private Briefing – Treasury Support Mechanisms | |
| The Panel received an Officer-led briefing on Treasury related support mechanisms in respect of education. The meeting was held in private in accordance with the Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011 (as amended) under Qualified Exemption Article 35. | |
| The Panel noted that the subject matter also fell within the remit of the Children, Education and Home Affairs Scrutiny Panel (hereafter the 'CEHA Panel') and requested that the Officer liaise with the Officer of the CEHA Panel on the workstream as appropriate. | AC |

Record of Meeting

Date: 30th July 2024

| Present | Deputy Helen Miles, Chair |
|---------------|--|
| | Deputy Max Andrews |
| | Deputy Jonathan Renouf |
| Apologies | Deputy Lucy Stephenson, Vice Chair |
| | Connétable David Johnson |
| | Deputy Alex Curtis |
| In attendance | Monique Magalhaes, Committee and Panel Officer |
| | Alex Cameron, Research and Project Officer |

| Agenda matter | Action |
|--|--------|
| 1. Record of Meetings | |
| The Panel noted and approved the records of the meetings held on 27 th June and 1 st , 2 nd , 9 th and 12 th July 2024. | AC |
| 2. People and Culture Follow-up Review | |
| The Panel agreed to present its Scrutiny Report for its People and Culture Follow-up Review that week. | AC |
| 3. P.29/2024 – Draft Statistics and Census (Jersey) Amendment Law 202- | |
| The Panel agreed that it would not be proposing any amendments to P.29/2024 - Draft Statistics and Census (Jersey) Amendment Law 202 | |
| The Panel requested that minor changes be made to its draft Comments ahead of its next meeting on 13 th August 2024. The Panel also agreed to consider and approve the draft Comments at that meeting. | ММ |
| 4. Government Plan 2025-28 Review | |
| The Panel noted that it was still awaiting the lodgement of the Proposition to the Government Plan 2025-28 in order to progress the Scrutiny workstream. The Panel anticipated that the Proposition would be lodged that week. | |
| The Panel noted and discussed the <u>letter</u> received from the Chief Minister on 26 th July 2024 in response to its <u>letter</u> dated 12 th July 2024. The Panel agreed to consider the workstream further once the Proposition was lodged. | MM |
| The Panel emphasised that it would consider its Scrutiny approach with regard to the Public Services Ombudsperson once it received sight of any proposals or otherwise within the Government Plan 2025-28, considering that funding had been allocated to the workstream within previous Government Plans. | мм |

5. Sub - Panel: OECD Pillar 2 Implementation Review

Deputy Renouf, Chair of the Sub-Panel, updated the Panel on the progress of the Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD) Pillar 2 workstream. The Chair noted that the Sub-Panel received a private Officer-led briefing on the draft legislation on 18th July 2024 and noted that the draft legislation appeared very technical in nature.

The Chair of the Sub-Panel emphasised that the indicative timeline provided by Government for scrutiny of the workstream was very tight and that further consideration regarding its feasibility was needed, particularly in light of the summer recess and the potential requirement for the Sub-Panel to engage an advisor to assist with the review.

It was noted that the Proposition had not yet been lodged, although it was anticipated that it would be lodged imminently.

It was also noted that a further meeting of the Sub-Panel was scheduled for the following day.

6. Briefings - Debrief

The Panel recalled and discussed the briefings received since its last meeting on 9th July 2024 including a private briefing regarding Occupational Health on 18th July 2024, a public briefing regarding Modernisation and Digital on 22nd July 2024 and a private briefing regarding education-related treasury support mechanisms on 24th July 2024.

The Panel agreed to stay abreast of the Occupational Health and Modernisation and Digital workstreams and to include areas of questioning on these workstreams during its upcoming Quarterly Hearings as appropriate.

The Panel agreed to write to the Minister for Treasury and Resources to follow up on certain treasury aspects raised within the private briefing on education-related treasury support mechanisms and to request a further meeting jointly with the Minister for Treasury and Resources and Minister for Education and Lifelong learning.

7. Upcoming Briefings and Meetings

The Panel noted its upcoming scheduled briefing on Emergency Planning scheduled for 12th September 2024.

The Panel noted that it would look to schedule a public hearing in relation to recruitment and retention as appropriate.

The Panel noted that a private meeting, jointly with the Children, Education and Home Affairs Scrutiny Panel, was being considered following the resignation of Jersey's Prison Governor, Susie Richardson. It was hoped that a meeting would be possible prior to her departure from the role on 15th August 2024.

8. Next Meeting

The Panel noted that its next scheduled meeting was on 13th August 2024 at 9:30am in the Blampied Room of the States Building. Deputy Renouf provided his apologies for that meeting.

ММ

MM

MM

MM

MM

Record of Meeting

Date: 13th August 2024

| Present | Deputy Helen Miles, Chair |
|---------------|--|
| | Deputy Lucy Stephenson, Vice Chair |
| | Deputy Max Andrews |
| | Connétable David Johnson |
| | Deputy Alex Curtis |
| Apologies | Deputy Jonathan Renouf |
| In attendance | Deputy Inna Gardiner [Item 5 only] |
| | Monique Magalhaes, Committee and Panel Officer Alex Cameron, Research and Project Officer Emily Thomas, Campaign Manager Gwyn Garfield-Bennett, Communications Officer |

| Agenda matter | Action |
|---|--------|
| 1. Record of Meetings | |
| The Panel noted and approved the records of the meetings held on 18 th , 24 th and 30 th July 2024. | AC |
| 2. People and Culture Follow-up Review [S.R.5/2024] | |
| The Panel noted that the People and Culture Follow-up Review [S.R.5/2024] was presented and published on 1st August 2024. The Panel agreed to ensure that the report would inform the Panel's future work and that evidence would continue to be gathered in the areas identified. The Panel noted that no Ministerial Response was expected. | |
| 3. P.29/2024 – Draft Statistics and Census (Jersey) Amendment Law 202- | |
| The Panel approved the draft Comments to the Draft Statistics and Census (Jersey) Amendment Law 202- [P.29/2024]. The Panel agreed to present the Comments as soon as possible and noted that the States' debate on the Proposition was scheduled for 10 th September 2024. | ММ |
| The Panel discussed and expressed its support for the Chief Minister's proposed Amendment to Deputy Bailhache's Amendment. | |
| 4. Corporate Services Sub-Panel: OECD Pillar 2 Implementation Review | |
| The Panel received an update on the OECD Pillar 2 Implementation Review and noted that the Propositions had not yet been lodged. The Panel raised concern that the Propositions were referenced in the Proposed Budget 2025-2028 without having been lodged. | |

5. Budget 2025-2028 Review

The Panel noted a briefing paper prepared by the Officer on the review process. The Officer informed the Panel of the Scrutiny process for reviewing the Proposed Budget 2025-28 (previously entitled the 'Government Plan'), explaining that the Panel would lead the review and consider all overarching elements of the review. It was noted that the other standing Scrutiny Panels would focus their reviews of the Proposed Budget 2025-28 on the areas specific to their remit.

The Panel considered its review approach and discussed how to collaborate with the Scrutiny Liaison Committee (SLC). The Panel discussed how Scrutiny would manage the elements which cut across the remits of multiple Panels through the allocation of projects, and the Chair agreed to provide an update to the SLC on the progress of the review at the weekly informal meetings of the SLC. In addition, should it be deemed necessary, it was discussed that the SLC may consider how it could utilise public hearings to address any areas of cross over. It was noted that this would need to be considered and actioned by the SLC as appropriate and not the Panel.

MM/H M

The Officer presented the draft Scoping Document for the review. The Panel noted the projects and revenue expenditure growth areas allocated to it for review. The Panel discussed the importance of scrutinising the funding proposals for the new Government of Jersey (Government) headquarters and considered how best to enable this.

