

## Public Accounts Committee

### Records of Meetings

**2025**

The following records of meetings have been approved by the Committee.

Signed



.....  
Chair  
Deputy Inna Gardiner

États de Jersey



L's États d'Jèrri

# Public Accounts Committee

## Record of Meeting

Date: 15<sup>th</sup> January 2025

Present	Deputy Inna Gardiner, Chair Deputy Kristina Moore, Vice-Chair [Online] Deputy Raluca Kovacs, Member Deputy Karen Wilson, Member Deputy David Warr, Member Philip Taylor, Lay Member Glen Kehoe, Lay Member Vijay Khakhria, Lay Member
Apologies	Graeme Phipps, Lay-Member Deputy Raluca Kovacs, Member
In attendance	Lynn Pamment, Comptroller and Auditor General  Jason Whitfield, Chief Operating Officer [item 3 only] Ruth Galloway, Head of Business Enablement and Customer Support [item 3 only] Nick Church, Head of Architecture [item 3 only]  Kate Faragher, Bespoke Skills [item 9 only Online]  Andy Harris, Committee and Panel Officer Joseph Brannigan, Research and Project Officer Michael Morris, Communications Officer

Agenda matter	Action
<b>1. Records of Meetings</b>  The PAC noted and approved the records of the meetings held on 16 <sup>th</sup> October and 6 <sup>th</sup> November 2024.	
<b>2. Conflicts of Interest</b>  The PAC noted that Deputy Kristina Moore had recently joined the Institute of Directors and would be updating her declarations of interest.	
<b>3. Briefing – IT general controls</b>  The PAC received Jason Whitfield, Chief Operating Officer, for a private briefing on IT general controls. The record of this meeting was classified as exempt in accordance with the Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011 (as amended) under Absolute Exemption Article 26.	
<b>4. Comptroller and Auditor General Update</b>  The PAC received an update from the Comptroller and Auditor General (C&AG) in relation to her audit plan and audit strategy for 2025 to 2028. The C&AG explained to the PAC the current work programme for the year and how it had been updated following consultation.	

<p>The C&amp;AG also informed the PAC to expect four reports in the first quarter of 2025 including:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Financial Management and Internal Control: Follow up,</li> <li>• Grants and Subsidies: Follow up,</li> <li>• Learning from Previous IT Implementations: Thinkpiece and;</li> <li>• Staff Recruitment and Retention.</li> </ul> <p>The C&amp;AG also provided the PAC with an overview of the audit strategy and informed the PAC to expect a feedback survey in February 2025 and the Transparency and Annual reports in May 2025.</p> <p>The C&amp;AG informed the PAC that it was the 20<sup>th</sup> anniversary of the Jersey Audit Office (JAO) in September 2025 and therefore JAO would be looking to put on an event to mark the occasion.</p> <p>The C&amp;AG advised the PAC that there would be a new Board of Governance and that there would be a transition of the Chair and one of the independent Members in the first quarter of 2025.</p> <p>The C&amp;AG informed the PAC of the proposal for an updated C&amp;AG Law which would allow the JAO to develop a new operating model and to use more on-Island resources.</p>	
<p><b>5. Executive Response – Tackling Fraud and Error Phase 2</b></p> <p>The PAC noted that the Executive Response to the C&amp;AG report Tackling Fraud and Error Phase 2 was due on Thursday 16<sup>th</sup> January 2025.</p>	<p><b>AH</b></p>
<p><b>6. Procurement by the Government of Jersey</b></p> <p>The PAC received an update on the progress of the review from the Chair. The PAC was informed that letters had been sent out to charities as part of the review to gather their views on the procurement and commissioning processes.</p> <p>The PAC discussed and reviewed the draft question plan prepared by Officers regarding the joint public hearing with representatives from the Jersey Institute of Directors, Jersey Chamber of Commerce and Jersey Construction Council taking place on 29<sup>th</sup> January 2025. The PAC approved the question plan subject to minor changes and tasked Officers to circulate an updated draft.</p>	<p><b>JB</b></p>
<p><b>7. Handling and Learning from Complaints</b></p> <p>The PAC agreed to meet on Thursday 16<sup>th</sup> January in Morier House Icho and Seymour Rooms to discuss the report which would be prepared by Officers.</p> <p>The PAC noted and discussed the responses to the follow up questions posed to the departments for Health and Community Services (HCS), Infrastructure and Environment (I&amp;E) and Customer and Local services (CLS) following the hearings which had taken place with the Chief Officers.</p> <p>The PAC tasked Officers to prepare a letter to CLS requesting further clarification on the information provided.</p>	<p><b>AH</b></p>