The Panel noted and discussed the stakeholders it wished to request submissions from. The Panel agreed that it would not be necessary to engage an advisor for the purpose of the review, however, noted that should areas of concern be highlighted as the review progressed, it could be considered at a later stage.

MM

The Panel highlighted that other jurisdictions had implemented processes to ensure that funding was balanced across different demographics, which aligned with priorities presented in the Common Strategic Policy. The Panel discussed the options for including gender-responsive budgeting as part of its review process and agreed to include this within the scope and Terms of Reference for its review, as appropriate.

MM

The Panel noted the Digital and Public Engagement Plan for its review, which was presented by the Campaign Manager. The Panel discussed the use of pop-up stands and considered different location opportunities to engage with all demographics. The Panel noted that pop-up stands for the review would involve all Panels, with members from the other standing Panels invited to join. The Panel considered the Government's communications strategy and the need for possible alignment or coordination, particularly in relation to engaging young people.

MM

The Panel requested that the necessary amendments be made to the draft Scoping Document, draft Terms of Reference and Digital and Public Engagement Plan for the Chair to approve ahead of seeking approval of the documentation from the SLC later that week.

MM/ET

The Panel noted and agreed the public review hearing dates with the Chief Minister and Minister for Treasury and Resources and requested that the necessary arrangements be made to secure those dates.

MM

The Panel noted that the Chair would record a launch video that afternoon to accompany the review launch. The Officer advised that, should approval for the review be received from the SLC that week, the review would be launched the following week. The Panel

| noted that a single press release to announce the launch of all Scrutiny Panels' reviews would accompany the Panel's review launch. | |
|--|----|
| 6. Correspondence – Minister for Treasury and Resources | |
| The Panel noted and discussed a confidential letter received from the Minister for Treasury and Resources dated 8^{th} August 2024. The Panel noted a meeting scheduled for Thursday that week to discuss the matter further with the Minister for Treasury and Resources and Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning. | |
| 7. Public Services Ombudsperson | |
| The Panel received an update on the work to date of the Legislative Advisory Panel (LAP) in relation to the Jersey Public Services Ombudsperson and discussed the workstreams of both the LAP and Government. The Panel expressed its uncertainty regarding the Government's position on whether to establish an Ombudsperson. | |
| The Panel agreed on the importance of this workstream and agreed to consider its approach further. The Panel discussed a possible review of the workstream. The Panel requested the Officer informally seek clarification on where the funding proposals for the Public Services Ombudsperson workstream could be located within the Proposed Budget 2025-28 documentation, noting that during the States Members' briefing on the proposals it was confirmed that funding for the workstream was allocated within the Proposed Budget 2025-28. | ММ |
| The Panel requested a further update on the work of the LAP at its next meeting. | DJ |
| 8. Upcoming Briefings/Meetings/Hearings | |
| The Panel noted and discussed the upcoming meetings and briefings currently scheduled. The Panel noted the meeting with the Prison Governor scheduled for later that day, which would be held jointly with the Children, Education and Home Affairs Panel. The Panel also noted the meeting with the Minister for Treasury and Resources and Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning scheduled for Thursday that week, and attendance for that meeting was agreed by the Panel. It was noted that a public hearing on recruitment and retention would be scheduled for November 2024, as appropriate. | мм |
| 9. Next Meeting | |
| The Panel noted that its next meeting was scheduled for 9:30am on Tuesday 20 th August 2024 in the Blampied Room of the States Building. | |

Record of Meeting

Date: 15th August 2024

| Present | Deputy Helen Miles, Chair Deputy Lucy Stephenson, Vice Chair Deputy Max Andrews Deputy Alex Curtis Connétable David Johnson |
|---------------|--|
| Apologies | Deputy Jonathan Renouf |
| In attendance | Deputy Robert Ward, Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning Deputy Elaine Millar, Minister for Treasury and Resources Russell Crowe, Head of Treasury and Investment Management, Treasury and Exchequer Sean O'Regan, Group Director of Education, Children, Young People, Education and Skills (CYPES) |
| | Martin Keith, Private Secretary, Office of the Chief Executive Allison Le Couteur, Private Secretary, Office of the Chief Executive Monique Magalhaes, Committee and Panel Officer Alex Cameron, Research and Project Officer |

| Agenda matter | Action |
|--|--------|
| Private Briefing – Treasury Support Mechanisms | |
| The Panel received a Minister-led briefing on Treasury support mechanisms in respect of Education. The meeting was held in private in accordance with the Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011 (as amended) under Absolute Exemption Article 23. | |

Record of Meeting

Date: 20th August 2024

| Present | Deputy Helen Miles, Chair |
|---------------|--|
| | Deputy Lucy Stephenson, Vice Chair |
| | Deputy Max Andrews |
| | Connétable David Johnson |
| | Deputy Alex Curtis |
| | Deputy Jonathan Renouf |
| In attendance | Monique Magalhaes, Committee and Panel Officer |
| | Alex Cameron, Research and Project Officer |
| | Gwyn Garfield-Bennett, Communications Officer |

| Agenda matter | Action |
|---|--------|
| 1. Record of Meetings | |
| The Panel noted and approved the records of the meetings held on 22 nd July, 13 th and 15 th August 2024. | AC |
| 2. P.29/2024 - Draft Statistics and Census (Jersey) Amendment Law 202- | |
| The Panel noted that its Comments on the Draft Statistics and Census (Jersey) Amendment Law 202- had been presented on 16 th August 2024. The Panel further noted that a States Members' briefing on the Proposition was scheduled for 4 th September 2024 at 9:00 am. | |
| 3. Corporate Services Sub-Panel: OECD Pillar 2 Implementation Review | |
| The Chair of the Sub-Panel provided an update on the progress of the OECD Pillar 2 Implementation Review. The Panel noted that the Chair had been in communication with the Minister for Treasury and Resources and Minister for External Relations and had also received correspondence on 8 th and 15 th August regarding the lodging and debate timeline of the Propositions. | |
| The Panel noted that the Sub-Panel would likely seek to further understand the possibility of extending the timeline for debate of the Propositions to ensure there was adequate time for thorough scrutiny of the proposals. | |
| 4. Proposed Budget 2025-2028 Review | |
| The Officer provided an update on the progress of the review, confirming that letters had been sent to both the Chief Minister and the Minister for Treasury and Resources to notify them of the review launch on Friday 16 th August 2024. The Panel noted that its review into the Proposed Budget 2025-28 was launched on 19 th August 2024 and that the media release would be sent out that morning. | GG |

| The Panel discussed plans for public engagement during Democracy Week, including pop-up stands to raise awareness about the Proposed Budget 2025-28 and engage the public. The Panel considered producing printed materials such as leaflets to distribute at the pop-up stands and the use of further visuals to encourage public engagement. | GG |
|---|----|
| The Panel noted and discussed a briefing paper prepared to assist in focusing its review on the clauses within the Proposition to the Proposed Budget 2025-28. | |
| The Panel also discussed key topics within the Proposed Budget 2025-28 that it would scrutinise as part of its review. The Panel agreed to consider these elements further in its upcoming meetings and to use its upcoming public hearings to explore topics further. | |
| The Panel discussed the allocations provided within previous Government Plans for the Jersey Public Services Ombudsperson (JPSO) workstream and agreed it was important to seek further clarification on how this was accounted for in the proposed Budget 2025-28. The Panel agreed to explore this further. | |
| The Panel noted the process and timeline for lodging of any Amendments to the Proposed Budget 2025-28 and discussed the importance of forming any proposed Amendments in sufficient time before the scheduled deadline. | |
| The Panel discussed the proposals for the Revenue Transformation Programme (Phase 3 and 4) and agreed to request a briefing on that workstream. | MM |
| The Panel noted the Scrutiny technical briefing on the Proposed Budget 2025-28 was scheduled for Friday 13 th September at 2pm. | |
| 5. P.55/2024 – Nationality Acts: Extension to Jersey | |
| The Panel noted that the Proposition - Nationality Acts: Extension to Jersey [P.55/2024] was lodged by the Chief Minister on 19 th August 2024. The Panel agreed to request clarification as to why the Proposition was lodged by the Chief Minister considering that the workstream was under the responsibility of the Minister for Justice and Home Affairs. The Panel also agreed to request a briefing on the proposals as appropriate. | ММ |
| 6. Public Services Ombudsperson | |
| An update was received on the work of the Legislative Advisory Panel regarding the JPSO workstream. The Panel agreed to further consider how best to approach this workstream at its next meeting | |
| 7. Meetings Debrief | |
| The Chair provided an update on the joint private meeting held with the Prison Governor alongside the Children, Education, and Home Affairs Panel on 13 th August 2024. | |
| The Panel noted and discussed the private meeting with the Minister for Treasury and Resources and the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning on 15 th August 2024. | |
| 8. Upcoming Briefings/Meetings/Hearings | |
| The Panel noted that the Quarterly Hearing with the Minister for Treasury and Resources on 11 th October 2024 would need to be rescheduled. The Panel agreed to reschedule the hearing to 15 th November 2024 as proposed. | ММ |

9. Next Meeting

The Panel noted that its next meeting was scheduled for 9:30am on Tuesday 3rd September 2024 in the Blampied Room of the States Building.

Record of Meeting

Date: 3rd September 2024

| Present | Deputy Lucy Stephenson, Vice Chair |
|---------------|---|
| | Deputy Max Andrews |
| | Connétable David Johnson |
| | Deputy Jonathan Renouf |
| Apologies | Deputy Helen Miles, Chair |
| | Deputy Alex Curtis |
| In attendance | Deputy Inna Gardiner [Item 3 only] |
| | |
| | Monique Magalhaes, Acting Principal Committee and Panel Officer |
| | Alex Cameron, Research and Project Officer |
| | Gwyn Garfield-Bennett, Communications Officer |

| Agenda matter | Action |
|---|--------|
| 1. Record of Meetings | |
| The Panel noted and approved the record of the meeting held on 20 th August 2024. | AC |
| 2. Corporate Services Sub-Panel: OECD Pillar 2 Implementation Review | |
| The Chair of the Sub-Panel updated the Panel on recent discussions and final amendments to the Terms of Reference for the review. The Panel discussed the review timeline. The Chair noted the social media reception of a video accompanying the review launch. | |
| 3. Proposed Budget 2025-2028 Review | |
| The Panel recalled its previous discussion around the communications plan for Democracy Week, particularly the locations for holding the pop-up stands. The Panel discussed whether expanding those locations to other areas would be appropriate but agreed that the current arrangement provided a good opportunity for a broad range of demographics to participate. | |
| The Officer provided an update on the progress of the review. The Panel noted that targeted submission requests had been sent to stakeholders with a three-week response window. Additionally, letters had been sent to the Chief Minister and the Minister for Treasury and Resources, with responses due by 9th September 2024. The Panel discussed the potential for further written questions and noted that written questions would be drafted for the Panel's consideration as appropriate. | ММ |
| The Panel discussed possible amendments to the Proposed Budget 2025-28 and agreed to consider it further at the next meeting. The Panel agreed to revisit the recommendations made in respect of the previous Panel's review of the Proposed Government Plan 2024-27 and agreed to consider these at its next meeting. The Panel | |

| discussed the proposals for the new Government Headquarters, as outlined in the Proposed Budget 2025-28. The Panel requested that an explanation of the associated clauses within the Proposition to the Proposed Budget 2025-28 be provided at the Scrutiny briefing scheduled for 13 th September 2024. | ММ |
|--|----|
| 4. Public Services Ombudsperson | |
| The Panel discussed the Jersey Public Services Ombudsperson (JPSO) workstream and any actions in that regard. The Panel noted that the Public Accounts Committee would be launching a review into the complaints process. | |
| The Panel agreed on the importance of maintaining awareness of the JPSO workstream and its implementation, while it remained under review by the Government and discussed ways in which that could be achieved. | |
| 5. Quarterly Hearing – Chief Minister | |
| The Panel noted that the Quarterly Hearing with the Chief Minister was scheduled for 20 th September 2024 and discussed key question areas to include. The Panel noted that a draft question plan would be drafted for its consideration ahead of its next meeting. | |
| 6. Upcoming Briefings/Meetings/Hearings | |
| The Panel noted the upcoming joint briefing with the Children, Education, and Home Affairs Panel on Emergency Planning, scheduled for 12 th September 2024 at 2:30pm. | |
| 7. Any Other Business | |
| The Panel discussed the possibility of a briefing on the workings of the tax system and agreed to explore that area further at a later date. | ММ |
| 8. Next Meeting | |
| The Panel noted that its next meeting was scheduled for 9:30am on Tuesday 17 th September 2024 in the Blampied Room of the States Building. | |

Record of Meeting

Date: 12th September 2024

| Present | Deputy Helen Miles, Chair |
|---------------|--|
| | Deputy Lucy Stephenson, Vice Chair |
| | Deputy Jonathan Renouf |
| | Deputy Max Andrews |
| | Deputy Alex Curtis |
| Apologies | Connétable David Johnson |
| In attendance | Deputy Catherine Curtis, Chair, Children, Education and Home Affairs Panel |
| | Connétable Mark Labey, Vice Chair, Children, Education and Home Affairs Panel |
| | Deputy Beatriz Poree, Children, Education and Home Affairs Panel |
| | Kate Briden, Director General, Department for Justice and Home Affairs Paul Brown, Chief Fire Officer, States of Jersey Fire and Rescue Service, Department for Justice and Home Affairs |
| | Nathan Fox, Associate Director, Justice Policy, Cabinet Office Kevin Murphy, Channel Islands Emergency Planning Officer, Department for Justice and Home Affairs. |
| | Monique Magalhaes, Acting Principal Committee and Panel Officer Katherine de Carteret, Committee and Panel Officer Bridgit Siddall, Research and Project Officer |

| Agenda matter | Action |
|---|--------|
| 1. Private Briefing – Emergency Planning: Resilience Policy and Strategy | |
| The Panel, jointly with the Children, Education and Home Affairs Scrutiny Panel, received an Officer-led private briefing on the progress in relation to the Resilience Policy and Strategy workstream for emergency planning. The meeting was held in private in accordance with the Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011 (as amended) under Qualified Exemption Article 35. | |

Record of Meeting

Date: 16th September 2024

| Present | Deputy Helen Miles, Chair |
|---------------|--|
| | Deputy Lucy Stephenson, Vice Chair |
| | Deputy Max Andrews |
| | Deputy Alex Curtis |
| Apologies | Connétable David Johnson |
| | Deputy Jonathan Renouf |
| In attendance | Deputy Inna Gardiner, Co-opted Panel Member for the purpose of |
| | Proposed Budget 2025-2028 Review |
| | Deputy Elaine Millar, Minister for Treasury and Resources Richard Summersgill, Comptroller, Treasury and Exchequer Mandy Sloan, Transformation Director, Treasury and Exchequer Jean - Marc Blanchet, Operations Manager, Treasury and Exchequer Scott Cameron, Senior Specialist Officer, Treasury and Exchequer Allison Le Couteur, Private Secretary to the Minister for Treasury and Resources. Monique Magalhaes, Acting Principal Committee and Panel Officer |
| | Edgar Glover, Research and Project Officer |

| Agenda matter | Action |
|---|--------|
| Private Briefing – Revenue Transformation Programme | |
| The Panel received a private briefing on the progress of the Revenue Transformation Programme (phases 3 and 4) to inform its review of the Proposed Budget 2025-2028. A public <u>briefing note</u> was also provided to the Panel to inform its review. The meeting was held in private in accordance with the Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011 (as amended) under Qualified Exemption Article 35. | |