<p><b>8. Quarterly Hearing with CEO</b></p> <p>The PAC discussed the topic areas for the quarterly public hearing with the Chief Executive Officer taking place on 12<sup>th</sup> February 2025. The PAC was joined by Kate Faragher from Bespoke Skills via Microsoft Teams who would be providing question training for Committee members on Wednesday 29<sup>th</sup> January 2025.</p> <p>The PAC tasked Officers to write to the Chief Executive requesting information to help inform the question areas for the public hearing on 12<sup>th</sup> February 2025. The Officers advised that correspondence would be drafted and sent in due course.</p>	<p><b>JB</b></p> <p><b>AH</b></p>
<p><b>9. Future Meetings</b></p> <p>The PAC noted that its next scheduled meeting was due to take place at 12:00pm on Wednesday 29<sup>th</sup> January 2025 in the Blampied Room of the States Building.</p>	

# Public Accounts Committee

## Record of Meeting

Date: 29<sup>th</sup> January 2025

Present	Deputy Inna Gardiner, Chair Deputy Raluca Kovacs, Member Deputy Karen Wilson, Member Deputy David Warr, Member Vijay Khakhria, Lay Member Graeme Phipps, Lay-Member Philip Taylor, Lay Member Glen Kehoe, Lay Member
Apologies	Deputy Kristina Moore, Vice-Chair Philip Taylor, Lay Member
In attendance	Lynn Pamment, Comptroller and Auditor General Kate Faragher, Bespoke Skills [item 2 only]  Adrian De Gruchy, Chairperson, Jersey Construction Council [item 1 only] Alex Ruddy, Institute of Directors [item 1 only] Eliot Lincoln, Jersey Chamber of Commerce [item 1 only] Murray Norton, Chief Executive, Jersey Chamber of Commerce [item 1 only via Microsoft Teams]  Andy Harris, Committee and Panel Officer Joseph Brannigan, Research and Project Officer Michael Morris, Communications Officer Charlotte Curry, Acting Communications Manager

Agenda matter	Action
<b>1. Conflicts of Interest</b>  It was declared that Mr Glen Kehoe was a member of the Jersey Chamber of Commerce and Mr Vijay Khakhria was a member of the Institute of Directors. Noting the attendance of these organisations at a scheduled public hearing it was agreed that they would not ask any questions during the proceedings.	
<b>2. Public Hearing: Procurement by the Government of Jersey review</b>  The PAC received Adrian De Gruchy, Chairperson, Jersey Construction Council, Alex Ruddy, Institute of Directors, Eliot Lincoln, Jersey Chamber of Commerce, and Murray Norton, Chief Executive, Jersey Chamber of Commerce, for a public hearing in relation to its review of procurement by the Government of Jersey. The proceedings were webcast live on the States Assembly website and a recording was made so that a transcript could be produced.	
<b>3. Training with Bespoke Skills</b>  The PAC received Kate Faragher of Bespoke Skills for a training session in relation to effective questioning. The PAC discussed the question plan for the quarterly public hearing with the Chief Executive on 12 <sup>th</sup> February 2025 as part of	<b>JB</b>

that training and agreed changes to the question plan. The Officers advised that an updated draft would be circulated in due course.	
<b>4. Future Meetings</b>  The PAC noted that its next scheduled meeting was due to take place at 12:30pm on Wednesday 12 <sup>th</sup> February 2025 in the Blampied Room of the States Building.	