Record of Meeting

Date: 17th September 2024

| Present | Deputy Helen Miles, Chair |
|---------------|---|
| | Deputy Lucy Stephenson, Vice Chair |
| | Deputy Alex Curtis |
| | Deputy Max Andrews (Items 1-3 only) |
| | Connétable David Johnson |
| | Deputy Jonathan Renouf |
| In attendance | Deputy Inna Gardiner [Item 2 only] |
| | |
| | Monique Magalhaes, Acting Principal Committee and Panel Officer |
| | Alex Cameron, Research and Project Officer |
| | Gwyn Garfield-Bennett, Communications Officer |

| Agenda matter | Action |
|--|--------|
| 1. Record of Meetings | |
| The Panel noted and approved the record of the meeting held on 3 rd September 2024. | AC |
| 2. Proposed Budget 2025-2028 Review | |
| The Panel noted the pop-up stands that were scheduled as part of the Democracy Week events commencing on 23 rd September 2024. The Panel discussed and agreed potential questions to be included in a survey, which was being drafted to assist with public engagement at the pop-up stands in respect of the Proposed Budget 2025-28 review. | GG |
| The Officer provided an update on the progress of the review. The Panel noted and discussed the submissions received to date. The Panel noted a request from the Channel Islands Tobacco Importers and Manufacturers Association (CITIMA) to meet and agreed to extend an invitation to CITIMA and for a meeting to be arranged as appropriate. | ММ |
| The Panel discussed possible amendments to the Proposed Budget 2025-28 and agreed to consider the potential for any amendments as the review progressed. | ММ |
| The Panel agreed to include questioning for its review hearings on the recommendations accepted by the Council of Ministers in respect of the previous Panel's review of the Proposed Government Plan 2024-27. | ММ |
| The Panel noted and discussed the letters received from the <u>Chief Minister</u> and <u>Minister for Treasury and Resources</u> dated 9 th September 2024. The Panel agreed to consider these when developing the questioning for it review hearings. | ММ |
| The Panel discussed the Scrutiny briefing received on the financial tables in respect of the Proposed Budget 2025-28 on 13 th September 2024 as well as the briefing received on the Revenue Transformation Programme on 16 th September 2024. The Panel agreed | |

| to include a line of questioning on the Revenue Transformation Programme for its review hearing with the Minister for Treasury and Resources scheduled for 18 th October 2024 | ММ |
|---|-------|
| The Panel noted the upcoming review hearing with the Chief Minister scheduled for 7 th October 2024 and discussed the areas of focus to include. It was noted that a question plan would be drafted accordingly. | ММ |
| The Panel discussed Government's risk appetite and analysis of risk in relation to the proposals within the Proposed Budget 2025-28. The Panel also discussed project areas that could cut across multiple Panel remits and how that could be appropriately managed. The Panel agreed to raise those aspects at the meeting of the Scrutiny Liaison Committee that afternoon. | HM/IG |
| 3. Corporate Services Sub-Panel: OECD Pillar 2 Implementation Review | |
| The Chair of the Sub-Panel updated the Panel on the progress of the review and noted the deferral of the States Assembly debate on the Propositions (P.53/2024 and P.54/2024) from 1st October 2024 to 22nd October 2024, which provided the Sub-Panel with a slightly extended timeline to carry out its review. The Chair, however, emphasised the tight timeframe that the Sub-Panel continued to work to. | |
| 4. Public Services Ombudsperson | |
| The Panel discussed the Jersey Public Services Ombudsperson (JPSO) workstream and noted a <u>report</u> by Jersey Cares - <i>Response to the Government Plan 2021-2024</i> , which highlighted the workstream. The Panel agreed to keep abreast of the workstream through its upcoming hearings. | ММ |
| 5. Emergency Planning Briefing | |
| The Panel noted and discussed the briefing received, jointly with the Children, Education and Home Affairs Panel, on 12 th September 2024 in respect of the Emergency Planning workstream. The Panel noted that the work was in the early stages of development and agreed to keep abreast of the workstream. | |
| 6. Quarterly Hearing – Chief Minister | |
| The Panel noted a request from the Chief Minister to alter the time of the Quarterly Hearing. The Panel agreed to maintain the schedule as previously agreed due to members' commitments. | ММ |
| The Panel discussed and agreed a draft question plan for the upcoming hearing with the Chief Minister scheduled for that Friday and also agreed the allocation of questions to members. | MM |
| The Panel noted that the question plan would be finalised and printed copies provided for the hearing that Friday. | ММ |
| 7. Work Programme | |
| The Panel noted and discussed its upcoming work programme and agreed to include the following areas of interest for future consideration: • Parish rates structures and rates legalisation. | ММ |

Public finances and future generation impact in respect of work being undertaken by the Comptroller and Auditor General.

8. Next Meeting

The Panel noted that its next meeting was scheduled for 9:30am on Tuesday 24th September 2024 in the Blampied Room of the States Building.

Record of Meeting

Date: 20th September 2024

| Present | Deputy Helen Miles, Chair |
|---------------|--|
| | Deputy Jonathan Renouf |
| | Connétable David Johnson |
| | Deputy Alex Curtis |
| Apologies | Deputy Max Andrews |
| | Deputy Lucy Stephenson, Vice Chair |
| In attendance | Items 2: |
| | Deputy Lyndon Farnham, Chief Minister |
| | Deputy Malcolm Ferey, Assistant Chief Minister |
| | Andrew McLaughlin, Chief Executive Officer, Cabinet Office |
| | Lesley Darwin, Chief People Officer, Cabinet Office |
| | Paul Wylie, Group Director of Policy, Cabinet Office |
| | Remi Harris, Apprentice Policy Officer, Cabinet Office |
| | Alexander Cameron, Research and Project Officer |
| | Gwyn Garfield-Bennett, Communications Officer [Items 2 and 3 only] |

| Agenda matter | Action |
|--|--------|
| 1. Quarterly Public Hearing with the Chief Minister: pre-hearing discussion | |
| The Panel discussed and agreed the areas of questioning for the quarterly public hearing with the Chief Minister scheduled to take place that morning. | |
| 2. Quarterly Public Hearing with the Chief Minister | |
| The Panel received Deputy Lyndon Farnham, Chief Minister, Deputy Malcom Ferey, Assistant Chief Minister, and Officers for the quarterly public hearing at 1:30pm. The hearing was webcast live, recorded and transcribed. | |
| 3. Quarterly Public Hearing with the Chief Minister: post-hearing discussion | |
| The Panel discussed and agreed the areas to include in a social media post to highlight the key areas of discussion that had taken place during the quarterly public hearing. The Panel requested that a social media post be drafted and published. | GG |

Record of Meeting

Date: 24th September 2024

| Present | Deputy Helen Miles, Chair |
|---------------|---|
| | Deputy Lucy Stephenson, Vice Chair |
| | Deputy Max Andrews |
| | Connétable David Johnson |
| | Deputy Jonathan Renouf |
| Apologies | Deputy Alex Curtis |
| In attendance | Monique Magalhaes, Acting Principal Committee and Panel Officer |
| | Alex Cameron, Research and Project Officer |
| | Gwyn Garfield-Bennett, Communications Officer |

| Agenda matter | Action |
|--|--------|
| 1. Record of Meetings | |
| The Panel noted and approved the records of the meetings held on 12 th ,16 th and 17 th September 2024. | AC |
| 2. Proposed Budget 2025-2028 Review | |
| The Panel noted and discussed the stakeholder submissions received and agreed to arrange two thirty-minute meetings with the Jersey Hospitality Association (JHA) and Channel Islands Tobacco Importers and Manufacturers Association (CITIMA) as appropriate. | ММ |
| The Panel discussed any themes of focus in relation to the review and how it might incorporate these in its review output. The Panel agreed to consider it further as the review progressed. The Panel also considered how sustainable wellbeing, Government overarching ambition, short and longer-term vision as well as gender responsive budgeting was accounted for in the Proposed Budget 2025-28. | ММ |
| The Panel discussed the Jersey Performance Framework and Future Jersey Vision and agreed, if possible, to request a meeting with a person of interest who was involved in the development thereof. | ММ |
| The Panel discussed stamp duty structures in respect of first-time buyers and agreed to include this as a questioning area for its review hearing with the Minister for Treasury and Resources scheduled for 18 th October 2024. | ММ |
| The Panel noted a request from the Chief Minister to alter the time of the review hearing scheduled for 7^{th} October 2024. The Panel agreed the proposed change and requested that it be arranged as appropriate. | MM |
| The Panel discussed a question plan drafted for the upcoming review hearing with the Chief Minister. The Panel agreed the questioning areas for the hearing as well as those | |

areas that it preferred to provide as written questions for a response in writing from the Chief Minister. The Panel noted that the question plan would be redrafted accordingly MM ahead of it being shared for further consideration and finalisation at a further meeting, which the Panel requested be scheduled for 3rd October 2024 at 2pm. The Panel discussed possible amendments to the Proposed Budget 2025-28 and agreed to consider the potential for any amendments as the review progressed. The Panel requested to receive the business cases for the revenue expenditure growth allocations in respect of the non-ministerial department and other states bodies as shown MM within the Proposed Budget 2025-28. The Panel noted and considered a timeline in respect of the review. The Panel noted the pop-up stands that were scheduled as part of the Democracy Week events that week. 3. Corporate Services Sub-Panel: OECD Pillar 2 Implementation Review The Chair of the Sub-Panel updated the Panel on the progress of the review on the Propositions (P.53/2024 and P.54/2024) scheduled for debate in the States Assembly on 22nd October 2024. The Panel noted the private stakeholder meetings that were scheduled for that afternoon and the joint review hearing with the Ministers for Treasury and Resources and External Relations that was scheduled for 26th September 2024. 4. Any Other Business MM The Panel noted the offer from the Chief Minister to hold a public hearing on the Gender Pay Gap workstream and agreed to hold the hearing in early 2025. The Panel noted it was awaiting two sets of terms of reference in respect of the Government reviews underway regarding the Jersey Public Services Ombudsperson and MM Complaints Panel workstreams. It was noted that had been followed up with the Cabinet Office. The Panel noted and discussed P.60/2024 - Westaway Trust: Transfer of Assets to Le Don De Faye Trust - lodged by the Minister for Treasury and Resources on 10th September 2024 for debate in the States Assembly on 22nd October 2024. The Panel agreed that no further action was required on the matter. The Panel discussed the online petition asking the States Assembly to 'make old age pensions exempt from tax' and noted a potential States Assembly debate in that regard. 5. Next Meeting The Panel noted that its next scheduled meeting was at 9:30am on Tuesday 8th October

2024 in the Blampied Room of the States Building.

Record of Meeting

Date: 7th October 2024

| Present | Deputy Helen Miles, Chair |
|---------------|---|
| | Deputy Jonathan Renouf |
| | Connétable David Johnson |
| | Deputy Alex Curtis |
| | Deputy Max Andrews [Items 1 and 2 only] |
| Apologies | Deputy Lucy Stephenson, Vice Chair |
| In attendance | Deputy Inna Gardiner (Co- opted Member) |
| | |
| | Items 2: |
| | Deputy Lyndon Farnham, Chief Minister |
| | Deputy Ian Gorst, Assistant Chief Minister |
| | Richard Bell, Treasurer of the States, Treasury and Exchequer Andrew Hacquoil, Group Director of Strategic Finance, Treasury and Exchequer |
| | Paul Wylie, Group Director of Policy, Cabinet Office |
| | Monique Magalhaes, Acting Principal Committee and Panel Officer Joanna Falla, Committee and Panel Officer Justine Lepp, Research and Project Officer Gwyn Garfield-Bennett, Communications Officer [Items 2 and 3 only] |

| Agenda matter | Action |
|---|--------|
| Proposed Budget 2025-28 Public Review Hearing with the Chief Minister: prehearing discussion | |
| The Panel discussed and agreed the areas of questioning for the public review hearing with the Chief Minister scheduled to take place that morning. | |
| 2. Proposed Budget 2025-28 Public Review Hearing with the Chief Minister | |
| The Panel received Deputy Lyndon Farnham, Chief Minister, Deputy Ian Gorst, Assistant Chief Minister, and Officers for the review public hearing at 1:00pm. The hearing was webcast live, recorded and transcribed. | |
| 3. Proposed Budget 2025-28 Public Review Hearing with the Chief Minister: post- hearing discussion | |
| The Panel discussed and agreed the areas to include in a social media post to highlight the key areas of discussion that had taken place during the public review hearing. The Panel requested that a social media post be drafted and published. | GG |

Record of Meeting

Date: 8th October 2024

| Present | Deputy Helen Miles, Chair Deputy Max Andrews Connétable David Johnson Deputy Jonathan Renouf |
|---------------|--|
| Apologies | Deputy Alex Curtis Deputy Lucy Stephenson, Vice Chair |
| In attendance | Chris Rayner, Account Director at Direct Input, Channel Islands Tobacco Importers and Manufacturers Association [Item 3 only] Ana and Marcus Calvani, Chief Executive Officers, Jersey Hospitality Association [Item 4 only] |
| | Monique Magalhaes, Acting Principal Committee and Panel Officer Justine Lepp, Research and Project Officer |

| Agenda matter | Action |
|--|--------|
| 1. Record of Meetings | |
| The Panel noted and approved the records of the meetings held on 20 th and 24 th September 2024. | JL |
| 2. Conflict of Interests | |
| The Panel noted a declaration of a conflict of interest from Deputy Curtis regarding his consultation on the Proposed Budget 2025-28 with Government and the Jersey Hospitality Association in relation to the proposals for Excise Duty Relief for Craft Producers, as well as a conflict of interest due to his involvement as a Distiller at La Côte Distillery. | |
| 3. Private Meeting - Channel Islands Tobacco Importers and Manufacturers Association (CITIMA) | |
| The Panel received Chris Rayner, Account Director at Direct Input on behalf of the Channel Islands Tobacco Importers and Manufacturers Association (CITIMA) for a private meeting in respect of the CITIMA's <u>submission</u> to the Panel's review of the Proposed Budget 2025-28. The meeting was held in private in accordance with the Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011 (as amended) under Absolute Exemption Article 26. | |
| 4. Private Meeting - Jersey Hospitality Association (JHA) | |
| The Panel received Ana and Marcus Calvani, Chief Executive Officers of the Jersey Hospitality Association (JHA) for a private meeting in respect of the JHA's <u>submission</u> to the Panel's review of the Proposed Budget 2025-28. The meeting was held in private in | |