# Public Accounts Committee

## Record of Meeting

Date: 12<sup>th</sup> February 2025

Present	Deputy Inna Gardiner, Chair Deputy Raluca Kovacs, Member Deputy Karen Wilson, Member Deputy David Warr, Member Vijay Khakhria, Lay Member Graeme Phipps, Lay Member Deputy Raluca Kovacs, Member
Apologies	Deputy Kristina Moore, Vice-Chair Philip Taylor, Lay Member Glen Kehoe, Lay Member
In attendance	Andrew McLaughlin, Chief Executive Officer [item 3 only] Sebastian Perez, Head of Office of the Chief Executive [item 3 only]  Lynn Pamment, Comptroller and Auditor General Helen Thompson, Deputy Comptroller and Auditor General  Andy Harris, Committee and Panel Officer Joseph Brannigan, Research and Project Officer Michael Morris, Communications Officer

Agenda matter	Action
<b>1. Records of Meetings</b>  The PAC noted and approved the records of the meetings held on 15th and 29th January 2025	
<b>2. Conflicts of Interest</b>  The PAC noted that there were no conflicts of interests to be declared in relation to the meeting's agenda.	
<b>3. Quarterly Public Hearing with the Chief Executive Officer Government of Jersey</b>  The PAC received Andrew Mclaughlin, Chief Executive Officer of the Government of Jersey and Sebastian Perez, Head of Office of the Chief Executive for a Quarterly Public Hearing. The proceedings were webcast live on the States Assembly website and a recording was made so that a transcript could be produced.  The PAC tasked Officers with drafting letters regarding information requested during the hearing with the Chief Executive Officer.	<b>JB</b>
<b>4. Comptroller and Auditor General Update</b>  The PAC received an update from the Comptroller and Auditor General (C&AG) in relation to the progress of the C&AG audit plan for 2024. The C&AG informed the PAC that the Learning from Previous IT Implementations Thinkpiece would be published shortly and explained the purpose of the Thinkpiece and the different	

<p>sections. The C&amp;AG noted that the report contained relevant areas on procurement that could be of interest to the PAC review into procurement.</p> <p>The C&amp;AG advised that, as the report did not contain recommendations, the PAC could write to the Chief Executive to understand how government would take forward the suggested areas contained within the report.</p>	
<p><b>5. Executive Response – Tackling Fraud and Error Phase 2</b></p> <p>The PAC noted and discussed the Executive Response to the C&amp;AG report Tackling Fraud and Error Phase 2. The PAC agreed that members would review the Executive Response further and provide any comments on Microsoft Teams.</p> <p>The PAC also tasked Officers to produce a comments paper based on any comments provided to be circulated on Microsoft Teams for approval.</p>	JB
<p><b>6. Procurement by the Government of Jersey</b></p> <p>The PAC noted that it would hold an optional meeting on Wednesday 19<sup>th</sup> February to review the evidence collected throughout the review in order to report back to the wider PAC on how to progress with the review. The PAC tasked Officers with collating the documentation and circulating this to Members prior to the meeting.</p> <p>The Officers provided an update on the proposed survey for the review noting that this had now been broadened to capture the views of non-government suppliers as well. It was noted that the previous approach of a joint survey with the Government of Jersey targeted specifically to suppliers was not desired following comments made during the recent joint public hearing with representatives from the Chamber of Commerce, Institute of Directors and Jersey Construction Council. It was noted that evidence had been provided which spoke of a fear amongst local suppliers when speaking out about procurement processes and that it was preferable for the PAC to conduct its own survey to allay these concerns. The PAC agreed the survey and requested that Officers circulate this by the end of the week. The Communications Officer advised that a news release had been prepared and a list of organisations had been identified to circulate the survey on behalf of the PAC. It was noted that the survey would be open until Wednesday 12<sup>th</sup> March 2025.</p> <p>The PAC agreed to arrange a public hearing with Officers to discuss the lessons learned from the joint ferry tender process and tasked Officers to arrange this for 12<sup>th</sup> March. The PAC was advised by the Officers that it may wish to arrange an additional meeting prior to this date to discuss the question plan. It was agreed that a date would be identified and a meeting request circulated in due course.</p> <p>The Chair informed the PAC that Deputy Alex Curtis had been invited to the PAC optional meeting on 19<sup>th</sup> February to discuss Government IT procurement. The Chair also advised the Committee that they could put together a standalone hearing regarding Government IT procurement.</p>	AH/JB  AH  JB
<p><b>7. Handling and Learning from Complaints</b></p> <p>The Chair noted that the Handling and Learning from Complaints Review Report was currently being drafted by officers and it was the intention for this to be shared with the PAC in due course.</p>	