accordance with the Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011 (as amended) under Absolute Exemption Article 26. A declaration of a conflict of interest was noted from Deputy Curtis regarding his consultation on the Proposed Budget 2025-28 with Government and the Jersey Hospitality Association in relation to the proposals for Excise Duty Relief for Craft Producers, as well as a conflict of interest due to his involvement as a Distiller at La Côte Distillerv. 5. Proposed Budget 2025-2028 Review The Panel noted that no further stakeholder submissions had been received since its previous meeting. MM The Panel noted that letters requesting feedback on the proposed Revenue Expenditure Growth allocations for the non-ministerial department would be sent that week. The Panel discussed the Public Review Hearing with the Chief Minister that took place on 7th October 2024. The Panel reviewed a guestion plan drafted for the upcoming review hearing with the Minister for Treasury and Resources scheduled for 18th October 2024. The Panel agreed MM the questioning areas for the hearing as well as those areas that it preferred to provide as written questions for a response in writing from the Minister. The Panel noted that the question plan would be redrafted accordingly ahead of it being shared for further consideration and finalisation at the Panel's next meeting on 15th October 2024. The Panel noted that the questioning areas would be shared with the Treasury and Exchequer department on Friday 11th October. The Panel agreed to request any questions from members of the public through social media to consider for inclusion in its questioning of the Minister for Treasury and MM Resources on the Proposed Budget 2025-28. The Panel noted the request would be GG followed up with the Communications Officer and actioned accordingly. The Panel discussed potential Panel amendments under consideration and those that might be brought in the capacity of its members instead. 6. Any Other Business The Panel discussed a private matter raised during a meeting of the Children Education and Home Affairs Panel of which the Chair was a member and any potential crossover with the Panel's remit. The Panel agreed for the Chair to follow up on the matter as appropriate and revert to the Panel as required with any areas to discuss further. The Panel recalled that the Terms of Reference (ToR) in respect of the reviews underway in relation to the Public Services Ombudsperson workstream by Government would be shared with it. It was noted that the ToR for the Complaints Panel related piece of work MM remained outstanding, however, had been followed up. 7. Next Meeting The Panel noted that its next scheduled meeting was at 9:30am on Tuesday 15th October 2024 in the Blampied Room of the States Building.

Record of Meeting

Date: 15th October 2024

| Present | Deputy Helen Miles, Chair Connétable David Johnson Deputy Jonathan Renouf |
|---------------|---|
| Apologies | Deputy Lucy Stephenson, Vice Chair Deputy Max Andrews Deputy Alex Curtis |
| In attendance | Deputy Inna Gardiner [Item 3 only] Monique Magalhaes, Acting Principal Committee and Panel Officer |

| Agenda matter | Action |
|--|--------|
| 1. Record of Meetings | |
| The Panel noted and approved the records of the meetings held on 7 th and 8 th October 2024. | MM |
| 2. Conflict of Interests | |
| No conflicts of interest were noted in respect of the meeting held. | |
| 3. Proposed Budget 2025-2028 Review | |
| The Panel noted a submission received from the Fiscal Policy Panel in respect of its review. The Panel noted it was expecting to receive a further submission from the Statistics Users' Group by Wednesday that week. | |
| The Panel noted that correspondence was due from the Chief Minister in respect of its written questions dated 30 th September 2024, however, noted that the response would be delayed. It was also noted that further correspondence was expected from the Chief Minister by 16 th October 2024 in response the Panel's letter dated 9 th October 2024. | ММ |
| The Panel reviewed a draft question plan for the upcoming review hearing with the Minister for Treasury and Resources scheduled for 18 th October 2024. The Panel agreed the allocation of questioning areas for the hearing. The Panel considered questions received from members of the public and agreed to include these in the question plan. The Panel agreed to consider the draft question plan further and to provide any additional | мм |
| changes by Thursday 17 th October 2024 at midday for it to be finalised thereafter and the final version to be shared with the Panel that afternoon. Deputy Inna Gardiner agreed to liaise with the Comptroller and Auditor General in respect of her input, as appropriate. | IG |
| The Panel requested that a briefing be arranged in relation to the proposals for the transition to the living wage as noted within the Proposed Budget 2025-28. It was agreed that all Scrutiny Panels should be invited to attend the briefing. | MM |

| The Panel discussed potential Panel amendments. The Panel agreed to consider any Panel amendments ahead of its next meeting in order to ideally finalise these at that meeting on 29 th October 2024. | ММ |
|---|----|
| 4. OECD Pillar 2 Implementation Review | |
| Deputy Renouf, Chair of the Sub-Panel undertaking the review, updated the Panel on the progress of the Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD) Pillar 2 review. It was noted that the Sub-Panel's review was in the final stages and that the intention was for the Scrutiny Report to be presented to the States Assembly that week ahead of the States Assembly debate on the Propositions (P.53/2024 and P.54/2024) which was due to commence on 22 nd October 2024. | |
| 5. Meetings and Briefings | |
| The Panel discussed Proposition P.67/2024 – Draft Royal Court and Stamp Duties and Fees (Jersey) Amendment Law 202- lodged by the Minister for Treasury and Resources for debate by the States Assembly on 12 th November 2024. The Panel noted it was due to receive a briefing on the proposals on 25 th October 2024. | |
| 6. Any Other Business | |
| The Panel discussed a matter that arose from the meeting held in private with the Jersey Hospitality Association in relation to their submission to the Panel's review of the Proposed Budget 2025-28 on 8 th October 2024. The Panel agreed to raise the matter regarding procedures for private meetings with the Scrutiny Liaison Committee. | нм |
| The Panel noted that some Members would not be able to attend the Panel's scheduled meeting on Tuesday 5 th November commencing at 9:30am and agreed to reschedule the meeting to the afternoon of that day commencing at 2:30pm. | ММ |
| 7. Next Meeting | |
| The Panel noted that its next scheduled meeting was at 9:30am on Tuesday 29 th October 2024 in the Blampied Room of the States Building. | |

Record of Meeting

Date: 18th October 2024

| Present | Deputy Helen Miles, Chair |
|---------------|--|
| | Connétable David Johnson |
| | Deputy Alex Curtis |
| | Deputy Max Andrews |
| Apologies | Deputy Lucy Stephenson, Vice Chair |
| | Deputy Jonathan Renouf |
| In attendance | Deputy Inna Gardiner (Co- opted Member for the Proposed Budget 2025-28 Review) |
| | Item 2: |
| | Deputy Elaine Millar, Minister for Treasury and Resources |
| | Richard Bell, Treasurer of the States, Treasury and Exchequer |
| | Cora O'Brien, Deputy Comptroller of Revenue, Treasury and Exchequer Andrew Hacquoil, Group Director of Strategic Finance, Treasury and Exchequer |
| | Monique Magalhaes, Acting Principal Committee and Panel Officer |
| | Charlotte Curry, Communications Officer [Item 3 only] |

| Agenda matter | Action |
|---|--------|
| Proposed Budget 2025-28 Public Review Hearing with the Minister for Treasury and Resources: pre-hearing discussion | |
| The Panel discussed and agreed the areas of questioning for the public review hearing with the Minister for Treasury and Resources scheduled to take place that morning. | |
| 2. Proposed Budget 2025-28 Public Review Hearing with the Minister for Treasury and Resources | |
| The Panel received Deputy Elaine Millar, Minister for Treasury and Resources, and Officers for the review public hearing at 10:00am. The hearing was webcast live, recorded and transcribed. | |
| 3. Proposed Budget 2025-28 Public Review Hearing with the Minister for Treasury and Resources: post-hearing discussion | |
| The Panel discussed and agreed the areas to include in a social media post to highlight the key areas of discussion that had taken place during the public review hearing. The Panel requested that a social media post be drafted and published. | СС |
| 4. Proposed Budget 2025-28 Review | |
| Deputy Gardiner provided her apologies for the Panel's meeting on 29 th October 2024. | ММ |

| The Panel considered and agreed the Heads of Report for its review and requested the Officer to commence the report drafting process accordingly. | MM |
|--|----|
| The Panel discussed and agreed Panel Amendments to take forward and requested they be drafted accordingly for the Panel's consideration and approval at its next meeting on 29 th October 2024. | ММ |