<p><b>8. Arm's Length Organisations, Grants and Subsidies</b></p> <p>The PAC noted that a draft scoping document and Terms of Reference would be circulated in due course in relation to the proposed review of Arm's Length Organisations, Grants and Subsidies. It was noted that the PAC would discuss this further at its next scheduled meeting on 12<sup>th</sup> March 2025.</p>	
<p><b>9. British Virgin Islands PAC visit</b></p> <p>The PAC noted that the final itinerary for the visit of the British Virgin Islands PAC (BVI PAC) had been circulated to the Commonwealth Parliamentary Association and Officers were in the process of finalising details for the visit between 10<sup>th</sup> and 14<sup>th</sup> March 2025. The Chair requested that the itinerary be circulated to all PAC Members and that they inform the officer of any sessions which they wished to attend. The PAC also noted that it would arrange an evening reception on Wednesday 12<sup>th</sup> March with the BVI PAC. The Officer noted that a meeting request would be circulated in due course and requested that Members provide confirmation of their attendance by Wednesday 19<sup>th</sup> February.</p>	<p><b>AH</b></p>
<p><b>10. Future Meetings</b></p> <p>The PAC noted that its next scheduled meeting was due to take place at 12:00pm on Wednesday 12<sup>th</sup> March 2025 in the Blampied Room of the States Building.</p>	

# Public Accounts Committee

## Record of Meeting

Date: 19<sup>th</sup> February 2025

Present	Deputy Inna Gardiner, Chair Deputy Kristina Moore, Vice-Chair Deputy Karen Wilson, Member Deputy David Warr, Member Vijay Khakhria, Lay Member Graeme Phipps, Lay Member
Apologies	Deputy Raluca Kovacs, Member Philip Taylor, Lay Member Glen Kehoe, Lay Member
In attendance	Deputy Alex Curtis, Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel Member Lynn Pamment, Comptroller and Auditor General  Andy Harris, Committee and Panel Officer Joseph Brannigan, Research and Project Officer Michael Morris, Communications Officer

Agenda matter	Action
<p><b>1. Procurement by the Government of Jersey</b></p> <p>The PAC discussed the evidence it had received to date in relation to its review of procurement by the Government of Jersey. The PAC also received Deputy Alex Curtis as a representative for the Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel (CSSP) to discuss the procurement of Information Technology projects.</p> <p>The PAC agreed that it would look to hold a public hearing with Commercial Services and Digital Services in order to discuss the manner in which IT programmes had been procured by the Government. It was agreed that this would be suggested for the scheduled meeting on 26<sup>th</sup> March 2025.</p> <p>It was also agreed that the PAC would identify specific procurement activities once it had received a list of all suppliers registered with the Government of Jersey in order to assess the respective frameworks for those procurements. It was noted that, at present, the threshold for requiring three quotes for a project sat at £25,000, with any projects coming in under that value only requiring one quote. The PAC questioned whether this could give rise to potential corruption and agreed it was beneficial to examine the number of contracts issued under the £25,000 threshold. Officers advised that this information would be shared in due course.</p>	<p><b>AH</b></p> <p><b>AH</b></p>
<p><b>2. Arm's Length Organisations, Grants and Subsidies</b></p> <p>The PAC noted a draft scoping document and Terms of Reference for the proposed review of Arm's Length Organisations, Grants and Subsidies. The PAC discussed the documents and agreed changes. The Officer advised that the changes would be made, and an updated version circulated in due course.</p>	

<b>3. Future Meetings</b>	
---------------------------	--

The PAC noted that its next scheduled meeting was due to take place at 12:00pm on Wednesday 12 <sup>th</sup> March 2024 in the Blampied Room, States Building.	
--	--

# Public Accounts Committee

## Record of Meeting

Date: 12<sup>th</sup> March 2025

Present	Deputy Inna Gardiner, Chair Deputy David Warr, Member Deputy Raluca Kovacs, Member Philip Taylor, Lay Member Glen Kehoe, Lay Member Vijay Khakhria, Lay Member
Apologies	Deputy Kristina Moore, Vice-Chair Deputy Karen Wilson, Member
In attendance	Lynn Pamment, Comptroller and Auditor General  Hon. Ronnie Skelton, Chair, British Virgin Islands Public Accounts Committee Hon. Stacy Mather, British Virgin Islands Public Accounts Committee Hon. Marlon Penn, British Virgin Islands Public Accounts Committee Hon. Myron Walwyn, British Virgin Islands Public Accounts Committee Mrs Bethsaida Smith-Hanley, Clerk/Secretary to Committee, British Virgin Islands Public Accounts Committee.  Richard Corrigan, Chief Officer, Department for the Economy [item 4 only] Andrew Scate, Chief Officer, Infrastructure and Environment Department [item 4 only]  Andy Harris, Committee and Panel Officer Joseph Brannigan, Research and Project Officer Michael Morris, Communications Officer

Agenda matter	Action
<b>1. British Virgin Islands Public Accounts Committee</b>  The PAC welcomed their counterparts from the British Virgin Islands (BVI) as part of a visit arranged by the Commonwealth Parliamentary Association. It was noted that the purpose of the visit was to share good practice and provide the BVI members with an outline of the processes and procedures in place in Jersey for the operation of the PAC.	
<b>2. Records of Meetings</b>  The PAC noted and approved the records of meetings held on 12 <sup>th</sup> and 19 <sup>th</sup> February 2025.	
<b>3. Conflicts of Interest</b>  Vijay Khakhria noted that he was currently working with the University of Edinburgh in relation to commercialising renewable energy products and it was expected that this would be operating in Jersey with potential for them to be sold to Government and Arm's Length Bodies. It was noted that the initiative would likely involve conversations with States Members, however, this did not extend to	

<p>matters of policy and was purely focused as a commercial project with no public discourse required.</p>	
<p><b>4. Public Hearing – Joint Ferry Tender Process</b></p> <p>The PAC received Richard Corrigan, Chief Officer, Department for the Economy and Andrew Scate, Chief Officer, Infrastructure and Environment Department for a public hearing on the joint ferry tender process as part of its ongoing procurement review. The proceedings were webcast live on the States Assembly website and a recording was made so that a transcript could be produced.</p>	
<p><b>5. Comptroller and Auditor General update</b></p> <p>The PAC received an update from the Comptroller and Auditor General (C&amp;AG) in relation to her audit plan for 2025. The following updates were provided:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Critical Infrastructure Resilience: Cyber Security Arrangements – the draft project specification was in the process of being developed.</li> <li>• Critical Infrastructure Resilience: Transport Links – fieldwork had commenced on the review.</li> <li>• Education Reform Programme - the draft project specification was in the process of being developed.</li> <li>• Efficiency Savings: Good Practice Guide – this was currently in the draft reporting stage with the good practice guide planned to be issued during quarter one 2025.</li> <li>• Financial Management and Internal Control – this was currently in the draft reporting stage with the report planned to be issued during quarter two 2025.</li> <li>• Grants and Subsidies: follow up - this was currently in the draft reporting stage with the report planned to be issued during quarter two 2025.</li> <li>• Staff Recruitment and Retention – this report was currently being finalised with publication intended on Monday 17<sup>th</sup> March 2025.</li> <li>• Strategic Property Management - this was currently in the draft reporting stage with the report planned to be issued during quarter two 2025.</li> <li>• Transparency and Excellence in Annual Reporting – the self-assessment had been issued to all bodies, however, the format of this report in 2025 was being reviewed through discussion with relevant parties.</li> </ul> <p>The C&amp;AG also noted that the following reviews were planned to be taken forward during 2025:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Fire and Rescue Service</li> <li>• Health Insurance Fund</li> <li>• Major and Strategic Projects including Capital Projects</li> <li>• Sustainable Healthcare Funding</li> <li>• Insurance</li> </ul>	
<p><b>6. Procurement by the Government of Jersey</b></p> <p>The PAC noted that it had received a written submission from the Association of Jersey Charities (AJC) in response to the review, alongside a copy of their report 'The Power of Partnerships' which had been produced to examine the manner in which the Government and Third Sector worked together. The PAC requested that Officers produce a summary of key themes identified within the submission and examine any possible findings and recommendations for the review arising in relation to the third sector.</p>	<p><b>AH/JB</b></p>