Record of Meeting

Date: 29th October 2024

| Present | Deputy Helen Miles, Chair Connétable David Johnson Deputy Alex Curtis Deputy Max Andrews Deputy Jonathan Renouf |
|---------------|---|
| Apologies | Deputy Lucy Stephenson, Vice Chair |
| In attendance | Item 1: Richard Summersgill, Comptroller of Revenue, Treasury and Exchequer Heather Morgan, Revenue Officer, Treasury and Exchequer Monique Magalhaes, Acting Principal Committee and Panel Officer Justine Lepp, Research and Project Officer Gwyn Garfield-Bennett, Communications Officer [items 2-7] |

| Agenda matter | Action |
|--|--------|
| 1. Private Briefing: P.67/2024 – Draft Royal Court and Stamp Duties and Fees (Jersey) Amendment Law 202 | |
| The Panel received a briefing on the proposals for P.67/2024 - Draft Royal Court and Stamp Duties and Fees (Jersey) Amendment Law 202 by the Comptroller of Revenue and Revenue Officer from the Treasury and Exchequer department. The meeting was held in private in accordance with the Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011 (as amended) under Qualified Exemption Article 35. | |
| The Panel was briefed on the key changes that would be coming into effect from the proposals, should the Proposition be adopted. The Panel noted that the Proposition (P.67/2024) lodged by the Minister for Treasury and Resources was due for debate by the States Assembly on 12 th November 2024. | |
| The Panel agreed that no further Panel actions were required in relation to the workstream. | |
| 2. Records of Meetings | |
| The Panel noted and approved the records of the meetings held on 15 th and 18 th October 2024. | JL |
| The Panel discussed the process for private meetings and the sharing of Panel file notes for those meetings with witnesses. Noting that a file note was drafted for the Panel's reference and was neither a formal record of a private meeting, nor provided a verbatim account of the meeting, the Panel agreed that a file note should not be shared outside of the Panel. The Panel also agreed that for private meetings, attendees should be informed | мм |

at the start of the meeting that, should they wish to retain notes from the meeting, they would be required to produce these themselves. Alternatively, a private meeting could take place where a transcript was provided, which would provide a verbatim account of the meeting.

3. Declaration of Interests

No declarations of interest were noted in respect of the meeting held.

4. Proposed Budget 2025-2028 Review

The Panel considered the submissions received in respect of the Non-Ministerial departments and noted that two remained outstanding including from the Bailiff's Chamber and the States Assembly.

The Panel noted that a response from the Chief Minister to its letter dated 30th September 2024 was received on 27th October 2024. The Panel reviewed the response and agreed that the information presented was useful to inform the Panel's Scrutiny Report. The Panel noted that it was awaiting a response from the Minister for Treasury and Resources to its letter dated 21st October 2024, which was due that Wednesday.

The Panel considered potential Amendments to the Proposed Budget 2025-28 and agreed those that it wished to proceed with. The Panel noted that the one Amendment would be circulated for further Panel consideration once the changes, as agreed at the meeting, were made as appropriate. The Panel discussed the second Amendment and noted that it was awaiting further information to inform that Amendment. It anticipated that the draft Amendment would be available for the Panel to consider at its next meeting on 4th November 2024, should the outstanding information be received.

The Panel noted that it was awaiting correspondence from the Chief Minister in respect of its letter dated 9th October 2024, which was due a response on 16th October 2024. The Officer advised that a response had been followed up.

The Panel discussed Deputy Sir P.M. Bailhache's proposed Amendment to the Proposed Budget 2025-28 (P.51-2024) regarding the increase of grants to States Funds and agreed that no action from the Panel was required.

The Panel noted individual amendments that Panel Members were considering.

The Panel briefly discussed any preparations for the Scrutiny Liaison Committee (SLC) public hearing which was being arranged in respect of the Budget 2025-28. The Chair agreed to raise the matter with the Officers for the SLC.

нм

| 5. OECD Pillar 2 Implementation Review | |
|--|----|
| The Panel noted that the Scrutiny Report for the OECD Pillar 2 Implementation Review was presented on 17 th October 2024. The Chair informed the Panel that she was thankful to Deputy Renouf for Chairing the Sub-Panel and to the Members who worked on the Sub-Panel and commended the diligent work that was undertaken in respect of that review. Officers were also thanked for their work on that review. | |
| The Panel discussed a concern that the Chair raised regarding 'Acte Operatoire' (Public Finances (Jersey) Law 2019 – Act 12) in which immediate effect to taxation legislation was given. The Chair raised the issue that sufficient notice was not provided to the Sub-Panel regarding the Act in respect of the OECD legislation. Moreover, raised concern in respect of any potential impact on legalisation by the Privy Council in circumstances where the legislation is newly drafted. The Panel agreed that Connétable David Johnson would bring that concern forward with the Legislation Advisory Panel. | DJ |
| 6. Any Other Business | |
| The Panel agreed to cancel the next Quarterly Hearing with the Minister for Treasury and Resources that was currently scheduled for 15 th November 2024 and to reschedule it for late January 2025. | ММ |
| The Panel noted that the Quarterly Hearing with the Chief Minister was rescheduled from 5 th December 2024 to 12 th December 2024. | ММ |
| The Panel discussed the Terms of Reference (ToR) for the review of the Complaints Panel and agreed to follow up with the Greffier in that regard, as well as to clarify who was progressing that review. | ММ |

7. Next Meeting

The Panel noted that its next scheduled meeting was at 2:30pm on Tuesday $5^{\rm th}$ November 2024 in the Blampied Room of the States Building.

Record of Meeting

Meeting held by electronic mail

Date: 7th November 2024

| Present | Deputy Helen Miles, Chair |
|---------------|--|
| | Deputy Max Andrews |
| | Connétable David Johnson |
| | Deputy Jonathan Renouf |
| Apologies | Deputy Alex Curtis |
| | Deputy Lucy Stephenson, Vice Chair |
| In attendance | Deputy Inna Gardiner (Co-opted Member for the Proposed Budget 2025-28 Review) |
| | Monique Magalhaes, Acting Principal Committee and Panel Officer Justine Lepp, Research and Project Officer |

| Agenda matter | Action |
|--|--------|
| 1. Statistics Jersey Amendment | |
| The Panel reviewed and agreed upon an Amendment to the Proposed Budget (Government Plan) 2025-2028 (P.51-2024) specifically related to increasing funding for Statistics Jersey in order to produce key statistical outputs such as the Business Tendency Survey, the Jersey Opinion and Lifestyle Survey and undertake work related to Gross Value Added for quarterly reporting. | |
| 2. Jersey Public Service Ombudsperson Amendment | |
| The Panel reviewed and agreed upon an Amendment to the Proposed Budget (Government Plan) 2025-2028 (P.51-2024) specifically related to the inclusion of a narrative within the Budget report to acknowledge that the workstream for establishing a Jersey Public Service Ombudsperson remained under review and that detailed proposals be brought forward for consideration by the States Assembly in 2025. | |

Record of Meeting

Date: 11th November 2024

| Present | Deputy Helen Miles, Chair |
|---------------|---|
| | Connétable David Johnson |
| | Deputy Alex Curtis |
| | Deputy Max Andrews |
| | Deputy Jonathan Renouf |
| Apologies | Deputy Lucy Stephenson, Vice Chair |
| In attendance | Deputy Inna Gardiner (Co- opted Member for the Proposed Budget 2025-28 Review) |
| | Monique Magalhaes, Acting Principal Committee and Panel Officer Justine Lepp, Research and Project Officer |

| Agenda matter | Action |
|--|--------|
| 1. Proposed Budget 2025-2028 Review | |
| The Panel received and considered a draft Scrutiny Report for its review of the Proposed Budget 2025-2028. The Panel discussed the areas where changes should be made and agreed to further consider the report and provide any additional feedback by the following morning at 9am. It was agreed for the Officer and Chair to finalise the report for the Panel's approval at a meeting scheduled for 13 th November 2024 at 2pm. It was further agreed for the fact checking process to commence thereafter. | мм |
| The Panel noted its intention to agree the final version of the Scrutiny Report for presentation at its next meeting scheduled for 19 th November 2024. | |