<p>The PAC noted that the C&amp;AG had circulated a Good Practice Guide to the Chair from the National Audit Office in relation to 'Managing the commercial lifecycle' which contained relevant information for the PAC's review. It was agreed that this would be circulated to Members for their information.</p> <p>The PAC recalled it had agreed to hold a public hearing to discuss Information Technology Procurement and that this was due to be held on Wednesday 26<sup>th</sup> March 2025. The Officers advised that a question plan would be shared in due course for approval.</p>	<p><b>AH/JB</b></p> <p><b>JB</b></p>
<p><b>7. Handling and Learning from Customer Feedback and Complaints</b></p> <p>The PAC noted and approved its report P.A.C.1/2025 'Handling and Learning from Customer Feedback and Complaints'. It was noted that the report would be sent out, under embargo, before formal presentation on Friday 14<sup>th</sup> March 2025.</p>	<p><b>AH</b></p>
<p><b>8. Arm's Length Organisations, Grants and Subsidies</b></p> <p>The PAC recalled that it had agreed changes to the Terms of Reference and Scoping Document for its proposed review of Arm's Length Bodies, Grants and Subsidies. The PAC discussed the documents further and agreed further changes. It was also agreed that the PAC would budget for the appointment of an external adviser to provide an analysis of the various governance arrangements within the Arm's Length Bodies being reviewed. The Officer advised that the scoping document would be updated to include these changes and recirculated to Members for final approval.</p> <p>Philip Taylor noted that he was the chair of the charity Jersey Trees for Life which was in receipt of grant funding from the Government of Jersey.</p>	<p><b>AH</b></p>
<p><b>9. Quarterly Hearing with the Chief Executive Officer, Government of Jersey</b></p> <p>The PAC noted a response from the Chief Executive to its follow up letter from the quarterly public hearing which took place on 12<sup>th</sup> February 2025. The PAC agreed to raise further questions for clarification and requested the Officer to draft correspondence for approval.</p>	<p><b>AH</b></p>
<p><b>10. Recommendations Tracker – Quarter Four 2024 update report</b></p> <p>The PAC reviewed the quarter four 2024 update report on the C&amp;AG/PAC recommendations tracker that had been provided by the Government of Jersey. The PAC agreed to follow up on the status of open recommendations in respect of the 'Deployment of Staff Resources in Health and Community Services' and 'Use of Consultants' report. It was agreed that these questions would be included in the follow up letter being sent to the Chief Executive.</p>	<p><b>AH</b></p>
<p><b>11. Future Meetings</b></p> <p>The PAC noted that its next scheduled meeting was due to take place at 12:30pm on Wednesday 26<sup>th</sup> March 2024 in the Blampied Room, States Building.</p>	