Record of Meeting

Date: 13th November 2024

| Present | Deputy Helen Miles, Chair |
|---------------|---|
| | Connétable David Johnson |
| | Deputy Alex Curtis |
| | Deputy Max Andrews |
| Apologies | Deputy Lucy Stephenson, Vice Chair |
| | Deputy Jonathan Renouf |
| In attendance | Deputy Inna Gardiner (Co- opted Member for the Proposed Budget 2025-28 Review) |
| | Monique Magalhaes, Acting Principal Committee and Panel Officer Justine Lepp, Research and Project Officer |

| Agenda matter | Action |
|---|--------|
| 1. Proposed Budget 2025-2028 Review | |
| The Panel reviewed comments and feedback on the draft Scrutiny Report for its review of the Proposed Budget 2025-2028. The Panel agreed and finalised the suggested changes to the report body and review's findings and recommendations. The Panel approved the body of the report and requested that it be sent to the relevant Ministerial Departments for factual accuracy checking of the evidence included. The Panel also requested that the evidence included from the stakeholders' submissions be sent for factual accuracy checking. It was requested that any suggested feedback on the factual accuracy of the evidence included be received by Monday 18th November 2024. | мм |
| The Panel requested that the findings and recommendations be circulated to the Panel once finalised for further review and approval. | ММ |
| It was noted that the executive summary and conclusion would be drafted for approval at the Panel's next meeting on 19 th November 2024. The Panel noted its intention to agree the final version of the Scrutiny Report at that meeting for presentation on 20 th November 2024, if possible. | нм |
| The Chair agreed to draft the Chair's foreword. | 11141 |
| 2. Control of Housing and Work Law Regulations | |
| The Panel noted the <u>letter</u> received from the Assistant Chief Minister on the Control of Housing and Work Law Regulations and the timeline for lodging. The Panel agreed to request sight of the Proposition and to receive a briefing prior to lodging, which was expected in 2024. | ММ |

Record of Meeting

Date: 19th November 2024

| Present | Deputy Helen Miles, Chair |
|---------------|--|
| | Connétable David Johnson |
| | Deputy Max Andrews |
| | Deputy Jonathan Renouf [Item 3 only] |
| Apologies | Deputy Lucy Stephenson, Vice Chair |
| | Deputy Alex Curtis |
| In attendance | Deputy Inna Gardiner (Co- opted Member for the Proposed Budget 2025-28 Review) [Item 3 only] |
| | Monique Magalhaes, Acting Principal Committee and Panel Officer Justine Lepp, Research and Project Officer |
| | Felicity Guest, Research and Project Officer |
| | Gwyn Garfield-Bennett, Communications Officer |

| Agenda matter | Action |
|--|--------|
| 1. Declaration of Interests | |
| No declarations of interest were noted in respect of the meeting held. | |
| 2. Records of Meetings | |
| The Panel noted and approved the records of the meetings held on 29 th October and 7 th , 11 th and 13 th November 2024. | JL |
| 3. Proposed Budget 2025-2028 | |
| The Panel reviewed and agreed, as appropriate, the factual accuracy feedback from the Ministerial Office regarding the evidence included within its Scrutiny Report. The Panel also noted and agreed one suggested stakeholder factual accuracy change. | ММ |
| The Panel discussed the evidence within its Report in respect of the submission received from the Channel Islands Tobacco Importers and Manufacturers Association (CITIMA) and whether or not it was prudent to include that evidence due to the fact that the World Health Organisation (WHO) had recommended that governments not engage with the tobacco industry. The Panel noted that any interactions should be reflected with maximum transparency. Due to the nature of the Panel's engagement with CITIMA, the Panel agreed to maintain the evidence within its Report. | мм |
| The Panel noted that the Jersey Hospitality Association (JHA) had requested an additional 48 hours to formulate a response to the Panel's request for feedback on the factual accuracy of the JHA's evidence within its Report. The Panel noted its intentions to present its Report on Wednesday that week and agreed to provide an extension up to 5pm that day. The Panel agreed that should the extension not be sufficient for the JHA, | мм |

| under the circumstances, the evidence would need to be removed from the Report prior to presentation. | |
|---|----------|
| The Panel noted that the draft executive summary and conclusion to the Report was posted on Teams for Panel Members to review. The Panel agreed that Members would complete their review of those elements by 9am the following morning as it was anticipated that the Report would be presented on 20 th November 2024, if possible. The Chair also agreed to provide the Chair's Foreword for inclusion. It was noted that following the deadline of 9am, the draft Report in its entirety would be taken as approved by the Panel for finalisation and presentation. | HM ММ |
| The Panel discussed the Scrutiny press release for presentation of Reports and Comments. It was noted that the press release would be finalised for publication on Friday that week. | GG |
| 4. Occupational Health | |
| The Panel discussed the People and Culture Follow-up Review that was undertaken by the previous Panel and reported on in August 2024, specifically around Occupational Health. The Panel noted that it was previously informed that a tender process would take place regarding any replacement for the current AXA contract, which was due to conclude. The Panel noted that a media publication had raised that a one-year contract was being given to a United Kingdom based firm to provide Occupational Health services for the Government of Jersey. The Panel noted that it was awaiting further information from the Chief Minister's Officers regarding any progress in relation to the tender process for a provider. | мм |
| The Panel noted its upcoming Quarterly Hearing on 12 th December 2024 with the Chief Minister and agreed to include a section of questioning on Occupational Health. | JL |
| 5. Quarterly Hearing | |
| The Panel considered and agreed the areas of questioning for the upcoming quarterly hearing with the Chief Minister on 12 th December 2024. The Panel noted that a draft of the question plan would be reviewed at the Panel's next meeting on 3 rd December 2024. | JL |
| 6. Meeting and Quarterly Hearing Dates 2025 | |
| The Panel noted and agreed its meeting and quarterly hearing dates for 2025. The Panel noted that they would be scheduled as agreed and invites would be sent out in the coming weeks. | ММ |
| The Panel noted other briefings and public hearings under consideration for 2025 and agreed a timeline for those to occur. | ММ |
| 7. Any Other Business | |
| The Panel reviewed and discussed the updated Work Programme for 2025. | |
| The Panel agreed to cancel the meeting scheduled for 17 th December 2024 and agreed to cover any outstanding Panel business on 12 th December 2024 when it was scheduled to meet for the quarterly hearing with the Chief Minister. | ММ |
| 8. Next Meeting | |
| | |

The Panel noted that its next scheduled meeting was at 9:30am on Tuesday $3^{\rm rd}$ December 2024 in the Blampied Room of the States Building.

Record of Meeting

Meeting held by electronic mail

Date: 25th November 2024

| Present | Deputy Helen Miles, Chair |
|---------------|---|
| | Connétable David Johnson |
| | Deputy Max Andrews |
| | Deputy Jonathan Renouf |
| | Deputy Alex Curtis |
| Apologies | Deputy Lucy Stephenson, Vice Chair |
| In attendance | Monique Magalhaes, Acting Principal Committee and Panel Officer |

| Agenda matter | Action |
|---|--------|
| 1. Next Meeting | |
| The Panel agreed to cancel its meeting scheduled for 3 rd December 2024 and its quarterly public hearing with the Chief Minister scheduled for 12 th December 2024. The Panel noted that its next scheduled meeting was scheduled for 9:30am on Tuesday 7 th January 2025 in the Blampied Room of the States Building. | |